

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiii
<i>Table of European Treaties and European Legal Instruments</i>	xxxvii
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	xxxix
Introduction	1
Introductory Definitions: Constitutional Interpretation and Constitutional Review	2
Background: The Need for a Perspective Combining National and European Constitutional Law	3
Objectives	5
Method	6
Terminology	9
Structure	9
Chapter 1	
The Role of Non-Judicial Actors in Upholding the Constitution	11
I. Introduction	11
II. Councils of State and Chancellors of Justice	12
A. Councils of State	13
i. <i>Dutch Council of State</i> (Raad van State)	14
ii. <i>Belgian Council of State</i> (Conseil d'État / Raad van State)	16
iii. <i>The Dual Mandate of Councils of State in the light of the European Convention on Human Rights</i>	18
B. Chancellors of Justice	20
III. Parliament and its Committees	23
A. Opportunities for Parliament to Uphold the Constitution	23
B. Parliament, its Chambers and its Committees	25
i. <i>Finland: Perustuslakivaliokunta</i>	26
ii. <i>United Kingdom: House of Lords Constitution Committee</i>	29
C. Influence of the Presence of Other Actors in the Constitutional System	32
IV. Heads of State	35
V. The People	43
VI. Concluding Remarks	50
Chapter 2	
The Rise of Constitutional Adjudication	53
I. Introduction	53
II. The Notion of 'Constitutional Jurisdiction'	54
III. Exploring the Reasons behind the Rise of Constitutional Adjudication	55

A.	Avoiding Competence Collisions between State Bodies	55
i.	<i>Belgium: From Cour d'arbitrage to Cour constitutionnelle</i>	56
ii.	<i>France: Conseil constitutionnel</i>	57
B.	Guaranteeing Observance of the Rule of Law and Affording Protection to Fundamental Rights	61
i.	<i>Germany: Bundesverfassungsgericht</i>	63
ii.	<i>Italy: Corte costituzionale</i>	65
iii.	<i>Spain: Tribunal Constitucional</i>	67
iv.	<i>Czech Republic: Ústavní Soud</i>	69
v.	<i>Poland: Trybunał Konstytucyjny</i>	71
vi.	<i>Hungary: Alkotmánybíróság</i>	73
C.	The Impact of the ECHR and of EU Membership	75
i.	<i>Finland</i>	76
IV.	Bucking the Trend? A Closer Look at the Approaches of the Netherlands and the United Kingdom	79
A.	The Netherlands	79
B.	United Kingdom	83
V.	Concluding Remarks and Some Brief Reflections on the Two European Courts	86
Chapter 3		
Purposes of Constitutional Adjudication and Access to Constitutional Courts		93
I.	Introduction	93
II.	The Institutional Design of Constitutional Adjudication	94
III.	Four Purposes that May be Served by Constitutional Adjudication	97
A.	Ensuring that the Legislature Does Not Overstep Constitutional Boundaries	99
i.	<i>Abstract Constitutionality Challenges</i>	99
ii.	<i>Preliminary References</i>	132
iii.	<i>Abstract Interpretation of the Constitution</i>	140
B.	Protecting the Fundamental Rights of Individuals in Specific Cases	142
i.	<i>Germany</i>	143
ii.	<i>Czech Republic</i>	145
iii.	<i>Spain</i>	146
iv.	<i>Hungary</i>	148
v.	<i>Poland</i>	150
vi.	<i>Comparative Remarks</i>	151
C.	Resolving Institutional Disputes	155
i.	<i>Enforcing the Vertical Balance of Powers</i>	156
ii.	<i>Enforcing the Horizontal Balance of Powers</i>	163
D.	Ensuring the Integrity of Political Office and Related Processes	168
i.	<i>Hearing Electoral Disputes</i>	169
ii.	<i>Adjudicating Presidential Impeachment</i>	172
iii.	<i>Proscribing Political Parties</i>	176
iv.	<i>Examining the Regularity and Constitutionality of Referendums</i>	181

IV. Final Comparative Remarks and Reflections on the Court of Justice	185
A. National Comparative Analysis: Some General Comments	185
B. The Court of Justice in Comparative Perspective	189
i. <i>Ensuring that the Legislature Does Not Overstep its Boundaries</i>	190
ii. <i>Protecting the Fundamental Rights of Individuals in Specific Cases</i>	193
iii. <i>Resolving Vertical and Horizontal Institutional Disputes</i>	196
iv. <i>Ensuring the Integrity of Political Office and Related Processes</i>	201
v. <i>Other 'Non-Constitutional' Functions Performed by the Court of Justice</i>	201
Chapter 4	205
The Constitutional Bench	205
I. Introduction	206
II. Selection and Appointment Procedures	210
III. Number of Judges and Eligibility Criteria	210
A. Number of Judges	211
B. Qualifications that New Judges Must Possess	218
IV. Tenure of Judicial Appointments and Termination Thereof	218
A. Duration of Appointment	221
B. Removal from the Bench	223
V. Final Comparative Remarks and Reflections on the Court of Justice	223
Chapter 5	229
Identifying the Sources of Standards for Constitutional Review	229
I. Introduction	230
II. Belgium: <i>Cour constitutionnelle</i>	235
III. Czech Republic: <i>Ústavní Soud</i>	239
IV. Germany: <i>Bundesverfassungsgericht</i>	243
V. France: <i>Conseil constitutionnel</i>	249
VI. Hungary: <i>Alkotmánybíróság</i>	255
VII. Italy: <i>Corte costituzionale</i>	260
VIII. Poland: <i>Trybunał Konstytucyjny</i>	262
IX. Spain: <i>Tribunal Constitucional</i>	264
X. The Netherlands: <i>Raad van State</i>	266
XI. United Kingdom: House of Lords Constitution Committee	268
XII. Finland: <i>Perustuslakivaliokunta</i>	269
XIII. European Union: Court of Justice	276
XIV. Comparative Remarks	
Chapter 6	281
Testing and Remedying Unconstitutionality	281
I. Introduction	282
II. Deference Rhetoric	286
III. Theory of the Living Law	291
IV. Constitution-Conform Interpretation	

A. General Introduction	292
B. Four Examples of Decisions Involving Courts Engaging in Constitution-Conform Interpretation	294
i. <i>Belgium: Restricting Party Financing on Fundamental Rights Grounds</i>	294
ii. <i>The Czech Republic: Burden of Proof in Discrimination Cases</i>	296
iii. <i>France: Security and Liberty</i>	297
iv. <i>Spain: Right to Assistance from Interpreters in Criminal Cases</i>	300
C. Evaluating the Technique of Constitution-Conform Interpretation	301
D. The European Level: The Court of Justice	305
V. Types of Judgment and their Effects	309
A. Decision to Uphold the Statute	309
B. Findings of Unconstitutionality	312
i. <i>General Features: Legal Effects, Partial Annulment and the Inclusion of Legislative Guidelines</i>	312
ii. <i>Timing and the Possibility of Deferring Annulment to a Later Date</i>	317
iii. <i>Findings of Unconstitutionality Not Accompanied by Annulment</i>	320
C. The European Level: The Court of Justice	324
VI. Concluding Remarks	327
Chapter 7	
Interplay between Constitutional Courts and Other Actors	329
I. Introduction	329
II. Interactions between Constitutional Courts and (Constitutional) Legislatures	331
A. Processes of Give-and-Take	334
i. <i>Case Study: Germany and the Regulation of Abortion</i>	338
ii. <i>Case Study: Hungary and Limitation Periods for Crimes Committed during Communism</i>	342
B. Legislative Overrides	346
i. <i>United Kingdom: Section 4 of the Human Rights Act 1998</i>	348
ii. <i>Poland: Non-Finality of Judgments Handed Down by the Trybunał Konstytucyjny before 1997</i>	353
C. Constitutional Overrides	356
i. <i>France</i>	357
ii. <i>Italy</i>	360
iii. <i>Germany</i>	363
iv. <i>Hungary</i>	364
v. <i>European Union</i>	367
vi. <i>General Observations</i>	369
D. Legislative Inertia following a Constitutional Decision	373
III. Interactions between Constitutional Courts and the Ordinary Courts	377
A. Constitution-Conform Interpretation and the Demarcation of Constitutional and Ordinary Jurisdiction	378
B. The Appellate Dimension of the Constitutional Complaint Mechanism	385

IV. Interactions among European Constitutional Courts	392
A. Conference of European Constitutional Courts	393
B. Venice Commission and World Conference on Constitutional Justice	396
C. Appraising the Move to Cross-Border Judicial Gatherings	399
V. Interactions between Constitutional Courts and the Court of Justice	403
A. Avenues for Interaction between Constitutional Courts and the Court of Justice	403
B. Topics on which Constitutional Courts and the Court of Justice Interact	408
C. The Impact of the Court of Justice's Case Law on the Position of Constitutional Courts within the Domestic Legal Order	418
VI. Interactions between National Highest and Constitutional Courts and the European Court of Human Rights	427
A. Communication through Case Law	428
B. Personal Encounters	436
VII. Concluding Remarks	438
<i>Bibliography</i>	441
<i>Index</i>	477