

Contents

1	Introduction	1
	Climate Change Cases	5
	References	6
2	Setting the Stage for Climate Change Litigation	7
2.1	The Scientific Framework of Climate Change	7
2.1.1	Understanding Climate Change	8
2.1.1.1	The Earth's Natural Climate System	8
2.1.1.1.1	Climate and the Climate System	8
2.1.1.1.2	The Earth's Average Temperature	8
2.1.1.2	Natural Causes of Climate Change	9
2.1.1.2.1	Climate Epochs	9
2.1.1.2.2	Natural Climate Variations	10
2.1.1.3	Anthropogenic Climate Change	11
2.1.1.3.1	The Greenhouse Effect	11
2.1.1.3.2	Non-Emissive Sources of Climate Change	13
2.1.2	Impacts of Climate Change and Global Warming	14
2.1.2.1	Melting of Glaciers, Ice Sheets and Polar Sea Ice	14
2.1.2.2	Melting Permafrost and the Release of Methane	16
2.1.2.3	Extreme Weather Events	17
2.1.2.4	Indirect Impacts of Climate Change	18
2.1.2.4.1	Impacts on Oceans, Nature and Biodiversity	18
2.1.2.4.2	Social Impacts	20
2.1.2.4.3	Economic Impacts	21
2.1.3	Conclusion	22
2.2	Climate Change Litigation: An Overview	22
2.2.1	Defining Climate Change Litigation	23

2.2.2	Categorizing Climate Change Litigation	26
2.2.2.1	Characteristics of Climate Change Lawsuits	26
2.2.2.1.1	Parties to the Proceeding	26
2.2.2.1.2	Jurisdiction, Area of Law and Subject Matter	27
2.2.2.1.3	Objectives and Motivation	29
2.2.2.2	Generations of Climate Change Litigation	31
2.2.2.3	Current Trends and Developments	32
	Climate Change? Cases	35
	Cases	37
	References	38
3	Causation in Climate Change Litigation	43
3.1	Causation as a Precondition of Law	43
3.1.1	The Purpose of Causation in Law	43
3.1.2	The Two-Tiered Approach to Causation in Law	45
3.1.3	Sources of Causal Inquiries	49
3.2	Causation in Legal Practice	51
3.2.1	Causation in Domestic Law	51
3.2.2	Causation in Regional and International Law	53
3.2.2.1	International Law and the International Court of Justice	53
3.2.2.2	Causation and State Responsibility	55
3.2.2.3	International Criminal Law, the International Criminal Court and International Criminal Tribunals	59
3.2.2.4	European Law and the Court of Justice of the European Union	62
3.2.3	Causation in the Regional and International Human Rights Framework	64
3.2.3.1	Negative Versus Positive Obligations	65
3.2.3.2	The European Convention on Human Rights and the European Court of Human Rights	66
3.2.3.3	The American Convention on Human Rights and the Inter-American Court of Human Rights	69
3.2.4	Conclusion	71
3.3	Causation and Climate Change	72
3.3.1	Scientific Causation and Climate Change	72
3.3.1.1	Model of a Climatic Chain of Causation	72
3.3.1.2	Attribution Science	76
3.3.2	Law-Inherent Obstacles to Finding Climatic Causation	79
3.3.2.1	Delimiting Climatic Causation	79

3.3.2.2	Minimal Contributions and the 'Drop-in-the-Ocean Argument'	80
3.3.2.3	The Temporal Sphere of Causing Climate Change: Historical and Future Emissions	82
3.3.2.4	Negative Versus Positive Obligations	83
3.3.3	Connecting Law and Science in Climatic Causation	85
3.3.3.1	The Nature of Climatic Causal Chains	85
3.3.3.2	Scientific and Legal Fact-Finding	86
3.3.3.3	Judicial Demands Versus Scientific Studies	87
3.3.3.4	Finding Common Grounds	88
3.4	The Status Quo of Causation in Climate Change Litigation: An Empirical, Systematic and Substantive Analysis	89
3.4.1	The Methodological Interface	90
3.4.1.1	Overall Parameters	90
3.4.1.2	Contextual Analysis and Subject of Research	92
3.4.2	Overall Findings	94
3.4.3	Causation in Climate Change Decisions and Judgments	95
3.4.3.1	The Marginal Existence of Causal Considerations	95
3.4.3.2	The Factual and Formalistic Analysis	97
3.4.3.2.1	The Geographical Allocation	97
3.4.3.2.2	The Field and Area of Law, Response and Direction of Action	100
3.4.3.3	The Systematic and Substantive Structure of Causal Argumentation	104
3.4.3.3.1	The Four Notions of Causal Argument	104
3.4.3.3.2	General Causation	115
3.4.3.3.3	Specific Causation	116
3.4.3.3.4	Cumulative Causation, Minimal Contributions and the Drop-in-the-Ocean Argument	118
3.4.4	Results of the Analysis	121
3.5	Summary of Findings	123
	Climate Change Cases	124
	Cases	127
	References	128
4	Factual Causation	135
4.1	Factual Causation in Climate Change Litigation	135
4.1.1	Introducing Factual Causation	136
4.1.2	Omissions as Causes	137
4.1.3	Evaluative Criteria of Factual Causal Doctrines	140
4.2	Counterfactual Causation	142

4.2.1	The Metaphysical Interface of Counterfactual Theories of Causation	142
4.2.2	The Viability of Counterfactual Tests in Climate Change Litigation	143
4.2.2.1	Cumulative Causation and Causal Over-Determination	146
4.2.2.2	Alternative Causation	151
4.2.2.3	The Outlier of Asymmetrical Overdetermined Concurrent Causes	153
4.2.2.4	The Spatial and Temporal Sphere of Causal Relata	154
4.2.2.4.1	The Spatial Sphere of Counterfactuality	154
4.2.2.4.2	The Temporal Sphere of Counterfactuality	155
4.2.2.5	Conclusion	157
4.2.3	The Strategy of Factual Concretization	157
4.2.3.1	Concretizing Climatic Causation	158
4.2.3.1.1	Concretizing Cases of Cumulative Causation	159
4.2.3.1.2	Concretizing Cases of Alternative Causation	161
4.2.3.1.3	Conclusion	163
4.2.3.2	Translating Causal Concretization into Climate Practice	163
4.2.3.3	Shortcomings of the Strategy of Concretization	164
4.2.3.4	Introducing Criteria of Concretization	166
4.2.3.4.1	Chain-Related Individualization	166
4.2.3.4.2	The Necessity for Legally Relevant Information	167
4.2.3.4.3	Factors of Legal Individualization	169
4.2.4	Conclusion	174
4.3	Regularity Theories of General Causation	176
4.3.1	Metaphysical Substantiation of Theories of Regularity	176
4.3.1.1	The General Principles of Theories of Regularity	176
4.3.1.2	Imperfect Regularities, Spurious Regularities and Epiphenomenal Causes	180
4.3.1.3	The Set-Setting Dilemma	182
4.3.1.4	Combining Counterfactuals and Regularities	187
4.3.2	Reconciling Theories of Regularity with Climatic Causation	188
4.3.3	Conclusion	192

4.4	Probabilistic Theories of Causation	193
4.4.1	Metaphysical Substantiation of Probabilistic Theories of Causation	193
4.4.1.1	The General Principles of Probabilistic Causation	193
4.4.1.2	The Dichotomy Between Logic, Intuition and Theory	195
4.4.1.2.1	Non-Probability Raising Causation	196
4.4.1.2.2	Probability Raising Non-Causation	197
4.4.1.3	Singular Probabilistic Causal Statements	199
4.4.1.4	Simpson's Paradox	200
4.4.2	Assessing Probabilistic Climatic Causation	202
4.4.2.1	Climate Change Litigation and Probabilistic Causation	202
4.4.2.2	Scientific Data, Probabilistic Causal Analysis and Climate Cases	207
4.4.2.2.1	The Need for Scientific Results	207
4.4.2.2.2	On Terminological Coherency and Methodological Discrepancies	208
4.4.2.2.3	The Dependency of Legal Assessments on Scientific Evidence	209
4.4.3	Conclusion	211
4.5	Climatic-Specific Causation as an Emergent and Dynamic Construct	212
4.5.1	Emission Share Causation Doctrine	213
4.5.1.1	The Tenets of the Market Share Liability Doctrine	213
4.5.1.2	The Convergence of the Market Share Liability Doctrine to Climatic Causation	215
4.5.1.2.1	From Market-Share to Emission-Share	215
4.5.1.2.2	DES and Climate Change	215
4.5.1.2.3	Delineating a 'Market' for Emissions	218
4.5.1.2.4	Conceptualizing Causation Under an Emission Share Approach	220
4.5.1.3	Conclusion	221
4.5.2	Contribution-Based Approach to Causation	221
4.5.2.1	The Substance of a Contribution-Based Perception of Factual Causation	222
4.5.2.2	The Contribution-Based Approach in Practice	223

4.5.2.2.1	Domestic Approaches to Reduced Standards of Causation	223
4.5.2.2.2	Regional and International Perceptions of Reduced Causal Standards	232
4.5.2.2.3	Lessons Drawn from Domestic and International Approaches to Contributory Causation	236
4.5.2.3	Climate Case Studies	239
4.5.2.3.1	Massachusetts v. EPA	240
4.5.2.3.2	Native Village of Kivalina v. Exxon Mobil et al.	241
4.5.2.3.3	Maniototo Environmental Society v. Central Otago District Council	242
4.5.2.3.4	Family Farmers and Greenpeace Germany v. Germany	243
4.5.2.4	Framing a Reduced Understanding of Causation	244
4.5.2.4.1	The Substance of a Contribution-Based Approach	244
4.5.2.4.2	The Metaphysical Interface of a Lowered Conception of Causation	246
4.5.2.4.3	Legislating Contributory Causation	250
4.6	Summary of Findings	251
	Climate Change Cases	253
	Cases	254
	References	255
5	Normative Causation	261
5.1	Normative Causation in the Law	261
5.2	Normative Implications for Causation	264
5.2.1	General Sources of Normativity	265
5.2.2	International Environmental Law	268
5.2.2.1	The Principle of Prevention	269
5.2.2.2	The Precautionary Principle	271
5.2.2.2.1	Disputing the Precautionary Principle	271
5.2.2.2.2	The Substance of the Precautionary Principle as an Interpretative Device for the Assessment of Normative Causation	273
5.2.2.3	The Polluter Pays Principle	276
5.2.2.4	The Concept of Common but Differentiated Responsibilities	277

5.2.3	Climate Justice	279
5.2.3.1	Climate Justice as a Principle of Law	279
5.2.3.2	The Substance of Climate Justice	281
5.2.3.2.1	Distributive Justice	283
5.2.3.2.2	Corrective Justice	285
5.2.3.2.3	Procedural Justice	290
5.2.3.2.4	Social Justice	292
5.2.4	Implications for Normative Causation in Climate Scenarios	294
5.3	The Principle of Foreseeability	295
5.3.1	Foreseeability as a General Principle of Normative Causation	295
5.3.2	Foreseeability and Climate Change	298
5.3.2.1	The Scope of Foreseeability	298
5.3.2.1.1	The Right Vantage Point	298
5.3.2.1.2	The Standard of the Right Observer	301
5.3.2.1.3	The Implementation of Special Knowledge	303
5.3.2.1.4	The Extent of Foreseeability	305
5.3.2.2	Present-Day Foreseeability of Climate Change and Climate Change-Induced Damage	310
5.3.2.3	Historic Emissions and the Timely Threshold of Foreseeability	311
5.3.2.3.1	General Foreseeability of Climate Change	312
5.3.2.3.2	Specific Foreseeability of Climate Change Impacts	318
5.3.3	Conclusion	323
5.4	Materiality Threshold	324
5.4.1	Materiality as a General Principle of Normative Causation	324
5.4.2	Materiality and Climate Change	325
5.4.2.1	The Need for a Causal Threshold	325
5.4.2.2	Status Quo of Materiality in Climate Change Litigation	327
5.4.2.3	Setting a Causation Threshold	332
5.4.2.3.1	Emission-Based Causal Threshold	333
5.4.2.3.2	Threshold for Other Climate Damaging Behaviour	343
5.4.3	Conclusion	344
5.5	Intervening and Superseding Causes	345
5.5.1	Intervening Causes as Normative Delimitation	345
5.5.2	Reconciling Climate Change and Intervening Causes	346

5.5.2.1	Natural Events	347
5.5.2.2	Human Actions	349
5.6	Theory of Adequacy	352
5.7	Theory of Proximate Cause	355
5.7.1	The General Perception of Proximate Cause	355
5.7.2	Climate-Relevant Particularities of the Theory of Proximate Cause	357
5.7.2.1	The Spatial and Personal Proximity of the Damage	357
5.7.2.2	Aligning Climate Change and the Theory of Proximate Cause	359
5.8	Protective Scope of the Norm	363
5.9	Summary of Findings	368
	Climate Change Cases	371
	Cases	373
	References	374
6	Distinguishing Different Cases of Applied Climatic Causation	383
6.1	Factual Causation	384
6.1.1	Civil Law Jurisdictions	384
6.1.2	Common Law Jurisdictions	385
6.1.3	Regional and International Jurisdictions	387
6.2	Normative Causation	388
6.2.1	Actor-Specific Differentiation	388
6.2.1.1	States	389
6.2.1.1.1	Foreseeability	389
6.2.1.1.2	Materiality	391
6.2.1.2	Multinational Corporations	394
6.2.1.2.1	Foreseeability	394
6.2.1.2.2	Materiality	396
6.2.1.3	Individuals	399
6.2.1.3.1	Foreseeability	400
6.2.1.3.2	Materiality	401
6.2.2	Area of Law and the Subject of Action	402
6.3	Summary of Findings	403
	Climate Change Cases	404
	References	405
	List of Instruments	407
	Appendices	413
	Annex I: German Summary	413
	Annex II: Table of Climate Cases with References to Causation	422
	Annex III: Data Included in Figure 3.2	429