

Contents

List of Figures	ix
List of Tables	xiii
Preface	xv
1 Introduction	1
1.1 An Interdisciplinary Approach to Finding Information . .	2
1.2 Central Themes	3
1.2.1 Law as a Problem Domain	3
1.2.2 Connectionist/Symbolic Hybrids	4
1.2.3 Text as Knowledge Representation	4
1.2.4 The Role of the User	5
1.3 Goals of the Research	5
1.4 A Sketch of the SCALIR Approach	6
1.5 A Preview of Things to Come	9
2 Humans, Computers, and Finding Information	11
2.1 Archives, Libraries, and IR Systems	12
2.2 A Baseline for IR Interaction	13
2.3 Seeing Connections	20
2.3.1 What's in a Trail?	20
2.3.2 To AIR is Human	21
2.4 Methods of Inquiry	22
2.4.1 Query by Example	22
2.4.2 Retrieval by Reformulation	25
2.5 Browsing	26
2.6 Adaptation	28
2.7 Implementation-Level Interface Issues	30
2.8 Who's in Charge Here?	32

2.9	A Framework for Interaction with an IR System	34
3	Knowledge Representation, Meaning, and Text in AI	37
3.1	Characterizations of AI	38
3.1.1	Connectionism as AI	38
3.2	Desiderata for Knowledge Representations	40
3.2.1	Avoiding the Acquisition Bottleneck	41
3.2.2	Learnability	42
3.2.3	Comprehensibility	43
3.2.4	Informability	44
3.2.5	Adaptivity	44
3.2.6	Unbounded Depth	45
3.3	Semantic and Connectionist Networks	46
3.3.1	Representing Knowledge in Semantic Networks . .	46
3.3.2	Representing Knowledge in Connectionist Networks	50
3.4	Representation and Meaning	52
3.4.1	Grounding by Observation	54
3.4.2	Grounding by Communication	55
4	Approaches to Information Retrieval	59
4.1	The Information Retrieval Task	59
4.2	The Two "Classical" Approaches	63
4.2.1	Inverted Files	64
4.2.2	The Vector Model	65
4.3	Standard Evaluation Techniques	67
4.3.1	Retrieval Errors	68
4.3.2	The Recall and Precision Measures	69
4.4	Rethinking the Classics	71
4.5	Variations and Alternatives	76
4.5.1	Thesaurus Construction	76
4.5.2	Natural Language Processing	78
4.5.3	Relevance Feedback	80
4.5.4	Dynamic Document Space	82
4.5.5	Probabilistic Retrieval	83
4.5.6	Genetic Adaptation	84
4.5.7	Parallel Implementations	85
4.5.8	Latent Semantic Indexing	86
4.5.9	Spreading Activation and Connectionism	89
4.6	Taking Stock	91

5	Some Perspectives on the Law and Legal Research	93
5.1	Their Word is Law	93
5.2	Legal Philosophy: Formalism vs. Realism	95
5.3	The Dual Nature of the Legal System	98
5.3.1	Symbolic Characteristics of Law	98
5.3.2	Connectionist Characteristics of Law	102
5.4	Legal Research	103
5.4.1	Research Resources	103
5.4.2	Manual Research	104
5.5	Legal Information Retrieval	106
5.5.1	A Brief History of Computer-Assisted Legal Research	106
5.5.2	What's Different About Legal IR?	108
5.5.3	Progress Toward Conceptual Legal IR	109
5.5.4	Problems With the Traditional AI Approach	116
5.5.5	What Are the Alternatives?	117
5.6	Copyright Law: Briefest Course	118
6	Hybrid Vigor	123
6.1	The Transduction Model	123
6.2	Symbolic Processing	124
6.3	Sub-Symbolic Processing	126
6.3.1	Learning as Data-Modulation	129
6.3.2	The Localist/Distributed Controversy	130
6.4	Types of Hybrid Systems	133
6.5	The Symbolic/Sub-Symbolic Continuum	135
6.6	Motivation for Hybrid Approaches	137
6.7	Problems with Hybrids	141
6.8	SCALIR as a Hybrid System	143
6.8.1	SCALIR as a Sub-Symbolic System	143
6.8.2	SCALIR as a Symbolic System	145
6.9	Avoiding One-Paradigm Reductionism	146
7	The Structure of SCALIR	149
7.1	A Brief Overview	150
7.2	The Origin and Contents of SCALIR Nodes	151
7.3	Multiple Link Classes	156
7.3.1	C-Links	156
7.3.2	S-Links	158
7.3.3	H-Links	161
7.4	Network Statistics	165

8	The Retrieval Process	171
8.1	An Activation-Based View of Retrieval	171
8.2	General Activation Issues	172
8.2.1	Interactive Activation for IR	175
8.2.2	Activation in AIR	176
8.3	SCALIR's Retrieval Algorithm	178
8.3.1	Conservation of Activity	178
8.3.2	Significance and Quiescence	180
8.3.3	Tapered Search	183
8.3.4	Evolution of the Activation Function	185
8.3.5	The Retrieval Algorithm	186
8.4	Hybrid Activity Propagation	188
8.5	Antirelevance and the "But Not" Operator	195
8.6	"Symbolic" Queries	196
9	Feedback and Learning	201
9.1	Choosing a Learning Approach	201
9.2	Hybrid Learning and the Credit Assignment Problem	204
9.3	Learning Rules that Use Feedback	205
9.4	A Simulation of Learning from Feedback	207
9.5	SCALIR's Learning Rule	212
9.5.1	How Activity and Feedback are Measured	212
9.5.2	Extensions for Vector-Valued Activity	214
9.5.3	Damping, Normalization, and Learning Rate	214
9.5.4	Negative Feedback and Anti-Activity	217
9.6	Demonstrations of Learning	217
9.6.1	A Very Simple Network	218
9.6.2	A "Two-Layer" Recurrent Network	219
9.6.3	An H-Link Network	221
9.7	One-Shot Learning	222
9.8	Micro- and Macro-Experiments	223
10	Interacting With SCALIR	225
10.1	How SCALIR Looks to the User	225
10.1.1	Initial Queries	227
10.1.2	Specifying Symbolic Relationships	230
10.1.3	The Retrieval Display	232
10.1.4	Browsing	234
10.2	User Testing	236
10.2.1	General (Non-SCALIR) Interface Issues	239
10.2.2	Low-Level Interaction Issues	239
10.2.3	Major Design Issues	241

10.2.4	Preconceptions and Misconceptions from CALR . . .	244
10.3	Assessing the Interface	245
10.3.1	Summarizing SCALIR Interaction Attributes	245
10.3.2	Direct Manipulation Revisited	246
10.3.3	Instantiating the Framework	247
11	Performance Evaluation	251
11.1	SCALIR Alone	252
11.2	SCALIR v. WESTLAW	255
11.2.1	Generating the Queries	256
11.2.2	Performing the Searches	257
11.2.3	Specific Comparisons	259
11.2.4	A Quantitative Evaluation Procedure	260
11.2.5	Questionnaire Results	263
11.3	SCALIR Before and After Learning	265
11.3.1	Qualitative Learning Phenomena	266
11.3.2	Specific Improvements	268
11.3.3	Changes in "Associative Coupling"	270
11.3.4	(In)validity of a Questionnaire Evaluation of Learning	271
11.4	Evaluating the Evaluation	273
12	Discussion	275
12.1	The Research Goals, Revisited	275
12.1.1	Improving Legal Information Retrieval	275
12.1.2	Feasibility of Hybrid AI Systems	277
12.1.3	IR for Natural Language	278
12.2	Other Considerations	279
12.2.1	SCALIR and IR Research	279
12.2.2	Scaling and Incremental Modification	280
12.2.3	SCALIR, Learning, and the Law Firm	281
12.2.4	User Satisfaction and System Performance	282
12.3	Future Directions	283
12.3.1	Generalizing to Other Domains	283
12.3.2	Analogy and Legal Reasoning	284
12.4	Conclusion	287
	References	289
	Author Index	307
	Subject Index	309