

Contents

Preface v
Contents vii
Table of Cases xxi
Table of Legislation ci

Part I:
The Review Framework

Chapter 1 Introduction

What do we mean by judicial review? 3
The history 5

Chapter 2 The Justification for Review

Judicial review as an express constitutional and legal requirement 9
Judicial review and parliamentary intent 10
Judicial review and the rule of law 13
Judicial review and democracy 15
The institutional justification 18
The implications of the justifications 18

Chapter 3 Standing for the Purpose of Review

What is locus standi? 27
Historical development of the standing rule 28
Standing under the Rules of the Superior Courts 1986 31
The approach to standing in planning cases 35
Sufficiency of interest in practice 39
Insufficiency of interest 41
The determination of the standing issue 42
'The most vexed question of all' 46

Chapter 4 The Decisions Subject to Review: An Overview

The historical development 49
Review of decisions with a public element 51
Judicial review and the control of power 54
Unreviewable public decisions 56

Chapter 5 The Decisions Subject to Review: The Case Law

The need for a decision 61
Whose decisions are subject to review? 64
Decisions of courts 64
Decisions of the Director of Public Prosecutions 68

Decisions of other administrative bodies	69
Decisions outside the scope of review	83
Actions other than decisions subject to review	93

Chapter 6 The Principles of Review

The role of judicial review	97
The need for principle	98
Categories of principle	99
Principles governing the decision under review	100
Principles governing the conduct of the review	102
Principles and values	104
The application of the review principles	107

Chapter 7 The Effect of Review

The theory and practice of nullity	113
Effect in the narrow sense	116
The impact of statutory provisions on the effect of review	119
Effect in the broad sense	121
The Irish experience	122

Chapter 8 The Philosophy of Review

The current philosophy	127
Is the current philosophy sufficient?	129
People and places	129
Constitutionalism, legality and the culture of justification	132
European influence on the philosophy of review	137
International influences	138
The style of judgment	139
The substance of judgment	140
An activist agenda?	143
Conclusion	149

Part II: Review For Error

Chapter 9 Jurisdiction and Legality: an Introduction

The meaning of jurisdiction	155
Review for error of law in Ireland	161
Review for error of fact	165
Ouster clauses	165

Chapter 10 Jurisdiction and Legality: the Case Law

Introduction	169
Absence of authority to decide or exceeding authority	170
Loss of authority to decide	175
Is there a general principle that error of law deprives a decision-maker of jurisdiction?	188

Chapter 11 Error in the Application of European Union Law

The significance of european union law	195
The Treaties as the basis of european union law	195
The charter of fundamental rights	198
Legislation and general principles of law	200
The infiltration of european law into Irish law	201
European union law and judicial review: when is it relevant?	206
European union law and judicial review: the measures which may be challenged and forms of challenge	208
European union law and judicial review: the nature of the remedy	209
European union law and judicial review: grounds of review	210
European union law and judicial review: the degree of scrutiny required	211
European union law and judicial review: the experience so far	212

Chapter 12 Error of Law on the Face of the Record

Introduction	217
Application of the doctrine	219
Operative and non-operative errors	222
Remedying the error	227
The future for error of law	227

Chapter 13 Error of Fact

The historical approach to errors of fact	229
The modern approach	230
The future for error of fact	232

Part III: Review For Unfairness

Chapter 14 The Requirement of Fairness in Public Law

What is fairness?	239
Substantive fairness	242
Procedural fairness	247
Why grant a hearing?	250
What comprises a fair hearing?	251
Factors which determine the elements of a fair hearing	254

Chapter 15 Bias

The rule against bias	259
The rule against bias in practice	262
The nature of objectionable bias	264
Manifestations of bias	272
Necessity, waiver and estoppel	276

Chapter 16 The Requirement of a Fair Hearing

What triggers the requirement?	279
The commencement and cessation of the hearing requirements	281
Pre-hearing requirements	285
The substantive hearing requirement	291
The conduct of the hearing	300
The question of legal representation	307
Other aspects of a fair hearing	313
Hearing and considering	316
Delay in public decision-making	316
Exclusion of the right to a fair hearing	322
Loss of the right to a fair hearing	323
The problem of multiple hearings	324

Chapter 17 The Requirement that Reasons be Given

Why should reasons be given?	327
Case law on the right to reasons	328
Is there a right to reasons independent of review?	335
Reasons required by statute	336
The adequacy of the reasons	338
Who should give the reasons and when they should be given?	344
The effect of an inadequate statement of reasons	346
Administrative decisions for which reasons are not required	348
Judicial decisions	349
The requirement of reasons under european law	351

Chapter 18 Legitimate Expectations

The origins of the doctrine	353
Elements of a legitimate expectation	356
Limiting and overriding expectations	364
Enforcement of a legitimate expectation	369
The absence of expectation as a basis for relief	373

Part IV:

Review For Breach of Fundamental Rights

Chapter 19 Breach of Constitutional Rights

Express, unenumerated and natural rights	379
Rights in the democratic context	382
The role of the courts in vindicating rights	385
The enforcement of constitutional provisions other than those relating to rights	390
Constraints on the enforcement of constitutional rights	391
Constitutional rights and questions of policy	392
Constitutional rights and administrative discretion	398
Competing constitutional rights and imperatives	400
Conclusion	403

Chapter 20 Standards of Review

What do we mean by a standard of review?	405
Standards in the constitutional review of legislation	406
The standard in the constitutional review of executive or administrative action	408
Should there be a single standard of constitutional review?	410
'Context is everything'	412

Chapter 21 Proportionality: An Introduction

Proportionality as a ground of review	415
What is proportionality review?	416
Criticisms	423
Why proportionality?	426

Chapter 22 Proportionality: Comparative Approaches

Comparative approaches	429
Canadian proportionality analysis	429
Proportionality in Strasbourg	431
Proportionality in Luxembourg	434

Chapter 23 Proportionality Review in Practice

Proportionality review of legislation	439
Proportionality review of administrative decision-making: introduction	446
Proportionality review of administrative decision-making: pre- <i>Meadows</i>	447
Proportionality review of administrative decision-making: the <i>Meadows</i> case	452
Initial application of meadows in the review of administrative decision-making	453
Subsequent applications of <i>Meadows</i> and proportionality	455
Should we distinguish constitutional from administrative review?	457
A unifying principle?	459

Chapter 24 Deference

What is deference?	461
The range of deference	462
Deference in constitutional adjudication	465
Deference in administrative adjudication	466
Why defer?	469
The case against deference	470
The case for due deference	473
Deference and justification	474
When is deference due: factors in the application of deference	477
Deference and statutory interpretation	484
The deferential application of proportionality	485
Practical problems in the application of deference to proportionality	489
Is Irish proportionality analysis too deferential? – three criticisms	494

Chapter 25 Breach of the European Convention on Human Rights

The European Convention on Human Rights	501
Incorporation of the ECHR	503
Applying the ECHR	504
Enforcing the ECHR	506
The ECHR and judicial review	507
The standard of review	508
The remedies available where the applicant relies on a breach of the ECHR	512
The application of the ECHR in practice so far	512

Chapter 26 Breach of Other International Agreements

International agreements and their status in Irish law	521
International agreements and a legitimate expectation of respect	524
International agreements and the interpretive function	526

Part V:

Review For Unreasonableness and Abuse of Power

Chapter 27 Reason and the Rule against Unreasonableness

The role of reason in public decision-making	531
The decisions subject to the reasonableness requirement	532
Unreasonableness or irrationality as the basis of review	534
The rule against unreasonableness	535
Commentary on <i>Meadows</i>	540

Chapter 28 Application of the Rule against Unreasonableness

Applications of <i>Keegan</i>	547
Subsequent applications of <i>Keegan</i> and <i>O'Keeffe</i>	548
Applications of the rule against unreasonableness since <i>Meadows</i>	550

Chapter 29 Categories of Unreasonableness and Factors in the Determination

The breadth of the unreasonableness concept	553
Categories of unreasonableness	553
Factors in the determination	557
Applying the factors: just what is an unreasonable decision?	557

Chapter 30 The Adequacy of Reasonableness Review

The application of the rule	561
The Supreme Court and the single standard	561
Should one size fit all?	563

Chapter 31 Fraud, Bad Faith and Misuse of Power

Fraud	567
-------------	-----

Part VI:
Defences to an Application

Chapter 32 Legality and Mistake

Legality	575
What is legality?	575
Justification through the rule of law	576
Administrative mistake	585

Chapter 33 Review as a Discretionary Remedy

Introduction	587
Case law	587
‘Traditional principles’ or ‘factors which can properly be taken into account’?	595
Discretion and the rule of law	596
Discretion and the public interest	599
Are all the review remedies discretionary?	601

Chapter 34 The Conduct of the Applicant

Conduct connected with the decision under review	603
Conduct in the review proceedings	610

Chapter 35 Failure to Exhaust Alternative Remedies

What alternative remedies are there?	615
What is the exhaustion principle?	618
The rule of law and the application of the exhaustion principle	619
The case law	623
Judicial review as the appropriate remedy	628
Errors in respect of which review is inappropriate	630
Some observations about the exhaustion principle and its application in recent case law	631
When should the issue be determined?	641
Conclusion	642

Chapter 36 Delay

The principle	645
Time limits	645
Extensions of time	646
The computation of time	650
Delay and the enforcement of european union law rights	651
The onus of proof where delay is an issue	652

Chapter 37 Futility

Categories of futility	655
Futility in the sense that there is no benefit to the applicant	656
The approach to the issue	658

Futility arising from respondent incapacity	660
Public interest futility	661
The utility of a hearing	663

Part VII: The Remedies

Chapter 38 Certiorari

The scope of the remedy	667
The function of the court on an application for <i>certiorari</i>	669
The effect of an order	669

Chapter 39 Mandamus

Introduction	673
The circumstances in which the order may be granted	675
Factors precluding the grant of an order	678
The nature of the order	679
Procedural matters	679

Chapter 40 Prohibition

Introduction	681
Prohibition of inferior courts	682
Prohibition of tribunals and other bodies	690

Chapter 41 Declaration

Introduction	693
General features of the declaration	694
The declaration in ord 84 judicial review proceedings	697
Future developments	704

Chapter 42 Injunction

Introduction	707
Types of injunction	707
The principles on which an injunction may be granted	708
Standing to sue	713
Injunctions and the enforcement of the law	713
Injunctions in judicial review proceedings	715
Interim and interlocutory relief in ord 84 review proceedings	717
The <i>Okunade</i> case	718
Application of the principles	726
Conclusion	728

Chapter 43 Damages

Claims for damages	731
The circumstances in which damages may be awarded	733
Immunities	745

Part VIII: Procedure

Chapter 44 Order 84 Application, Plenary Action or Relator Action?

Order 84 application or plenary action?	749
If there is one form of review should there be one form of procedure?	750
What the courts have said about judicial review and constitutional challenge	752
Conclusion on the ord 84 or plenary action issue	755
Relator actions	756
Observations on the use of the relator action	759

Chapter 45 An Introduction to Order 84 Judicial Review Procedure

An historical introduction	763
The function of the rules	764
The question of procedural exclusivity	766
The Irish attitude	770
Some suggested reforms	773
More fundamental reforms	777

Chapter 46 Preliminary Procedure Including the Application for Leave

Pre-leave correspondence	779
The requirement that the applicant apply for leave	779
The title of the proceedings and the parties	780
The time limit and timing	783
Papers required for the leave application	786
The application for leave	790
Applications on notice	794
Judgment on the application	797
The imposition of terms on the grant of leave	798
Interim relief or staying the proceedings under review	799
Appeals in respect of the refusal of leave	804
The position of the respondent on the grant of leave	804

Chapter 47 Post-Leave Procedure

Steps for the applicant	805
Steps for the respondent	807
The exchange of submissions	809
Directions prior to the hearing	809
Documents required for the substantive hearing	811
The asylum, immigration and citizenship list	812
Commercial cases	813

Chapter 48 Interlocutory Applications

The entitlement to make an interlocutory application	815
Applications to amend	815
Discovery applications	820

Interrogatories	827
Applications for injunctions	827
Applications to stay, strike out or dismiss review proceedings	827
Applications for security for costs	829
Applications for undertakings as to damages	830
Applications for the trial of a preliminary issue	831
Bail	832

Chapter 49 The Hearing of the Review Application

The purpose of the hearing	833
The judge who hears the application	833
Representation	834
The form of the hearing	835
The scope of the hearing	839
The sequence in which issues are determined	839
The evidence	840
The argument	840
The conduct of the case	841
The onus and standard of proof	842
Should the hearing be in public and should the applicant be present?	843
A modular trial	844

Chapter 50 The Decision of the Court

The parameters for the decision	845
The three pillars of judicial decision-making	845
The reliefs which may be granted	849
The power to remit	851
Remittal in civil proceedings	851
Remittal in criminal proceedings	853
The reconsideration following remittal	858
Enforcement of the court's decision	858

Chapter 51 Appeals

The right of appeal to the Court of Appeal	861
Is the appeal moot?	861
The conduct of the appeal	862
Appeals to the Supreme Court	867
The conduct of the appeal	869
The application for leave to appeal does not operate as a stay	876
Relief pending the hearing	876

Chapter 52 Costs

Costs at the leave stage	877
Interlocutory applications in respect of costs	878
Costs on interlocutory applications	882
Final orders in respect of costs	883
Against whom the order may be made	885

Costs in particular situations	885
Costs in environmental judicial reviews	892
Costs and access to justice	895

Part IX: Procedure in Special Cases under Statute

Chapter 53 An Introduction to Statutory Judicial Review Procedure

The statutory provisions	899
Designing the structure for statutory judicial review	903
The statutory provisions and ord 84	904

Chapter 54 Procedure in Planning Cases

Introduction	905
Provisions relating to the leave application	906
Interlocutory applications	912
The hearing of the substantive application	913
Provisions affecting the court's order on the substantive hearing	913
The finality of the high court decision and restrictions on appeals	913

Chapter 55 Procedure in Immigration and Refugee Cases

Restrictions on challenges and their constitutional validity	917
The application for leave	919
The principles applicable in refugee matters	923
Review of findings on credibility and issues of fact	927
Appeals	931

Chapter 56 Procedure in Public Procurement Cases

The new directives	934
General procurement principles	938
Protection for the unsuccessful tenderer or candidate	939
Judicial review of procurement decisions: order 84A of the rules of the superior courts 84A cases	945
Contracts coming within the national guidelines	950
Judicial review of procurement decisions other than those within the Directives	952

Chapter 57 Procedure in Other Special Cases under Statute

Infrastructure decisions	955
Decisions affecting the environment and natural resources	958
Decisions of regulatory bodies	962
Decisions of bodies set up following the 2008 financial crisis	965
Decisions under the Houses of the Oireachtas (Inquiries, Privileges and Procedures) Act 2013	967
Decisions of the Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse	968

**Part X:
Other Forms of Review**

Chapter 58 Case Stated

Introduction	973
Appeal by case stated from the District Court	974
Consultative case stated from the District Court	980
Case stated from the Circuit Court	983
Case stated from the High Court	986
Other forms of case stated	988
What constitutes a point or question of law	989

Chapter 59 Statutory Appeals

The prevalence of statutory appeals	993
The statutory appeal and to whom it lies	994
The scope of the appeal	996
General appeals	996
Appeals in respect of questions of law	1006
Procedure	1011

Chapter 60 Article 40 Inquiries and Habeas Corpus Applications

Habeas corpus	1015
Article 40 of Bunreacht na hÉireann	1017
Who may apply	1020
Whether to apply or not	1021
The nature of the detention complained of	1022
Successive applications	1022
Respondents and notice parties	1023
The conduct of the inquiry	1024
The order for production of the body	1025
Justification of the detention	1026
Detention not in accordance with law	1027
Detention not in accordance with law in context	1030
The decision of the court	1041
Detention subsequent to the making of the order	1044
Non-compliance with orders of the court	1045
Appeals to the Court of Appeal	1046

**Chapter 61 References under Article 267 of the Treaty on the
Functioning of the European Union**

Sources of jurisdiction	1047
Who may refer	1048
The circumstances in which a reference may be made	1049
The subject-matter of a reference and its terms	1054
Hearing the reference	1057

Appendix

Order: 84	
Judicial Review and orders affecting personal liberty	1059
Order 84A	
Review of the Award of Public Contracts	1071
Order 84B	
Procedure in Statutory Applications	1076
Order 84C	
Procedure in Statutory Appeals	1081
Index	1085