

Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Legislative Provisions and Treaties</i>	xxvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxxvii
1. Introduction	1
The Aims of this Study	1
Evaluating Supreme Courts	1
Assessments Elsewhere	2
The Approach of this Book	5
2. The Origins of the Supreme Court	7
The Birth of an Independent Ireland	7
The Evolution of the Court System in Ireland	9
Irish influence in the House of Lords	9
The Constitution and Dáil Éireann courts	10
The Judiciary Committee 1923	12
Supreme Courts Elsewhere at this Time	14
Canada	14
Australia	15
South Africa	16
Newfoundland and New Zealand	17
European nations and the USA	17
The Courts of Justice Act 1924	19
3. The Supreme Court and the Irish Free State	22
Appeals to the Privy Council	23
Appeals in practice	26
The Performing Right Society case	28
The Statute of Westminster 1931	29
Appeals from other dominions	30
Parliamentary Sovereignty	32
Civil Unrest and Emergency Legislation	34
The State (Ryan) v Lennon	37
The Court's Performance 1924–37	42
4. The Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court	45
The Role of the Supreme Court	45
Ireland's Final Court of Appeal	45
The Court of Criminal Appeal	47
The Growing Caseload of the Supreme Court	49
The Constitution Review Group	51
Chief Justice Keane's lecture	52
The Law Reform Commission	53
Statistics on the Supreme Court's workload	54
The Working Group on the Court of Appeal	56

The Jurisdiction of the Supreme Court Today	59
Leapfrog Appeals to the Supreme Court	60
Referrals to the Supreme Court	61
Cases Stated and Original Jurisdiction	62
The Impact of the New Court of Appeal	63
The Presumed Continuance of pre-1922 Laws	64
The Meaning of 'Limited Functions and Powers of a Judicial Nature'	65
Non-justiciable Questions	68
Conclusion	69
5. The Judges of the Supreme Court	71
Eligibility for Appointment	71
Method of Appointment	73
The Judicial Appointments Advisory Board	74
Beyond the Advisory Board	76
The Judicial Appointments Commission Bill	78
Salaries and Pensions	81
Ensuring Standards of Excellence	86
Retirement	87
Those Who Have Served	88
The top judges before 1924	88
The original judges	90
Judges appointed between 1925 and 1936	92
Judges appointed between 1939 and 1954	94
Judges appointed between 1961 and 1976	95
Judges appointed between 1981 and 1992	97
Judges appointed between 1994 and 2006	98
Judges appointed since 2010	101
The Representativeness of the Supreme Court Judges	103
6. The Supreme Court and the Constitution	105
The President's Power to Refer Legislation to the Supreme Court	106
Emergency Laws: An Early Test and Its Aftermath	108
How Have Article 26 References Worked in Practice?	112
Developments in the 1990s	114
Developments in the 2000s	117
The 'One Judgment' Rule	119
The 'Immutability' Rule	122
Posterior constitutional review	123
Unenumerated Rights	125
Expenditure of Public Money and Socio-Economic Rights	128
Constitutional provisions and the <i>Sinnott</i> and <i>TD</i> cases	131
Alternative approaches	133
The Influence of 'Natural Law'	136
Conclusion	137
7. The Supreme Court and Northern Ireland	141
Arms Smuggling and <i>R v Haughey</i>	141
The Sunningdale Agreement	142
<i>Boland v An Taoiseach</i>	144
The Anglo-Irish Agreement and <i>McGimpsey v Ireland</i>	146
The Belfast (Good Friday) Agreement and <i>Riordan v An Taoiseach (No 2)</i>	149

Extradition	151
The Extradition Act 1965, <i>Bourke and Magee</i>	153
The Law Enforcement Commission Report	155
<i>Re Article 26 and the Criminal Law (Jurisdiction) Bill 1975</i>	157
A Change of Heart	159
The <i>McGlinchey</i> litigation	160
<i>McMahon v Leahy, Shannon v Fanning and Quinn v Wren</i>	162
The Extradition (Convention on the Suppression of Terrorism) Act 1987	164
<i>Russell v Fanning</i>	164
A Further U-turn: <i>Finucane v McMahon</i> and Its Aftermath	166
Extradition Today	170
Conclusion	171
 8. Administrative Law	 173
State Side Orders, Applications for Judicial Review, and Public Law	173
The <i>Ultra Vires</i> Doctrine and Beyond	174
Principles of Natural Justice	176
Reasonableness	177
Proportionality	180
Reaction to <i>Meadows</i>	183
Deference	185
Public Liability	186
<i>Byrne v Ireland</i>	186
<i>Webb v Ireland</i>	188
Duties of Care, Economic Loss and Nervous Shock	189
Police and Army Cases	192
Aggravated Damages	193
Conclusion	194
 9. Criminal Justice	 196
Introduction	196
Ensuring that a Criminal Trial Proceeds Fairly	197
The Special Criminal Court	200
Developments since the 1990s	203
The Right to Bail	207
Evidence Obtained Unconstitutionally	209
The <i>Damache</i> and <i>JC</i> cases	211
The Retrospectivity of Declarations of Unconstitutionality	214
Conclusion	217
 10. Family and Personal Life	 218
Introduction	218
The Family, Illegitimacy and Adoption	220
Further Cases on Adoption	222
The Position Today	225
Immigration	227
Matrimonial Property	229
Contraception	232
Abortion	235
Human Assisted Reproduction	240
The Right to Die	242
Conclusion	246

11. The Supreme Court and the European Union	247
The Reception of European Law by the Supreme Court	247
<i>Campus Oil and Pesca Valentia</i>	249
The <i>Crotty</i> Case	252
Maastricht and the <i>Meagher and Mallon</i> Cases	255
The <i>Maher</i> Case	259
The Amsterdam, Nice and Lisbon Treaties	260
<i>Pringle</i> and the European Stability Mechanism	261
Other Encounters with EU Law	265
Conclusion	266
12. The Supreme Court and the European Convention on Human Rights	268
The 1960s and the <i>Lawless</i> Case	270
Failed Attempts to Challenge Supreme Court Decisions	272
The <i>Airey</i> and <i>Johnston</i> Cases	274
The <i>Norris</i> Case	275
The <i>Pine Valley</i> , <i>Open Door</i> and <i>Keegan</i> Cases	278
The <i>Heaney</i> , <i>DG</i> and <i>McElhinney</i> Cases	283
The <i>Murphy</i> and <i>Independent News</i> Cases	286
The <i>Bosphorus Airways</i> Case	290
Further Cases on Delay and Unfairness	291
Delay in Criminal Cases	293
Delay Today	296
The <i>A, B and C</i> Case	297
The <i>O'Keeffe</i> Case	298
The Impact of the European Convention on Human Rights Act 2003	301
Conclusion	302
13. Conclusion	304
A Summing Up	304
Constraints on the Supreme Court's Decision-Making	305
The Principle of Consistency	306
Appendices	
Appendix 1 <i>Office Holders, 1922–2018</i>	309
Appendix 2 <i>A Chronology of Supreme Court Appointments</i>	313
Appendix 3 <i>Biographies of the Judges of the Supreme Court 1924–2018</i>	317
Appendix 4 <i>References to the Supreme Court under Article 26 of the Constitution</i>	329
Appendix 5 <i>Supreme Court Decisions reviewed in Strasbourg</i>	333
Bibliography	345
Index	365