

HOW DID WE make reliable predictions before Pascal and Fermat's discovery of the mathematics of probability in 1654? What methods in law, science, commerce, philosophy, and logic helped us to get at the truth in cases where certainty was not attainable? In *The Science of Conjecture*, James Franklin examines how judges, witch inquisitors, and juries evaluated evidence; how scientists weighed reasons for and against scientific theories; and how merchants counted shipwrecks to determine insurance rates.

The Science of Conjecture provides a history of rational methods of dealing with uncertainty and explores the *coming to consciousness* of the human understanding of risk.



"A remarkable book. Mr. Franklin writes clearly and exhibits a wry wit. But he also ranges knowledgeably across many disciplines and over many centuries."—*Wall Street Journal*



"*The Science of Conjecture* opens an old chest of human attempts to draw order from havoc and wipes clean the rust from some cast-off classical tools that can now be reused to help build a framework for the unpredictable future."—*Science*



"Franklin's style is clear and fluent, with an occasional sly Gibbonian aside to make the reader chuckle."—*New Criterion*



"Franklin gives a magisterial account of matters as diverse as the Talmud, Justinian's *Digest*, torture, witch hunts, Tudor treason trials, ancient and medieval astronomy and physics, humanist historiography, scholastic philosophy, speculations in public debt, and 17th century mathematics. His treatment of medieval law is among the best I have ever read."—*International Journal of Evidence and Proof*



JAMES FRANKLIN is a professor in the School of Mathematics and Statistics at the University of New South Wales.

JOHNS HOPKINS

Baltimore | www.press.jhu.edu

ISBN 13: 978-1-4214-1880-3
ISBN 10: 1-4214-1880-0

\$40.00



9 781421 418803

Preface to the 2015 Edition ix

Preface xvii

1. The Ancient Law of Proof 1

Egypt and Mesopotamia 1; The Talmud 3; Roman Law: Proof and Presumptions 7; Indian Law 10

2. The Medieval Law of Evidence: Suspicion, Half-proof, and Inquisition 12

Dark Age Ordeals 12; The Gregorian Revolution 14; The Glossators Invent Half-proof 15; Presumptions in Canon Law 20; Grades of Evidence and Torture 24; The Postglossators Bartolus and Baldus: The Completed Theory 28; The Inquisition 33; Law in the East 37

3. Renaissance Law 40

Henry VIII Presumed Wed 40; Tudor Treason Trials 41; Continental Law: The Treatises on Presumptions 43; The Witch Inquisitors 47; English Legal Theory and the Reasonable Man 58

4. The Doubting Conscience and Moral Certainty 64

Penance and Doubts 65; The Doctrine of Probabilism 69; Suarez: Negative and Positive Doubt 76; Grotius, Silhon, and the Morality of the State 79; Hobbes and the Risk of Attack 81; The Scandal of Laxism 83; English Casuists Pursue the Middle Way 84; Juan Caramuel Lobkowitz, Prince of Laxists 88; Pascal's *Provincial Letters* 94

5. Rhetoric, Logic, Theory 102

The Greek Vocabulary of Probability 103; The Sophists Sell the Art of Persuasion 104; Aristotle's *Rhetoric* and Logic 109; The *Rhetoric to Alexander* 114; Roman Rhetoric: Cicero and Quintilian 116; Islamic Logic 120; The Scholastic Dialectical Syllogism 121; Probability in Ordinary Language 126; Humanist Rhetoric 127; Late Scholastic Logics 129

6. Hard Science 131

Observation and Theory 132; Aristotle's Not-by-Chance Argument 133; Averaging of Observations in Greek Astronomy 134; The Simplicity of Theories 138; Nicole Oresme on Relative Frequency 140; Copernicus 145; Kepler Harmonizes Observations 147; Galileo on the Probability of the Copernican Hypothesis 154
7. Soft Science and History 162

The *Physiognomics* 162; Divination and Astrology 164; The Empiric School of Medicine on Drug Testing 165; The Talmud and Maimonides on Majorities 172; Vernacular Averaging and Quality Control 175; Experimentation in Biology 177; The Authority of Histories 180; The Authenticity of Documents 184; Valla and the *Donation of Constantine* 187; Cano on the Signs of True Histories 192
8. Philosophy: Action and Induction 195

Carneades's Mitigated Skepticism 196; The Epicureans on Inference from Signs 200; Inductive Skepticism and Avicenna's Reply 202; Aquinas on Tendencies 203; Scotus and Ockham on Induction 206; Nicholas of Autrecourt 210; The Decline of the West 216; Bacon and Descartes: Certainty? or Moral Certainty? 217; The Jesuits and Hobbes on Induction 222; Pascal's Deductivist Philosophy of Science 224
9. Religion: Laws of God, Laws of Nature 228

The Argument from Design 228; The Church Fathers 230; Inductive Skepticism by Revelation 232; John of Salisbury 233; Maimonides on Creation 235; Are Laws of Nature Necessary? 237; The Reasonableness of Christianity 242; Pascal's Wager 249
10. Aleatory Contracts: Insurance, Annuities, and Bets 258

The Price of Peril 259; Doubtful Claims in Jewish Law 261; Olivi on Usury and Future Profits 262; Pricing Life Annuities 269; Speculation in Public Debt 272; Insurance Rates 273; Renaissance Bets and Speculation 278; Lots and Lotteries 283; Commerce and the Casuists 285
11. Dice 289

Games of Chance in Antiquity 289; The Medieval Manuscript on the Interrupted Game 291; Cardano 296; Gamblers and Casuists 300; Galileo's Fragment 302; De Mére and Roberval 302; The Fermat-

Pascal Correspondence 306; Huygens' *Reckoning in Games of Chance* 313; Caramuel 316

12. Conclusion 321

Subsymbolic Probability and the Transition to Symbols 324; Kinds of Probability and the Stages in Discovering Them 326; Why Not Earlier? 330; Two Parallel Histories 340; The Genius of the Scholastics and the Orbit of Aristotle 343; The Place of Law in the History of Ideas 348; Conclusion and Moral 360

Epilogue: The Survival of Unquantified Probability 362

The *Port-Royal Logic* 362; Leibniz's Logic of Probability 363; To the Present 365

Appendix: Review of Work on Probability before 1660 373

Notes 385

Index 487