

## CONTENTS

|                                                                                      |         |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| Acknowledgments .....                                                                | xv      |
| Prologue .....                                                                       | xvii    |
| Notes on the Text and Its Modes of Reference .....                                   | xix     |
| <br>1 Method and Direction .....                                                     | <br>1   |
| 1.1 Research hypothesis .....                                                        | 1       |
| 1.2 Research design .....                                                            | 8       |
| 1.3 Selection of sources .....                                                       | 14      |
| <br>2 Theologians and Contract Law: Contextual Elements .....                        | <br>21  |
| 2.1 Theologians and the <i>ius commune</i> .....                                     | 22      |
| 2.1.1 Law and theology? .....                                                        | 22      |
| 2.1.2 The <i>ius commune</i> in Spain and its theological<br>status .....            | 28      |
| 2.1.3 A syncretic legal culture .....                                                | 40      |
| 2.2 From manuals for confessors to systematic legal treatises .....                  | 44      |
| 2.2.1 Symbiosis <i>versus</i> separation of law and morality .....                   | 44      |
| 2.2.2 The Dominicans at Salamanca and the renewal<br>of the Catholic tradition ..... | 49      |
| 2.2.3 The Jesuits and the reinforcement of the symbiosis .....                       | 55      |
| 2.3 Moral jurisprudence and the court of conscience .....                            | 69      |
| 2.3.1 A court for the soul and the truth .....                                       | 69      |
| 2.3.2 A minimalistic concept of morality .....                                       | 73      |
| 2.3.3 A plurality of legal sources .....                                             | 82      |
| 2.4 Enforcement mechanisms .....                                                     | 86      |
| 2.4.1 Norms and force .....                                                          | 86      |
| 2.4.2 Evangelical denunciation and the power of<br>the keys .....                    | 88      |
| 2.4.3 Secret compensation .....                                                      | 101     |
| <br>3 Toward a General Law of Contract .....                                         | <br>105 |
| 3.1 Introduction .....                                                               | 105     |
| 3.2 The long roads to consensualism .....                                            | 107     |
| 3.2.1 Haunted by the Romans .....                                                    | 107     |
| 3.2.1.1 The civilian tradition .....                                                 | 109     |
| 3.2.1.2 Classical convulsions .....                                                  | 115     |

|         |                                                                       |     |
|---------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3.2.2   | The refreshing spirit of canon law .....                              | 121 |
| 3.2.2.1 | <i>Pacta quantumcumque nuda servanda</i> .....                        | 122 |
| 3.2.2.2 | <i>Causa</i> .....                                                    | 130 |
| 3.2.3   | A new world: the victory of consensualism .....                       | 142 |
| 3.2.3.1 | Natural law .....                                                     | 143 |
| 3.2.3.2 | <i>In utroque foro hodie ex pacto nudo habebimus ius agendi</i> ..... | 153 |
| 3.3     | The making of contractual obligation .....                            | 162 |
| 3.3.1   | Liberty and the will .....                                            | 163 |
| 3.3.1.1 | <i>Contrahentibus libertas restituta</i> .....                        | 163 |
| 3.3.1.2 | <i>Voluntas libertatem possidens</i> .....                            | 166 |
| 3.3.1.3 | <i>De contractibus in genere</i> .....                                | 170 |
| 3.3.2   | All accepted promises are binding .....                               | 178 |
| 3.3.2.1 | First requirement: <i>animus obligandi</i> .....                      | 178 |
| 3.3.2.2 | Second requirement: <i>promissio externa</i> .....                    | 182 |
| 3.3.2.3 | Third requirement: <i>promissio acceptata</i> .....                   | 187 |
| 3.3.3   | The interpretation of contractual obligation .....                    | 192 |
| 3.3.3.1 | Fictitious and doubtful promises .....                                | 192 |
| 3.3.3.2 | Legally vs morally binding promises .....                             | 197 |
| 3.3.3.3 | Implied conditions and changed circumstances .....                    | 202 |
| 3.4     | Grotius .....                                                         | 208 |
| 3.5     | Conclusion .....                                                      | 212 |
| 4       | Natural Limitations on 'Freedom of Contract' .....                    | 215 |
| 4.1     | Introduction .....                                                    | 215 |
| 4.2     | Duress ( <i>metus</i> ) .....                                         | 216 |
| 4.2.1   | Foundations .....                                                     | 216 |
| 4.2.1.1 | Romano-canon law .....                                                | 216 |
| 4.2.1.2 | The Aristotelian-Thomistic tradition .....                            | 219 |
| 4.2.1.3 | Soto: the virtues of constancy and courage ....                       | 224 |
| 4.2.1.4 | Covarruvias at the confluence of scholasticism and humanism .....     | 225 |
| 4.2.1.5 | Molina: duress makes contracts void <i>ab initio</i> .....            | 231 |
| 4.2.2   | Tomás Sánchez's doctrine of duress .....                              | 234 |
| 4.2.2.1 | Duress and the law of marriage .....                                  | 234 |
| 4.2.2.2 | The constant man test of coercion .....                               | 236 |

|           |                                                                                        |     |
|-----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 4.2.2.2.1 | Promoting virtue, protecting the weak .....                                            | 236 |
| 4.2.2.2.2 | The constant man, his relatives, and his friends .....                                 | 240 |
| 4.2.2.2.3 | The constant man, his property, and his profits .....                                  | 243 |
| 4.2.2.3   | Pressure and flattery .....                                                            | 247 |
| 4.2.2.4   | Reverential fear .....                                                                 | 250 |
| 4.2.2.5   | Void vs voidable contracts .....                                                       | 254 |
| 4.2.3     | The Jesuit moral theologians and the casuistry of duress .....                         | 259 |
| 4.2.3.1   | Duress and general contract doctrine .....                                             | 259 |
| 4.2.3.2   | Contract as a means of escaping a threat ...                                           | 261 |
| 4.2.3.3   | The use and abuse of litigation rights .....                                           | 263 |
| 4.2.3.4   | Minor fear .....                                                                       | 267 |
| 4.2.3.5   | Void vs voidable contracts .....                                                       | 268 |
| 4.2.4     | A brief synthesis of the scholastic tradition on duress (Grotius) .....                | 272 |
| 4.3       | Mistake ( <i>dolus/error</i> ) .....                                                   | 274 |
| 4.3.1     | Foundations .....                                                                      | 274 |
| 4.3.1.1   | Romano-canon law .....                                                                 | 274 |
| 4.3.1.2   | Aristotelian-Thomistic tradition .....                                                 | 280 |
| 4.3.2     | Nullity <i>ipso facto</i> and the <i>bonae fidei / stricti iuris</i> distinction ..... | 283 |
| 4.3.2.1   | Is mistake a vice of the will? .....                                                   | 283 |
| 4.3.2.2   | A humanist scholastic canon lawyer on good faith vs strict law .....                   | 290 |
| 4.3.2.3   | Molina: mistake makes contracts void <i>ab initio</i> .....                            | 297 |
| 4.3.2.4   | Sánchez: delictual and criminal liability ....                                         | 303 |
| 4.3.2.5   | A swansong to nullity <i>ab initio</i> .....                                           | 305 |
| 4.3.3     | Voidability and the end of the <i>bonae fidei/stricti iuris</i> distinction .....      | 308 |
| 4.3.3.1   | The format of Lessius' revolution .....                                                | 309 |
| 4.3.3.2   | General application of voidability .....                                               | 311 |
| 4.3.3.3   | General application of the tacit condition ....                                        | 315 |
| 4.3.3.4   | Voidability without tacit condition .....                                              | 318 |
| 4.3.4     | The impossible synthesis of the scholastic tradition on mistake (Grotius) .....        | 321 |
| 4.4       | Conclusion .....                                                                       | 325 |



|       |                                                                         |     |
|-------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 5     | Formal Limitations on 'Freedom of Contract' .....                       | 329 |
| 5.1   | Introduction .....                                                      | 329 |
| 5.2   | The post-glossators and insolemn testaments .....                       | 331 |
| 5.2.1 | Natural equity .....                                                    | 331 |
| 5.2.2 | Substantial formalities .....                                           | 333 |
| 5.3   | The decretalists and the consensualist turn .....                       | 337 |
| 5.3.1 | Contracts, elections, and last wills .....                              | 337 |
| 5.3.2 | Formalities against fraud and deceit .....                              | 339 |
| 5.3.3 | A general principle of consensualism .....                              | 342 |
| 5.3.4 | Teleological interpretations of positive law .....                      | 344 |
| 5.3.5 | The triumph of equity and conscience .....                              | 346 |
| 5.4   | Theologians for formalism I: the absolutistic version .....             | 352 |
| 5.4.1 | Property, contracts, and restitution .....                              | 353 |
| 5.4.2 | Individual property and the State .....                                 | 358 |
| 5.4.3 | The moral enforcement of State regulation .....                         | 362 |
| 5.4.4 | Against teleological interpretation .....                               | 365 |
| 5.4.5 | The politics of conscience .....                                        | 366 |
| 5.5   | Theologians for formalism II: the diplomatic version .....              | 369 |
| 5.5.1 | Property, exchange, and the common good .....                           | 369 |
| 5.5.2 | Technical nuances and academic courtesy .....                           | 374 |
| 5.5.3 | The absoluteness of positive law .....                                  | 376 |
| 5.5.4 | The equation of legal and spiritual security .....                      | 380 |
| 5.5.5 | Contracts and last wills vs marriage and election ...                   | 381 |
| 5.6   | Early modern canon law and the imperatives of the State ...             | 384 |
| 5.6.1 | Contracts for third-party beneficiaries .....                           | 385 |
| 5.6.2 | Moral vs legal natural debt .....                                       | 387 |
| 5.6.3 | Resisting, assisting or tolerating natural obligation ...               | 390 |
| 5.6.4 | The triumph of Spanish statutory law .....                              | 393 |
| 5.6.5 | Defective testaments: naturally binding, but not in<br>conscience ..... | 398 |
| 5.7   | Theologians and formalism III: the critical approach .....              | 399 |
| 5.7.1 | The disjunction of the debates on testaments and<br>contracts .....     | 399 |
| 5.7.2 | Moderate formalism in contracts and the<br>resurgence of equity .....   | 400 |
| 5.7.3 | Restoring the primacy of the will in testaments .....                   | 403 |
| 5.7.4 | Formalities, the political contract, and leges<br>irritatoriae .....    | 406 |
| 5.7.5 | Lessius against Covarruvias .....                                       | 410 |
| 5.8   | Conclusion .....                                                        | 416 |

|         |                                                                           |     |
|---------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 6       | Substantive Limitations on 'Freedom of Contract' .....                    | 419 |
| 6.1     | Introduction .....                                                        | 419 |
| 6.2     | Sex, theologians and contract law .....                                   | 420 |
| 6.2.1   | Immoral object vs immoral motive .....                                    | 420 |
| 6.2.2   | Roman canon law and the nullity of immoral<br>contracts .....             | 422 |
| 6.3     | Prostitution and the law of restitution .....                             | 425 |
| 6.3.1   | Illicit acquisition vs acquisition by virtue of an<br>illicit cause ..... | 425 |
| 6.3.2   | Leasing a right of use over your body .....                               | 429 |
| 6.3.3   | The Saint, the sinner, and the Digest .....                               | 430 |
| 6.3.4   | Sex for sale .....                                                        | 432 |
| 6.3.5   | The <i>domina's</i> (quasi-)contractual claim to a wage ...               | 433 |
| 6.4     | Moralists, realists, theologians and canonists .....                      | 437 |
| 6.4.1   | The rigorist approach .....                                               | 437 |
| 6.4.1.1 | Sex outside wedlock is mortal sin .....                                   | 437 |
| 6.4.1.2 | Medina I: radical Augustinianism .....                                    | 439 |
| 6.4.1.3 | Medina II: waiting for the liberal<br>fornicator .....                    | 443 |
| 6.4.2   | The pragmatic approach .....                                              | 447 |
| 6.4.2.1 | Soto on the moral limits to 'freedom of<br>contract' .....                | 447 |
| 6.4.2.2 | The market price for sex .....                                            | 449 |
| 6.4.2.3 | Theological psychoanalysis .....                                          | 452 |
| 6.4.3   | Thomistic canon law .....                                                 | 455 |
| 6.4.3.1 | The prostitute's right to remuneration .....                              | 455 |
| 6.4.3.2 | Unjust enrichment and secret prostitutes ...                              | 457 |
| 6.4.4   | A moralizing and experienced teacher .....                                | 460 |
| 6.4.4.1 | Envy in the canon law faculty .....                                       | 460 |
| 6.4.4.2 | Moral worthlessness and lack of economic<br>and juridical force .....     | 464 |
| 6.4.4.3 | College freshmen and the plea against<br>tolerating prostitution .....    | 470 |
| 6.5     | The Jesuits and a general doctrine of immoral promises ...                | 472 |
| 6.5.1   | The market price for immoral services .....                               | 473 |
| 6.5.2   | Immoral and impossible conditions .....                                   | 478 |
| 6.5.3   | Immoral promises invalid as a matter of<br>natural law .....              | 482 |



|         |                                                                       |     |
|---------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 6.5.4   | Immoral promises invalid as a matter of positive law .....            | 485 |
| 6.5.5   | The politics of good morals ( <i>boni mores</i> ) .....               | 486 |
| 6.5.6   | Morality and the final motivating cause .....                         | 490 |
| 6.5.7   | Sex as a luxury good and the <i>stylus aulae</i> .....                | 492 |
| 6.6     | Grotius enjoying scholastic wisdom .....                              | 494 |
| 6.7     | Concluding observations on sex and the early modern theologians ..... | 496 |
| 6.7.1   | Classification and analysis of the opinions .....                     | 496 |
| 6.7.2   | Suárez and the protection of 'freedom of contract' ....               | 499 |
| 6.7.3   | Invalidity versus immorality and illegality .....                     | 501 |
| 6.7.4   | Contract law and unjust enrichment .....                              | 503 |
| 7       | Fairness in Exchange .....                                            | 507 |
| 7.1     | Introduction .....                                                    | 507 |
| 7.2     | The point of gravity: just pricing .....                              | 509 |
| 7.2.1   | <i>Justitia commutativa</i> .....                                     | 509 |
| 7.2.1.1 | Enriching contracts .....                                             | 509 |
| 7.2.1.2 | Restitution .....                                                     | 514 |
| 7.2.2   | <i>Justum pretium</i> .....                                           | 519 |
| 7.2.2.1 | Demystifying the just price .....                                     | 519 |
| 7.2.2.2 | Utility and necessity .....                                           | 522 |
| 7.2.3   | <i>Laesio enormis</i> .....                                           | 529 |
| 7.2.3.1 | C. 4,44,2 and the <i>ius commune</i> .....                            | 529 |
| 7.2.3.2 | The Aristotelian-Thomistic tradition .....                            | 532 |
| 7.3     | Contractual fairness in early modern scholasticism I .....            | 536 |
| 7.3.1   | A clash between legal and moral principles .....                      | 537 |
| 7.3.1.1 | Roman maxims vs Christian morals .....                                | 537 |
| 7.3.1.2 | Just pricing vs gift-making .....                                     | 541 |
| 7.3.2   | A clash between secular and spiritual jurisdictions .....             | 544 |
| 7.3.2.1 | Enforcing contractual equilibrium .....                               | 545 |
| 7.3.2.2 | Competing for normative power .....                                   | 549 |
| 7.4     | Lesion for dummies: the systematic approach .....                     | 553 |
| 7.4.1   | The external court .....                                              | 554 |
| 7.4.1.1 | The renunciability of C. 4,44,2 .....                                 | 555 |
| 7.4.1.2 | Gifts are not presumed .....                                          | 557 |
| 7.4.2   | The internal court .....                                              | 560 |
| 7.4.2.1 | Reason of sin vs reason of state .....                                | 560 |
| 7.4.2.2 | Unjust enrichment .....                                               | 561 |
| 7.4.2.3 | Gifts are not presumed .....                                          | 563 |

|         |                                                                |     |
|---------|----------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 7.5     | Lesion for the advanced: the critical approach .....           | 566 |
| 7.5.1   | Socio-political foundations .....                              | 567 |
| 7.5.1.1 | Individual property and rights .....                           | 568 |
| 7.5.1.2 | The do-no-harm principle .....                                 | 569 |
| 7.5.2   | A humanist critique .....                                      | 572 |
| 7.5.2.1 | <i>Novum ius</i> .....                                         | 572 |
| 7.5.2.2 | The myth of <i>dolus re ipsa</i> .....                         | 573 |
| 7.5.2.3 | Circumscribing <i>invicem se circumvenire</i> .....            | 577 |
| 7.5.3   | Philology meets equity .....                                   | 581 |
| 7.5.3.1 | The non-renunciability of C. 4,44,2 .....                      | 582 |
| 7.5.3.2 | A humanist jurist more Catholic than the<br>theologians? ..... | 587 |
| 7.6     | Contractual fairness in early modern scholasticism II .....    | 589 |
| 7.6.1   | Theory: the moral menace of Roman law .....                    | 590 |
| 7.6.2   | Practice: playing the market game .....                        | 592 |
| 7.7     | Grotius and the legacy of fairness in exchange .....           | 598 |
| 7.8     | Conclusion .....                                               | 601 |
| 8       | Theologians and Contract Law: Common Themes .....              | 605 |
| 8.1     | Between freedom and justice .....                              | 606 |
| 8.2     | Between Church and State .....                                 | 621 |
| 8.3     | Between medieval and modern .....                              | 634 |
|         | Bibliography .....                                             | 651 |
|         | Index of Names .....                                           | 697 |
|         | Index of Terms .....                                           | 703 |