

CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	v
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
<i>Acronyms</i>	xxi

Introduction	1
---------------------------	---

1	Background of the research	1
2	Problem statement and state of the art	2
2.1	Legal uncertainty	2
2.2	Regulatory inaction	4
2.3	Stakeholder risks	5
3	Research objective	6
4	Research questions	7
5	Relevance of the research	10
6	Methodology and structure	12
6.1	Typology, terminology, and interdisciplinary research	12
6.2	Supportive trust analysis	14
6.3	Money and virtual currencies	16
6.4	Fundamental analysis and critical assessment	17
6.5	Functional comparison	19
6.6	Integration, final assessment and recommendations	20

PART I CONCEPTUAL ANALYSIS	23
---	----

Chapter I

Typology and Terminology of Virtual Currencies	25
---	----

1	Introduction	25
2	Terminology of virtual currencies	26
2.1	Virtual currencies in the EU	26
2.2	Why 'virtual currencies'?	29
2.2.1	'Digital', 'electronic', or 'virtual'?	29
2.2.2	'Cash', 'currency', 'money', or none of the above?	32
2.3	Defining virtual currencies	35
3	Practical examples	38
3.1	Loyalty programs	38
3.1.1	Classic loyalty point programs	39

3.1.2	Mobile platforms	40
3.1.3	Frequent-flyer programs.....	41
3.2	In-game currencies.....	42
3.2.1	Pay-to-play	42
3.2.2	Free-to-play	45
3.2.3	Second Life	47
3.3	Prepaid value currencies	49
3.4	Cryptocurrencies	50
3.4.1	Background	51
3.4.2	Technical aspects.....	54
3.4.2.1.	Wallets and addresses	54
3.4.2.2.	Transactions	55
3.4.2.3.	Confirmation and blockchain	56
3.4.2.4.	Mining.....	59
3.4.2.5.	Other applications	61
3.4.3	Economic aspects	63
3.4.3.1.	Economics of cryptocurrencies	63
3.4.3.2.	Cryptocurrencies and fractional-reserve banking	66
3.4.3.3.	Mining risk	68
4	Typology	70
4.1	The ECB's typology of virtual currencies.....	70
4.1.1	Closed schemes	70
4.1.2	Unidirectional schemes	71
4.1.3	Bidirectional schemes.....	72
4.2	Application of typology to practical examples	73
4.2.1	Loyalty programs.....	73
4.2.2	In-game currencies	74
4.2.3	Prepaid value currencies	75
4.2.4	Cryptocurrencies.....	75
4.3	Alternative typology	76
5	Risk analysis	78
5.1	User risks	79
5.2	Market risks.....	81
5.3	Investor risks.....	82
5.4	Service provider risks	83
5.5	Risks and typology.....	84
6	Interim conclusions	85
 Chapter II		
Elements of Trust		89
1	Introduction	89

2	The abstract notion of 'trust'	90
2.1	Philosophy	91
2.2	Psychology	93
2.3	Sociology	93
2.4	Economy	96
2.5	Computer science and engineering	98
2.6	Law	103
2.7	Synthesis	109
2.8	Trust in modern society	110
3	Trust operationalization through law	112
3.1	Trust services in the EU	112
3.1.1	E-Signatures Directive	113
3.1.2	eIDAS Regulation	118
3.1.3	Synthesis	122
3.2	Other forms of trust operationalization through law	123
3.2.1	Trusted service providers at the EU Member States' level ..	123
3.2.2	Trusted custodian	125
3.2.3	Trust through consumer law	128
3.2.4	Trust through financial law	131
3.2.5	Synthesis	132
4	Interim conclusions	133

Chapter III

	Perspectives of Money	137
1	Introduction	137
2	Money as a legal concept	138
3	Theories on money	141
3.1	The credit theory and the origins of money	141
3.2	State theory	143
3.3	Role of the state in money creation	146
3.4	Functional theories	150
3.5	Amended state theory	152
4	Functions of money	154
4.1	Medium of exchange	154
4.2	Unit of account	155
4.3	Store of value	156
5	Virtual currencies as money	157
5.1	Virtual currencies and theories on money	157
5.2	Virtual currencies and functions of money	160
6	Interim conclusions	162

PART II LEGAL ANALYSIS	165
------------------------------	-----

Chapter IV

E-Money and Payment Services in the EU	167
--	-----

1	Introduction	167
1.1	Virtual currencies, e-money, and payment services.	167
1.2	E-money and payment services in the EU	169
2	E-money	171
2.1	Regulatory background	171
2.1.1	E-money before 2000	172
2.1.1.1	Working Group on EU Payment Systems 1994	172
2.1.1.2	EMI Council opinion 1997	177
2.1.1.3	ECB report 1998	179
2.1.1.4	EC proposal and explanatory memorandum 1998	182
2.1.1.5	ECB opinion 1999	186
2.1.1.6	Economic and Social Committee opinion 1999 .	188
2.1.1.7	European Parliament first reading 1999	189
2.1.1.8	Council common position 1999	192
2.1.1.9	Further procedure 2000	193
2.1.1.10	Findings	194
2.1.2	First E-money Directive	196
2.1.2.1	Directive	196
2.1.2.2	DG Internal Market Consultation Paper	198
2.1.2.3	Implementation in Member States	200
2.1.2.4	Review	203
2.1.3	Second E-money Directive	209
2.1.3.1	Directive	209
2.1.3.2	Implementation in the Member States	211
2.1.3.3	Review	212
2.1.4	Evaluation	213
2.2	E-money scope	214
2.2.1	Definition	214
2.2.1.1	Electronically, including magnetically, stored value	214
2.2.1.2	Represented by a claim on the issuer	216
2.2.1.3	Issued on receipt of funds for making payment transactions	217
2.2.1.4	Accepted by institutions other than their issuer	219
2.2.2	Redeemability	220

2.3	E-money and virtual currencies	222
2.3.1	Closed scheme virtual currencies	222
2.3.2	Unidirectional scheme virtual currencies	222
2.3.3	Bidirectional scheme virtual currencies	224
2.3.4	Evaluation	225
3	Payment services	226
3.1	Regulatory background	226
3.1.1	Before 2007	227
3.1.1.1	Early stages	227
3.1.1.2	Proposal PSD1	228
3.1.1.3	European Central Bank Opinion	230
3.1.1.4	European Economic and Social Committee Opinion	231
3.1.1.5	Council negotiations	232
3.1.1.6	European Parliament adoption	233
3.1.2	First Payment Services Directive	234
3.1.3	Review	237
3.1.3.1	Implementation, green paper, and consultation .	237
3.1.3.2	Proposal PSD2	239
3.1.3.3	European Economic and Social Committee Opinion	242
3.1.3.4	European Central Bank Opinion	243
3.1.3.5	European Parliament Committee Stage – First attempt	243
3.1.3.6	Council General Approach	244
3.1.3.7	European Parliament Committee Stage – Second attempt and adoption	245
3.1.4	Second Payment Services Directive	245
3.1.5	Evaluation	248
3.2	Payment services scope	249
3.2.1	Positive scope	249
3.2.2	Scope exemptions	256
3.2.2.1	Added value exemption	256
3.2.2.2	Limited network exemption	258
3.2.2.3	Money exchange exemption	260
3.3	Payment services and virtual currencies	261
3.3.1	Closed scheme virtual currencies	261
3.3.2	Unidirectional scheme virtual currencies	261
3.3.3	Bidirectional scheme virtual currencies	262
3.3.3.1	General remarks	262
3.3.3.2	Member States' opinions	263
3.3.3.3	European Commission's opinion	265

3.3.3.4	Exemptions	266
3.3.3.5	Additional remark	266
3.3.4	Evaluation	267
4	Toward a unified framework?	267
5	Interim conclusions	271
5.1	Findings	272
5.2	Normative assessment	274

Chapter V

Anti-Money Laundering in the EU		277
1	Introduction	277
2	Money laundering and the EU directives	278
2.1	The concept of money laundering	278
2.2	Road to Anti-Money Laundering Directive 4	279
3	Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive	281
3.1	Proposal Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive	281
3.2	Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive	284
4	Amendments to Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive	286
4.1	Commission proposal and legislative procedure	286
4.2	Virtual currencies	289
4.3	Virtual currency service providers	292
5	Virtual currencies under anti-money laundering rules	294
5.1	Virtual currencies as money laundering tool	294
5.2	Virtual currency service providers until AMLD4	298
5.3	Virtual currency service providers after AMLD4 amendments ...	303
6	Interim conclusions	307
6.1	Findings	307
6.2	Normative assessment	308

Chapter VI

Financial Instruments in the EU		311
1	Introduction	311
2	Regulatory background	313
2.1	Before 2004	313
2.2	First Markets in Financial Instruments Directive	315
2.3	Markets in Financial Instruments Regulation and Second Directive	316
3	Financial instruments scope	317
3.1	Personal scope of MiFID1 and 2	317
3.2	Material scope of MiFID1 and 2 – investment services	318
3.3	Material scope of MiFID1 and 2 – financial instruments	318

4	Markets in financial instruments and virtual currencies	321
4.1	Closed scheme virtual currencies	321
4.2	Unidirectional scheme virtual currencies	322
4.3	Bidirectional scheme virtual currencies	323
4.3.1	Cryptocurrencies intended as means of payment	323
4.3.1.1	EU perspective	323
4.3.1.2	Member State deviation: Germany	326
4.3.2	Cryptocurrencies intended as means of investment	329
4.3.2.1	EU perspective	329
4.3.2.2	Member State case: Belgium	332
A.	Investment instruments	332
B.	Crowdfunding	334
5	Interim conclusions	336
5.1	Findings	336
5.2	Normative assessment	337

Chapter VII

Virtual Currencies and Service Providers in the US

1	Introduction	341
2	Methodology	342
3	US regulatory frameworks	343
3.1	Money	343
3.1.1	Constitution	343
3.1.2	Stamp Payments Act 1862	344
3.1.3	Counterfeiting statutes	346
3.1.4	Application to virtual currencies	347
3.2	Payments	349
3.2.1	Electronic Fund Transfer Act 1978	349
3.2.2	Uniform Commercial Code	351
3.2.3	Application to virtual currencies	353
3.3	Anti-money laundering	354
3.3.1	Bank Secrecy Act 1970	355
3.3.2	Money Laundering Control Act 1986	362
3.3.3	State regulation	364
3.3.3.1	Uniform Money Services Act	364
3.3.3.2	California	366
3.3.3.3	Virginia	367
3.3.4	Application to virtual currencies	367
3.4	Investments	368
3.4.1	Securities regulation	369
3.4.1.1	Overview	369
3.4.1.2	Notes	370

3.4.1.3	Stock.....	372
3.4.1.4	Investment contracts.....	373
3.4.1.5	Currency.....	379
3.4.2	Derivatives regulation.....	380
3.4.3	State regulation.....	384
3.4.3.1	Blue sky laws and federal preemption.....	384
3.4.3.2	Uniform Securities Act.....	385
3.4.3.3	State commodity laws.....	386
3.4.4	Application to virtual currencies.....	387
4	Legislative developments.....	390
4.1	Federal level.....	390
4.2	Uniform Regulation of Virtual Currency Businesses Act.....	392
4.3	California.....	396
4.4	Delaware.....	400
4.5	New Hampshire.....	401
4.6	New York.....	403
5	Interim conclusions.....	407
5.1	Findings.....	407
5.2	Normative assessment.....	410

PART III CONCLUSION.....	413
--------------------------	-----

Chapter VIII

Integration, assessment, conclusions, and recommendations.....	415
--	-----

1	Integration of research findings.....	415
1.1	Virtual currencies as money.....	416
1.2	Virtual currencies under e-money and payment services.....	417
1.3	Virtual currencies under anti-money laundering.....	419
1.4	Virtual currencies and investment services.....	420
1.5	Findings.....	421
2	In need of regulation?.....	422
2.1	Preliminary assessments.....	423
2.1.1	E-money and payment services.....	423
2.1.2	Anti-money laundering.....	424
2.1.3	Investment services.....	424
2.1.4	Findings.....	425
2.2	Regulatory need.....	426
2.2.1	Risk pertinence.....	427
2.2.2	Changing virtual currency landscape.....	427
2.2.3	Objectives of financial law frameworks.....	431
2.2.4	Desirability of regulation.....	433
3	Conclusion.....	437

4 Recommendations 441

4.1 Merchants and users of virtual currencies 441

4.2 Virtual currency service providers and issuers 441

4.3 Legislators and regulators 442

Bibliography 445