

# *Table of Contents*

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of Legislation and Official Documents</i>	xxi

<b>Introduction</b>	1
Aims and Scope: Fundamental Rights and Duties in the Constitutional Order of the European Union	1
Structure and Outline of Chapters	6

## I. THE CONSTITUTIONAL FOUNDATIONS OF HORIZONTALITY

<b>1. The Horizontal Effect of Fundamental Rights as a Constitutional Problem</b>	15
1.1 Introduction	15
1.2 The Horizontal Effect of Human Rights	16
1.3 The Horizontal Applicability of Fundamental Rights within Constitutional Law	21
1.4 Horizontality and the Role of Fundamental Rights in EU Constitutionalisation	27
1.5 Conclusion: Horizontality in Constitutional Perspective	35
<b>2. The Constitutional Operation of Horizontality</b>	37
2.1 Introduction	37
2.2 Three Types of Horizontality	38
2.3 The Application of Horizontal Effect in Different Jurisdictions	40
2.4 Dispelling the Controversies Surrounding Direct Horizontal Effect	44
2.5 Conclusion: The Supranational Operation of Horizontality	51

## II. THE HORIZONTAL EFFECT OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS IN EUROPEAN UNION LAW

<b>3. From <i>Defrenne</i> to the Charter: Understanding the EU Horizontality Heritage</b>	57
3.1 Introduction	57
3.2 Vertical and Horizontal Individual Rights as Means of Advancing Integration within the Common Market	58

3.2.1	A horizontal conception of rights: <i>Van Gend en Loos</i> and <i>Defrenne II</i>	59
3.2.2	The lack of direct horizontal effect of directives	63
3.3	Counteracting the Distinction between Treaty Rights and Directives	66
3.3.1	Emanations of the state	67
3.3.2	Application of indirect horizontality as a substitute for the lack of direct horizontal effect	69
3.3.3	A conceptually flawed application of state-mediated effect	71
3.3.4	Fundamental rights-specific horizontality: direct horizontal effect through the general principles of EU law	75
3.4	Conclusion: 'A Law of Diminishing Coherence'	79
4.	<b>Horizontal Effect after the Entry into Force of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights</b>	82
4.1	Introduction	82
4.2	The Charter's Drafting Intricacies: Scope and the Rights/Principles Distinction	83
4.2.1	Horizontality and the Charter's scope of application: Article 51 EUCFR	84
4.2.2	The distinction between rights and principles	88
4.3	The Direct Horizontal Effect of the Charter in the Court's Case Law	91
4.3.1	<i>Prigge</i> and <i>Dominguez</i> : the continued salience of general principles in the determination of horizontality	91
4.3.2	<i>Association de Médiation Sociale</i> : rights-conferring and non-rights-conferring provisions of the Charter as a test for (direct) horizontality	95
4.3.3	<i>Dansk Industri</i> and <i>Egenberger</i> : the challenge of legitimate expectations and legal certainty	100
4.4	De Facto Application of Horizontality without 'Horizontal' Reasoning	109
4.5	Conclusion: A Law of Diminishing Legitimacy?	113
5.	<b>Horizontal Effect and the Hybrid Constitutional Structure of EU Law</b>	117
5.1	Introduction	117
5.2	The Court's Hybrid Conception of Constitutionality: <i>Viking</i> and <i>Laval</i>	118
5.3	A Broader Conception of Fundamental Rights as Individual Interests	125
5.4	The Role of Horizontality in Reinstating Meaningful Forms of Publicness	130
5.5	Conclusion: Towards Horizontality in a Constitutional Polity	136

### III. A THEORY OF HORIZONTALITY FOR FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

<b>6. Rediscovering Supranational Constitutional Reasoning in the Interpretation of Horizontality</b>	141
6.1 Introduction	141
6.2 The Need for a Substantive Theory of Horizontality at the EU Level	142
6.3 Supranational Constitutional Reasoning about Fundamental Rights: Public Justification	147
6.4 The Reach of Fundamental Rights into Private Disputes: Reasoning through Public Justification	153
6.5 Conclusion: Horizontality in a Supranational Constitutional Polity	158
<b>7. A Justification for Horizontality: Political Equality</b>	161
7.1 Introduction	161
7.2 Political Equality as an Overarching Justification of Fundamental Rights	162
7.3 Linking Political Equality and Horizontality	165
7.4 Applying a Conception of Horizontality through Political Equality	170
7.5 Conclusion: Political Equality and Horizontal Responsibilities under the Charter	175
<b>8. The Application of a Constitutional Theory of Horizontality in EU Fundamental Rights Law: Two Clarifications and a Question</b>	178
8.1 Introduction	178
8.2 Which Provisions of the Charter are Horizontally Applicable?	179
8.3 Is Horizontal Direct Effect Obsolete?	183
8.4 Postnational Public/Private Actors: An Emerging Category	188
8.5 Conclusion: A Theory of Horizontal Applicability	190
<b>Conclusion</b>	192
A Short Overview: Horizontality within a Supranational Constitutional Order	192
Limitations of the Argument and Some Possible Challenges	195
A Constitutional View of Horizontality in the Union: More than Idealisation?	196
<i>Bibliography</i>	201
<i>Index</i>	219