

---

# Contents

Acknowledgements	xi
1 INTRODUCTION	1
An Experiment Using Exegetical <i>Hadīths</i>	1
Assumptions, Conclusions, and Qualifications	3
2 <i>HADĪTH CRITICISM</i>	6
Traditional Sunni Muslim Account	6
Early Western Scepticism	8
I. Goldziher and the Advocacy of Scepticism	9
J. Schacht and Fictitious Legal <i>Hadīths</i>	12
E. Stetter and <i>Topoi</i> and <i>Schemata</i> in <i>Hadīths</i>	17
Reaction Against Scepticism	18
N. Abbott and the Early Continuous Written Tradition	18
F. Sezgin and the Cataloguing of Early Texts	21
M. M. Azami and the Critique of Schacht	23
The Search for Middle Ground	26
G. H. A. Juynboll and the Refinement of Schacht's Methods	26
F. Rahman and an Attempt to Save the Sunna	32
G. Schoeler and the Oral/Written Distinction	34
H. Motzki and the Implausibility of Fabrication	36
J. Horovitz, J. W. Fück, J. Robson, N. J. Coulson, and U. Rubin	38
Renewed scepticism	42
M. Cook and the Spread of <i>Isnāds</i>	42
N. Calder and the Common Link as the Locus of Controversy	45
Analyses and Conclusions	48

<b>3 EXEGETICAL HADĪTHS AND THE ORIGINS OF TAFSĪR</b>	65
Defending <i>Isnāds</i> and Reconstructing Early <i>Tafsīrs</i>	65
H. Horst and Counting <i>Isnāds</i>	66
Birkeland, Abbott, Sezgin, and Goldfeld	69
G. Stauth and Comparing Transmissions from Mujāhid	73
The Scepticism and Literary Analysis of J. Wansbrough, A. Rippin, et al.	78
Middle Ground	83
C.H.M. Versteegh, M. Muranyi, New Manuscripts and Reconstructions	84
C. Gilliot and the Function of <i>Isnāds</i> in the <i>Imaginaire</i>	88
F. Leemhuis' Intermediate Position	89
Other Scholars Who Have Entered the Fray	91
Implications for the Study of Early “ <i>tafsīr(s)</i> ”	92
<b>Excursus: THE AUTHENTICITY OF THE HISTORICAL HADĪTHS</b>	106
<b>4 METHODOLOGY: ISNĀDS AND EXEGETICAL DEVICES</b>	112
Content Versus Style	113
An Alternative	118
Parameters: al-Ṭabarī and Ibn ‘Abbās	120
Al-Ṭabarī	120
Al-Ṭabarī’s <i>Tafsīr</i> as a Text	122
Al-Ṭabarī as a Compiler	124
Al-Ṭabarī as an Exegete	125
Ibn ‘Abbās	129
The Mythic Ibn ‘Abbās	131
The Students and Works Attributed to Ibn ‘Abbās	135
Hypotheses for Possible Outcomes	137
Database of <i>Isnāds</i> and Exegetical Devices	141
Construction of the Database	143
Selecting the Sample Set of Informants and Students	145
Exegetical Devices	148
Wansbrough’s Twelve	148
Additional Categories	155
Determining the Exegetical Device(s) for a <i>Hadīth</i>	156
<b>5 DATA AND ANALYSIS: THE AUTHENTICITY OF IBN ‘ABBĀS’S HADĪTHS IN AL-ṬABARĪ’S TAFSĪR</b>	173
Analysis 1: Ibn ‘Abbās versus his Students and the Informants of al-Ṭabarī	174

Analysis of Individual Devices	175
Patterns and their Implications	187
Analysis 2: The Students of Ibn 'Abbās versus the Informants of al-Ṭabarī	191
Analysis of Individual Devices	192
Patterns and their Implications	205
The Provenance and Chronology of Exegetical <i>Hadīths</i>	208
<b>6 CONCLUSIONS</b>	<b>219</b>
The Impasse	219
Resolving the Impasse: History versus Literature	226
<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>232</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>247</b>