

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
Introduction	ix
Part I Relativism	1
1 Five varieties of cognitive relativism	3
Part II Incommensurability	19
2 Kuhn's changing concept of incommensurability	21
Appendix: Incommensurability and the indeterminacy of translation	34
3 Kuhn's ontological relativism	42
4 Taxonomic incommensurability	66
Part III Untranslatability	81
5 In defence of untranslatability	83
Appendix: Translation and languagehood	106
6 Incommensurability, translation and understanding	110
Part IV Rationality	123
7 The problem of rational theory choice	125
8 Judgement and rational theory choice	135

Part V	Naturalism	147
9	Rationality, relativism and methodological pluralism	149
10	Normative naturalism and the challenge of relativism	165
11	Popper's metamethodological conventionalism and the turn to naturalism	185
<i>Bibliography</i>		200
<i>Index</i>		206

Index

- Abrantes, P. 183
- Achinstein, P. 114, 121
- aims 77-8, 137, 145, 165, 167-8,
170, 173-4, 176-7, 180, 188-
91, 193-6
- algorithm xiv, 24, 45, 127-8,
130, 135-9, 141-2, 166
- antirealism xiii, 3, 42, 61, 66,
72, 76-7
- Barnes, B. 157, 159, 164
- Bartley, W.W. 182, 184
- Bernstein, R. xiii, 134
- bilingual 89, 92, 113
- Blackburn, S. 109
- Bloor, D. 157, 159, 164
- Brown, H.I. xiv, 134, 136-7,
142-6
- categories 14-5, 29, 32-3, 42-3,
49-60, 66-72
- causal theory of reference 12-3,
51-2, 73, 79
- Chalmers, A. 5, 134, 149, 153
- charity, principle of 92-4, 108,
117-20, 122
- classification 29, 33, 49-50, 52-
5, 67-8, 71-2, 78, 96-7, 99
- coherence
methodological 129, 140-1,
152
- conceptual xi-ii, 3, 7-9, 12-3,
16, 47, 83-5, 87-91, 93-4,
111-3, 120
- comparison of theoretical con-
tent 27, 31-2, 40, 47, 59, 74-
5, 111
- conceptual relativism, see rela-
tivism, conceptual
- conceptual schemes xi-ii, 3, 14-
5, 42-3, 46-9, 53, 60, 95, 99-
100
- constructive idealism, see con-
structivism
- constructivism 12, 14, 48-9, 52,
55-6, 59
- convention 58, 76-8, 116, 139,
157-8, 185-93, 195-7
- convention T 100, 102
- conventionalism 191-2
meta-methodological xiv,
172, 174, 179, 183, 185-6,
195-7
- criteria
methodological xi, 4-5, 43-5,
127-35, 138-42, 144-6, 152,
154, 157, 187-8, 194
of categorization 33, 50, 67-
70

- of languagehood 95, 97-8, 100, 106
- of demarcation 188, 190, 194
- problem of criterion 145, 175
- Davidson, D. xi-ii, 46-7, 61-2, 70, 83-8, 91-106, 108-9, 121-2
- dephlogisticated air 14, 48, 69, 88
- descriptive vs. normative 6, 14, 156-8, 172, 185
- Devitt, M. 39, 62, 120
- direct language learning 88, 90, 92, 113-5, 118-20
- Doppelt, G. 44, 61, 149, 163
- Duhem, P. 191
 - Quine-Duhem thesis 119
- effability 59, 80, 117
 - principle of 115-6, 120, 122
- Ellis, B. 134, 149, 163
- Elster, J. 137
- empiricism ix-x, xiv, 4, 15, 25, 125-6, 166-7, 186, 189, 195, 197
- Enç, B. 63
- epistemological relativism, see relativism, epistemological
- falsificationism 125, 150, 166, 191-3
- Feyerabend, P. x-xiv, 5, 9, 21-2, 25, 40, 62, 66, 83, 85-6, 90, 108, 110-2, 120-1, 125, 130, 134, 149, 151, 163, 166, 195
- Field, H. 80, 120
- Fine, A. 63, 79
- Frege, G. 122
- Goldman, A. 182-3
- Gower, B. 134, 149, 153, 163
- Hacking, I. xv, 40, 52-5, 63-4
- holism 33, 47, 50-1, 69
 - local 69
- Horwich, P. 65
- Hoyningen-Huene, P. vii, 40, 49, 56, 63-4
- hypothetical imperative 172-3, 175, 195-6
- idealism 11-2, 16, 26, 39, 43, 48-9, 52, 60, see also constructivism
- incoherence, see coherence
- incommensurability viii-xiv, 9-10, 16, 21-7, 29-38, 40, 42-3, 45-7, 51, 60-2, 66-7, 69-75, 77, 83-92, 97, 101, 108, 110-2, 114-5, 120-1, 166
- indeterminacy of translation 21, 27-9, 34-8, 40-1, 66
- induction 4, 119, 178-80
- inductivism 150, 153, 177-8, 193
- interpretation 87-90, 92-4, 118, 120
- intuitionism 172, 186, 193-5, 197
- judgement 13-4, Chapter 8 *passim*
- Kant, I. 14, 49, 55-6, 60, 63-4, 199
- Katz, J. 122
- Kitcher, P. 61-2, 80, 120-1
- Kripke, S. 63
- Kroon, F. 63, 79
- Kuhn, T.S. x-xiv, 5, 9, 11, 16, Chapters 2-4 *passim*, 82-7, 90, 108, 110-2, 120-1, 125, 127-9, 134, 136, 146, 149, 152-3, 163, 166, 174, 183-4, 195
- Lakatos, I. 44, 134, 149, 163, 166, 182-3, 186, 192-5, 199
- language acquisition 92, 94, 113, 115
- Laudan, L. vii, xii, xiv, 5, 6, 134, 149, 153-4, 159, 163-4, Chapter 10 *passim*, 185-6, 189, 192-3, 195-9
- LeGrand, H. 134
- Leplin, J. 184

- lexical structure 51, 56-8, 70-2
- lexical taxonomy 71-2
- lexicons 51, 56-60, 63, 70-8, 80
- Mandelbaum, M. 39, 62
- Martin, M. 80, 120
- Masterman, M. 38
- meaning variance 43-7, 51
- metalanguage 47, 75, 87, 100, 103, 107-8, 111
- metamethodology xiv, 166, 171-2, 177-80, 185-6, 192-5, 197
- method ix-x, xiv, 4, 23, 43, 125-6, 128, 130, 135, 149-55, 161
 - Chapters 10-11 *passim*
- methodology ix-xi, xiii-xiv, 21, 23-4, 43-5, 60, 66, Chapter 7 *passim*, 135-6, 138, Chapters 9-11 *passim*
- mind dependence 12, 54, 78-9
- mind independence 12, 14, 16, 52, 55-6, 60, 64, 78
- Musgrave, A. vii, 62
- natural kind 42, 52-3, 55-60, 67, 70-1
- natural kind term 51, 70, 77
- naturalism xi, xiv, Chapter 10 *passim*, 183, 185-6, 193-7
- Newton-Smith, W.H. 134, 145, 164
- Nola, R. vii, 39, 62-3, 79, 198-9
- no-overlap principle 59, 67, 70-1, 73
- nominalism 14, 52-4, 64
 - transcendental nominalism 52-3, 55-6, 59
- non-algorithmic model of rationality, see algorithm
- norms 129, 157-8, 190, 196
- normative 6, 130, 133, 145, 155-9, 161, 185, 189
- normative naturalism xiv, Chapter 10 *passim*, 185, 195
- object language 75, 100, 111
- objectivity ix-x, 3-5, 10-1, 15-6, 21, 42, 44-6, 60, 77, 125-6, 132-4, 142, 144-5, 150, 152, 154, 157, 161-3, 168-9, 171, 174, 191-2, 195, 197
- observation ix-x, 4, 14-5, 21-2, 24-5, 46, 48, 59, 92, 100, 119, 126, 129, 150, 197
- ontological relativism, see relativism, ontological
- paradigms 5, 11, 21-7, 42-9, 54-5, 60, 66, 70, 78, 151-3, 174
- phenomenal world 49, 52, 55-9, 63
- pluralism xi, xiii-iv, 128-9, 131, 135, 149-50, 152, 154-6, 161
- Poincaré, H. 191
- Popper, K.R. xiv, 4, 44, 129, 134, 149-50, 163-4, 172, 174, 178, 182-4, Chapter 11 *passim*
- principle, see no-overlap, charity, effability, R_1
- problem of the criterion, see criteria
- Putnam, H. xi-ii, 16, 61, 63, 65, 70, 83-94, 111-2, 120, 134, 164
- Quine, W.V.O. xii, 21, 27-9, 34-8, 40-1, 66
- Quine-Duhem thesis 119
- R_1 177-80, 184
- rationality ix-xi, xiii-xv, 4-8, 10, 16, 42-5, 60-1, 120, 125-7, 130, 132-3, 135-7, 139, 142-5, Chapter 9 *passim*, 165-71, 186, 194-5, 198
- rationality relativism, see relativism, rationality
- realism xii-v, 53, 55, 60-1, 64, 66, 77-8
- reality 3, 11-6, 26, 42, 46, 48-9, 52, 55-60, 63-4, 66, 72, 75-9, 95-100

- reference xiii, 16, 26-9, 31-2, 40, 51-2, 61, 70-4, 79, 83-5, 88, 110-1, 121
- relativism ix-xiv, Chapter 1 *passim*, 24, 39, 42-9, 55-8, 60-2, 126-7, 132-3, 135, 149-58, 160-1, 164, Chapter 10 *passim*, 185, 192, 195
- cognitive 3-4
- conceptual xi, 14-6, 42-8, 60, 62
- epistemic xi, 132-3
- epistemological xi, xiv, 10, 12, 16, 44, 126, 149, 151, 165, 185, 192, 195
- ontological xi-ii, 11-3, 16, Chapter 3 *passim*
- rationality xi, xiv, 4-8, 10, 16, 42, 45, 132-3, Chapters 9-10 *passim*
- sceptical 153, 170-1, 175-8, 181
- truth xi, 7-10, 12, 16, 59-60, 80
- Rescher, N. viii, 183
- Rorty, R. 65, 109
- Rosenberg, A. 179, 184
- rules xiv, 5, 42, 45, 58, 127-30, 135-6, 141-5, 151-2, 161, 166-7, 172-82, Chapter 11 *passim*
- sceptical relativism, see relativism, sceptical
- scepticism, see criteria, problem of
- Scheffler, I. 39, 44, 61-2, 120-1, 149
- scientific method, methodology x-xi, xiv, 4-5, 125-6, 128-31, 135, 140, 149-55, 161, 165, 170-1, 173-4
- scientific realism xii, xiv-v, 60, 66, 77-8
- Shapere, D. 38-9, 44, 47, 61-2, 70
- Siegel, H. 40, 44, 61, 134, 149, 163
- standards xiv, 3-7, 12, 15, 21, 23-4, 42-5, 60, 66, 68, 126, 132, Chapters 9-10 *passim*
- subjective 126, 134, 144-5, 162-3, 192
- sublanguage 47, 86-7, 97, 102-3, 111, 115-7
- Tarski, A. 100-2, 104, 106, 122
- taxonomic 42-3, 48-52, 54-8, 60, 63, 66-72, 77-9
- taxonomy xi, 33, 51, 67-8, 70-2, 78
- theory change 11, 21, 42, 45, 67, 78, 110
- theory choice xiii-iv, 4, 43-5, 60, Chapters 7-8 *passim*, 150, 162
- theory dependence
- of observation 24, 48, 126
- of phenomenal world 56-7
- theory-laden 75, 150
- translation xii-iii 9, 21-2, 27-42, 48-51, 66-9, 71-5, 78-80, Chapters 5-6 *passim*
- Trigg, R. 121
- truth xi, 3, 7, 14, 16-7, 31, 46, 57-60, 64-7, 72-80, 92-107, 117-20, 127, 133, 156, 161, 164, 172, 183, 186, 188, 191, 193-6, 198
- correspondence theory of 57-9, 67, 75-8
- internalist conception of 65, 80
- minimalist theory of 65
- redundancy theory of 64
- verificationist theory of 59
- truth relativism, see relativism, truth
- understanding xii-iii, 23, 84, 88-93, 97, 99-100, 102, 105-6, Chapter 6 *passim*

untranslatability, see
translation
value judgement 186, 191-2,
194
values, epistemic or scientific
24, 45, 128, 151, 153, 162,

191-2
verificationism 59, 97-8, 109
world change 11-2, 25-7, 32,
42-3, 48-9, 53-5, 78
Worrall, J. xiv, 5-6, 134, 149,
163-4, Chapter 10 *passim*