
CONTENTS

<i>Foreword by Dr John Temple Lang</i>	ix
<i>Preface</i>	xi
<i>Case Law, Commission Decisions, Legislation, EU Documents,</i> <i>Other Documents</i>	xxi

1. In the General Interest?	1
A. Introduction	1
B. The Nature of the Problem	3
C. The Mechanics of Article 106(2)	6
1. Services of General Economic Interest	6
2. Entrustment with Particular Tasks	9
3. Necessity	10
4. Proportionality	11
5. The Effect on the Development of Trade	12
D. The Essence of Government Failure and its Cost	13
1. A Primer on the Concept of Government Failure	13
2. The Cost of Government Failure	15
E. This Book	16
1. Objectives	16
2. Approach	17
3. Elements	19
2. The Pathology of Government Failure	21
A. Introduction	21
B. Government Failure and Market Failure	22
C. The Constitutional Grounding for Government Failure Control Under Article 106(2)	24
D. Approaches to Government Failure	26
1. Wolf's Theory of Government Failure	27
2. Le Grand's Critique of Wolf	28
3. Röller et al's Refined Economic Approach for State Aid	29
E. Government Failure Under Article 106(2)	31
1. The Risk of Government Failure in SGEI Formulation	31
2. Diagnosing Government Failure in SGEI Verification	33
(a) Context	33
(b) Forms of Market Failure	35

3.	Market Feasibility as the Critical Government Failure Concern in SGEI Verification.....	40
4.	Diagnosing Government Failure in Disapplication Review	41
	(a) Limitations of Government Failure Theories for the Purposes of Disapplication Review	41
	(b) Adapting Insights from Government Failure to Assess Disapplication Review.....	43
F.	Conclusions	45
3.	The Contestation and Indeterminacy of Article 106(2)	46
A.	Introduction	46
B.	The Political, Constitutional and Administrative Battleground	47
	1. The Trigger—Article 106(3)	47
	2. An Evolving Constitutional Position for SGEIs.....	49
	(a) Article 16 Treaty Establishing the European Community.....	49
	(b) The Public Service Broadcasting Protocol to the Amsterdam Treaty	50
	(c) The Treaty Establishing a Constitution for Europe (TECE).....	51
	(d) Article 14 of the TFEU Introduced by the Treaty of Lisbon.....	52
	(e) Protocol 26 to the Treaty of Lisbon	53
	3. The Commission's SGEI Containment Strategy.....	55
	(a) The Commission's Soft Law Guidance	55
	(b) Avoiding a Framework Directive	57
	(c) Styling Services of General Economic Interest.....	58
	4. Manifest Error and the Problem of Legitimacy	60
	(a) Judicial Approval	60
	(b) An Open Standard.....	61
C.	Accounts of Article 106(2)	62
	1. Prosser's Solidarity-based Account of SGEIs	62
	2. Ross's Communautaire Core Reading of <i>BUPA</i>	63
	3. Ølykke and Møllgard's Network Component Theory of SGEIs	65
	4. Sauter and Schepel's Pre-emption-based Account of Proportionality Review Under Article 106(2)	66
D.	Conclusions	69
4.	A Most Contingent Exemption	70
A.	Introduction	70
B.	Contestation—The Scope of Article 106(2) <i>Ratione Materiae</i>	70
	1. Introduction	70
	2. The Public Authority Exception	71
	3. The Solidarity-based Exception and Undertakings.....	76
C.	Competition—The Free Movement Derogations	83
	1. Introduction	83
	2. Direct Effect and Scope.....	83

(a)	The Free Movement Derogations	83
(b)	Article 106(2)	86
3.	Hard Limits on Article 106(2)?	89
4.	A Preference Revealed	91
5.	Explaining the Court's Preference	94
D.	Subordination—The State Aid Rules	95
1.	Introduction	95
2.	Procedural Relationship Between Article 106(2) and State Aid Enforcement	95
3.	<i>Altmark</i> as a Proxy for Article 106(2)	97
E.	Conclusions	99
5.	Government Failure in Assessing Market Feasibility	102
A.	Introduction	102
B.	Telecommunications	103
1.	The Economics of the Telecommunications Sector	104
2.	Universal Service Obligations as the Exemplary SGEI	105
3.	The Digital Revolution	106
(a)	Technological Transformation	106
(b)	Economic Reordering	107
4.	Broadband and Hybrid-Market Failure	107
5.	The Curtailment of Permissible SGEIs	110
C.	Environmental Protection	113
1.	The Economics of Environmental Protection	114
2.	The Constitutional Treatment of Environmental Issues	115
3.	Environmental Arguments and SGEIs	116
4.	The Presumptive Environmental SGEI	117
5.	Market Failure Deconstructing the Presumptive SGEI	120
6.	Environmental Public Goods as SGEIs	123
D.	Broadcasting	125
1.	The Economics of Broadcasting	125
(a)	Market Failures in Broadcasting	125
(b)	The Merit Goods Argument for PSB	127
2.	The Informed Citizenry Justification for PSBs	128
3.	Digitalisation and the Emergence of the Consumer Sovereignty Paradigm	129
(a)	The Transformation of Broadcasting Through Digitalisation	129
(b)	The Erosion of the Market Failure Case for Intervention	129
4.	PSB and Market Feasibility Under Article 106(2)	131
(a)	Defining PSB and its Treatment as a Conclusive SGEI	131
(b)	Renouncing Market Feasibility	134
5.	Digital Switchover and Market Failure	136
E.	Conclusions	138

6. Government Failure in Disapplication Review	141
A. Introduction	141
B. The First Phase—The Strict Exception	142
1. Introduction	142
2. Transparency and Proof	142
3. Necessity and Proportionality	144
(a) The General Position	144
(b) Pragmatism Portended	146
4. Efficiency—The Manifest Incapacity Doctrine and Article 106(2)	148
C. The Second Phase—Permissive Derogation	150
1. Introduction	150
2. Transparency and Proof	150
3. Necessity and Proportionality	153
(a) The Necessity of the Intervention	153
(b) Proportionality of Means	159
4. Efficiency	160
(a) The Limits of the Manifest Incapacity Doctrine	161
(b) Pre-eminence as to SGEI Definition Precluding Efficiency Scrutiny	161
D. The Third Phase—Partial Revival	163
1. Introduction	163
2. <i>Altmark</i> and the Transformation of Article 106(2)	164
(a) <i>Altmark</i> and the Mitigation of Government Failure	164
(b) Initial Stasis	165
3. Elements of Disapplication Analysis post <i>Altmark</i> Implementation	166
(a) Transparency and Proof	166
(b) Necessity and Proportionality	167
(c) Efficiency	172
E. Conclusions	174
7. Contours of a Better Exemption	176
A. Introduction	176
B. Government Failure Redux	176
1. The Problem of Government Failure Under Article 106(2)	176
2. Implications of the Exposure of Government Failure	178
(a) A Single Strict Proportionality Standard Under Article 106(2) is not Viable	178
(b) The Contingency of Article 106(2) is Irreversible in Significant Respects	180
(c) Greater Deference is Required from the Commission in the Supervision of General Interest Interventions that are not Market Failure Related	180

C.	Proposals for a Reorientation of the Law with Respect to SGEIs	181
1.	Clarify the Nature of Manifest Error Control under Article 106(2).....	182
2.	Establish Market Feasibility Testing as the Basis of SGEI Verification	183
3.	Distinguish Between Existing and New Special or Exclusive Rights Underpinned by SGEIs	185
4.	Make Compliance with Relevant Sectoral Legislation a Condition of Article 106(2) Qualification	187
5.	Revisit the Public Authority and Solidarity Exclusions.....	188
D.	Concluding Observations	188
	<i>Bibliography</i>	191
	<i>Index</i>	207