

Contents

<i>Preface</i>		vii
<i>Part One Aesthetic Interests and Aesthetic Qualities</i>		1
1. The Aesthetic Point of View	<i>Monroe C. Beardsley</i>	10
2. Aesthetic Concepts	<i>Frank Sibley</i>	29
3. Categories of Art	<i>Kendall L. Walton</i>	53
4. Piece: Contra Aesthetics	<i>Timothy Binkley</i>	80
5. The Myth of the Aesthetic Attitude	<i>George Dickie</i>	100
6. Artistic and Aesthetic Values	<i>Roman Ingarden</i>	117
<i>Bibliography</i>		133
<i>Part Two The Definition of Art</i>		137
7. The Role of Theory in Aesthetics	<i>Morris Weitz</i>	143
8. The Artworld	<i>Arthur Danto</i>	155
9. Creativity in the Arts	<i>Jack Glickman</i>	169
10. The Possibility of Art: Remarks on a Proposal by Dickie	<i>Ted Cohen</i>	187
<i>Bibliography</i>		200
<i>Part Three The Ontology of Art</i>		203
11. Art and Its Objects	<i>Richard Wollheim</i>	208
12. Toward an Ontology of Artworks	<i>Nicholas Wolterstorff</i>	229
13. The Ontological Peculiarity of Works of Art	<i>Joseph Margolis</i>	253
14. Art and Authenticity	<i>Nelson Goodman</i>	261
<i>Bibliography</i>		276

<i>Part Four Representation in Art</i>		279
15. Reality Remade	<i>Nelson Goodman</i>	283
16. Picturing and Representing	<i>Marx W. Wartofsky</i>	307
17. Representation as Expression	<i>Peter Kivy</i>	319
18. Puzzles of Pictorial Representation	<i>Joseph Margolis</i>	338
<i>Bibliography</i>		358
 <i>Part Five The Intentional Fallacy and Expressive Qualities</i>		 361
19. The Intentional Fallacy	<i>W. K. Wimsatt, Jr. and Monroe C. Beardsley</i>	367
20. Intention and Interpretation in Criticism	<i>Frank Cioffi</i>	381
21. Expressive Properties of Art	<i>Guy Sircello</i>	400
22. Art and Expression: A Critique	<i>Alan Tormey</i>	421
23. Gadamer's Theory of Interpretation	<i>E. D. Hirsch, Jr.</i>	438
<i>Bibliography</i>		455
 <i>Part Six The Objectivity of Criticism and Interpretation</i>		 459
24. The Testability of an Interpretation	<i>Monroe C. Beardsley</i>	466
25. Robust Relativism	<i>Joseph Margolis</i>	484
26. Hermeneutical Experience	<i>H.-G. Gadamer</i>	499
27. From Work to Text	<i>Roland Barthes</i>	518
<i>Bibliography</i>		525
 <i>Part Seven Metaphor</i>		 529
28. Metaphor	<i>Max Black</i>	535
29. The End of the Book and the Beginning of Writing	<i>Jacques Derrida</i>	553
30. Metaphor and the Central Problem of Hermeneutics	<i>Paul Ricoeur</i>	577
<i>Bibliography</i>		593
 <i>Notes on the Contributors</i>		 597
<i>Index</i>		601

Index

References to complete selections are given in italics.

Adler, Renata, 25

aesthetic: and artistic, 117–132 *passim*;
 attitude, 101–116, 422; Beardsley on, 85,
 89; Bell on, 86; boundaries, 1–2;
 categories, 8; concepts, 24–52; as
 condition-governed, 24–52 *passim*;
 education, 24; gratification, 16;
 Hungerland on, 86; Langer on, 86;
 Langfeld on, 109; and moral and
 scientific, 1–2, 111–114 *passim*; object,
 117, 119–120; and perceptual qualities,
 3–4, 7, 24–52 *passim*, 53–79 *passim*, 80–99
passim; point of view, 10–28; Pole on,
 112–113; qualities, 6–8; Schapiro on, 22;
 sensibility, 8–9; Sibley on, 55–85, 86;
 Stolnitz on, 103, 108–111 *passim*; Tomas
 on, 114; Urmson on, 104; value, 15–20
passim, 117–132

aesthetics, 80–99; and art, 1–4, 80–81, 89–93
passim; Baumgarten on, 83, 85; and
 philosophy of art, 83–86

allographic. *See* Autographic

Alpers, Svetlana, 342

Alston, William, 473–478 *passim*, 493

“Among School Children” (Yeats), 390–394
passim

Anderson, Quinton, 389–390

anthropomorphic predicates, 402, 405–410
passim, 412–419 *passim*

Aristotle, 150, 513, 558–559, 590–592
passim

Arnold, Matthew, 572

art: and aesthetic and non-aesthetic
 properties, 54–55, 80–99 *passim*; and
 aesthetic values, 117–132 *passim*; as
 artifact, 151, 179–183 *passim*; as
 autographic and allographic (Goodman),
 206–207, 268–273 *passim*; Bell-Fry theory
 of, 144–145, 146, 152; Binkley on
 definition of, 80–99; constituted by
 theory, 155, 156, 159–160, 164, 166–167,
 181; and copies, 232–233; and creativity,
 168–185; Danto on real things and,
 154–167; descriptive and evaluative use of,
 150–152; Dickie’s institutional theory of,
 190–192, 193–196; Duchamp and, 81, 83,
 91–97 *passim*, 180, 182, 183, 188–192
passim, 195–198 *passim*, 254, 256–257;
 Emotivists on, 145; and forgery, 261–275;
 Formalists on, 144–145; *Gestalt* properties
 of, 55–59 *passim*; Greenberg on, 97;
 Goodman on, 261–275; and
 illocutions/perlocutions, 193–196 *passim*;
 Imitation Theory (IT) of, 155–157 *passim*;
 and interpretation, 226–228; Intuitionists
 on, 145; Langer on, 88; Margolis on
 ontology of, 88–89, 95, 253–260, 495–496;
 and media, 86–90 *passim*, 92, 93–96
passim; as open concept, 149–150;
 Organicists on, 145; and perceptual
 properties, 53–55, 57–59, 85–86, 261–266;
 and performances, 229, 241–246 *passim*;

art (*continued*)

- "physical-object hypothesis of" (Wollheim), 208; Reality Theory (RT) of, 157–158; and reproduction, 233; Sartre on, 338–339; and types and particulars, 178; and type/token distinction, 205–206, 220–225, 238–241, 250–251, 253–260; Voluntarists on, 146; Walton on aesthetic features of, 53–79; Weitz on definition of, 143–153; Wollheim on ontology of, 208–228; Wolterstorff on ontology of, 229–252
- art works: expressiveness of, 213–219 *passim*; as kinds (types), 93–97, 154–167 *passim*, 238–247 *passim*; as physical objects, 87–89 *passim*, 95, 117, 208–213, 218–220, 231–232, 233
- artistic and aesthetic values, 123–124
- artworld, Danto on, 154–167
- Austin, J. L., 6, 193, 473, 490, 529, 580
- autographic (Goodman), 206–207, 268–273 *passim*
- Bacon, Roger, 342, 343, 344
- Bain, Alexander, 542
- Barthes, Roland, 464, 465, 531
- Bathsheba* (Rembrandt), 343, 344
- Bataille, Georges, 520
- Bateson, F. W., 477, 494
- Batteux, Charles, 323
- Baumgarten, Alexander, 83, 85
- "beach art" (Glickman), 180, 254–255
- Beardsley, Monroe C., 4–5, 8, 9, 85, 87, 108, 142, 361, 362–363, 364, 365, 383–390 *passim*, 393–394, 399, 400–401, 410, 415, 460–461, 463, 489–494 *passim*, 578, 581, 582, 583–584, 587, 590
- Bell, Clive, 3, 86, 115, 137, 144–146
- Berggren, Douglas, 581
- Bernard (Saint), 23, 25
- Bewley, Marius, 395, 396
- Binkley, Timothy, 5
- Black, Max, 552, 579, 581, 582, 583–584
- Boech, August, 438–440
- Bottlerack* (Duchamp), 180, 182–183, 256–257
- Bouwsma, O. K., 400–401, 410
- Bradley, A. C., 145
- Brentano, Franz, 361, 364
- Brillo boxes (Warhol), 162–164 *passim*, 167
- Brooks, Cleanth, 494
- Brunelleschi, Filippo, 339, 340, 343, 551
- Bullough, Edward, 8, 100, 101
- Bultman, Rudolf, 439
- Cassirer, Ernst, 400
- Cioffi, Frank, 364, 492
- Cohen, Ted, 7–8, 141
- Coleridge, Samuel, 372, 374, 384
- Collingwood, R. G., 175, 197, 400, 422, 425, 508–510 *passim*, 512–513
- composing music, 247–249
- Cone, Edward T., 324, 326
- Coomaraswamy, Ananda K., 369
- copies, 232–233
- creativity, 168–185; Glickman on, 253–256; Kennick on, 175–176; Morgan on, 168–169; Tomas on, 169–173, 175–177 *passim*, 179
- criticism: and art, 459–461 *passim*; Beardsley on, 460–461, 466–483, 489–495 *passim*; Hospers on, 42–44 *passim*; Isenberg on, 462–463; Macdonald on, 41–43 *passim*; Margolis on, 460, 483–498; objectivity in, 459–460, 466–483 *passim*; and relativism, 461, 470, 484–498; and values, 462–463
- Croce, Benedetto, 145–146, 175, 370, 400
- Curtius, E. R., 563
- Dada, 188–189, 198
- Danto, Arthur, 139–140, 181, 183, 189, 364
- Dawson, Sheila, 100, 101–102
- Deleuze, Gilles, 551
- definition: Weitz on, 143–153 *passim*; Wittgenstein on, 147–148
- de Man, Paul, 531–533
- Derrida, Jacques, 465, 531, 532–533, 534
- denotation, 284, 291–296
- Dewey, John, 175, 400, 421, 422–425 *passim*, 434
- Dickie, George, 8, 15, 141, 142, 181, 183, 186–199
- différance* (Derrida), 571
- Dilthey, Wilhelm, 440, 449, 451, 464, 505, 577
- disinterestedness (Stolnitz), 103, 105–110 *passim*
- Donne, John, 375–376, 379, 387
- Drexler, Arthur, 181
- Ducasse, Curt, 145, 372, 421, 425
- Duchamp, Marcel, 81–83, 90–93 *passim*,

- 95–97 *passim*, 180, 182–183, 188–192
passim
- Droysen, Johann Gustav, 440–505
- “Easy Come, Easy Go” (Steen), 344
- Edgerton, Samuel, 343
- Eliot, T. S., 376–379 *passim*
- Emery, Clark, 469
- expression, 319–333 *passim*, 341
- Expression Theory(ies), 401–402, 407, 410,
412–416 *passim*, 424, 426, 427–428,
431–435 *passim*
- expressive qualities: Sircello on, 364,
400–420; Tormey on, 365, 421–454
- Fichte, Johann Gottlieb, 506
- fiction, 530
- Fingal’s Cave* (Opus 26: also, *The Hebrides*,
Mendelssohn), 333–334
- Fink, Eugen, 567
- First Quartet* (Bartok), 236
- forgery, 261–275 *passim*
- Foucault, Michel, 350, 465, 531, 534
- Fountain* (Duchamp), 96, 180, 188, 192,
195–198 *passim*
- Fried, Michael, 188–189, 195, 198
- Fry, Roger, 144, 146, 157
- fusion of horizons (Gadamer), 446–447, 467,
504, 589
- Fussell, Jr., Paul, 480
- Gadamer, Hans-Georg, 361, 365–366,
438–454, 464, 531, 534, 590
- Galilei, Vincenzo, 320–322, 436
- Gibson, J. J., 281, 286, 310, 313–314, 348
- Giovanni Arnolfini and His Wife* (van
Eyck), 343, 345, 351
- Glickman, Jack, 141, 253–256 *passim*
- Gombrich, E. H., 279–281 *passim*, 286, 297,
338, 339, 347–350 *passim*
- Goodman, Nelson, 140–141, 206, 279–281
passim, 312, 316, 338, 339, 347–350
passim, 361, 365, 366
- Gotshalk, D. W., 425
- Greenberg, Clement, 97
- Grice, H. P., 329
- Grizzly, the (Wolterstorff), 239–240
- Habermas, Jürgen, 534
- Hampshire, Stuart, 42–44 *passim*, 467–468
- Harding, D. W., 397
- Hart, H. L. A., 35–36
- Hegel, G. W. F., 505, 506, 509, 559, 565,
572–574 *passim*
- Heidegger, Martin, 361, 439, 441, 447, 449,
464, 500, 506, 507, 531, 533, 534, 558,
560, 566–570 *passim*
- Henson, Richard, 484
- hermeneutic circle, 577–578, 589–590
- hermeneutics, 364, 365–366; Collingwood
on, 508–510, 512–513; Gadamer on,
499–517; Hirsch on, 438–454; and
metaphor, 577–592; Ricoeur on, 577–592
- Hightower, John, 14
- Hiller, Johann Adam, 323
- Hirsch, Jr., E. D., 364, 365–366, 464, 469,
493, 494, 586
- Hospers, John, 401
- Humboldt, Wilhelm Freiherr von, 440, 587
- Hungerland, Isabel, 7, 86
- Husserl, Edmund, 9, 361, 364, 449, 464, 506,
533, 534, 570
- Hynes, Samuel, 469
- illocutionary acts, 193–194, 473–478 *passim*,
481
- Ingarden, Roman, 8–9, 204
- “innocent eye,” 279, 285, 347
- Intentional Fallacy, 361–364, 367–380,
383–394, 399
- intentionality, 362, 365
- Intentionality (Margolis), 339, 340–345
passim, 352–353
- intentions, author’s, 362, 363, 367–380, 502;
Cioffi on, 381–399; and interpretation,
364, 381–399
- interpretation, 226–228; Beardsley on,
466–483; Gadamer’s theory of, 438–454;
Hampshire on, 467–468; Hirsch on,
438–454; Margolis on, 468–470; meaning
of, 438–454 *passim*, 466
- intransitive attention (Vivas), 106, 107
- “is” of artistic identification (Danto),
159–162, 364
- Isenberg, Arnold, 461
- Iser, Wolfgang, 9
- Jarvie, I. C., 463
- Johnson, Samuel, 396–397
- Kant, Immanuel, 1, 402, 500, 506, 513, 570,
586

- Kenner, Hugh, 469
 Kennick, William, 174, 175–176
 Kermode, Frank, 469
 Kingsmill, Hugh, 395
 Kivy, Peter, 7–8, 281
 Kristeller, Paul Oskar, 323
 “Kubla Khan” (Coleridge), 372–374

 Lacan, Jacques, 519
Lady Reading a Letter at an Open Window
 (Vermeer), 340–341
 Langer, Susanne, 86, 87–88, 102, 225, 400
 Langfeld, H. S., 109
 language, Derrida on, 554–576
 Leavis, F. R., 388–389, 394–396 *passim*
 Leibniz, Gottfried Wilhelm, 572
 Lenin, V. I., 11, 25
 Lewis, C. S., 367
L.H.O.O.Q. (Duchamp), 81–83 *passim*,
 91–97 *passim*
L.H.O.O.Q. Shaved (Duchamp), 81–83
passim, 91–97 *passim*
 Longinus, 370
 “Love Song of J. Alfred Prufrock, The”
 (Eliot), 379, 384–386 *passim*, 390, 403–404,
 408–412 *passim*, 416
 Lowes, John Livingston, 373–374
 Luther, Martin, 440

 Macdonald, Margaret, 41–43 *passim*
Maninas, Las (Velasquez), 345, 350, 351
 Margolis, Joseph, 88–89, 95, 179, 206, 282,
 460, 463, 468–470
 Maritain, Jacques, 21
 Matthews, Robert, 140
 Matthiessen, F. O., 376–378 *passim*
 Maynard, Patrick, 280
 meaning, 473, 541, 582; Alston on, 473–478
passim, 493; Beardsley on, 493–494
 Meegeren, Hans Van, 261, 265, 267
 Meinecke, Friedrich, 448
Melancholia I (Durer), 254, 257
 Merleau-Ponty, Maurice, 8
 metaphor, 530–532; Aristotle on, 578,
 590–592 *passim*; Bain on, 592; Beardsley
 on, 584–585; Black on, 532, 535–552, 584;
 and hermeneutics, 577–592; interaction
 view (Black) of, 543–547 *passim*, 584;
 Nietzschean theme regarding, 533;
 Riceour on, 533, 577–592; Whateley on,
 542
 Mill, John Stuart, 312

Mistress, The (Cowley), 396–397
 Moore, G. E., 462
 Morgan, Douglas, 168–169
 Murry, John Middleton, 388

 Naturalistic Fallacy (Moore), 462
 Nietzsche, Friedrich, 352, 464, 507, 531, 532,
 533, 534, 566–567, 571
 nominalism, 346–347
 Nowell-Smith, P. H., 490, 491

Obedient unto Death (Rouault), 230–231,
 235
Opus III (Beethoven), 235, 243, 248, 249

 Pacheco, Francisco, 350
Pacific 231 (Honegger), 319–320
 Parker, D. W., 145–146
Pastoral (Beethoven), 324, 326, 328–333
passim, 335
 Peirce, Charles Sanders, 220
 perception: as artifactual, 307–309; Gibson
 on, 281, 286, 310–311, 313–314, 348;
 Gombrich on, 279–281, 286, 312, 347–350
passim; Goodman on, 279–281, 347–350
passim; and Intentionality, 342; Maynard
 on, 280; and perspective, 286–290,
 347–351; and picturing, 307–312 *passim*,
 314, 316–317; Wartofsky on, 281, 307–318
passim; Wollheim on, 280
 performances, 229, 241–246 *passim*
 perlocutionary acts, 473
 perspective, 286–290, 297–300, 347–351
 “Peter and the Wolf” (Prokofiev), 404, 416,
 418
 pictorial realism, 297–300
 pictures, 315–316
 Plato, 137, 506, 508, 512
 poem, Beardsley on, 479, 481
 Pole, David, 112–113
 prejudice (Gadamer), 438, 449–453 *passim*,
 464, 503
 psychical distance (Bullough), 101–103
 Putnam, Hilary, 139

 Rader, Melvin, 481
 “Rape of the Sabine Women, The”
 (Poussin), 402, 408, 409, 417–418
 Reid, L. A., 421
 realism, 297–300, 347
 relativism, 461, 464, 484–498
 representation: Bacon on perceptual, 342;

- Beethoven on musical, 324–333 *passim*;
and denotation, 284, 291–296; and
expression, 319–333 *passim*, 341; Galilei
on musical, 320–322; Gombrich on,
279–280, 312–313, 347–350 *passim*;
Goodman on, 279–280, 283–306, 316,
347–350 *passim*; and Intentionality
("aboutness"), 339, 340–345 *passim*,
352–353; Kivy on, 281–282, 319–337;
Margolis on, 282, 338–357; Maynard on,
280; in music, 319–337; and resemblance,
279–280, 283–286, 312–313, 345–350
passim; and realism, 297–300, 347;
Tormey on, 281; Wartofsky on, 307–318;
Wollheim on, 280
- Richards, I. A., 228, 543–544, 581, 582
- Ricoeur, Paul, 533
- Robinson, James M., 439
- Romantic Fallacy, 303, 369–370
- Rosenberg, Harold, 183
- Rousseau, Jean-Jacques, 323, 554–555, 564
- Russell, Bertrand, 352
- Ryle, Gilbert, 100, 173
- Sailing to Byzantium* (Yeats), 236, 238
- Santayana, George, 421, 425
- Sartre, Jean-Paul, 140, 338, 339, 342
- Saussure, Ferdinand de, 465, 533
- Schapiro, Meyer, 22
- Schleiermacher, Friedrich, 364, 365, 440,
449, 453, 577
- Schoenberg, Arnold, 72
- Schwartz, Delmore, 391
- Scott, Geoffrey, 12
- Scriven, Michael, 490–491
- Scruton, Roger, 462
- Searle, John, 350, 363, 529
- Sibley, Frank, 6–8 *passim*, 85, 86, 486–489
passim
- Simmel, Georg, 440
- Sircello, Guy, 364
- Sixth Symphony* (Nielsen), 432–433
- Socrates, 154–155, 370–371
- Sontag, Susan, 23, 25
- Speech-act theory, 363, 529
- Steinthal, Heymann, 440
- Stoll, Avrum, 368–369
- Stolnitz, Jerome, 100, 106, 108–111 *passim*,
115
- Strawson, P. F., 158, 250
- Sullivan, J. W. N., 325, 326
- Taylor, Paul, 15
- text, 440–443 *passim*, 445–447 *passim*,
464–465; Barthes on, 465, 478, 518–524;
Gadamer on, 499–517; Ricoeur on, 578,
580–581, 583, 586, 587–588
- Thibaudet, Albert, 520
- Tillyard, E. M. W., 367, 373
- To His Coy Mistress* (Marvell), 385, 386,
389
- Tolstoy, Leo, 145, 425, 509
- Tomas, Vincent, 101, 103, 114, 109–113
passim, 175–177 *passim*, 179, 422
- Tormey, Alan, 281, 365, 462
- Tormey, Judith, 281
- tradition, 442
- "Turn of the Screw, The" (James), 392, 395
- type/token distinction, 205–206, 220–225,
238–241, 250–251, 253–260; Glickman on,
178, 253–254; Margolis on, 253–260;
Wollheim on, 220–225; Wolterstorff on,
238–241
- universals, 346
- Urmson, J. O., 2–3, 5, 104
- "Valediction, A" (Donne), 375–376, 379,
387, 393
- "Variations II" (Cage), 404–405, 417
- Verklaarte Nacht* (Schoenberg), 229–230
- Véron, Eugène, 425
- Vico, Giambattista, 510
- Vivas, Eliseo, 100, 103, 105–106
- Wain, John, 393–394
- Walton, Kendall, 7
- Warhol, Andy, 162–163
- Wartofsky, Marx, 142, 281
- "Waste Land, The" (Eliot), 376–378, 389
- Weitz, Morris, 138, 179, 187
- Whateley, Richard, 339, 341–342
- Wilbur, Richard, 480
- Wilson, Edmund, 392
- Wimsatt, Jr., William, 362–363, 364,
383–390 *passim*, 393–394, 399
- Wisdom, John, 6
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 2, 6, 138, 147, 352,
381, 394, 396, 398, 473–474
- Wollheim, Richard, 189, 205, 206, 280
- Wolterstorff, Nicholas, 205–206
- Wordsworth, William, 469–471 *passim*, 473
- "work of art," 137–138
- "X-ray" art, 281