Contents

	Acknowledgements	vii
	Introduction	1
1	History: challenges and detours	11
2	History and hermeneutics	36
3	History, hermeneutics and Ricoeur	61
4	History and memory	89
	Conclusion	116
	Notes	121
	Bibliography	179
	Index	195

Index

aboutness 78, 83
agency 5, 12, 67, 89
anamnesis 99
anthropocentrism 51
appropriation 78–80
archival research 10, 15, 33, 44, 58, 73, 87, 106
Aristotle 97, 99–100
authenticity 40, 57–8, 69, 72, 107, 109
authorial intention 64–6, 71, 74, 76, 79, 81
authorial meaning 42, 48, 64, 66

Barthes, Roland 30, 67 Bauman, Zygmunt 9, 30, 37 belief 20, 49, 97, 100, 115 British Library 1

Carlyle, Thomas 95, 102, 168, 181
Carr, David 24, 104–6
commemoration 58, 90, 94, 96
communication 39, 41, 44, 67–8, 75–6, 79, 81, 83, 88, 92
consciousness: false 113; historical 20, 29, 47–8, 54–5
conversation 39, 56–9, 67–8, 70–3, 90–3
conversational exchanges 39, 91–2
conversational models 39, 61, 73, 88
Croce, Benedetto 24, 28, 42, 49, 91
Cubitt, Geoffrey 90, 95, 99–101

deconstruction 22, 24, 100 decontextualization 65 Derrida, Jacques 23, 68 Dilthey, Wilhelm: and archival labour 73; and common humanity 95; and hermeneutics 37–9, 64, 117;

and historical discipline 21-2; and historical methodology 6, 44-5, 51; and science 45-7, 49-50, 53, 57, 62, 80-1,85discourse: directional nature of 76–7; historical 4, 16, 90, 105-6, 114; meaning and intention 71; spoken and written 62, 65, 67, 69-72, 75-7, 80, 82, 88, 91, 114, 118-19; transcription of 93 distanciation 40, 57, 59, 61, 75-9, 84, 88, 90, 92, 113, 119-20 documentary analysis 46, 63, 77, 118 documentary evidence 25, 62, 74, 82, 112, 114–15, 120 documents: reading 74-5; reliance on 27; trust in 112 dreams 63, 102-3, 177 Durkheim, Émile 45, 102

education, history of 2, 34–5 empathy 42, 73, 79, 84–5, 87–8 empirical enquiry 21 empiricism 17, 19 Enlightenment 36, 40, 53–5, 57, 96, 99 epistemology: and hermeneutics 51; and history 12, 25, 59, 113; realist 6, 11, 23, 26, 46, 55; and relativism 41 ethnomethodology 39, 91 eyewitness authority 109

fiction 4, 25, 105–6 finitude 16, 29, 31, 47, 51, 59, 62, 119 Fogel, Robert 22, 32 formalism 2 Foucault, Michel 58, 67 Freud, Sigmund 101–3, 110–11, 113 Gadamer, Hans-Georg: dispute with Habermas 54; and conversation 67–8, 118; and distanciation 79; and effective history 29, 57–8; and hermeneutics 39, 50–3; and interpretation 57; and intertemporal dialogue 44; and ontology 50; and prejudices 48, 55–6; and truth 59 Geisteswissenschaften 46, 49, 53 Gorst, Sir John 27–8

Habermas, Jürgen 54 Halbwachs, Maurice 77, 99, 101-4, 107, 109–11 Heidegger, Martin 37-8, 43, 45, 50-2, 56, 58 Hempel, Carl 85-6 hermeneutic naiveté 20 hermeneutic thinking 49-50, 75 hermeneutics: definition of 36, 57; attitudes towards 1; development of 50-1; and dialogue 68, 94; double 27; elements of 83; focus of 51–2; foundation of modern 40-1; general 40-1, 44-5, 50, 52, 139, 145; in Heidegger 37–8, 52; and history 37–9, 117; and interpretation 105-6; and memory 31, 89; and methodology 53; model of the text 74; need for 39; and ontology 45; origins of term 9; philosophical 38, 59; psychologistic 43, 53-4, 64; Romantic 43, 45, 48, 50, 53, 58–9, 65, 78, 83, 118; and structuralism 80; and subjectivity 66; of suspicion 113; and understanding 41–2; and verification 114

Hirsch, E. D., 63–5, 81–2, 151
historians: agency of 5, 12; attitudes
to hermeneutics 38; authority of
14, 53; construction of narrative
87; documentary 34, 115, 120;
internal dialogue of 67–8; intimacy
with sources 27–8; and journalism
30; mainstream 2, 4, 7, 58; and
methodology 11–13, 37; motivations
of 54, 75; and narrative 106, 108–9;
objectives of 116; oral 70, 115,
120; practical activity of 17, 20;
professional self-presentation of 2–3,
6, 15–16; reaction to postmodernist
critique 23; self-effacement of 48–9;

and sources 114–15; and theory 18; traditional 1, 32–3, 59; training of 15 historical: conscience 28; distance 26, 57–8; documents 26, 52, 56, 63, 78, 107, 114; enquiry 21, 30, 70; intelligence 11; method 14–15, 38, 48, 50, 57, 97, 107; research 2, 6, 8–9, 12, 27, 39, 43, 52, 54, 59, 85, 106; scholarship 9, 46, 55, 72, 91, 99 historicality 44, 47–8, 50–1, 53, 59 historicity 28–9, 38, 49, 51–4, 56, 59, 79

historiography 5, 7, 9, 18, 30, 37, 54, 75, 85, 101, 106–7

history: academic 6, 13, 40, 45, 52, 95-6; and anamnesis 99; awareness of 52, 59; books 19, 22, 107; critiques of 16–21; discipline of 8, 13, 31, 41, 45, 95, 97, 99; documentary 62, 88, 97, 100; effacement of historian in 30-1; effective 29, 53, 57-9; empirical 20-1, 58; epistemological ground for 6; and fiction 25; founding fathers of 45; ground of 101-2, 117, 120; Heidegger on 51; and hermeneutics 45; historians' presentation of 3; and human life 29; interpretive openness of 5; and journalism 64; mainstream 10, 100, 110; metaphorical image of 39; and narrative 16, 30, 85-6, 105; objective and subjective 24; oral see oral history; philosophy of 3, 17–18, 21; proof in 20; public 3, 95; reader expectations of 22; as science 46-7; and temporal distance 41; theoretical tensions in 4-7; traditional 7-8, 21-2, 59; and truth 7-8, 11, 24, 59, 105; and writing 70

Hobsbawm, Eric 34, 70, 72 Holocaust 114 horizons, fusion of 55–6, 59, 61, 79 Hutton, Patrick 89–90, 94, 99, 101, 103

identity: fragility of 111; idem- and ipse-, 109; narrative 89, 104–5, 107–11, 117, 119; national 99; personal 110, 176

Iggers, George 12, 46 imagination 5, 13, 15, 24–8, 30, 97–8, 101, 120

immediacy 37, 45, 64, 90, 92 indexicality 91 intentionality 28, 47, 58, 66, 83, 98 interpretation: and authorial intention 63-4, 66-7, 74; de-psychologizing of 66; defence of 13; and distanciation 78, 88; effective 42; epistemology of 30; goal of 50; hermeneutic 31, 36, 53, 58, 113, 117; historical 5, 7, 11–12, 16, 78, 82, 106; limits of 44, 117-18; and narrative 23-4; object of 45; paradox of 14–15; problems of 26-7; and relativism 7; and representation 114; scope of 77; and surplus meaning 70; and temporal distance 72; and truth 6-7, 11-12, 59, 82; types of 81; use of term 4, 41 interpretivism 8, 12

Jenkins, Keith 7, 18 journalism 64

Kaplan, David 5, 58, 61, 78, 110 knowledge: archaeology of 15; critique of 25; historical 2, 4, 6, 12, 14, 17, 34, 41, 45, 49–50, 54, 57, 84, 95, 107, 115; inside and outside 46; and memory 100; objective 13, 55

labour: historical 28, 30, 33; methodological 71 language: and hermeneutics 39; of history 16, 56; polysemic 71; in structural theory 40; and trust 113 Lévi-Strauss, Claude 81 linguistic contexts, normative 65, 71, 78, 83, 118 linguistic turn 1, 21, 33 linguistics 61, 80, 85 literary theory 2, 4, 16, 61, 117

Marx, Karl 45, 86, 113
Marxism 78
meaning: appropriation of 79; and distanciation 76; and intention 71, 74, 77; potential 82; and reading 81; surplus 65, 68, 70, 74–6, 79, 88, 92, 113, 118–19
memory: archived 115; collective 77, 89–90, 99–100, 102–4, 109–11; and commemoration 58; concerns of 10;

critique of 25; and hermeneutics 31;

and history 34-5, 57, 89-90, 94-8, 103, 105, 107, 109, 115, 119; and identity 102, 105, 108, 115; living 2, 90, 94, 107, 112-13; modes of 111; and narrative 108, 110, 119-20; operation of 34, 63, 89–90, 94, 98-9; personal 25, 89-90, 100-1, 108-10; and place 58, 103, 111-12; and psychonanalysis 101; reliability of 62-3, 103-5; in Ricoeur 62; as social fact 102; spatial setting of 75; and speech 71; work 8, 99, 101, 111 methodological openness 120 methodological suppositions 116 methodology: challenges to 1-2; historical 3, 8, 44, 63, 79–80, 96; implicit 12; interpretive 6, 11, 26, 46; principles of 4, 7, 53 Mill, J. S., 46 mneme 99 modernism 18, 20, 130, 132-3, 183 modernity 58, 94, 109 Munslow, Alun 18, 20 myth 4, 29, 52, 81, 96, 108

knowledge 105; and meaning 89–90; theory 105; and time 119; and truth 105 narrativism 25 narrativity 86, 105 non-ostensive reference 75–6, 78, 81,

narrative: constructions 7, 23-4; and

objectification 25, 47, 55, 79
objectivism 28, 55
objectivity, historical 57
oral history: and documentary history
88; integrity of 107–8; interviews 8,
35, 62, 72, 75, 91–2, 98, 104, 107,
111–12; and memory 2, 10, 90,
103, 109, 119; movement 90, 95;
practitioners of see historians, oral;
transcriptions 26, 72–3, 92–4
ostensive reference 76, 83, 90–1, 93–4,
119
otherness 57, 61, 110

pastness 19, 67, 94, 98, 100 performativity 67 pharmakon 68, 96, 115, 118 phenomenology 61, 64, 75, 102 philology 41 philosophers 8, 13, 18-19, 21-2, 30-1, 65, 116 philosophy, European 4, 20 Plato 67, 69, 72 plurivocity 82 polysemy 39, 71, 75, 82 postmodernism: attitude to history 20, 59, 95, 100; disciplinary challenges of 3-4, 6, 13, 54; and historical interpretation 11-12; and memory 94; opposition to 1, 22; and philosophy of history 18, 21 pre-understanding 44, 52-3, 56, 75, 81,83 prejudices 48, 53-6 professional practice 13, 15 psychological interpretation 44

rationalism 54, 96-7 reader-response theory 70 recordings 90-4 reference 119 referentiality 106 repetition 96, 99-101, 103-4, 111-12 research procedures 44 Ricoeur, Paul: critique of Gadamer 68, 79; on Dilthey 62; hermeneutic thinking of 61-2, 80, 87-8; theory of the text 73-4, 76-7, 84; and authorial intention 64, 66; and detours 9; and discourse 69, 71, 78-80, 82-3; and distanciation 77-8; and historians' agency 5; and identity 109-10, 117; and interpretation 65-7, 70, 82-4, 114, 118; and memory 96-100, 104, 111; and narrative 85-7, 104-7; and reading 73-4, 118; and structuralism

Samuel, Raphael 2–3, 97, 108
Saussure, Ferdinand de 40, 42, 80
Schleiermacher, F. D. E., 39–45, 47–8, 50, 58, 64, 83, 116
sciences, classification of 46
scientific method 53, 57
self: foundational 109; and memory 102
selfhood 61, 109–10, 119
semantic autonomy 74, 88, 118–20
semantics 81, 83
semiological challenge 80

Romanticism 44-5, 50, 62, 96

semiotics 1, 80 Skinner, Quentin 7, 15, 19, 23, 64-7, 71, 73–5, 83, 118 social theory 17 sources: documentary 34, 63; nondocumentary 1; openness of 91; primary 15, 34 speech: alienated 68; anterior 63, 68; conversational 71; situational specificity of 72 speech-act theory 30, 65-6, 71, 118 spelling ear 92 storytelling 86-7, 104-6, 108 structural analysis 19, 81, 83-4 structuralism 2, 40, 56, 62, 80-1, 85 subjectivism 79 subjectivity 42, 47, 58, 66, 73, 80 suspicion 17-18, 37, 63, 96, 98, 107, 113, 115 symbolic interactionism 39

Tedlock, Dennis 92-4

97

temporality 28-9, 51, 62, 64, 75, 78, 84-6, 88, 97, 111 textual objectifications 47 theology 9, 117 throwness 52-3 Thucydides 72, 100 time: human 87-8, 104-5, 119; social 77; understanding of 8-9; unrepresentability of 29-30 totality 37, 45, 48-9, 55, 81, 86, 118 traces 13-14, 77, 87, 118; material 24, 34, 37, 70 tradition 53-4, 56-7, 78-9, 96, 100; and historical consciousness 47; and modernism 20 truth: conceptions of 59; correspondence ideal of 107; and everyday life 25; historical 6–7, 11–12, 14, 24, 26, 34, 50, 53–4, 112, 120; and interpretation 6-7, 11-12,

temporal distance 39-40, 57, 63-5, 78,

understanding: and explanation 46, 62, 79–81, 83–5, 96, 106; hermeneutic 80; historical 6, 8, 40, 42, 44–5, 48, 50, 53, 55–7, 59, 75, 84–6; intuitive

82, 118; and memory 105, 112; and

method 79; past as 6; and speech 71;

standards of 24; use of term 4

and truth 45
validation 6, 16, 36, 82
witness, bearing 105, 108, 111–12, 114, 119

46, 85; model of 43–4; narrative 86;

world of the text 74, 76, 88 writing: historical 24-7, 84; and memory 92, 103; and speech 62, 67-8, 73; and surplus meaning 70, 76; transformational nature of 74 Yates, Frances 99