

CONTENTS

Foreword	v
Acknowledgments	ix
Preface	xi
Table of Cases	xxv
Table of Statutes	xxxix
Table of Statutory Instruments	xli
 Chapter 1	
Introduction	1
 Chapter 2	
Fiduciary Duties	5
Introduction	5
Overview	5
General duties under the 2006 Companies Act	6
Continuing relevance of fiduciary duties	7
Summary of the current law concerning directors' and employees' fiduciary duties	8
The need for clarity	11
Summary: the way ahead?	11
The fiduciary principle	13
Three fiduciary doctrines?	13
The relationship of trust and confidence: loyalty	13
Duties peculiar to fiduciaries	14
The meaning of 'fiduciary': undivided loyalty and the denial of self-interest	14
Self-denying loyalty: its application to directors and employees	18
Duties which are 'peculiarly fiduciary'	19
The relevance of remedy	20
The law on fiduciary duties in Australia	21
Does English law follow the Australian approach?	22
Conflicts of interest and unauthorised profits	23
The 'no conflict' rule	23
Self-dealing: statutory disclosure of interests – a new civil claim?	24
The provisions under the 2006 Act	25
Conflicts of duty and duty – the director of two companies	27
The 'no profit' rule	29
Sections 175 and 176 Companies Act 2006	30

Duration of 'no conflict' and 'no profit' duties	32
Inter-relationship of the 'no conflict' and 'no profit' rules	33
Rules or duties?	35
Concepts underlying the 'no conflict' and 'no profit' duties	36
Deterrence of self-interest	36
Strict application	37
Honesty and good faith irrelevant	37
What would have happened irrelevant	37
Interests – direct and indirect	38
'Possible conflicts'	40
Application of the 'no conflict' and 'no profit' duties	40
Prescriptive fiduciary duties	42
Outline	42
Statutory designation of duties as fiduciary	42
Section 171: the duty of a director to act within his powers	43
Section 172: duty to promote the success of the company	44
Section 173: Duty to Exercise independent judgment	45
A 'fiduciary duty of disclosure'	45
<i>Item Software (UK) Ltd v Fassihi</i> – the facts	46
<i>Item Software v Fassihi</i> : the decision of the Court of Appeal	47
Subsequent application of <i>Item Software</i>	48
Duties of disclosure as an employee	50
Contract	50
Equity	51
Summary of Law on disclosure: directors and employees	51
<i>Item Software</i> – discussion	52
<i>Bell v Lever Brothers</i>	53
A positive fiduciary obligation to disclose	53
Employees' duties of disclosure	55
Approach in relation to employees	56
Content of duty to disclose	57
Information	57
Misconduct	58
Duration of duty to disclose	59
Effect of breach of duty to disclose	60
The law as it stands and the case for proscription	60
English law: proscriptive or prescriptive:	60
Fiduciary loyalty – requiring positive action or the denial of self-interest	61
Academic opinion	61
Application of proscriptive approach	63
Conclusions	65
By whom and to whom are fiduciary duties owed?	67
Directors and de facto directors	67
Shadow directors	67
Employees	68
Duties to the company	68
Duties to third parties	68

Piercing the corporate veil	69
Duties by directors to shareholders	69
Comment	71
Duties to creditors	72
Relief from liability	72
The defence of fully informed consent	72
Ratification	75
Director interested in contract with the company	75
'Honest profits' made in circumstances which benefit the company	76
Misappropriation of company property	76
Bribes	77
Special resolution	77
Consent of all shareholders – the <i>Duomatic</i> principle.	77
Exception to applicability of <i>Duomatic</i> principle: fraud on creditors	78
Section 1157 relief	79
Principles	79
 Chapter 3	
Employees Owing Fiduciary Duties	83
Introduction	83
Scope of chapter	83
Background to claims against employees for breach of fiduciary duty	83
Concepts underlying the fiduciary doctrine	85
Loyalty, influence and confidentiality	85
Who is a fiduciary?	86
Fiduciary duties	87
Breach	88
Remedies	89
The primacy of the employment contract	90
Identifying the obligations owed by the 'fiduciary'	90
A fiduciary relationship in respect of part of an employee's role	91
The foundation of the contractual relationship	91
Relationship between the contractual relationship and a fiduciary relationship	92
Fiduciary duties: the status approach	93
<i>Attorney-General v Blake</i>	93
Wider recognition of the fiduciary nature of the employment relationship	96
Conclusions	97
Fiduciary duties: the modern approach – <i>University of Nottingham v Fishel</i>	98
Summary	98
The facts	98
Elias J's analysis	99
Application of the principles	101

Subsequent cases	102
The Court of Appeal's approach: <i>Helmet Integrated Systems Ltd v Tunnard</i>	106
Fiduciary duties – the agency approach	109
<i>Canadian Aero Service Ltd v O'Malley</i>	109
<i>Shepherds Investments Ltd v Walters</i>	110
The agent/servant distinction – an unhelpful approach	111
An employee's duty to account for profits	112
An employer's claim to profits in law and equity	112
<i>Reading v the King</i>	114
Discussion	118
Tension between <i>Fishel</i> and <i>Attorney-General v Reading</i>	118
Tension between <i>Fishel</i> and <i>Attorney-General v Blake</i>	119
<i>Fishel</i> and <i>Canadian Aero Services</i> reconciled?	122
The principles in practice	122
General	122
Acting solely in the interests of the employer	123
The relevance of discretion	125
The effect of contractual control on the existence of a fiduciary relationship?	127
Situations which are likely to give rise to the imposition of fiduciary duties	128
Employees having control of company property	128
Employees exercising a management function	128
Autonomous employees	129
Client-facing employees	129
Fraud	129
Bribery	130
Contracting into a fiduciary relationship?	130
Conclusion – a suggested approach	131
Chapter 4	
Contractual Issues	133
Introduction	133
The duty of fidelity	133
Origins of the duty of fidelity	134
The content and limits of the duty of fidelity	138
Competing	139
Preparatory acts	139
Spare time	143
Team moves	144
Garden leave	146
Effect of garden leave on the duty of fidelity	147
Garden leave and directors	148
Duration of the duty of fidelity	149
Duties to disclose misconduct	149
Remedies	155
Springboard injunctions	155

Account of profits	159
Covenants in restraint of trade	161
The enforceability of covenants	162
Legitimate interests	162
Confidential information	162
Staff stability	164
Goodwill	164
Evaluating covenants	164
Introducing covenants	165
The effect of TUPE on covenants	167
Repudiatory breach	169
The implied term of mutual trust and confidence	174
 Chapter 5	
Unlawful Competition	177
Introduction	177
Scope of chapter	177
Corporate opportunities	177
Preparing to compete	178
Confidential information	180
The relevant duties and their duration	181
Duties	181
No conflict/no profit	182
Good faith/disclosure	182
Duration of fiduciary duties	183
The general rule	183
Liability to account for profits under the general rule	184
Exceptions to the general rule	185
No powers to exercise: exclusion/garden leave	185
Resignation of directorship; continuing employment relationship	186
Exploitation of maturing business opportunities	187
The Companies Act 2006	191
Discussion	191
Corporate opportunities	192
Basis of liability	192
The principles in operation	193
Qualifications to the 'no conflict' and 'no profit' duties	194
Scope of business	194
Receipt of confidential information	195
Fiduciaries acting in more than one capacity	196
Common scenarios	197
Diversion of company/employer's contract or opportunity	197
Exploitation of opportunity which comes to the attention of the fiduciary in his fiduciary capacity but which the company/employer cannot exploit	198
Exploitation of opportunity coming to attention of fiduciary in private capacity	199
The need to show a particular duty?	199

<i>Industrial Development Consultants v Cooley</i>	199
A narrower formulation of duties?	201
Post-termination exploitation of 'maturing' business opportunity	202
The test	204
The maturing opportunity	205
'Prompted or influenced'	206
Comment	206
Preparations to compete	207
The 'no conflict' approach	209
<i>Balston Ltd v Headline Filters Ltd</i>	209
<i>Framlington Group plc & another v Anderson & others</i>	211
<i>Saatchi & Saatchi Company plc and others v Maurice Saatchi and others</i>	213
Conflicting interests	214
Termination – acting 'in concert'	214
The 'disclosure' approach	215
<i>British Midland Tool Ltd v Midland International Tooling Ltd</i>	215
<i>Item Software (UK) Ltd v Fassihi</i>	217
<i>Shepherds Investments Ltd v Walters</i>	218
Pragmatism – the way forward	220
<i>HISL v Tunnard</i>	220
<i>Foster Bryant Surveying Limited v Bryant</i>	221
Comment	223
Confidentiality	226
Overview	226
The nature of confidential information	227
The status of confidential information	229
Duration of confidentiality	229
The duty of confidence	230
Third parties and confidential information	230
Springboard relief	231
Confidential information received in the course of fiduciary relationship	233
<i>Bolkiah</i> – the right to a protective injunction	233
Contrasting approach towards directors and employees	234
Reversing the burden of proof: application of <i>Bolkiah</i> outside field of solicitors	236
Discussion	237
Chapter 6	
Bribes	239
Introduction	239
Principles in relation to bribes	239
The court's expressions of disapproval	240
The nature of a bribe	241
The need for classification	243
Secrecy	243

Third party's knowledge of the agent's position	245
Attribution of knowledge to the briber	246
The time at which knowledge is acquired	247
Is proof of inducement necessary?	248
The need for fiduciary duties?	250
<i>Reading v Attorney-General</i>	250
Bribes in the absence of a fiduciary duty	252
Breach of contract	253
Money had and received	254
Deceit	255
Fiduciary obligations by reason of the bribe	255
Offers of employment as bribes	257
Disclosure and consent	258
Contributory negligence	260
Rights of the briber	260
Remedies against the agent	261
The agent's 'right' to commission	262
The agent's 'right' to an allowance for skill and labour	262
Action in deceit	263
Remedies against the briber	265
Money had and received	265
Alternative remedies	266

Chapter 7

Accessory Liability in Equity	269
Introduction	269
Liability in equity	270
Dishonest assistance in a breach of fiduciary duty	271
The facts in <i>Royal Brunei Airlines</i>	271
The modern basis of liability	272
The nature of the relevant fiduciary duties	273
The nature of dishonest assistance	274
Is 'trust property' necessary?	275
Types of assistance	277
Omissions as assistance	278
Timing of the assistance	280
Knowledge of the trust or relevant fiduciary duty	281
Fiduciary's dishonesty is irrelevant	284
The test of dishonesty	285
Causation	289
Knowing receipt	289
Constituents of a claim	290
Disposal of assets in breach of fiduciary duty	290
Property or assets	292
Beneficial receipt	295
Causal link between breach and receipt	295
Knowledge	296
Time at which knowledge is relevant	298

Contributory negligence	298
Contribution proceedings	300
The approach to assessing contribution	301
 Chapter 8	
Vicarious Liability, Attribution, Imputation of Knowledge	305
Introduction	305
Three sets of rules	305
Vicarious liability	306
The rationale for vicarious liability	306
‘Course of employment’ and intentional wrongdoing	307
Lister and the ‘close connection’ test	309
Forgery and ‘close connection’	311
Vicarious liability and deceit	313
‘Close connection’ and vicarious liability for dishonest assistance	314
Bribes and vicarious liability	316
Joint wrongdoers and vicarious liability	317
Attribution	320
The reason for rules of attribution	321
Sources of rules of attribution	321
A working example	321
Directing mind and will	322
Imputation of knowledge – agency theory	323
The factual context in <i>El Ajou</i>	324
Hoffman LJ’s category 3 – authority to receive communications	324
Limits on imputation by authority to receive communications	327
Hoffman LJ’s category 4 – the agent’s duty to his principal	329
Category 2 – principal’s duty to investigate or disclose	331
Hoffman LJ’s category 1 – agent’s knowledge affecting performance or terms of authorised contract	332
Imputation and the ‘forgetful’ director	332
Aggregating knowledge and states of mind	333
The ‘fraud exception’ or ‘ <i>Hampshire Land</i> Principle’	335
The rationale for the fraud exception	336
(1) <i>In Re Hampshire Land Company</i>	336
(2) <i>J C Houghton v Nothard, Lowes & Wells</i>	337
(3) <i>Belmont Finance Corporation v Williams Furniture Ltd</i>	338
(4) <i>Moore Stephens v Stone & Rolls Ltd</i>	339
 Chapter 9	
Proprietary and Personal Remedies	343
Introduction	343
Overview: the available remedies	344
Rescission	346
Terminology	346
Following/tracing	346
The distinction between an account and an account of profits	347
Restitution and unjust enrichment	347

Remedies as of right/discretion	347
Election	348
Proprietary remedies	349
Three proprietary remedies, not one	349
Constructive trust	349
Definition	350
Institutional or remedial?	350
Application where property held by fiduciary	351
No application in cases of dishonest assistance	351
Historical development	352
The current position – <i>Attorney-General for Hong Kong v Reid</i>	353
What is property?	355
Businesses and business profits	355
Discussion	356
Can business profits be the subject of a proprietary claim?	358
Discussion	358
Proprietary relief and limitation	359
Account of profits	360
Principles underlying fiduciary accountability	360
Account of Profits – duty or remedy?	361
Rationale	361
What profits fall within the obligation to account?	362
Disproportionate remedy	363
The requirement for a nexus between the breach of fiduciary duty and the profits made	363
A fiduciary's liability to account for profits made by a third party	365
Profits made by a partnership of which the fiduciary is a partner	366
Profits made by a company in which the fiduciary is interested	366
'Alter Ego' companies	366
Summary	367
'Single asset' profits and 'business' profits	368
Single assets	368
Asset enhanced in value	369
Business profits	369
Loss of nexus through effluxion of time	370
A future relaxation of the law?	372
A two stage process	372
Assessment of the profits	373
General matters	373
Tax	374
Equitable allowances	375
Illustration through case law	375
<i>Boardman v Phipps</i>	375
<i>Guinness plc v Saunders</i>	377
<i>O'Sullivan v Management Agency Limited</i>	378
<i>Chirnside v Fay</i>	381
Discussion	381

Summary of relevant considerations	383
Equitable compensation	384
Availability of remedy for breach of fiduciary duty	384
Breach of duty – disclosure?	386
Causation and remoteness	387
Secondary liability: remedies	388
Remedies for dishonest assistance	388
Equitable Compensation	389
1 Account of defaulting fiduciary's profit	389
2 Account of personal profit:	389
3 Proprietary remedies	389
Basis of liability – primary or secondary?	390
Primary liability	390
Secondary liability	390
Account of fiduciary's profit	391
Accountability for personal profits	392
Equitable allowance in respect of dishonest assistant's allowance	393
Proprietary remedies	393
Discussion	394
Conclusion	396
Knowing receipt	397
Compound interest	397
Compound interest and dishonest assistance	398
Chapter 10	
Limitation	399
Introduction	399
The statutory provisions	399
A simple summary	401
Breach of trust – section 21	401
Three conditions of applicability	402
Pre-existing obligation	402
Substance of the pre-existing obligation	403
Connection between the obligation and the property	405
Is fraud enough?	406
Company directors	406
Employees	407
Duty to account – section 23	407
Directors and employees	408
Limitation by analogy	409
How a court of equity 'would have' proceeded	410
Equitable relief	410
Fraud or concealment – section 32	412
Section 212 of the Insolvency Act 1986	413
Laches	414
Dishonest assistance in a breach of fiduciary duty	415
Knowing receipt	416

Chapter 11	
Procedural Issues	419
Introduction	419
Statements of case	419
Pre-action disclosure	422
Disclosure against non-parties	424
Summary judgment and striking out	426
Index	429