

CONTENTS

Introduction

Why Constitutional Identity Suddenly Matters: A Tale of Brave States, a Mighty Union and the Decline of Sovereignty

ALEJANDRO SAIZ ARNAIZ AND CARINA ALCOBERRO LLIVINA 1

1. Part I: the Concept of National Constitutional Identity 3
 - 1.1. From Sovereignty to Identity 3
 - 1.2. Sketching scope and meaning of the concept. 8
2. Part II: National Constitutional Identity in the Aftermath of the Lisbon Treaty 9
3. Part III: National Constitutional Identity in the Jurisprudence of European Courts 12

Chapter 1

Two Different Ideas of Constitutional Identity: Identity of the Constitution v. Identity of the People

JOSÉ LUIS MARTÍ 17

1. Introduction 17
2. Two Ideas of ‘Constitutional Identity’ 19
 - 2.1. The Identity of the Constitution. 21
 - 2.2. The Identity of the People 30
3. Conclusion 35

Chapter 2

Methods of Identification of National Constitutional Identity

CONSTANCE GREWE 37

1. Introduction 37
2. The Typology of Constitutional Amendments 40
 - 2.1. The substantial conception of the revision 40
 - 2.1.1. Textual analysis 40
 - 2.1.2. Constitutional case-law 41
 - 2.2. The procedural conception 42

2.2.1.	Textual analysis	42
2.2.2.	Case-law	43
2.3.	The formal conception	43
3.	The Introductory Provisions of Constitutions	44
3.1.	The content of the 'introductory part'	45
3.1.1.	Institutional or 'sovereignist' content.....	45
3.1.2.	Constitutionalist or substantive content	45
3.2.	The preferences highlighted in the <i>Introductions</i>	46
3.2.1.	Textual analysis	46
3.2.2.	Case-law	47
4.	Conclusion	48

Chapter 3

Sovereignty Lost, Constitutional Identity Regained

ROBERTO TONIATTI	49
1. Introduction: Ambiguity and Ambivalence in the Process of Supranational Constitutional Integration	49
2. The Waning of Sovereignty.....	54
3. The Blooming of Identity	62
3.1 National identity as constitutional identity	63
3.2 Testing the identity clause in court: an ‘invitation to struggle’ ...	68
4. Final Remarks	71

Chapter 4

National Constitutional Identity in European Constitutionalism: Revisiting the Tale of the Emperor's New Clothes in Spain?

	RAFAEL BUSTOS GISBERT.....	75
1.	Two Sides of the Same Coin: Article 4(2) TEU and the ‘European Clauses’ in National Constitutions.....	75
2.	The Most Important Constitutional Changes Provoked by European Integration: A Brief Overview.....	77
2.1.	Legal system	78
2.1.1.	The extra-constitutional logic of the EU legal system ...	78
2.1.2.	The absence of an institution in charge of resolving competence conflicts.....	79
2.2.	The form of government.....	80
2.3.	The allocation of powers.....	82
2.4.	The centralised model of judicial review.....	84
2.5.	The constitutional regulation of the economy.....	85
2.6.	Preliminary title of the Constitution	87

3.	Is the Spanish Constitution Naked? Are We Witnessing Another Dangerous Case of the Emperor's Clothes?	88
----	---	----

Chapter 5

What Lies Behind Article 4(2) TEU?

	GIUSEPPE MARTINICO	93
1.	Goals and Structure	93
2.	Article 4(2) TEU as the Apex of a Constitutional Crescendo	94
3.	The Struggle for <i>τάξις</i>	98
4.	The Maastricht Treaty as a Turning Point in the Relationship between the ECJ and National Governments	100
5.	The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU	103
6.	Final Remarks	107

Chapter 6

National Identity: Trump Card or Up for Negotiation?

	MONICA CLAES	109
1.	Introduction	109
2.	The European Discovery of the Concept of 'Constitutional Identity'...	112
2.1.	The advent of 'national identity'	115
2.2.	A new context	118
2.3.	The embracement of 'constitutional identity'	121
3.	'National and Constitutional Identity' in the Case-Law of the Constitutional Courts	124
3.1.	National Identity in the case-law of the European Court	130
4.	Negotiating National Identity	134
4.1.	Modalities of the negotiations on national identities	135
5.	Conclusions	138

Chapter 7

Constitutional Identity and Fundamental Rights: The Intersection between Articles 4(2) TEU and 53 Charter

	AIDA TORRES PÉREZ	141
1.	Introduction	141
2.	The Substantive Perspective	143
3.	The Functional Perspective	145
3.1.	The primacy of EU law	145
3.2.	The uniform application of EU law	148
4.	The Procedural Perspective	152
5.	Concluding Remarks	156

Chapter 8

Criminal Law as an Essential Function of the State: Last Line of Resistance?

MARIBEL GONZÁLEZ PASCUAL 159

1. Criminal Law, Essential State Functions and National Constitutional Identity 159
2. European Criminal Law: Institutional Framework 165
3. Mutual Recognition of Judgments in Criminal Matters 167
4. Criminal Law as the Last Line of Resistance: Myth or Reality? 170

Chapter 9

The EU's Constitutional Core

DANIEL SARMIENTO 177

1. The EU's Legal Identity and the Three Normative Ideals 179
2. Channelling Identity through European Citizenship 181
3. The Constitutional Core of EU law: Foundation, Autonomy and Content 184
 - 3.1. Foundation and autonomy 184
 - 3.2. The protected content of the constitutional core 186
 - 3.2.1. Protection of the existence of the statute 187
 - 3.2.1.1. No arbitrary *de iure* deprivation of the statute 188
 - 3.2.1.2. No arbitrary *de facto* deprivation of the statute 189
 - 3.2.2. Protection of the substance of the rights attached to the statute: no strategic/structural restriction of fundamental rights 191
 - 3.2.2.1. Strategic breach 191
 - 3.2.2.2. Structural breach 193
 - 3.3. The constitutional core as a living instrument, and the inspiring force of the three normative ideals 195
4. Response to the Critics 197
 - 4.1. Competence Creep 198
 - 4.1.1. The critique 198
 - 4.1.2. Response 199
 - 4.2. Legitimacy 200
 - 4.2.1. The critique 200
 - 4.2.2. Response 200
 - 4.3. Subsidiarity 202
 - 4.3.1. The critique 202
 - 4.3.2. Response 202

Chapter 10

The Defence of National Identity by the German Constitutional Court

CHRISTIAN TOMUSCHAT	205
1. An Obsession – or a Serious Concern?	205
2. The Jurisprudence of the German Constitutional Court	207
2.1. Solange I	207
2.2. Solange II	208
2.3. The Maastricht Judgment	209
2.4. The Banana Market Decision	210
2.5. The Lisbon Judgment	210
2.6. The Honeywell Decision	214
2.7. The Judgment on the <i>Euro Crisis</i>	217
3. Concluding Observations	218

Chapter 11

What is not Constitutional Pluralism in the EU: National Constitutional Identity in the German *Lisbon* Judgment

HÈCTOR LÓPEZ BOFILL	221
1. Introduction	221
2. The Member State as the ‘Primary Democratic Space’	224
3. The Lisbon Judgment of the German Constitutional Court as a ‘Non Pluralist Constitutional’ Approach	226
3.1. Constitutional identity and the eternity clause	230
3.2. Citizenship	230
3.3. Civil and military monopoly on the use of force and deprivation of liberty in the administration of criminal law	231
3.4. Revenue and expenditure including external financing	233
3.5. Cultural issues such as language and the shaping circumstances concerning family and education	234
3.6. Freedom of opinion and press. Freedom of association. The dealing with the profession of faith or ideology	235
4. Plural Constitutional Identities before the EU Institutions are not Constitutional Pluralism in the EU	237
5. EU Law Primacy versus Constitutional Identity	239
6. Final Remarks	241

Chapter 12

The Case-law of the Polish, Hungarian and Czech Constitutional Courts on National Identity and the 'German Model'

JOËL RIDEAU	243
1. The Emergence of the Notion of Constitutional Identity in the Case-law of the Constitutional Courts.....	243
2. The 'German Model'.....	244
2.1. Solange I and Solange II.....	244
2.2. Maastricht Treaty.....	244
2.2.1. The control of acts of the European institutions	245
2.2.2. The Democratic Principle	245
2.3. The Decision on the Lisbon Treaty	246
2.3.1. The defence of the democratic principle	246
2.3.2. The principle of attribution of competences and its limits	247
2.3.3. The control of the respect of the limits.....	248
2.4. The order of 6 July 2010: concrete implementation of the control.....	249
2.5. The order of 27 October 2011	249
2.6. The decision of 7 September 2011	250
3. The Adoption of the 'German Model' by the Polish and Hungarian Constitutional Courts	250
3.1. Poland.....	250
3.1.1. The decision on the Accession Treaty.....	251
3.1.2. The European Arrest Warrant	251
3.1.3. The Decision on the Lisbon Treaty	252
3.2. Hungary	253
3.2.1. The Decision on the Lisbon Treaty	253
3.2.2. Present concerns.....	254
4. The Relative Distancing by the Czech Republic	254
4.1. The limits to the transfers of competences	255
4.2. Lisbon I.....	255
4.2. Lisbon II.....	256
4.3. The 2012 Decision	257
5. The Recognition of National Identity by EU Primary Law	258
5.1. National identity – a European notion.....	259
5.2. The convergence of national identity and of constitutional identities.....	259
6. Conclusion	260

Chapter 13

National Identity in Spanish Constitutional Court Case-law

PABLO PÉREZ TREMPs	263
1. Approximations in Defining Concepts and Content.	263
1.1. Introduction	263
1.2. Traditional Content: Freedom and Democracy.	264
1.3. Additional Content of National Identity	266
1.4. The 'Guarantee of the State'	268
2. The Constitutional Court's Definition of Identity	268
2.1. The formal Framework	268
2.2. The case-law content of 'identity': Guaranteeing the 'State' by safeguarding its sovereignty	270

Chapter 14

A Huron at the Kirchberg Plateau or a Few Naive Thoughts on Constitutional Identity in the Case-law of the Judge of the European Union

LAURENCE BURGORGUE-LARSEN	275
1. Nihil Novi I.	276
2. Nihil Novi II.	287

Chapter 15

National Identity and the European Convention on Human Rights

LUIS LÓPEZ GUERRA	305
1. Relative Absence of a Provision on National Identity in the European Convention on Human Rights.	305
2. National Identity and Margin of Appreciation	307
3. Some Aspects of National Identity: Politics, Transitional Situations, Traditions and Culture	309
3.1. Politics, national identity and electoral regulation	310
3.2. Right of property: transitional situations	311
3.3. Traditions and culture	313
4. Constitutional Identity. A Positive Consideration	314
5. Limits to the Relevance of Constitutional Identity	315
6. Constitutional Identity as an Aggravating Circumstance?	318
7. National Identity in the Absence of a Nation?	319
<i>A Brief Author CV</i>	323