

# Contents

Preface xi

Acknowledgments xv

## PART ONE | THE CONSTITUTIONAL COURT

### 1. *The Historical Development of Italian Constitutional Adjudication* 3

#### 1. Constitutional Justice prior to 1948 3

##### 1.1 The First Italian Constitution 4

###### 1.1.1 Parliamentary Omnipotence 6

###### 1.1.2 The Lack of an Independent Judiciary 8

##### 1.2 Two Exceptions to the Absence of Judicial Review 8

#### 2. American-Style Constitutional Review during the Postwar Transition 11

#### 3. A Complex Conception: Designing the Constitutional Court 12

##### 3.1 The Constituent Assembly Debate 13

##### 3.2 The Incomplete Court 17

#### 4. A Long Gestation: The Activation of the Court 19

##### 4.1 Fundamental Choices 21

##### 4.2 The Delay in the Parliamentary Election of Justices 23

#### 5. The Birth of a New System of Constitutional Adjudication 24

##### 5.1 A Context of Uncertainty 24

##### 5.2 The Court's Rules of Procedure 28

##### 5.3 The "Italian *Marbury v. Madison*": Judgment 1/1956 30

#### 6. Taking a Deep Breath: The Court's Relationship to the Body Politic 34

#### 7. The "Eras" of the Constitutional Court 37

#### 8. The Present and Future of the Court: Constitutional Justice in Global Context 39

2. *The Constitutional Court: Rules and Model* 41

1. The System of Constitutional Justice Designed by the Constituent Assembly 41
2. Composition 43
  - 2.1 The Principle of Collegiality 46
3. Jurisdiction 49
  - 3.1 Conflicts of Attributions 49
  - 3.2 Charges against the President of the Republic 50
  - 3.3 Admissibility of Referenda 51
  - 3.4 Judicial Review of Statutes 52
4. The System of Judicial Review 52
  - 4.1 The Direct Method of Judicial Review 53
  - 4.2 The Incidental Method of Judicial Review 54
    - 4.2.1 A Judge in the Course of a Judicial Proceeding Must Raise a Question 54
    - 4.2.2 The Question of Constitutional Legitimacy Must Be Relevant and Not Manifestly Unfounded 57
    - 4.2.3 The Question Can Be Raised by the Parties or by the Judge on His Own Motion 59
5. Acts that Are Subject to Judicial Review 60
6. The Italian Model of Judicial Review: "Cooperative" and "Networked" 63

3. *Forms and Methods of Judicial Reasoning* 67

1. A Concurrent Plurality of Methods of Interpretation 67
2. Reasonableness, Proportionality, and Balancing of Values 74
3. The Use of Transnational Law and Comparative Method 78
4. The Decisions of the Constitutional Court and Their Effects 82

## PART TWO | CONSTITUTIONAL JURISPRUDENCE

4. *Key Rights and Freedoms* 95

1. The Rights and Duties of Citizens in the Constitution 95
2. The Fundamental Principles of Inviolability and Equality 97
  - 2.1 Inviolable Rights 97
  - 2.2 Equality 101
3. Personal Liberty 107
4. Freedom of Religion 114
5. Life, Reproduction, Health 122
  - 5.1 Right to Life 122
  - 5.2 Reproductive Freedom 123
  - 5.3 Health 129
  - 5.4 End of Life 132

6. Family 136
7. Social Rights 144
8. Citizens and Migrants 151
5. *Powers and Conflicts* 155
  1. Relation of Powers and the Unique Role of the Judiciary 155
  2. Executive vs. President of the Republic 159
  3. Executive vs. Parliament 164
  4. Judiciary vs. Parliament 172
  5. Judiciary vs. President of the Republic 177
6. *Regionalism* 183
  1. Not "Federal" but "Regional" 183
  2. The 2001 Constitutional Reform of the Regional System 186
  3. Statutory Autonomy 189
  4. Legislative Autonomy 192
    - 4.1 How to Define a Matter? From the Literal Meaning to the "Prevalence Doctrine" 193
    - 4.2 The Strong "Centripetal" Pull in the Distribution of Powers between State and Regions 194
      - 4.2.1 "Cross-Cutting" Competences 195
      - 4.2.2 "Catch-all" Competences 197
      - 4.2.3. "Detailed" Principles 198
  5. Administrative Autonomy: The Principle of Subsidiarity 199
    - 5.1 "Vertical" vs. "Horizontal" Subsidiarity 199
    - 5.2 The "Subsidiarity Call" Doctrine 200
    - 5.3 Horizontal Subsidiarity: The "Social Liberty" Doctrine 202
  6. Financial Autonomy 203
7. *National Constitutional Adjudication in the European Space* 205
  1. The European Clauses of the Italian Constitution 205
  2. The Constitutional Court and the European Union 207
    - 2.1 Constitutional Resistance to the Supremacy of European Legislation 208
    - 2.2 Limitations of Sovereignty 210
    - 2.3 Constitutional Surrender to the Supremacy of EU Legislation 212
    - 2.4 The Last Citadel: The Doctrine of "Counter-Limits" 214
    - 2.5 The Constitutional Court and the Preliminary Ruling to the Court of Justice of the European Union 217
      - 2.5.1 The Constitutional Court as a "Sovereign" Judge 218

- 2.5.2 A One-Way Conversation: Lower Courts as the Official “Speakers” of the National Legal System 219
- 2.5.3 The First Preliminary Ruling of the Italian Constitutional Court to the Court of Justice of the European Union 220
- 3. The Constitutional Court and the European Convention on Human Rights 222
  - 3.1 The European Convention on Human Rights: A General Overview 222
  - 3.2 From “Constitutional Patriotism” to “Integration through Interpretation” 224
  - 3.3 Interpreting Domestic Law “According to” the European Convention 225
  - 3.4 The Turning Point: The European Convention on Human Rights’ Special Rank 226

#### CONCLUSION: THE “ITALIAN STYLE” IN GLOBAL CONSTITUTIONAL ADJUDICATION 231

- 1. The Globalization of Constitutional Adjudication 231
- 2. The “Italian Style” in Constitutional Adjudication 234
  - 2.1 Institutional Relationality 235
  - 2.2 Interpretive Relationality 238
- 3. The Sources of the Italian Constitutional Court’s Distinctive Voice 239
- 4. An “Italian Style” for a Pluralistic Global Constitutionalism? 242

#### APPENDIX I: THE CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF ITALY 243

#### APPENDIX II: JUSTICES 1955 TO PRESENT 277

#### APPENDIX III: BASIC STATISTICS ON THE CONSTITUTIONAL COURT 287

#### TABLE OF CASES 293

#### INDEX 301