

Contents

| | |
|------------------------------|------|
| <i>List of Illustrations</i> | xiii |
| <i>List of Tables</i> | xv |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | xvii |
| <i>Prologue</i> | xxi |

PART ONE: *Introduction*

CHAPTER ONE

| | |
|--|----|
| Overcoming Methodological Challenges | 3 |
| <i>Social Science Debates over the Superiority of Particular Methods</i> | 7 |
| <i>Multiple Methods: Promises and Challenges</i> | 11 |
| <i>Practical Challenges and Methodological Trade-Offs</i> | 14 |
| Technological Development and the Costs of Border Crossing | 15 |
| Availability and Accessibility of Data | 17 |
| <i>Career Incentives as Methodological Constraints</i> | 18 |
| Training | 19 |
| Career Incentives and Specialization | 20 |
| <i>Our Substantive Focus</i> | 21 |
| Interactions between Theory and Methods | 23 |
| Multiple Methods and Collaborative Research | 23 |
| Practical Constraints on Methodological Choices | 23 |
| Career Incentives and Methodological Practice | 24 |
| <i>Outline of the Book</i> | 24 |

PART TWO: *Field Methods*

CHAPTER TWO

| | |
|--|----|
| Small-N Case Studies: Putting the Commons under a Magnifying Glass | 31 |
| <i>The Conventional Theory of the Commons</i> | 31 |
| <i>The Case Study Method</i> | 33 |
| Cases, Case Studies, and Case Study Research | 33 |
| Analytical Strengths and Weaknesses | 34 |
| Practical Considerations | 37 |
| <i>Synthesizing Challenges and Coordinating New Research Efforts</i> | 39 |
| <i>Contributions to the Study of the Commons</i> | 45 |
| Property Rights and Tenure Security | 45 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Group Characteristics | 52 |
| Resource Characteristics | 57 |
| <i>Case Studies as a Foundation</i> | 60 |
| CHAPTER THREE | |
| Broadly Comparative Field-Based Research | 64 |
| <i>Methodological Practices over Fifteen Years of Research</i> | 65 |
| Defining the Units of Analysis | 66 |
| Trading Geographic Scope for Numbers? | 68 |
| Theoretical Aspirations and Methodological Practices | 74 |
| <i>Practical Challenges to Broadly Comparative Field-Based Research</i> | 74 |
| Costs of Data Collection | 75 |
| Research Design and Sampling | 76 |
| The Implications of Data Scarcity and Costliness | 78 |
| <i>Meta-Analysis: An Introduction</i> | 78 |
| Weighing the Benefits and Costs of Meta-Analysis | 81 |
| Coding Strategies and Missing Data | 81 |
| Potential Sources of Sample Bias | 83 |
| <i>The Choice of Methodological Strategy: Weighing Costs against Control</i> | 86 |
| CHAPTER FOUR | |
| Meta-Analysis: Getting the Big Picture through Synthesis | 89 |
| <i>Meta-Analysis: A Recapitulation</i> | 89 |
| <i>The Common-Pool Resource (CPR) Research Program</i> | 90 |
| Defining Variables | 92 |
| Compensating for Gaps in Case Materials | 93 |
| Contributions | 94 |
| Overall Assessment | 101 |
| <i>NIIS: A Hybrid Approach</i> | 102 |
| Adaptation of the CPR Protocols | 103 |
| Measurement and Sampling | 104 |
| Contributions | 105 |
| Overall Assessment | 107 |
| <i>Other Synthetic Studies</i> | 107 |
| Additional Examples of Meta-Analysis | 108 |
| An Example of Narrative Synthesis | 111 |
| <i>Progress and Continuing Challenges</i> | 113 |
| CHAPTER FIVE | |
| Collaborative Field Studies | 115 |
| <i>Collaboration in Field-Based Research, 1990–2004</i> | 116 |
| <i>Two Research Partnerships</i> | 118 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Community-Based Management of Common-Pool Resources in Tanzania | 118 |
| Traditional Management of Artisanal Fisheries in Nigeria | 120 |
| Thoughts about Research Partnerships | 124 |
| CGIAR: A Global Research Alliance | 124 |
| IFRI: An International Research Network | 126 |
| Strategies for Data Collection | 127 |
| Strategies for Coordination | 128 |
| Contributions and Challenges | 129 |
| <i>Comparing the Strategies and Drawing Implications</i> | 132 |

PART THREE: *Models and Experiments in the Laboratory and the Field*

CHAPTER SIX

| | |
|--|-----|
| Experiments in the Laboratory and the Field | 141 |
| <i>The Experimental Method</i> | 142 |
| <i>Laboratory Experiments of Relevance to the Study of the Commons</i> | 144 |
| Public Goods Experiments | 146 |
| Common-Pool Resource Experiments | 150 |
| <i>Insights from Public Goods and Common-Pool Resource Experiments in the Laboratory</i> | 153 |
| Face-to-Face Communication in the Laboratory | 153 |
| Heterogeneity | 156 |
| Sanctioning Experiments | 158 |
| <i>Field Experiments</i> | 159 |
| <i>Toward a New Generation of Experiments of Commons Dilemmas</i> | 163 |
| New Developments in Laboratory Experiments | 164 |
| Toward a New Generation of Field Experiments | 168 |
| <i>Conclusion</i> | 169 |

CHAPTER SEVEN

| | |
|---|-----|
| Agent-Based Models of Collective Action | 171 |
| <i>A Brief Introduction to Agent-Based Modeling</i> | 171 |
| Cellular Automata | 172 |
| Networks | 173 |
| Agents | 174 |
| Strengths and Weaknesses of Agent-Based Models | 175 |
| <i>Repeated Prisoner's Dilemma</i> | 177 |
| Cooperation among Egoists | 177 |
| Evolving Strategies in Prisoner's Dilemma Tournaments | 178 |
| <i>Spatial Games</i> | 180 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Spatial Social Dilemma Games | 180 |
| Spatial Public Goods Games | 181 |
| <i>Indirect Reciprocity</i> | 182 |
| <i>Evolution of Costly Punishment</i> | 185 |
| <i>Evolution of Social (Meta) Norms</i> | 187 |
| <i>Future Challenges</i> | 188 |
| <i>Conclusion</i> | 191 |
| CHAPTER EIGHT | |
| Building Empirically Grounded Agent-Based Models | 194 |
| <i>Comparing Simulations with Data</i> | 195 |
| <i>Different Approaches to Combine Empirical Data and Agent-Based Models</i> | 196 |
| <i>Agent-Based Models of Laboratory and Field Experiments</i> | 198 |
| <i>Role Games and Companion Modeling</i> | 204 |
| <i>Models of Case Studies</i> | 207 |
| <i>Methodological Challenges</i> | 210 |
| <i>Conclusion</i> | 212 |
| PART FOUR: <i>Synthesis</i> | |
| CHAPTER NINE | |
| Pushing the Frontiers of the Theory of Collective Action and the Commons | 215 |
| <i>Synopsis of Research Developments Reviewed in Parts II and III</i> | 217 |
| <i>Toward a More General Behavioral Theory of Human Action</i> | 220 |
| Assumptions of a Behavioral Theory | 222 |
| The Centrality of Trust | 226 |
| <i>Unpacking the Concept of Context</i> | 227 |
| <i>The Microsituational Context</i> | 228 |
| The Impact of Microsituational Variables on Cooperation | 228 |
| The Challenge of Linking Contextual Scales | 231 |
| <i>The Broader Scale Affecting Collective Action</i> | 232 |
| Ontological Frameworks | 233 |
| An Ontological Framework of Social-Ecological Systems | 234 |
| Predicting Self-Organization Drawing on the SES Framework | 236 |
| Diagnosing Institutional Change | 239 |
| <i>Challenges for Future Research</i> | 243 |
| <i>Conclusion</i> | 245 |
| APPENDIX 9.1: A Theoretical Puzzle: Why Do Some Resource Users Self-Organize and Others Do Not? | 246 |

CHAPTER TEN

| | |
|---|-----|
| Learning from Multiple Methods | 248 |
| <i>Interlocking Developments in Methods and Theory</i> | 249 |
| <i>Methodological and Disciplinary Cross-Fertilization and Theoretical Innovation</i> | 251 |
| Sequential Movement between Methods and Disciplines | 252 |
| Combining Multiple Methods and Disciplines in a Program of Research | 255 |
| Spaces for Cross-Fertilization | 257 |
| <i>Practical Challenges</i> | 258 |
| Trade-Offs in Training and Research | 258 |
| Professional Incentives | 260 |
| <i>Collaborative Research as a Collective-Action Problem</i> | 262 |
| Rewards to Individual and Collaborative Research | 263 |
| Fragmentation of Academia | 265 |
| Misunderstandings and Mistrust | 266 |
| Long-Term Funding | 269 |
| Responding to the Challenges | 270 |
| <i>Looking Forward</i> | 271 |
| Notes | 275 |
| References | 289 |
| Index | 339 |