
Contents

Acknowledgments xi

Introduction i

PART ONE | FOUNDATIONS

1. *Criminal Law Basics and the Willful Ignorance Doctrine* 7

- I. Criminal Law Basics 7
- II. The Willful Ignorance Doctrine and Its Normative Basis 11
 - A. Knowledge Crimes and Inculpatory Propositions 11
 - B. The Willful Ignorance Doctrine 12
 - C. A Brief History of the Willful Ignorance Doctrine 13
 - D. Introducing the Equal Culpability Thesis 15
- III. The Basic Notion of Willful Ignorance 17
- IV. Clarifying the Equal Culpability Thesis 21
- V. The Questions to Be Answered 23

2. *What Is Criminal Culpability?* 27

- I. Why Manifestation Is Essential 32
- II. Explaining Manifestation Is Harder than You Might Think 34
 - A. The Pure Causal Approach 34
 - B. The Epistemic Approach 40
- III. Toward a Better Theory of Criminal Culpability 42
 - A. Two Notions of Criminal Culpability 44
 - B. Necessary Condition: Inadequate Repulsion from Criminality Must Be a Cause of Your Act 46
 - C. How Much Insufficient Regard Is Manifested? 50
 - D. Objections 58

- E. Further Benefits: Defending the Culpability Hierarchy 60
 - F. Concluding Remarks 63
- IV. Moving to Normative Culpability: Culpability vs. Moral Blameworthiness 64
- V. Normative Arguments for a Lenity Approach to Manifestation 67
 - A. Legislature-Facing Considerations 67
 - B. Citizen-Facing Considerations 68
- VI. Clarifying the Theory: The Proper Role of Motives 72
 - A. Institutional Design Arguments for the Motive-Free Approach 74
 - B. The Pro-Defendant Argument 75
 - C. Summing Up 80

PART TWO | FROM WILLFUL IGNORANCE TO A THEORY OF EQUAL
CULPABILITY IMPUTATION

- 3. *The Scope of the Willful Ignorance Doctrine (I)* 85
 - I. The Unrestricted Equal Culpability Thesis 87
 - A. The Challenge for the Equal Culpability Thesis 87
 - B. Positive Arguments against UECT 89
 - II. First Restriction: Husak and Callender's Restricted-Motive Approach 93
 - III. Second Restriction: The Counterfactual Approach of Luban and Michaels 96
 - IV. Third Restriction: Hellman's Unjustified Ignorance Approach 101
 - A. Main Problem: Overinclusiveness 102
 - B. Second Problem: Objective Justification or Justifying Circumstances One Is Aware Of? 103
 - C. Another Worry: Excused Ignorance? 105
- 4. *The Scope of the Willful Ignorance Doctrine (II): The Duty to Reasonably Inform Oneself* 109
 - I. How to Properly Restrict ECT 110
 - II. There Is a Duty to Reasonably Inform Oneself 112
 - III. How the Duty to Reasonably Inform Oneself Affects Culpability 117
 - A. Breaching DRI Enhances Culpability 117
 - B. How Much Culpability Does Breaching DRI Confer? 121
 - IV. The Problem of Additivity: Preliminary Considerations 128
 - V. Getting Practical: Formulating Better Willful Ignorance Jury Instructions 130
 - A. The Simple Approach 132
 - B. The Safe Approach 135
- 5. *Toward a Normative Theory of Equal Culpability Imputation* 139
 - I. The Structure of Equal Culpability Imputation Principles 142
 - A. Imputation Principles Generally 142
 - B. The Role of Equal Culpability 143

- C. Reaching Equal Culpability through Aggregation 145
- II. The Practitioner's Problem vs. The Lawmaker's Problem 147
 - A. Defending Equal Culpability Imputation Generally: Legislative Intent and Purposive Arguments 148
 - B. Narrower Textualist Arguments 151
 - C. Statutory Reforms 154
- III. Answering the Lawmaker's Question: A Normative Theory of Equal Culpability Imputation 155
 - A. Yaffe's Account 156
 - B. A General but Precise Statement of the Same Rationale Rationale 156
- IV. Applications 161
 - A. Justifying Some Imputation Doctrines: Transferred Intent 161
 - B. Limiting Some Imputation Doctrines: Felony Murder, Voluntary Intoxication, and Pinkerton 163
- V. In Defense of the Willful Ignorance Doctrine 168

PART THREE | BEYOND WILLFUL IGNORANCE

- 6. *Iterated Reckless Ignorance as a Substitute for Knowledge* 175
 - I. The Existing Willful Ignorance Doctrine Doesn't Go Far Enough 176
 - II. Nonwillful Ignorance Can Be as Culpable as Knowing Misconduct 180
 - A. The Intuitive Case 180
 - B. The Theory behind the Scenes 183
 - III. Objections 188
 - A. Is the Required Addition Legitimate? 188
 - B. Is This Merely Substituting Negligence for Knowledge? 189
 - C. Practical Concerns 189
- 7. *Substituting Willful Ignorance for Purpose?* 195
 - I. Willful Ignorance Instructions in the Conspiracy Context 196
 - A. Willful Ignorance in the Conspiracy Context 196
 - B. Why the Second Circuit's No-Substitution Rule Is Correct 198
 - C. The More Interesting Question 200
 - II. Willful Ignorance Cannot Substitute for Purpose—First Argument 202
 - A. Why Purposeful Misconduct Is More Culpable than the Same Willfully Ignorant Misconduct 202
 - B. An Objection 208
 - III. Willful Ignorance Cannot Substitute for Purpose—Second Argument 210
- 8. *Subwillful Motivated Ignorance* 213
 - I. Subwillful Motivated Ignorance 214
 - A. Introducing the Concept 214

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| B. | An Account of Subwillful Motivated Ignorance | 219 |
| II. | Substituting Subwillful Ignorance for Recklessness | 223 |
| A. | Blanket Ignorance of a Foreseen Range of Risks Can Substitute for Recklessness | 224 |
| B. | Selective Risk Recognition Could but Probably Shouldn't Substitute for Recklessness | 228 |
| 9. | <i>Corporations Keeping Themselves in the Dark</i> | 231 |
| I. | The Duty to Inform Others | 235 |
| II. | What Is Corporate Criminal Culpability? | 239 |
| A. | Sidestepping Some Theoretical Challenges | 239 |
| B. | Sketching an Account of Corporate Criminal Culpability | 241 |
| III. | Constructing Corporate Culpability | 243 |
| A. | The Starting Point: Respondeat Superior | 243 |
| B. | Calling Respondeat Superior into Question: The Collective Knowledge Doctrine | 246 |
| IV. | The Equal Culpability Basis for the Collective Knowledge Doctrine | 249 |
| A. | The Insight behind the Collective Knowledge Doctrine | 249 |
| B. | The Proper Scope of the Collective Knowledge Doctrine | 250 |
| C. | Knowledge Aggregation beyond Willful Ignorance | 252 |
| D. | Knowledge Generation beyond Willful Ignorance | 254 |
| E. | An Objection | 260 |
| | <i>Conclusion</i> | 263 |
| | INDEX OF CASES AND LEGAL AUTHORITIES | 267 |
| | INDEX | 271 |