Table of Contents

Ken Oliphant and Richard W. Wright
Medical Malpractice and Compensation in Global Perspective: Introduction 1
I. Issues Addressed 2
A. Overall Scheme 2
B. Details of the Applicable Liability and Compensation Systems . . 3
C. Empirical Data 4
D. Attitudes, Concerns, and Prospects 4
II. Aims 4

Bernhard A. Koch
Medical Malpractice in Austria 7
Introduction 7
I. The Insurance Framework 8
A. Social Insurance in Austria 8
B. The Role of Private Insurance 9
1. First-Party Insurance 9
2. Liability Insurance 10
II. The Regulatory Framework 10
A. Professional Law 10
B. Criminal Law 11
C. Contract Law 12
D. Tortious and Contractual Liability 13
1. Tortious and Contractual Liability Not Mutually Exclusive . . 13
2. Tort Law in General 14
3. Damage 14
4. Causation 14
5. Wrongfulness and Fault 17
6. Multiple Persons Involved 18
7. Informed Consent 21
8. Remedies 24
III. Compensation claims in practice 28
A. General Remarks 28
B. Patient Advocacies 29
C. Conciliation Bodies 30

D. Compensation Funds 31
E. Outlook 32

Eduardo Dantas
A Bridge over troubled Waters: The Development of Medical Malpractice Litigation in Brazil 35

Introduction 35
I. The Brazilian Legal System 39
II. The Structure of the Brazilian Legal System 40
III. The influence of the Consumer's Defense Code 43
A. Informed Consent, the Duty to Inform, and Informed Choice . . . 45
B. Moral Damages and the Inversion of the Burden of Proof As Patient's Basic Rights 49
IV. The Changes Brought by the New Civil Code 50
Conclusion 52

Colleen M. Flood and Bryan Thomas
Canadian Medical Malpractice Law in 2011: Missing the Mark on Patient Safety 55

Introduction 55
I. The Canadian Malpractice Context 57
A. Service Delivery, Regulation and Liability Insurance 59
II. State and Quality of the Canadian Health Care System 60
A. Medical Malpractice in the Domain of Privately Financed Care . . 66
III. Redressing Adverse Events through the Courts 67
A. Canadian Medical Malpractice Liability in Context 69
B. Empirical Trends on Medical Liability Claims 70
C. Black Letter of Canadian Tort Law 72
1. Battery by Physicians 73
2. Negligence by Physicians 73
3. Hospital Liability 81
4. Government Liability 83
5. Damages 84
6. Ongoing Issues and Avenues of Reform 86
IV. Preventing Adverse Events: Professional and System Reform 87
A. Reforms at the Level of the Professions 88
1. Alternative Complaint Mechanisms 88
2. Revalidation/Recertification 89
3. Apology Legislation 90
B. Systemic Reforms 91
1. Accreditation of Facilities 91
2. Canadian Patient Safety Institute 92
3. Improved Information Gathering and Dissemination 92
Conclusion 94

Zhu Wang and Ken Oliphant
Yangge Dance: the Rhythm of Liability for Medical Malpractice in the People's Republic of China 97

Introduction 97
I. The Wider Healthcare Context 99
II. The Early P.R. China: Medical Services as Social Welfare (1949–1987) 102
III. The Administrative Liability Regime 105
A. The Medical Accident Rules 1987 105
1. Context 105
2. Main Features of the Administrative Liability Regime, 1987–2002 106
B. The Medical Accident Regulations 2002 108
1. Context 108
2. Main Features of the Administrative Liability Regime, 2002 onwards 108
IV. The Tort Liability Regime 111
A. Recourse to the General Principles of Civil Liability 111
B. Elements of the Tort Liability Regime 113
1. Cause of Action 113
2. Burden of Proof 113
3. The Identification Process 114
4. Assessment of Damages 115
C. Effect on the Administrative Liability Regime 116
V. Reform of Medical Liability under the Tort Liability Law of 2009 . . . 117
A. Antecedents 117
1. Increasing Disputes between Doctors and Patients 117
2. Concerns about Defensive Medical Treatments 118
3. The Chaos Resulting from the Dual Dystem of Medical Liability 119
B. Legislative History 120
C. Four Dimensions of the TLL 121
1. Basis of the Cause of Action 121
2. Burden of Proof 124
3. The Identification Procedure 126
4. Assessment of Damages 126
VI. Another Step Backwards on Its Way? 127
Conclusion 130

Medical Malpractice and Compensation in France 131

Florence G'sell-Macrez

Part I: The French Rules of Medical Liability since the Patients' Rights Law of March 4, 2002 131

Introduction 131

I. General Conditions of Medical Liability 134

A. Facts Likely to Justify the Physician's Responsibility 135

1. Liability Based on Fault 136

2. Strict Liability 143

B. The Causal Link 148

1. Causation Criterion 148

2. Causation Proof 149

C. The Victim's Harm 154

II. Administration and Adjudication of claims based on liability rules . . 156

A. Adjudication Through Conciliation Commissions 157

B. Adjudication Through Courts 159

Geneviève Helleringer

Part II: Compensation Based on National Solidarity 163

Introduction 163

I. Typology of Cases Covered by National Solidarity 164

A. Medical Hazards 164

B. Hospital-Acquired Infections 166

C. Blood Transfusions Infections 167

1. HIV Infection 167

2. Hepatitis C Infection 168

3. Additional Grounds 168

II. Administration and Adjudication of Claims Based on National Solidarity 169

A. Administrated Claims 169

B. Procedural Routes to ONIAM 171

C. Adjudication Proceedings in Front of ONIAM 173

D. Regulatory Principles Applying to Rights of Recourse 174

III. Awarded Compensation 175

Marc S. Stauch

Medical Malpractice and Compensation in Germany 179

Introduction 179

I. The Potential Legal Consequences of Medical Injury 181

A. Criminal Law 181

B. Professional and Disciplinary Sanctions 182

C. Fault-Based Compensation in Private Law 183

D. Strict Liability and No-Fault Compensation for Medical Product Injury . . . 186
E. Social Security, Insurance, and Subrogation Issues . . . 187
II. The System of Private Law Compensation . . . 189
A. Treatment Malpractice Claims . . . 189
1. Faulty Treatment . . . 189
2. Causation . . . 192
3. Proof Issues . . . 193
B. Disclosure Malpractice Claims . . . 196
1. Background . . . 196
2. Standard of Disclosure . . . 197
3. Causation . . . 198
C. Damages and Liability Insurance Issues . . . 199
D. The Medical Arbitration Boards . . . 201
III. Assessment of the Current Situation . . . 202
A. Empirical Data . . . 202
B. Evaluation of the Private Law Redress Rules . . . 205
C. Patient Safety Initiatives . . . 207
Conclusion . . . 208
Addendum . . . 209

Claudia Di Marzo
Medical Malpractice: The Italian Experience . . . 211

Introduction . . . 211
I. The Problematic Nature of Medical Liability . . . 213
II. The Assignment of the Burden of Proof Between Parties . . . 221
A. Proving Fault . . . 221
B. Proving Causation-In-Fact . . . 226
C. Proving Causation Under the Criminal Law and Under the Civil Law . . . 229
D. The Role of Informed Consent . . . 232
Conclusion . . . 235

Robert B Leflar
The Law of Medical Misadventure in Japan . . . 239

Introduction . . . 239
I. Prosecutions and Their Consequences . . . 242
A. Prosecutions in Medical Cases . . . 242
B. Response by the Health Ministry and the Medical Profession . . . 246
C. One Prosecution Too Many: The Medical Professionals' Counterattack and the String of Acquittals . . . 249
II. Civil Liability . . . 251
A. Substantive Law of Medical Malpractice . . . 252
1. Theories of Recovery . . . 252

2. Standard of Care . . . 253
3. Level of Proof . . . 254
4. Informed Consent and Related Actions . . . 257
5. Damages . . . 258
B. Key Aspects of Procedural Law and Practice . . . 260
1. In General . . . 260
2. Discovery of Peer Review Findings . . . 261
3. Judicial Administration Reforms . . . 262
4. Settlement Practices, Overall Claiming Levels, and Malpractice Insurance Premiums . . . 263
5. Plaintiffs' Attorney Fees and Court Filing Fees . . . 267
III. The No-Fault Compensation System for Obstetrical Injury . . . 268
Conclusion . . . 271
Addendum . . . 273

Stephen Todd
Treatment Injury in New Zealand . . . 275
Introduction . . . 275
I. The New Zealand Accident Compensation Scheme . . . 276
A. The Woodhouse Report . . . 276
B. Implementation . . . 278
C. Developments to 2010 . . . 279
D. Relationship with the Common Law . . . 283
E. Cover . . . 285
1. Categories of Cover . . . 285
2. Personal Injury . . . 286
3. Residual Actions for Damages . . . 287
F. Claimants . . . 288
G. Benefits . . . 288
H. Claims Process . . . 290
I. Funding . . . 291
J. Administration . . . 292
II. Medical Injuries . . . 292
A. Cover . . . 295
B. Treatment Injury . . . 296
1. Proof of Cause . . . 296
a. *Atkinson* and *Ambros* . . . 297
b. Modification of Ordinary Rules? . . . 301
2. Nature of Treatment Injury . . . 304
3. Treatment Injury in Operation . . . 307
4. Costs . . . 310
C. Professional Accountability . . . 311
1. Reporting of Medical Risks . . . 312
2. Complaints . . . 313

3. Actions for Damages 314
a. Clinical Trials 314
b. Stillbirths 315
c. Pregnancy and Unwanted Births 316
d. Informed Consent Cases 317
e. Mental Injury 318
f. Miscellaneous 318
g. Exemplary Damages 318
Conclusion 319
A. Adequate Compensation? 319
B. Defensible Boundaries? 319
C. Administratively Efficient? 321
D. Disincentive to Safety-Conscious Behavior? 322
E. Overview 324

Kinga Bączyk-Rozwadowska
Medical Malpractice and Compensation in Poland 327
Introduction 327
I. Grounds for Civil Liability 331
II. Liability Based on Fault 344
III. Burden of Proof and Causation 351
IV. Compensation 356
V. Professional Liability of Doctors 370
Conclusion 372
Addendum 373

Vibe Ulfbeck, Mette Hartlev and Mårten Schultz
Malpractice in Scandinavia 377
Introduction 377
I. The Overall Scheme for Preventing and Redressing Medical Errors and Adverse Events 379
A. Regulatory Methods in the Nordic Health Care Systems 379
B. Compensation Systems 380
C. Liability Systems 381
D. The Relationship Between the Systems 382
II. The Details of the Applicable Liability and Compensation Systems . . 383
A. Patient Injury Compensation Systems 383
1. Introduction 383
2. Basis for Compensation 383
a. The Experienced Specialist Standard 383
b. The Failure of Apparatus 385
c. The Alternative Treatment Rule 386
d. The Reasonableness Rule 386
e. "Accidents" 387

f. Wrong Diagnosis 388
g. Infection 388
3. Causation 388
a. The Concept of Causation in Scandinavian Law 388
b. The Problems of Causation in Malpractice Law 392
c. Relaxation of Evidence 392
d. Assessment of Damages 393
III. Available Empirical Data 394
Conclusion 395

L.C. Coetzee and Pieter Carstens
Medical Malpractice and Compensation in South Africa 397
I. The Overall Scheme for Preventing and Redressing Medical Errors and Adverse Events, Including Regulation, Criminal and Civil Liability, and Social and Private Insurance, and the Relationships Among These Various Systems 397
A. Regulatory Methods 397
1. Government Licensing Authorities for Doctors and Hospitals 397
2. Medico-Ethical Codes of Conduct 401
3. Reporting of Medical Errors and Adverse Events to the Health Profession Council of South Africa 402
B. Liability Systems 403
1. Contract 403
2. Delict (Tort) 406
3. Criminal Law 406
4. Relationship Between the Liability Systems 408
C. Compensation Systems 409
1. Sufficient Insurance Cover To Be Required for Private Health Establishments 413
2. Private Indemnity (Medical Protection Society) 414
D. Relationships Among the Compensation Systems, the Liability Systems, and the Regulatory Systems 415
II. The Details of the Applicable Liability and Compensation Systems . . 418
A. Criteria Defining Qualification for Compensation 418
1. Liability Based on Fault 418
2. The Role of the South African Constitution, 1996 420
3. Nature of Damages and Compensation 421
B. Causation and "Loss of Chance" 423
1. General Rules on Causation 423
2. "Loss of a Chance" 425
C. Liability for Failure to Obtain Informed Consent 426
D. Matters of Proof and Gathering of Evidence 427
1. Matters of Proof 427
a. General 427
b. Gathering of Evidence 431

III. Available Empirical Data on Medical Errors and Adverse Events, the Operation of the Systems Designed to Prevent and/or Redress such Errors and Events, and the Prevalence and Impact of Measures Designed to Reduce Medical Errors and Adverse Events, Improve System Performance, or Reduce System Costs 432
IV. Attitudes and Concerns About the Liability and Compensation Systems 435

Richard Goldberg
Medical Malpractice and Compensation in the UK 439
Introduction 439
I. The Context of Medical Malpractice Liability 440
II. Recent Empirical Evidence on the Numbers and Funding of Claims. . 442
A. England 442
B. Scotland 445
C. Summary 446
III. NHS Redress Act 2006 446
IV. Patients' Rights Bill in Scotland: The No-Fault Compensation Review Group Report (McLean Report) 448
V. Basis of Liability for Medical Injury 451
A. Contract, Tort, and Delict 451
B. The Requirements of Negligence 451
C. Duty of Care 452
D. Standard of Care 452
E. Causation 454
1. Difficulties in Proving Causation in Clinical Negligence Cases 455
2. The Burden of Proof 456
3. The "But For" Test 456
4. Cumulative Causation 457
5. Material Increase in Risk 457
6. Alternative Causation 457
7. Reinstating *McGhee: Fairchild* 458
8. The Scope of *Fairchild* and Clinical Negligence Cases 459
9. Loss of a Chance 462
VI. Reforming the Costs of Civil Litigation in England and Wales: Implications of the Jackson Report for the Costs of Clinical Negligence and the Ministry of Justice Reform of Legal Aid 466
A. Jackson Report 466
B. Reform of Legal Aid in England and Wales 469
Conclusion 470

David A. Hyman and Charles M. Silver
Medical Malpractice and Compensation in Global Perspective: How Does the U.S. Do It? 473

Introduction 473
I. Details of the Applicable Regulatory and Liability/Compensation Systems 476
A. Regulating the Delivery of Medical Care 476
B. Liability/Compensation Systems 477
1. Fault-Based (Negligence) 477
2. No-Fault Liability (Strict Liability) 483
C. Limitations on Liability/Contracting out of Liability 483
D. Immunity from Liability 485
II. Empirical Data on Medical Errors/Adverse Events and Malpractice Litigation 486
A. How Common Are Medical Errors and Adverse Events? 486
B. Malpractice Litigation 487
1. Claiming Frequency (relative to rate of medical error/adverse events) 488
2. Compensation Patterns and Time Trends 489
3. Impact of Caps on Non-Economic Damages 496
4. Accuracy of the Liability System 499
5. Frivolous Lawsuits 501
6. Cost of Medical Errors/Adverse Events 502
7. Cost of the Liability System 503
III. Attitudes and Concerns About the Liability and Compensation Systems 505
IV. Why Do Things Look the Way They Do? 506
V. What Have We Learned by Studying Texas? 507
A. Who Decides Malpractice Cases? 507
B. Does it Matter How Much the Jury Awards in a Malpractice Case? 508
C. How Much Coverage Do Physicians Have? 508
D. Do Changes in the Tort System (i.e., increases in the number of claims, or payouts per claim) Help Explain the Malpractice Crises that Hit the United States in 2000–2003? 509
E. Impact of Tort Reforms on Claim Frequency and Payouts 510
Conclusion 510

Ken Oliphant
Medical Malpractice and Compensation: Comparative Observations 513

Introduction 513
I. Making Sense of Diversity 516
A. A Diversity of Legal Mechanisms 516

1. Liability systems 516
2. Alternative compensation systems 521
3. Other regulatory and complaints mechanisms 523
B. The Wider Context 526
1. The substantive legal context 526
2. The wider litigation process 527
3. The health care context 530
C. Comparative Functional Analysis 533
II. Assessment of Liability-Based Approaches 535
A. Compensation 535
1. Mechanisms for dealing with organizational complexity . . . 536
2. Adaptation of the Requirements of Causation and Proof . . . 539
3. Patients' Rights and Disclosure Duties 542
B. Prevention 547
1. The deterrent effect of liability rules 547
2. Pushing prevention too far? Defensive medicine and related issues 549
C. Accountability 550
D. Weighing the Evidence 551
1. Public controversy and narratives of crisis 551
2. Empirical evidence 552
III. Assessment of No-Fault Alternatives 555
A. Introduction 555
B. New Zealand: an exclusive no-fault regime 555
C. The Nordic Patient Insurance Schemes 557
D. France: Compensation on the Basis of National Solidarity 558
E. Comparison and Evaluation 559
Conclusion 561

Publications 513