

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	page xvii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xxvi
<i>Table of cases</i>	xxvii

PART I	Fundamental concepts and sources	1
1	The various aspects of human dignity	3
1.	Theology, philosophy and constitutional law	3
A.	The difference between the intellectual history and the constitutional interpretation	3
B.	The similarity between the intellectual history and the constitutional interpretation	4
2.	Criticism of the use of the concept of human dignity and response to it	8
A.	The criticism	8
B.	The response	10
3.	Human dignity – a social value, a constitutional value and a constitutional right	12
2	The intellectual history of the social value of human dignity	15
1.	The ancient world	15
A.	History of ideas	15
B.	The Stoics and Cicero	17
C.	The world religions	18
(1)	Judaism	18
(2)	Christianity	21
(3)	Islam	23
2.	Philosophical approaches	24
A.	Philosophical approaches until Kant	24
(1)	The Renaissance	24

	(2) The Enlightenment	25
	B. Kant	26
	C. Dworkin	28
	D. Waldron	30
	3. The lessons learned from the intellectual history	33
3	Human dignity as a value and as a right in international documents	34
	1. Human dignity in legal discourse	34
	2. Human dignity in international conventions	37
	A. Human dignity discourse in international conventions	37
	B. United Nations conventions	38
	(1) The UN conventions on human rights of 1966	38
	(2) United Nations conventions on particular issues	39
	(3) Conventions of the United Nations' specialized agencies	41
	C. Conventions on particular issues	42
	D. Regional conventions	44
	(1) Europe	44
	(2) America	45
	(3) Africa	47
	(4) The Arab League	48
	(5) The Organization of Islamic Cooperation	48
4	Human dignity as a value and as a right in constitutions	49
	1. Pre-Second World War developments	49
	A. Pre-First World War developments	49
	B. Development from the First World War until the Second World War	49
	2. Development from the Second World War until the present	51
	A. The scope of the development	51
	B. Development of human dignity in the constitutions of the European states	52
	(1) The 1940s	52
	(2) The 1950s – the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	54
	(3) The 1960s, 1970s and 1980s	54

- (4) The 1990s 56
- (5) The start of the twenty-first century 58
- (6) In retrospect 59
- C. Development of human dignity in the constitutions of Latin American states 59
 - (1) Until the end of the 1940s 59
 - (2) Human dignity in modern constitutions 61
- D. Development of human dignity in the constitutions of African states 62
- E. Development of human dignity in the constitutions of Asian states 64

PART II Human dignity as a constitutional value 67

5 Purposive constitutional interpretation 69

- 1. Constitutional uniqueness and its influence on constitutional interpretation 69
 - A. Human dignity as a constitutional value and constitutional interpretation 69
 - B. A constitution as a supreme norm 70
 - C. The uniqueness of a constitution and its purposive interpretation 72
 - D. Purposive interpretation of a constitution – comparative law 72
- 2. Constitutional meaning 73
 - A. Express and implied meaning 73
 - B. Express meaning 74
 - C. Constitutional silence 76
 - D. Implied meaning 77
 - E. Constitutional structure 80
- 3. The constitution's subjective purpose 82
 - A. Its essence 82
 - B. Its sources: structure 83
 - C. Its sources: constitutional history 84
- 4. The constitution's objective purpose 84
 - A. Its essence 84
 - B. The sources of the objective purpose 85
 - (1) Internal sources: the constitution as a whole and the search for constitutional unity 85
 - (2) External sources: other constitutional provisions 86

(3)	External sources: post-constitutional history	87
(4)	External sources: precedent	87
(5)	External sources: fundamental values	89
(6)	External sources: comparative law	90
C.	Determining the ultimate purpose of the constitution	95
(1)	The approach of purposive interpretation	95
(2)	The subjective purpose of the constitution is not decisive	96
(3)	The objective purpose and protection of the individual	98
(4)	"A living constitution" and "a living tree"	99
(5)	Interpretation with a spacious view	100
6	The role of human dignity as a constitutional value	103
1.	Three roles of human dignity as a constitutional value	103
2.	Human dignity as a constitutional value that lays a foundation for all of the rights	104
3.	The interpretational role of human dignity as a constitutional value	105
A.	General interpretational role	105
B.	Particular interpretational role: interpretation of the right to human dignity	110
4.	Human dignity as a constitutional value in the limitation of constitutional rights	112
7	Three types of model for determining the content of the constitutional value of human dignity	114
1.	Theological models, philosophical models and constitutional models	114
2.	Theological models	114
3.	Philosophical models	116
A.	Assessment of the philosophical models	116
B.	Human dignity and Kant	117
C.	Human dignity and Dworkin	118
D.	Human dignity: Margalit and Statman	119
4.	Constitutional models	120
A.	The characteristics of the constitutional models	120

(1)	An interpretational approach with a spacious view	120
(2)	Interpretation of the constitutional value of human dignity and the constitutional rights with a spacious view	122
(3)	The multiplicity of constitutional models	123
B.	The content of the constitutional value of human dignity	124
(1)	The humanity of the person as a human being	124
(2)	The humanity of the person as a free being	127
(3)	The humanity of the person as autonomy of will	129
(4)	The humanity of the person as rejection of the person as a mere means	130
(5)	The humanity of the person in the framework of a society	130
(6)	The humanity of the person and the human race	131
C.	Criticism of the constitutional model of humanity	132
PART III	Human dignity as a constitutional right	137
8	Recognition of the constitutional right to human dignity and its content	139
1.	Constitutional recognition	139
A.	Express recognition of a constitutional right to human dignity	139
B.	Recognition of a constitutional right to human dignity by implication	141
C.	Recognition of human dignity as a constitutional right by filling a lacuna in a constitution	142
(1)	The lacuna	142
(2)	A lacuna in a constitution?	143
2.	The content of the constitutional right: the realization of the constitutional value	144
A.	The general approach	144
B.	The unique case of the German Basic Law	145
3.	Purposive constitutional interpretation and human dignity	147
A.	Interpretation with a spacious view	147
B.	A spacious view is not a limitless view	148

- C. Purposive interpretation of human dignity and limitation of a different right 149
- D. Purposive interpretation of human dignity and limitation of the public interest 150
- E. Criticism of this view and response 153

9 Human dignity as a framework right (mother-right) 156

- 1. Human dignity as a framework right 156
 - A. Framework rights 156
 - B. A bundle of rights 158
 - C. Framework rights and rights with no special name 159
- 2. Daughter-rights of human dignity 160
 - A. Daughter-rights fulfill the mother-right's purpose 160
 - B. The various aspects of the humanity of a person 160
 - C. Deriving a daughter-right from the mother-right of human dignity 161
 - D. Daughter-rights and those same rights as independent rights 162
 - E. The relationship between the daughter-rights of human dignity 163
 - (1) Lack of overlap, complementary overlap and conflicting overlap 163
 - (2) Lack of overlap 163
 - (3) Complementary overlap 163
 - (4) Conflicting overlap 164
 - (a) Conflicting overlap between two principles 164
 - (b) Conflicting overlap between a principle and a rule 167
 - F. The relationship between daughter-rights and independent constitutional rights 167

10 The area covered by the right to human dignity 170

- 1. The area covered and the overlap problem 170
- 2. The area covered exclusively by the right to human dignity in a comprehensive bill of rights 170
- 3. The constitutional right to human dignity and the complementary overlap with independent constitutional rights in a partial bill of rights 174

4. Architectural difficulty: the right to human dignity and the right to personal liberty 175
 - A. Presenting the problem 175
 - B. South Africa 176
 - C. Canada 177
 - D. Israel 178
5. Human dignity is not a "residual right" 181

PART IV Human dignity in comparative law 183

11 Human dignity in American constitutional law 185

1. A constitutional right to human dignity is not recognized in the federal constitution 185
 - A. The lack of a special express provision on human dignity in the federal constitution 185
 - B. Human dignity is not part of a framework right in the federal constitution 185
 - C. Human dignity and *Griswold v. Connecticut* 189
2. Human dignity as a constitutional right in the state constitutions 190
3. Human dignity as a constitutional value in the federal constitution 192
 - A. Human dignity and the dignity of the state 192
 - B. The history of human dignity as a constitutional value 193
 - (1) Pre-Second World War 193
 - (2) The 1940s and 1950s 193
 - (3) Continued use of human dignity in the Supreme Court 197
 - (a) Expanding the application of human dignity to most of the Bill of Rights 197
 - (b) The contribution of Justice Brennan 199
 - (c) The contribution of Justice Kennedy 201
 - C. The assessment of human dignity as a constitutional value in the US Constitution 205
 - (1) The status of human dignity as a constitutional value 205
 - (2) The essence of human dignity in American common law 206

12 Human dignity in Canadian constitutional law	209
1. The Canadian Charter does not recognize a constitutional right to human dignity	209
A. The lack of an independent right to human dignity	209
B. Rejection of human dignity as a derived (daughter) constitutional right	209
C. Human dignity as a sub-constitutional value	211
2. Human dignity as a constitutional value in the Canadian Charter	212
A. The centrality of human dignity as a constitutional value	212
(1) In the Canadian Charter in general	212
(2) In certain constitutional rights	213
(a) The right to equality	213
(b) The right to freedom of expression	214
(c) The right to life, liberty and security of the person	215
(d) Legal rights	215
B. The content of human dignity	217
(1) Human dignity as the humanity of the person	217
(2) The various expressions of human dignity	218
(a) Human dignity in <i>Law</i>	218
(b) Human dignity in <i>Morgentaler</i>	219
(c) Human dignity, free will and individual autonomy	220
(d) Human dignity and viewing a person as an end unto himself	221
(e) Human dignity within a society	221
C. The role of human dignity as a constitutional value	222
(1) Human dignity as an interpretational standard for determining the scope of a constitutional right	222
(2) Human dignity in the limitation of constitutional rights	223
13 Human dignity in German constitutional law	225
1. The normative traits of human dignity	225
A. The provisions of Article 1(1) of the German Basic Law	225
B. Human dignity as an absolute right	227
C. Human dignity as an eternal right	229

D.	Human dignity as the supreme value in the German constitution	230
E.	The area covered by human dignity as a constitutional right	231
F.	The uniqueness of human dignity in German constitutional law	232
2.	Human dignity as a constitutional value and a constitutional right	233
A.	Human dignity solely as a constitutional value	233
B.	Human dignity as a constitutional right	234
3.	The definition of human dignity	235
A.	Negative and positive definitions	235
B.	Shared and conflicting elements of the various definitions	236
4.	The scope of human dignity	237
A.	The dignity of every person as a human being	237
B.	Human dignity's beginning and end	238
(1)	Human dignity's beginning	238
(2)	Human dignity's end	239
C.	Human dignity and bioethics	239
5.	Human dignity in German constitutional law and comparative law	240
14	Human dignity in South African constitutional law	243
1.	The normative traits of human dignity	243
A.	The provisions of sections 10 of the South African Constitution	243
B.	Human dignity as a relative right	244
C.	Human dignity as a constitutionally amendable constitutional right	248
D.	Human dignity as a supreme value	252
E.	The area covered by human dignity as a constitutional right	256
(1)	A zone of exclusive application of human dignity	256
(2)	Human dignity and the residual right to freedom	259
F.	The uniqueness of the right to human dignity in South African constitutional law	261

(1)	Human dignity as a constitutional right that covers all conduct that falls within human dignity as a constitutional value	261
(2)	The overlap between the right to human dignity and the other constitutional rights	262
(3)	The minimum core problem	264
2.	Human dignity as a constitutional value and a constitutional right in South African constitutional law	266
A.	Human dignity as one of the human rights	266
B.	The relationship between the constitutional value of human dignity and the constitutional right to human dignity	267
3.	The scope of the constitutional value of human dignity	267
A.	Definitional difficulties	267
B.	Human dignity as seeing a person as an end and not a mere means	268
4.	The scope of the constitutional right to human dignity	271
A.	Overlap and conflict between human dignity and other constitutional rights	271
B.	The parties to the constitutional right to human dignity	272
C.	The content of the constitutional right to human dignity	273
(1)	The external context and the internal context	273
(2)	The content of human dignity as a constitutional right in light of the Constitutional Court's jurisprudence	275
(3)	Human dignity and the autonomy of individual will	277
15	Human dignity in Israeli constitutional law	280
1.	The normative traits of human dignity	280
A.	Articles 2 and 4 of the Basic Law	280
B.	Human dignity as a relative right	281
C.	Human dignity is not an eternal right	283
(1)	There is no express eternity clause	283
(2)	Is there an eternity clause by implication?	284

D. Human dignity as a supreme value	285
E. The area covered by human dignity as a constitutional right	286
2. The daughter-rights of human dignity	288
A. The right to personality	288
B. The right to dignified human subsistence	288
C. The right to reputation	292
D. The right to family life	292
E. The right to equality	295
F. The right to freedom of expression	296
G. The right to freedom of conscience and religion	296
H. The right to freedom of movement	298
I. The right to education	299
J. The right to employment	299
K. The right to due process	300
3. Parties to the right	301
A. The bearer of the right to human dignity	301
(1) A person	301
(2) Groups	303
(3) A corporation	303
B. Obligee	304
4. Temporal application	305
A. Active application of the Basic Law	305
B. A normative anomaly	306
<i>Bibliography</i>	308
<i>Index</i>	347