

# Contents

Acknowledgments	viii
Preface	ix
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>I</b>
The judiciary and executive in constitutional democracies	I
judicial selection systems vary and sometimes they change	2
The theory of institutions and institutionalism	5
Ireland	6
<b>1 Institutional change to judicial selection systems</b>	<b>10</b>
Role of government in judicial selection systems in common law countries	13
<i>Executive appointment</i>	14
<i>Executive nomination with legislature approval for appointment</i>	18
<i>Executive nomination following application by candidate and             independent judicial screening commission             recommendation</i>	22
Why do politicians introduce institutional change to judicial selection systems?	27
Cases of resistance to political debate about institutional change	38
Implications: political debate and institutional change	47
Variation in political commitment to institutional change	49
Political commitment and institutional design – comparing judicial selection commissions	52
Conclusions	57
<b>2 Judicial selection reform in Ireland: the trigger for reform and the instrument of reform</b>	<b>58</b>
Context of political conflict – the informality of the Judicial selection process	58
The absence of debate or demands for change of judicial selection processes in Ireland	64
Political crisis between coalition partners in 1994	65
Development of institutional change of judicial selection processes in Ireland	69
Political impetus behind the Courts and Court Officers Bill 1994	69
Political impetus behind the Courts and Court Officers Bill 1995	72

The instrument of institutional change: the Courts and Court Officers Bills	74
Differences between the Courts and Court Officers Bills 1994 and 1995	81
Conclusions: hybrid model of judicial selection	88
<b>3 The operation and impact of the new judicial selection model in Ireland</b>	<b>90</b>
Judicial selection processes in Ireland – formal institutional changes introduced in 1995	93
Judicial selection in Ireland: views from the ‘Selected’ in 1969 and 2004	104
Judicial selection processes in Ireland: views from inside the JAAB	110
<i>Composition</i>	110
<i>Opaque</i>	113
<i>Operation</i>	114
<i>Recommendations</i>	122
Implementation of the 1995 Act by the JAAB, 1995–2007	126
Judicial selection processes in Ireland: views from inside the Cabinet	131
<i>Cabinet process</i>	131
<i>Role of the Attorney General</i>	132
<i>Role of the Taoiseach and the Minister for Justice</i>	134
<i>Role of political connections</i>	137
<i>Identifying potential judges, canvassing and lobbying for appointment</i>	144
<i>Network effects and ‘being known’</i>	145
<i>Diversity in the judiciary</i>	148
Conclusions: consequences of institutional reform	150
<b>4 Reforming politically sensitive elements of the administration of justice: independent prosecutions office in Ireland and judicial selection in Scotland</b>	<b>156</b>
Institutional reform in the administration of justice in Ireland	156
Recruitment of other constitutional office-holders in Ireland	162
Institutional reform in the administration of justice in Scotland	163
Judicial appointments in Scotland historically	164
Judiciary and Courts (Scotland) Act 2008	167
Procedures of the Judicial Appointments Board for Scotland	168
Comparable reform; contrasting results	171
Conclusions	174
<b>5 Prospects for further reform in Ireland</b>	<b>176</b>
Review of procedures for appointment as a judge	179

Proposed legislation and Oireachtas debate on judicial selection, 2013–14	194
<i>Oireachtas debate</i>	203
2014 process changes by the JAAB and government	204
An approach to further institutional development to judicial selection in Ireland	209
<i>Problems with judicial selection system in Ireland</i>	210
<i>Suggested developments to judicial selection system in Ireland</i>	223
<i>Process-based developments</i>	224
<i>Statute-based developments</i>	227
<b>Conclusions: implications for institutional change</b>	232
Comparative analysis of moments of institutional reform	233
Functioning of institutions over time	236
Appendix 1: Interview codes	239
Appendix 2: Interview with Alan Shatter	241
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	243
<b>INDEX</b>	253