

# Table of Contents

Foreword		xvii
Introductory Note:	The TRIPS Agreement Twenty Years After	1
I	The Origins	1
II	Awakening to Reality	5
III	Finding the Evidence: The TRIPS Agreement Is about Trade	8
IV	A New Piece of the Puzzle: TRIPS "Flexibilities"	10
	[A] The Concept of "Flexibilities"	10
	[B] Four Clusters of Flexibilities	12
	[1] The First Cluster: Transition Periods	12
	[2] The Second Cluster: Flexibilities Regarding Implementation of International Obligations	12
	[3] The Third Cluster: Flexibilities As to Standards of Protection; Upward (TRIPS Plus) and Downward (Exceptions and Limitations) Flexibilities; Modalities of Exceptions and Limitations: Internal and External Examples	13
	[4] The Fourth Cluster: Flexibilities in the Field of Enforcement; Injunctions and the Principle of Equity	15
	[C] Another Approach to Flexibilities: Three Sequential Moments in the Life of Rights and Corresponding Flexibilities	15
	[D] General Principles That Apply to Flexibilities and Conclusion	17
V	The TRIPS Agreement As Unfinished Business and the Need to Move Forward	20
Preamble	Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights	31
1	The Scope, the Nature and the Function of the TRIPS Agreement	32
	(a) The scope of the TRIPS Agreement	32

## Table of Contents

	(b) The dynamic dimension of the TRIPS Agreement	35
	(c) The nature and the function of the Agreement	37
	(i) The first objective of the TRIPS Agreement: to reduce distortions and impediments to international trade	40
	(ii) The second objective of the TRIPS Agreement: to protect private property rights	44
2	Intellectual Property and Trade	46
	(a) TRIPS and the GATT	51
	(b) The WTO and WIPO	57
3	Patent Protection and Economic Development	62
PART I		
	General Provisions and Basic Principles	71
Article 1	Nature and Scope of Obligations	71
1	The TRIPS Agreement: A Minimum Standards Agreement (in Part)	72
2	Method of Implementing the Provisions of the TRIPS Agreement	77
3	Implementation	81
4	The Scope of TRIPS Obligations	86
Article 2	Intellectual Property Conventions	89
1	The Objective of the Paris Convention in the Field of Patents: The Articulation of National Patent Systems	89
2	The National Treatment Principle under the Paris Convention	92
3	Priority	93
4	The Principle of Independence	96
5	Article 5 of the Paris Convention and Trade Protectionism	98
6	From the Paris Convention to the TRIPS Agreement	99
7	The Relationship between the TRIPS Agreement and the Paris Convention	102
Article 3	National Treatment	109
1	The "No Less Favourable" Treatment Standard of the TRIPS Agreement As Opposed to the "Same" Treatment Standard of the Paris Convention	109
2	The Concept of "Necessity" in the TRIPS Agreement	113
3	Two GATT Panel Reports on the National Treatment Principle and Article XX(d) of the GATT 1947	117
4	The Principle of National Treatment in the <i>European Communities</i> Cases	120
5	Scope and Reach of Footnote 3	123
Article 4	Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment	127
1	The MFN Treatment Principle	127
2	The MFN Principle and the National Treatment Principle: A Rule of Thumb	128



3	The Scope of the MFN Principle	129
4	Exemptions from the MFN Principle	131
Article 5	Multilateral Agreements on Acquisition or Maintenance of Protection	135
1	The Scope of the Exemption under Article 5	135
2	An Example of an Admissible Exemption: Discriminatory Reduction of Fees	138
Article 6	Exhaustion	139
1	Exhaustion	139
2	The Meaning of Article 6	148
3	The Legal Implications of International Exhaustion	151
4	Using Exhaustion As a Tool to Address Anticompetitive Practices	159
5	Other Modalities of Exhaustion	160
Article 7	Objectives	164
1	The Origins of Article 7 and the Notion of Intellectual Property	164
2	Patents, Trade Secrets and Patronage: Alternative Mechanisms to Promote Invention and Innovation	171
3	Article 7 Is Not about the Objectives of the TRIPS Agreement	178
4	Patents, Innovation, and Transfer and Dissemination of Technology	179
	(a) Patents and invention	182
	(b) Transfer and dissemination of technology	184
5	The Meaning of the Second Part of Article 7	191
Article 8	Principles	193
Paragraph 1		193
1	Article 8 Is Not about Principles of the Agreement but Rather about Principles of Implementation of the Agreement	193
2	The Origins of Article 8	194
3	The Conditions of the Application of Article 8.1	194
4	Article 8.1 and Non-violation Complaints	197
5	The TRIPS Agreement and Public Health	198
6	The Doha Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health	205
	(a) Introduction	205
	(b) Commentary	206
Paragraph 2		213
1	The Meaning and the Reach of Article 8.2	213
2	The Interface between Patent and Competition Law	215
	(a) Patents and monopolies	215
	(b) The interface between intellectual property and competition law	228
	(i) The three levels of the interface	229
	(ii) Examples	231
	- Intellectual property in the wrong dosage (too much and too less intellectual property)	231
	- Abuses of patent rights	232

## Table of Contents

-	(Rare) cases of anticompetitive intellectual property rights (even if in the correct dosage and not abused)	234
3	The Interface between Patent and Competition Law: A List of Issues	236
4	The Interface between Intellectual Property and Competition in the TRIPS Agreement	238
PART II		
	Standards Concerning the Availability, Scope and Use of Intellectual Property Rights	245
	Section 5: Patents	245
	Article 27 Patentable Subject Matter	245
	Paragraph 1	245
1	The History of Article 27	245
2	Prohibition of Discrimination	248
3	Article 27.1 and Article 1	252
4	The Scope of Article 27.1: Superjacent and Subjacent TRIPS Conditions of Patentability	252
	(a) The superjacent TRIPS conditions of patentability	254
	(i) Novelty	254
	(ii) Inventive step (non-obviousness)	257
	(iii) Capability of industrial application (usefulness)	261
	(b) The subjacent conditions of patentability	264
	(i) Artificiality	264
	(ii) Non-communicability	265
	(iii) Alternativeness	266
	(iv) Materiality	269
	(c) The conditions of patentability and the differentiating function of patents	272
	(i) Computer software	273
	(ii) Business methods	274
	(iii) Second uses	278
5	Substantive Examination	284
6	Conditions of Patentability: A Minimum or a Maximum?	288
7	Discrimination As to the Place of Invention	290
8	Discrimination As to the Field of Technology	290
9	Discrimination As to the Local of Production: The Local Working Requirement	292
	(a) The working requirement under the Paris Convention	292
	(b) The meaning of the last sentence of Article 27.1	294
	(c) The interface between international exhaustion and the local working requirement	296
	(d) A persuasive precedent of the GATT jurisprudence: The United States Manufacturing Clause	297



(e)	The cross-disputes between the United States and Brazil	298
(f)	The local exploitation requirement and Article XX(j) of the GATT 1947: an admissible exception to Article 27.1?	304
10	The Local Exploitation Requirement As Distinguished from the Working Requirement	305
11	Prohibition to Discriminate As to the Enjoyment of Rights	307
	Paragraph 2	308
1	Exclusions from Patentability on Ethical Grounds	308
2	Morality and " <i>Ordre Public</i> "	311
3	The Two-Step Necessity Test	313
4	Exclusions from Commercial Exploitation as Opposed to Other Forms of Exploitation	317
5	Article 27.2 and Article 4 <i>quater</i> of the Paris Convention	317
6	Other Remarks on Article 27.2	319
	Paragraph 3(a)	319
	Paragraph 3(b)	322
1	Plant Variety Protection: The UPOV	324
	(a) The farmers' exemption	327
	(b) The breeders' exemption	329
2	The Relationship between the TRIPS Agreement and the CBD	331
	(a) The negotiations in the TRIPS Council	331
	(b) The intersection of the TRIPS Agreement with the CBD	337
	(i) The precautionary principle and the TRIPS Agreement	338
	(ii) Article 8(j) of the CBD and the TRIPS Agreement	339
	(iii) Article 15 of the CBD and Articles 27 and 28 of the TRIPS Agreement	342
	(iv) Article 16 of the CBD and the TRIPS Agreement	345
	(v) Article 18 of the CBD and the TRIPS Agreement	348
	(vi) In a nutshell, there is no necessary conflict between the CBD and the TRIPS Agreement	348
3	The Relationship between the TRIPS Agreement and the FAO International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture	352
	Article 28 Rights Conferred	355
	Paragraph 1	355
1	The Meaning and Scope of Article 28	356
2	Administrative Enforcement of Patent Rights by Regulatory Authorities: The Patent Linkage, a New Trend?	359
	Paragraph 2	361
	Article 29 Conditions on Patent Applicants	364
1	Enabling Disclosure	364
2	Elements for Assessing the Sufficiency of the Disclosure	365
3	Best Mode Disclosure	368

## Table of Contents

4	Information Concerning Foreign Applications	370
5	The Requirement to Disclose the Origin of Genetic Resources and Prior Informed Consent of the Use of Traditional Knowledge in Patent Applications	371
Article 30	Exceptions to Rights Conferred	375
1	The Three Conditions for the Application of Article 30	378
2	Article 30 and Article 27.1	383
3	Examples of Exceptions to Rights Conferred; the Problems with Exhaustion, Manual Handling of Pharmaceutical Preparations and the Prior User Exceptions	383
4	Article 30 and the Implementation of Paragraph 6 of the Doha Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health	386
Article 31	Other Use without Authorization of the Right Holder	387
	Paragraph	387
	Subparagraph (a)	399
	Subparagraph (b)	400
	Subparagraph (c)	410
	Subparagraph (d)	413
	Subparagraph (e)	414
	Subparagraph (f)	415
1	The Meaning and Scope of Article 31 (f)	415
2	Paragraph 6 of the Doha Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health	418
3	The Decision of the WTO General Council of 30 August 2003, on the Implementation of Paragraph 6 of the Doha Declaration of the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health	420
	(a) Introduction	420
	(b) Commentary	427
	Subparagraph (g)	456
	Subparagraph (h)	458
	Subparagraph (i)	459
	Subparagraph (j)	460
	Subparagraph (k)	460
1	The Legislative History of Subparagraph (k)	460
2	Compulsory Licenses and Antitrust Law	462
3	Remuneration	467
4	Adjudication	468
5	Other Issues	469
	Subparagraph (l)	470
Article 32	Revocation/Forfeiture	476
1	The Meaning and the Scope of Article 32	476
2	Revocation or Forfeiture of Patents to Remedy Antitrust Violations: Divestiture and the <i>FRUITS Doctrine</i>	482
Article 33	Term of Protection	485



Article 34	Process Patents: Burden of Proof	494
Section 7	Protection of Undisclosed Information	499
Article 39		499
Paragraph 1		499
1	Introduction	499
2	The Legislative History of Article 10 <i>bis</i> of the Paris Convention	501
	(a) Legislative history	501
	(b) Does Article 10 <i>bis</i> of the Paris Convention provide for mandatory protection of trade secrets?	509
	(c) Conclusions	513
3	Do Paragraphs 1 and 2 Cover Different Subject Matters?	516
Paragraph 2		517
1	The Legislative History of Article 39.2 of the TRIPS Agreement	520
2	Protection of Trade Secrets under Article 39.2	534
3	Protection of Confidential Information in Court Procedures	547
Paragraph 3		550
1	The Legislative History of Article 39.3	550
	(a) The origins of the protection of test data	550
	(b) The legislative history of Article 39.3	552
	(i) Proposals on test data in the second cycle of TRIPS negotiations (1989-1990)	553
	(ii) Proposals on test data in the third (and last) round of TRIPS negotiations (1990-1991)	559
2	Economic and Social Constraints over Protection of Test Data	568
3	The Scope, the Reach and the Application of Article 39.3	572
	(a) Test data protection under Article 39.3 of the TRIPS Agreement: a <i>sui generis</i> mechanism	572
	(b) Substantive protection of undisclosed test data (i.e., against unfair commercial use) is mandatory as regards pharmaceutical and agricultural chemical products only	578
	(c) Test data protection: substantive and adjective protection	581
	(i) The meaning of "unfair commercial use" – the obligation to ensure substantive protection	582
	(ii) The first possible modality of substantive protection: data exclusivity	586
	(iii) The second possible mechanism of substantive protection: right-to-remuneration	593
	(d) Exclusivity of data does not mean either exclusivity of information or product or market exclusivity	598
	(e) Requirements	601
	(i) Submission must be mandatory	601
	(ii) The nature of the product	602
	(iii) Novelty	604
	(iv) Secrecy of the data	608

## Table of Contents

	(v) Considerable efforts required for obtaining the data	611
	(vi) Approval of the relevant chemical entity	612
	(f) Protection against disclosure	613
	(g) Term of protection	617
	(h) The relationship between test data protection and patent rights – the “patent linkage”	619
	(i) Exceptions and limitations to rights conferred	623
	(i) Fair use of test data	623
	(ii) Non-commercial use	629
	(iii) International exhaustion	631
	(j) A few additional issues	632
	(i) Restoration of terms of protection	632
	(ii) Core dossier registrations and the protection of supplementary data	633
	(iii) Biological products	634
4	Recent Developments Concerning Protection of Test Data: “TRIPS Plus” Standards in the Context of Bilateral FTAs	635
Section 8:	Control of Anticompetitive Practices in Contractual Licences	640
Article 40		640
1	The Meaning and the Scope of Article 40	641
2	Legislative History of Article 40	642
3	An Exhaustive or Indicative List? The Impact of the Language of Article 40.2 on the Freedom of WTO Members to Address Anticompetitive Practices in Contractual Licenses	644
4	Article 40.2 and Non-violation Complaints	657
5	International Cooperation in the Field of Antitrust Violations in Licensing Agreements	658
6	Work in the WTO on the Interface between Intellectual Property and Antitrust	662
PART IV		
	Acquisition and Maintenance of Intellectual Property Rights and Related <i>Inter Partes</i> Procedures	667
	Article 62	667
	Paragraph 1	667
	Paragraph 2	671
	Paragraph 4	674
PART V		
	Dispute Prevention and Settlement	675
Article 64	Dispute Settlement	675
1	Objectives and Nature of the DSM	675
2	The New Features of the DSM	677



## Table of Contents

3	Conciliatory Steps	678
4	The Outcome of the DSM	679
5	Specific Issues Concerning the Withdrawal of Concessions in the TRIPS Agreement: The Problem of Cross-Retaliation Sanctions	681
6	Non-violation and Situation Complaints	684
7	The Special (and Overlooked) Interest of LDCs in Non-violation Complaints	691
8	Disputes	693
	(a) Patent-related disputes	693
	(b) Test data-related disputes	697
9	Lessons from the DSM	697
	(a) First lesson: Good intentions do not count	697
	(b) Second lesson: More (Protection) is always better than less	698
	(c) Third lesson: International Trade has reasons that the reason does not know	698
PART VI		
	Transitional Arrangements	701
	Article 65 Transitional Arrangements	701
	Paragraph 5	701
1	Standstill	701
2	Standstill and LDCs	702
	Article 66 Least-Developed Country Members	708
	Paragraph 1	708
	Paragraph 2	715
	Article 70 Protection of Existing Subject Matter	718
	Paragraph 1	718
	Paragraph 2	721
	Paragraph 3	724
	Paragraph 4	724
	[...]	725
	Paragraph 6	725
	Paragraph 7	726
	Paragraph 8	727
	Paragraph 9	729
	Jurisprudence	737
APPENDICES		
	Appendix I Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights	743
	Appendix II Paris Convention for the Protection of Industrial Property	781
	Index	821