

Contents

Foreword	XI
Preface	XIII
A Child-Friendly Summary	XV
Acknowledgments	XVI

Introduction: Children, Autonomy and the Courts: Beyond the Right to be Heard 1

1	The Argument in Favour of Prioritising Children's Autonomy in Best Interest Proceedings	1
2	The Problem with Best Interest Proceedings	4
3	Introducing the Children's Autonomy Principle	9
4	The Aim of this Book: Embedding Children's Autonomy in Official Decisions	11
5	Overview of this Book	14

1 A Proposal: Replace the 'Right to be Heard' with a 'Children's Autonomy Principle' 15

Introduction 15

1	Children and Proceedings: Is Article 12 Effective or is it Just Rhetoric?	17
2	The Obscured Autonomy Idea in the CRC	21
3	Let's Talk about Autonomy Instead of a Right to be Heard	30
4	Do Children <i>Want</i> Autonomy in Proceedings?	36
5	Why the Text of CRC Article 12 is Flawed	43
6	The Right to be Heard is a Right Particular to Children: Due Process and Fair Trial Rights	58
7	Comparison with Legal Rights for Adults with Cognitive Impairment	63
8	Concluding Thoughts on the Validity of the 'Right to be Heard' in Proceedings	67

2 The Children's Autonomy Principle and the Best Interest of the Child 71

Introduction 71

1	The 'Children's Rights' Age: The Legal Journey and the Best Interest Principle	73
2	The Best Interest Principle: Focusing on the Child	80

- 3 Where Should the Limits of the Best Interest Principle Lie? 90
- 4 The Best Interest Principle in Practice 97
- 5 The Interests of Which Children? 102
- Concluding Thoughts on Autonomy in the Context of the Best Interest Principle 112
- 3 The 'Liberal Ideal': Autonomy, Capacity and the Adult/Child Divide 115**
- Introduction 115
- 1 Introducing Autonomy 118
- 2 What Does 'Autonomy' Actually Mean? 122
- 3 Self Determination Theory: Autonomy as Crucial to Well-being 132
- 4 Is it so Obvious that Children Should be Denied Legal Autonomy? 138
- 5 What We Can Learn about Autonomy from Medical Law 146
- 6 Children's Autonomy in Medical Law (Compared to Other Areas of Law): A Different Ball Game? 162
- 7 Developmental Psychology and Children's Decision-Making Abilities 175
- Conclusions on Children and Autonomy 189
- 4 Ensuring Good Processes for Children through Respect for Autonomy 192**
- Introduction 192
- 1 Provision at National Level for the Right of Children to be Heard in Best Interest Proceedings: Being Heard is Not Seen as a *Right* 194
- 2 Providing the Opportunity to be Heard: Too Little Too Late? 'Capability', Being Heard 'Freely' and the Issue of Resources 208
- 3 Do Children Enjoy the Right to be Heard the Way they Wish? Representation, Judicial Interviews and Due Process 235
- Concluding Thoughts on the Process of the Right to be Heard 277
- 5 'Weighing' Views: The Right to be Heard Does Not Allow Children to Sufficiently Influence Outcomes 280**
- Introduction 280
- 1 The Right to be Heard is Not Making a Sufficient Difference 283
- 2 The Right to be Heard Has Benefited Some Older Children 318
- 3 Younger Children's Wishes Devalued 324
- 4 Why the Right to be Heard Gives Children Little Influence on Outcomes 325

- 5 Concluding Thoughts on the Inability of Children to Influence Outcomes 345
- 6 **Putting the Autonomy Principle into Practice: Moving from a Focus on 'Competence' to One on Significant Harm** 350
- Introduction 350
- 1 Justifying a Focus on Significant Harm 352
- 2 Redefining Harm: Repressing Autonomy as Harmful 355
- 3 Significant Harm in the Context of Respect for Children's Autonomy 363
- 4 The Concern that Children Will be Pressured or Manipulated in Proceedings 372
- 5 The Complexity of Reality: Resources and Other Obstacles 380
- 6 The Process of the Children's Autonomy Principle and Its Application 387
- Concluding Thoughts on a Focus on Significant Harm 390
- 7 **Autonomy Support: Embedding the Children's Autonomy Principle in Good Systems** 393
- Introduction 393
- 1 A Different Approach for Legal Systems: Children as Equals 396
- 2 Balancing Autonomy and the Integrity of the Family 404
- 3 Not Just Providing an Opportunity: Encouraging and Assisting 409
- 4 Autonomy Support: Structuring Respect 418
- 5 Systems Suitable for Autonomy Support 423
- Conclusions on Embedding the Children's Autonomy Principle in Good Systems 431
- Conclusion** 434
- 1 Recognising that Children Deserve More than a Right to be Heard 434
- 2 Prioritising Children's Autonomy in the Courts: Moving Beyond a Right to be Heard 436
- 3 Reframing the Best Interest Principle to Explicitly Include Autonomy 437
- 4 Respecting Families and Supporting Autonomy 439
- 5 Reframing Systems for Best Interest Proceedings 439
- Index** 443