

# CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	v
<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	xxiii
<i>Table of Statutory Instruments</i>	xxix
<i>Table of EU Legislation</i>	xxxv
<i>Table of International Treaties and Conventions</i>	xxxvii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xli

## **Chapter 1 History of the Refugee Convention, Sources of Refugee**

### **Law and Principles of Interpretation 1**

1	The Status of the Convention in English Law	2
2	Sources of Refugee Law	6
	(a) The Qualification Directive	6
	(b) The Travaux Préparatoires	9
	(c) The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees	10
	(d) The UNHCR Handbook	12
	(e) Human rights instruments	15
	(f) Decisions from Foreign Courts	16
	(g) Academic Authority	18
3	Construction of the Convention	18

## **Chapter 2 Well-founded Fear 31**

1	The Standard of Proof	31
2	General Approach to the Assessment of Historical Facts	38
	(a) The Spirit of the Enquiry	39
	(b) The UNHCR Handbook	41
3	Fairness and the Fact-Finding Process	42
4	Confidentiality	43
5	Features of the Asylum Seeker's Account	44
	(a) Discrepancies	44
	(b) Fear of the Authorities	52
	(c) Interviews	53
	(d) Legal Representation at Interview	55
	(e) Witnesses of Trauma; Victims of Sexual Abuse	56
	(f) Vagueness; Political and Religious Knowledge	59
	(g) Dishonesty	59
	(h) Exaggeration	62
	(i) Plausibility	62
	(j) Plausibility and the Reasonable Man	66
	(k) Extraneous Considerations	67
6	Relevant Factors Taken into Account by the Secretary of State	68
	(a) Failure to Claim Asylum in a Third Country	71
	(b) Failure to Claim Asylum at the Border	73
	(c) Delay in Claiming Asylum	74

(d)	Intention to Return to the Country of Origin	76
(e)	Corroboration	76
(f)	Demeanour	79
(g)	Language Analysis	80
(h)	Evaluating Sexuality	81
7	Subjective Fear	82
8	Objective Risk	83
(a)	The Reality of Risk	87
(b)	Conjecture and Inference	87
(c)	Objective Risk: Timing of the Enquiry	89
9	Objective Risk: Factors in the Assessment	91
(a)	Focus on the Country of Origin	91
(b)	Sources of Information; the Fate of Returnees; Diplomatic Assurances	91
(c)	Prominence of the Individual	94
(d)	The Experiences of the Claimant's Family	97
(e)	Generic Risk	97
10	Judgments on Foreign Countries	99
11	The Relevance of Past Events	100
12	The Relevance of Past Persecution	100
13	Change of Circumstances in the Country of Origin	104
14	Risk Based on Future Conduct	107
15	The Country of Origin – Departure and Return	109
(a)	Delay in Leaving the Country	109
(b)	Departure from the Country of Origin	110
(c)	Return to the Country of Origin	111
(d)	Risks arising from mode of return	112
16	Assessing Risks from Post-Departure Events	115
(a)	Fears Arising from Enquiries by the Status Determination Authorities	115
(b)	Fears Arising from Claiming Asylum	116
<b>Chapter 3 Persecution</b>		<b>119</b>
1	Persecution and human rights	121
	Analysing Human Rights Abuses: Domestic and International Perspectives	132
2	Persecution, State Protection, and Non-State Actors	133
3	Systematic Ill-treatment	135
4	Persistence and Persecution	136
5	Severity of Persecution	137
6	General Approach to Persecution	138
7	Forms of Persecution	139
8	Physical Harm	140
	Threats of Harm	142
9	The Subjective Nature of Persecution	143
10	Singling Out for Persecution	144
11	Persecution of Family Members	145
12	Atrocious Past Persecution	147

13	Persecution, Socio-Economic Rights and Discrimination	148
(a)	Denial of Employment as Persecution	151
(b)	Denial of Education as Persecution	153
14	Persecution and Armed Conflict	154
15	Prosecution and Persecution	159
(a)	The Criminalisation of the Exercise of Human Rights	164
(b)	Sexuality and Persecution	168
(c)	The Overcoming of Conscience as Persecution	173
(d)	Military Service Cases	174
(e)	Political Offences	189
(f)	Prosecution by States not Recognised by the International Community	193
(g)	Laws in Desuetude	194
(h)	Illegal Departure from the Country of Origin	195
(i)	Violation of Laws regarding Population Control	196
16	Inability to Return to the Country of Origin; Deprivation of Nationality	198
<b>Chapter 4 The Convention Reasons and Causation</b>		<b>203</b>
1	Race	204
2	Nationality	207
3	Religion	207
4	Political Opinion	213
(a)	Attributed Political Opinion	220
(b)	Future Activities	223
5	Membership of a Particular Social Group	225
(a)	Women as a Particular Social Group	240
(b)	Gay Asylum Seekers as a Particular Social Group	242
(c)	Family as Particular Social Group	243
(d)	Shared Employment and Particular Social Group	246
(e)	Victims of Criminals, Guerrillas and Forced Conscription as Members of a Particular Social Group	246
(f)	Population Control and Particular Social Group	248
6	Causation	252
(a)	'For Reasons Of'	252
(c)	Discrimination and Causation	255
(d)	Intention and Causation	256
(e)	Mixed Motives and Causation	259
(f)	Inferences and Causation	262
<b>Chapter 5 Protection Against Non-State Actors and Internal Relocation</b>		<b>265</b>
1	Non-state Actors	265
(a)	Inability and Unwillingness; The History of 'Sufficiency of Protection'	267
(b)	<i>Horvath</i> and the Protection Test	269
(c)	Applying the Protection Test	272
(d)	Species of Non-State Actor	275

(e) Individualised Consideration	277
(f) Expectations of the Authorities	280
(g) States Unable to Grant Nationality	283
(h) Protection via Militias	285
2 Internal Relocation	286
<b>Chapter 6 Countries of Nationality and Habitual Residence, Statelessness and the Establishment of Nationality</b>	<b>311</b>
1 The Country of Nationality	311
2 Multiple Nationalities	312
3 Exclusion due to National Protection	315
4 Statelessness	317
5 The Country of Former Habitual Residence	321
6 The Burden and Standard of Proof in the Assessment of Nationality	324
7 Applications for Nationality	324
8 Establishing Nationality	326
<b>Chapter 7 Particular Categories of Asylum Seeker</b>	<b>331</b>
1 Refugees 'Sur Place'	331
(a) Activities in the Country of Asylum	331
(b) Failed Asylum Seekers	336
2 Gender	340
(a) Substantive Law Issues and the Gender Guidelines	340
(b) Sexual Violence and Persecution	341
(c) Persecution: Differential Access to the Criminal Justice System; Female Genital Mutilation; Arranged Marriages	343
(d) Women and Convention Reason	345
(e) Sexual Violence and Convention Reason	349
(f) Women and State Protection	349
(g) Women and Internal Relocation	351
(h) Gender: Procedures and Evidence	352
(i) Female Genital Mutilation	354
3 Minors	354
Age Assessment	361
4 Trafficking	365
5 Mentally Ill Applicants	369
<b>Chapter 8 Cessation, Cancellation and Exclusion</b>	<b>371</b>
1 The Cessation Clauses	371
2 Cancellation of Refugee Status	378
3 Article 1D: exclusion due to other UN assistance	378
4 Article 1F: Exclusion Due to Serious Wrongdoing	384
(a) Exclusion on Appeal	388
(b) 'Serious Reasons for Considering'	391
(c) Expiation and Proportionality	395
(d) Article 1(f)(a): Crimes Against Peace	396

(e)	Article 1(f)(a): War Crimes	398
(f)	Article 1(f)(a): Crimes against Humanity	400
(g)	Serious Non-Political Crimes	405
(h)	Acts Contrary to the Purposes and Principles of the United Nations	415
(i)	Terrorism and Exclusion	420
(j)	Complicity	421
(k)	Command Responsibility	426
(l)	Membership of Organisations	427
(m)	Defences to Exclusion: Coercion and Following Orders	430
(n)	Defences to Exclusion: Lack of Capacity, Duress and Self-Defence	431
(o)	Family Members and Children	432
<b>Chapter 9</b>	<b>The Protection Owed to Refugees</b>	<b>435</b>
1	The Prohibition on Refoulement: Article 33	435
(a)	Limitations on the Prohibition on Refoulement	441
(b)	Particularly Serious Crimes	444
(c)	National Security Cases	448
2	Third Country Cases: The Situation in Principle	450
	The Impact of Status Determination Abroad	458
3	Refugees Lawfully in the Country of Application: Article 32	460
4	Penalties for Illegal Entry: Article 31	462
(a)	'Without Delay'	463
(b)	'Present Themselves without Delay'	464
(c)	'Good Cause'	464
(d)	'Penalty'	465
(e)	Future Application of Article 31	465
5	Protection and the Declaratory Nature of Refugee Status	465
<b>Chapter 10</b>	<b>Common European Asylum System and Subsidiary or Humanitarian Protection</b>	<b>467</b>
1	The European Union Asylum Framework – the CEAS	468
(a)	Pre-Tampere Resolutions and Positions	472
(b)	The Dublin Convention 1990	475
(c)	Council Directive Laying Down Minimum Standards for the Reception of Asylum Seekers	478
(d)	The 'Dublin II Regulation' 2003	481
(e)	Council Directive on the Right to Family Reunification	489
(f)	'The Refugee Qualification Directive'	492
(g)	Council Directive on Asylum Procedures	507
2	Subsidiary or Humanitarian Protection in the UK	517
(a)	Qualification for Humanitarian Protection	517
(b)	Exclusion from Humanitarian Protection	524
(c)	Beneficiaries of Humanitarian Protection	526
(d)	Cessation and Revocation of Humanitarian Protection	528

<b>Chapter 11</b>	<b>Asylum and the Human Rights Convention</b>	<b>533</b>
1	The European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, 1950	533
	(a) The Nature of the Protected Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	536
	(b) Implementation	539
	(c) The European Court of Human Rights	540
2	Domestic Application of the European Convention on Human Rights and the Human Rights Act 1998	545
	(a) The Human Rights Act 1998: Summary of Most Relevant Provisions	548
	(b) Very Limited Retrospective Effect of the HRA 1998	552
3	The Human Rights Act 1998 and Immigration Control	553
	(a) Applicability of the HRA 1998 in Immigration Cases	553
	(b) The Immigration and Asylum Chamber of the Tribunal and the Human Rights Act 1998	554
	(c) Asylum Support Adjudicators (now judges of the First-tier Tribunal) and the Human Rights Act 1998	556
	(d) The Standard of Review on Appeal in Human Rights Cases	558
	(e) Bail Decisions and Human Rights	562
	(f) Appeals on Human Rights Grounds before the Special Immigration Appeals Commission	562
	(g) The Effect of the HRA 1998 on Judicial Review Claims	563
	(h) The Effect of the HRA 1998 on Appeals to the Court of Appeal	567
4	The Convention Rights Generally in the Context of Immigration Cases	568
	The Extent to which Convention Rights are Relevant in Terms of Deportation or Removal	570
5	Article 3 of the Human Rights Convention and its Applicability in Immigration Cases	576
	(a) Applicability of Article 3 in Immigration Cases	577
	(b) The Absolute Nature of the Right under Article 3	579
	(c) The Threshold or Level of Severity of Mistreatment Necessary to Amount to a Violation of Article 3	582
	(d) Burden and Standard of Proof and Assessment of Facts in Article 3 Immigration Cases	598
	(e) Sufficiency of Protection in Article 3 Immigration Cases	604
	(f) Internal Protection, Relocation and Article 3	612
	(g) Article 3 in Health Cases	613
	(h) Beneficiaries of Article 3 Protection	621
6	Other Incorporated Human Rights Relevant to Asylum Cases	623
	(a) Article 2 and Thirteenth Protocol, Article 1	624
	(b) Article 4	625

(c)	Articles 5 and 6	626
(d)	Article 7	630
(e)	Article 8	631
(f)	Articles 9, 10 and 11	634
(g)	Article 12 and Protocol 1, Article 2	636
(h)	Article 14	637
<b>Chapter 12</b>	<b>Claiming Asylum in the United Kingdom</b>	<b>639</b>
1	Claims for Asylum within the Context of Immigration Law	639
(a)	Port Applications	645
(b)	In-country Variation-Based Applications	647
(c)	Deportation	649
(d)	Administrative Removal	656
2	Consideration of Asylum Claims	660
(a)	The Procedure	660
(b)	Spouses, Children and Dependants	663
(c)	Child Applicants	664
(d)	Victims of Trafficking	666
(e)	Criteria for Assessing Asylum Claims in the UK	667
3	Withdrawal of Asylum Claims and Voluntary Departure	674
4	Decisions on Asylum Claims and their Consequences	677
(a)	Grant of Asylum as a Refugee	677
(b)	The Gateway Protection Programme	680
(c)	Refugees and Family Reunion	681
(d)	Exceptional Leave, Humanitarian Protection and Discretionary Leave	686
(e)	Humanitarian Protection	686
(f)	Discretionary Leave	688
(g)	Appeal Rights for Persons Granted Humanitarian Protection or Discretionary Leave	691
(h)	Outright Refusal of Asylum Claim	692
(i)	Refusals in Variation Cases	693
(j)	Notification of Refusals, Removal Directions and Rights of Appeal	694
5	Certifications of Asylum Claims by the Secretary of State on their Refusal	696
(a)	Clearly Unfounded Certifications	696
(b)	Certifications on the Basis of Exclusion from the Benefits of the Refugee Convention	704
(c)	Certifications on National Security Grounds	707
6	Fresh Claims for Asylum Following Earlier Refusal	708
(a)	The Judgment in <i>Onibiyo</i>	708
(b)	Immigration Rules, Paragraph 353	711
7	Renewal of Refugee Status and Humanitarian Protection	715
8	Transfer of Refugee Status	718
(a)	European Agreement on the Transfer of Responsibility for Refugees 1980	718
(b)	Home Office Practice on Transfer of Refugee Status	718

9	Ending Refugee Status and Humanitarian Protection and Revocation of Indefinite Leave	721
<b>Chapter 13 Treatment of Asylum Seekers</b>		<b>725</b>
1	Fingerprinting and Application Registration Cards (ARCs)	725
2	Induction Centres	726
3	Liability of Asylum Seekers to Detention	727
4	Detention pending consideration of asylum claims	736
5	The Detention and Control of Suspected Terrorists	739
6	Temporary Admission, Bail and Habeas Corpus	741
7	Employment for Asylum Seekers	748
8	Welfare Support for Asylum Seekers	749
9	The Scheme for Asylum Support	750
10	Failed Asylum Seekers	757
11	Persons released on bail	758
12	Accommodation Centres	759
13	Eligibility for Asylum Support	761
14	Unaccompanied asylum seeking children	764
15	Asylum Seekers entitled to Social Security Benefits	766
16	Refusal of support – Late Claim for Asylum	768
17	Application for Support: False or Incomplete Information	771
18	Ending of Eligibility for Support	772
19	Appeals against Refusals of Support	773
20	Social Security Benefits and Tax Credits for Refugees	774
<b>Chapter 14 Third Country Cases</b>		<b>777</b>
1	Introduction	777
2	The UK Domestic Approach up to 2004	777
	(a) Initial Development of the Approach to Third Country Removals Prior to 1996	777
	(b) Third Country Cases under the Asylum and Immigration Act 1996 and the Immigration and Asylum Act 1999	780
3	The UK Approach since 2004	791
	(a) Third Country Cases under the Asylum and Immigration (Treatment of Claimants, etc) Act 2004 and the Immigration Rules	791
	(b) Practical Application and the Effect of the Dublin II Regulation	798
	(c) Exercise of Discretion in Whether to Remove to a Third Country	802
	(d) Human Rights and Third Country Removals	808
4	Judicial Supervision in Third Country Cases	813
	(a) Appeals	813
	(b) Judicial Review	819
<b>Chapter 15 Statutory Rights of Appeal</b>		<b>825</b>
1	The Development of the Right of Appeal in Asylum Cases	825
	(a) Appeal Rights prior to the Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2002	825

(b)	The Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2002 (NIAA 2002) and the Asylum and Immigration Tribunal	825
2	Rights of Appeal in Asylum Cases under the Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2002 (NIAA 2002) to the First-tier Tribunal, Immigration and Asylum Chamber	828
(a)	Appeals against Immigration Decisions Relating to Exclusion or Imminent Removal from the United Kingdom	830
(b)	Grounds of Appeal	833
(c)	Appeals on Refugee Asylum Grounds under the Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2002, ss 83 and 83A	836
(d)	Limitations on Appeal Rights to the Tribunal: National Security	838
(e)	Suspensive and Non-suspensive Appeal Rights: Clearly Unfounded Claims and Third Country Cases	840
(f)	The One-Stop Procedure and Limitations on Subsequent Appeal Rights	842
(g)	Appeals Pending and Lapsing	845
(h)	The Statutory Duty of the First-tier Tribunal in Appeals under the Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2002	847
(i)	Transitional Provisions in Respect of Appeals in Asylum Cases to the First-tier Tribunal	850
3	Appeals to the Upper Tribunal in Asylum Cases	851
(a)	Statutory Rights of Appeal to the Upper Tribunal in Asylum Cases	852
(b)	Statutory Powers and Duties of the Upper Tribunal in Asylum Cases	854
(c)	Transitional Provisions in Respect of Appeals in Asylum Cases to the Upper Tribunal	856
4	Appeals to the Special Immigration Appeals Commission in Asylum Cases	857
5	Onward Statutory Appeals in Asylum Cases to the Appellate Court	862
(a)	Statutory Rights of Appeal to the Relevant Appellate Court from the Upper Tribunal in Asylum Cases	862
(b)	Statutory Powers and Duties of the Relevant Appellate Court on an Appeal from the Upper Tribunal in Asylum Cases	867
(c)	Transitional Provisions in Respect of Appeals to the Appellate Court in Asylum Cases	867
(d)	Statutory Rights of Appeal to the Appropriate Appellate Court from the SIAC in Asylum Cases	868
6	Judicial Review in Asylum Cases where Suspensive Statutory Right of Appeal is denied	868

<b>Chapter 16</b>	<b>Procedure before the First-tier Tribunal; Evidence before the Immigration and Asylum Chambers</b>	<b>875</b>
1	Procedure	875
(a)	Introduction	875
(b)	Pre Hearing Issues	884
(c)	Conduct of the Appeal and Directions	903
(d)	Appeals – Withdrawal, Abandonment, Determinations without Hearings and in the Absence of a Party	950
(e)	Representation	959
(f)	General Procedure	977
(g)	Determinations	980
(h)	Fast Track	984
2	Evidence	988
(a)	General Principles	988
(b)	Forms of Evidence	991
(c)	Expert Evidence	1015
<b>Chapter 17</b>	<b>Challenging the First-tier Tribunal and Procedures in the Upper Tribunal</b>	<b>1035</b>
1	Appeals and Review of First Instance Decisions: Practice and Procedure for Challenges via the First-tier Tribunal	1037
(a)	Introduction	1037
(b)	Decisions which may be Challenged by Appeal or Review	1037
(c)	Jurisdiction upon Review and Appeal	1038
(d)	The Tribunal's Own Duty to identify Errors of Law	1040
(e)	Permission to Appeal to the Upper Tribunal via the First-tier Tribunal – Time and Procedure	1044
(f)	Service	1046
(g)	The Respondent's Duties of Service	1047
(h)	Content and Treatment of the Application	1049
(i)	Tribunal's Duty regarding Review	1051
(j)	Review of Determination for Administrative Error and Slips	1053
(k)	Consequences of Procedural Irregularities	1053
(l)	Transitional Cases: Time Limit for Making Applications	1055
(m)	Transitional Cases: Procedure	1055
(n)	Fast Track Cases	1056
2	Appeals and Review of First Instance Decisions: Practice and Procedure for Challenges in the Upper Tribunal	1056
(a)	Application for Permission to Appeal to the Upper Tribunal: Direct Applications	1056
(b)	Considerations regarding Permission to Appeal	1057
(c)	Late Applications to the Upper Tribunal	1059
(d)	Grant or Refusal of Permission to Appeal	1059
(e)	Response to the Notice of Appeal	1059
(f)	Reply	1060

	(g) Constitution of the Upper Tribunal	1060
3	Proceedings in the Upper Tribunal	1061
	(a) Upper Tribunal: Character	1061
	(b) General Powers of the Upper Tribunal	1062
	(c) Objectives of Upper Tribunal; Duties of Parties; Case Management	1063
	(d) Variation of Grounds	1064
	(e) Remittal to the First-tier Tribunal	1065
	(f) Remittal back to the Original Immigration Judge	1067
	(g) Re-Making of Decisions in the Upper Tribunal	1068
	(h) Fresh Evidence	1069
	(i) Approach to Original Determination	1070
	(j) Transfer of Proceedings	1071
	(k) Transitional Cases	1071
	(l) Events Leading to Deemed Abandonment	1072
	(m) Service of Decisions	1072
	(n) Irregularities in the Upper Tribunal	1072
	(o) UNHCR in the Upper Tribunal; Representation Generally	1073
	(p) Time in the Upper Tribunal	1073
	(q) Fast Track Cases	1073
4	The Role of the Senior Immigration Judiciary	1074
	(a) The Tribunal and Consistency	1074
	(b) Precedent and 'Starring'	1075
	(c) Reporting of Tribunal Determinations	1078
	(d) The Role of the Tribunal in giving Country Guidance	1080
5	Errors of Law	1084
	(a) Common Errors of Law	1084
	(b) Error of Law and Fresh Evidence	1087
	(c) Erroneous Exercise of Jurisdiction by Tribunal	1091
	(d) The 'Three Month Rule': Delay in the Credibility Assessment	1094
	(e) Determinations	1097
	(f) Findings of Fact	1100
	(g) Flawed Findings of Fact	1102
	(h) Reasons	1104
	(i) Reasons and Credibility	1108
	(j) Submissions and Authorities	1109
	(k) Drafting Grounds of Appeal, including Challenges to conduct of the Hearing	1110
6	Challenging the Upper Tribunal	1112
	(a) Application for Permission to Appeal to Court of Appeal: Procedure	1112
	(b) Application for permission to appeal against its own decision to the Upper Tribunal: Powers	1112
	(c) Time Limit for Court of Appeal Application	1113
	(d) Time Limit for Making Applications to Court of Appeal: Transitional Cases	1113

*Contents*

(e) Challenges to the Upper Tribunal made to the Court of Appeal Directly	1114
(f) Asylum Appeals in the Court of Appeal	1116

<b>Index</b>	<b>1119</b>
--------------	-------------