## Contents

List of Figures pa	ige viii
List of Tables	ix
Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction	1
Why Study the Rule of Law?  Judicial Independence and the Rule of Law  Why Do Some Countries Have Independent Courts and	4 5
Others Do Not?	6
Judicial (In)Dependence in Russia and Ukraine Roadmap	9 11
1. What Is Judicial Independence?	14
Institutional Judicial Independence Behavioral Judicial Independence Decisional Judicial Independence Independent from Whom? Judicial Independence from Different Principals Capacity vs. Willingness Conceptualization of Judicial Independence Judicial Independence at Different Levels of Abstraction	14 16 18 19 20 23
Conclusion	<sup>2</sup> 3
<ol><li>Judges and Politicians: Theories about the Origins of Judicial Independence</li></ol>	26
Structural Insulation Theories of Judicial Independence: How to Make It Impossible for Politicians to Pressure the Courts	27

	Strategic Actor Theories of Judicial Independence: When Do	
	Politicians Offer Independent Courts?	28
	Strategic Actor Theories of Judicial Independence: When Do	
	Judges Resist Pressure from Politicians?	30
	Judicial Independence and Regime Type: Why Are	
	Independent Courts a Rarity Outside of the World's	
	Consolidated Democracies?	32
	Political Competition and Judicial Independence in Emerging	
	Democracies – A Strategic Pressure Theory	38
	Regime Age and Independent Courts	41
	Conclusion	43
		17
3.	What Can a Focused Comparison of Russia and Ukraine	
	Tell Us about the Origins of Independent Courts?	44
	Existing Measures of Judicial Independence	45
	Multistage Win-Rate Analysis as a Method of Measuring	12
	Judicial Independence	47
	Measuring Judicial Independence from Politicians in Russia	
	and Ukraine	50
	Why Russia and Ukraine?	52
	Similarities between Russia and Ukraine	52
	Structural Insulation of the Judiciary in Russia and Ukraine	55
	Political Competition in Russia and Ukraine	60
	Theoretical Predictions about Judicial Independence	
	in Russia and Ukraine	66
4.	The Role of Ukrainian and Russian Courts in the Provision	
	of Free and Fair Elections: Judicial Independence from	
	Politicians during the 2002 Rada and the	-
	2003 Duma Campaign	68
	What Are Electoral Registration Disputes?	70
	The Datasets	77
	What Can a Plaintiff's Political Affiliation Tell Us about	
	Judicial Independence?	79
	Measuring the Independent Variables	81
	Administrative Resources and Case Merit: Why 2002–2003	
	Progovernment Candidates Should Have Been Losing	
	in Court	91
	Sartori Selection Model of Court Appeal-Rate and Win-Rate	93
	Effect Magnitude as a Measure of Judicial Independence	97

Contents	vii
Implications of the Electoral Dispute Analysis for Judicial Independence Theories	99
The Role of Ukrainian and Russian Courts in the Provision of Press Freedom: Judicial Independence in Defamation	
Lawsuits, 1998–2003	102
The Statutory Framework for Defamation Lawsuits	105
The Datasets Loss, Victory, and "Moral Damage" Awards: Multistage Win-Rate Analysis of Judicial Independence from	107
Politicians in Defamation Disputes	112
Judicial Independence from Other Principals	122 126
Conclusion	120
6. Politicians' Capacity to Pressure the Courts	128
Ex Parte Communication	129
Telephone Law	131
Internal Dependence in the Russian and Ukrainian Judiciaries How Superior Court Judges Influence Lower Court Judg Links between the Judiciary's Leadership and the Presidential	es 134
Administration	139
Supporting Agencies as Supervisors, Rather Than Assistants Implications for Judicial Independence Theories	143 146
7. Politicians' Willingness to Pressure the Courts,	0
1998–2004 and Beyond	148
A Tale of Two Municipal Elections	148
A Tale of Two Lawyers for the Opposition	155
Tales of Maverick Judges	157 161
Judicial (In)dependence in Russia and Ukraine, Post-2004 Continued Politicization of Justice in Post-Orange Ukraine	161
Russia's Authoritarian Reversal and the Courts: Looking	
beyond the Khodorkovsky/Yukos Cases	165
Conclusion	166
Conclusion: Politicized Justice in Russia, Ukraine, and Beyond	168
Pathways to Independent Courts?	172
Bibliography	
Index	