

Contents

1	A Short History of Crimes Against Humanity	1
1.1	From the Laws of Humanity to Crimes Against Humanity	1
1.2	Nuremberg and the Invention of Crimes Against Humanity	8
1.2.1	The Nuremberg Charter	8
1.2.2	The Nuremberg Judgment	20
1.2.3	The Tokyo trial and subsequent prosecutions	25
1.2.4	The legacy of Nuremberg and Tokyo	29
1.3	From Nuremberg to The Hague and Beyond	33
2	Crimes Against Humanity Under General International Law	38
2.1	Scope of Applicability	38
2.1.1	General considerations	38
2.1.1.1	Crimes against humanity as crimes under international law	38
2.1.1.2	No necessary linkage to other crimes	46
2.1.1.3	Peace and war	50
2.1.2	Personal scope of application	56
2.1.2.1	Individuals	56
2.1.2.1.1	Nationality of victim irrelevant	56
2.1.2.1.2	Membership in group irrelevant	57
2.1.2.1.3	Private or public capacity irrelevant	59
2.1.2.1.4	Applicable modes of liability	61
2.1.2.1.5	Exclusion of the defence of superior orders	61
2.1.2.1.6	Exclusion from refugee status	63
2.1.2.2	States	66
2.1.2.2.1	General considerations	66
2.1.2.2.2	Responsibility of states to protect their population and to prevent crimes against humanity	66
2.1.2.2.3	Obligation not to engage in crimes against humanity	73
2.1.2.2.4	Limitation of state's normative sovereignty	73
2.1.2.2.5	Duty to punish	74
2.1.2.2.6	Extradition and Cooperation	92
2.1.2.3	Corporations and corporate actors	107
2.1.2.3.1	Corporations	107
2.1.2.3.2	Corporate leaders and employees	110
2.1.3	Temporal scope of application	140
2.1.4	Territorial scope of application	144
2.2	Gravity of the Crime	145
2.2.1	General considerations	145
2.2.2	Crimes against humanity and other international crimes	146
2.2.3	Sentencing	147
2.3	Normative Status	149
2.3.1	Customary law status of prohibition and definitions	149
2.3.2	<i>Jus cogens</i>	151
2.3.3	<i>Erga omnes</i> obligations	154
2.4	Principles of Interpretation	157

3 Jurisdiction Over Crimes Against Humanity	159
3.1 Jurisdiction to Investigate and Prosecute Crimes Against Humanity—General Considerations	159
3.1.1 A right for any state to exercise universal jurisdiction over crimes against humanity	159
3.1.1.1 Relevant practice and precedents	159
3.1.1.2 Effect of the right to exercise universal jurisdiction over crimes against humanity	165
3.1.1.3 Definition of the offence and right to exercise (universal) jurisdiction	166
3.1.2 No general duty to exercise jurisdiction	167
3.2 Torture	169
3.3 Enforced Disappearance and Apartheid	172
3.3.1 Enforced disappearance	172
3.3.2 Apartheid	174
4 Immunities, Amnesties, and Statutes of Limitation	175
4.1 Immunities	175
4.2 Amnesties	176
4.2.1 General considerations	176
4.2.2 Evaluating the validity of amnesties pertaining to crimes against humanity	179
4.2.3 No extra-territorial effect of amnesties	184
4.2.4 The special case of torture	186
4.3 Statutes of Limitation	187
5 <i>Chapeau</i> or Contextual Elements	194
5.1 General Considerations	194
5.2 An ‘Attack’	196
5.2.1 Definition	196
5.2.1.1 Customary international law	196
5.2.1.2 ICC framework	200
5.2.2 Element of scale	204
5.2.3 Individual components	207
5.2.4 Timing of the attack	210
5.2.5 Geographical scope of the attack	212
5.2.6 Reason for attack	214
5.2.6.1 General considerations	214
5.2.6.2 No general requirement of discrimination	214
5.2.6.3 No <i>tu quoque</i> justification	217
5.2.7 ‘Attack’ and armed conflict	220
5.2.7.1 Two distinct notions	220
5.2.7.2 An ‘attack’ in a military context	222
5.2.8 Evidential considerations	224
5.2.8.1 Standard of proof and object of proof	224
5.2.8.2 Factors relevant to establishing the attack	228
5.3 Directed Against Any Civilian Population	232
5.3.1 General considerations	232
5.3.2 ‘Directed against’	232
5.3.2.1 <i>Raison d’être</i>	232
5.3.2.2 Meaning	233
5.3.2.3 Evidential considerations	237
5.3.3 ‘Any’ civilian population	242

5.3.4	'Civilian population'	245
5.3.4.1	'Population'	245
5.3.4.1.1	<i>Raison d'être</i>	245
5.3.4.1.2	Definition	246
5.3.4.1.3	Identifying the attacked population	247
5.3.4.2	'Civilian' population	248
5.3.4.2.1	<i>Raison d'être</i>	248
5.3.4.2.2	Definition	249
5.3.4.3	Attacks on the armed forces	257
5.3.4.4	Individual victims	259
5.4	'Widespread or Systematic' Character of the Attack	266
5.4.1	General considerations	266
5.4.1.1	<i>Raison d'être</i>	266
5.4.1.2	Widespread or systematic—Alternative requirements	267
5.4.1.3	Relative notions	269
5.4.2	'Widespread'	270
5.4.3	'Systematic'	273
5.4.4	Evidential considerations	277
5.4.5	Policy requirement	285
5.4.5.1	Customary law—No requirement of policy	285
5.4.5.2	ICC regime	287
5.4.5.2.1	Normative framework	287
5.4.5.2.2	<i>Raison d'être</i>	291
5.4.5.2.3	Meaning	292
5.4.5.2.4	Evidential issues	304
5.4.5.2.5	State or an organization promotes or encourages	313
5.4.5.2.6	'Pursuant to or in furtherance of'	323
5.4.5.2.7	<i>Mens rea</i> and policy requirement	325
5.5	Nexus Between the Acts of the Accused and the Attack	327
5.5.1	Definition of the 'nexus'	327
5.5.1.1	General considerations	327
5.5.1.2	Acts of the accused are an objective part of the attack	328
5.5.1.3	Exclusion of isolated acts	331
5.5.1.4	Nexus and <i>mens rea</i>	333
5.5.1.5	No policy requirement	334
5.5.2	Evidential considerations	334
5.5.2.1	Relevant factors	334
5.5.2.2	Contextual appraisal of the requirement	338
5.5.2.3	Exclusion of isolated acts	340
5.6	Requisite State of Mind or <i>Mens Rea</i>	341
5.6.1	General considerations	341
5.6.2	Knowledge by the accused of the attack and of his participation therein	342
5.6.2.1	Extent of required knowledge	342
5.6.2.2	Purpose and motives	344
5.6.2.3	<i>Mens rea</i> of the accused or that of the perpetrator?	346
5.6.2.4	The ICC regime	349
5.6.3	Evidential factors	351
6	Underlying Offences	357
6.1	What Crimes Can Constitute Crimes Against Humanity	357
6.1.1	Underlying crimes in the jurisdiction of international(ized) criminal tribunals	357
6.1.1.1	Nuremberg, Tokyo, and Control Council Law No. 10	357
6.1.1.2	The UN war crimes tribunals	357

6.1.1.3	The ICC	358
6.1.1.4	Other international(ized) jurisdictions	359
6.1.2	Customary law and beyond	360
6.1.2.1	Which crimes against humanity form part of customary international law?	360
6.1.2.2	Exhaustive nature of the list of crimes against humanity	366
6.1.2.3	Conspiracy to commit crimes against humanity	367
6.2	Murder	369
6.2.1	General considerations	369
6.2.1.1	Murder as a crime against humanity—A brief history	369
6.2.1.2	Elements of the offence—Customary international law	370
6.2.1.3	Murder in the ICC regime	372
6.2.2	<i>Actus reus</i>	373
6.2.3	<i>Mens rea</i>	378
6.2.4	Murder and associated offences	381
6.3	Extermination	383
6.3.1	General considerations	383
6.3.1.1	Extermination as a crime against humanity—A brief history	383
6.3.1.2	Elements of the offence—Customary international law	384
6.3.1.2.1	Collective context; individual acts	384
6.3.1.2.2	Elements of the offence	386
6.3.1.3	Extermination in the ICC regime	387
6.3.2	<i>Actus reus</i>	388
6.3.2.1	Large-scale killings	388
6.3.2.1.1	Mass killings as a necessary element of the offence	388
6.3.2.1.2	A single occurrence of mass killings or connected incidents	391
6.3.2.1.3	Victims of the crime are a collection of individuals, not a group or population as such	395
6.3.2.1.4	Evaluating the element of scale	396
6.3.2.2	Direct or indirect contribution to killings	398
6.3.2.3	Method of killing irrelevant	401
6.3.2.4	Creating inhuman conditions of life as a method of extermination	402
6.3.3	<i>Mens rea</i>	403
6.3.3.1	Elements of <i>mens rea</i>	403
6.3.3.2	Motives, purpose, and discriminatory mindset	407
6.3.3.3	Evidential considerations	408
6.3.4	Extermination and associated offences	408
6.4	Enslavement	412
6.4.1	General considerations	412
6.4.1.1	Enslavement as a crime against humanity—A brief history	412
6.4.1.2	Elements of the offence—Customary international law	414
6.4.1.3	Enslavement in the ICC regime	415
6.4.1.4	Breadth of the prohibition	417
6.4.2	<i>Actus reus</i>	421
6.4.2.1	Elements of the <i>actus reus</i>	421
6.4.2.2	Absence of consent not an element of the offence	423
6.4.2.3	Evidential considerations	424
6.4.3	<i>Mens rea</i>	426
6.4.4	Enslavement and associated offences	427
6.5	Deportation and Forcible Transfer of Population	430
6.5.1	General considerations	430
6.5.1.1	Deportation and forcible transfer as crimes against humanity—A brief history	430

6.5.1.2	Elements of the offence under customary international law	433
6.5.1.3	Deportation and forcible transfer in the ICC regime	436
6.5.2	<i>Actus reus</i>	440
6.5.2.1	Core elements	440
6.5.2.2	Movement across borders for deportation	444
6.5.2.3	No minimum distance of displacement required	449
6.5.2.4	Unlawful displacement not limited to removal from usual place of residence	450
6.5.2.5	No minimum duration of displacement	452
6.5.2.6	'Forced' or coerced nature of movement	452
6.5.2.7	Displaced persons 'lawfully present'	462
6.5.2.7.1	Broad and purposeful interpretation of the notion of lawful presence	462
6.5.2.7.2	Lawful presence to be determined in accordance with international law	465
6.5.2.7.3	Considerations pertaining to the status of the displaced person	466
6.5.2.8	Permissible grounds of removal under international law	467
6.5.2.8.1	Permissible grounds of displacement	467
6.5.2.8.2	Conditions and modalities of displacement	470
6.5.2.9	Evidential considerations	474
6.5.3	<i>Mens rea</i>	478
6.5.4	Deportation, forcible transfer, and associated offences	481
6.6	Imprisonment	485
6.6.1	General considerations	485
6.6.1.1	Imprisonment as a crime against humanity—A brief history	485
6.6.1.2	Elements of the offence under customary international law	487
6.6.1.3	Imprisonment in the ICC regime	489
6.6.2	<i>Actus reus</i>	492
6.6.2.1	Arbitrary deprivation of liberty	492
6.6.2.1.1	General considerations	492
6.6.2.1.2	Existence of a valid legal basis for detention	497
6.6.2.1.3	Protection of basic procedural safeguards	499
6.6.2.2	Relevant forms or types of deprivation of liberty	502
6.6.2.3	Security detention	504
6.6.3	<i>Mens rea</i>	507
6.6.4	Imprisonment and associated offences	507
6.7	Torture	509
6.7.1	General considerations	509
6.7.1.1	Torture as a crime against humanity—A brief history	509
6.7.1.2	Normative status and scope of application	510
6.7.1.3	Elements of the offence under customary international law	517
6.7.1.4	Torture in the ICC regime	517
6.7.2	<i>Actus reus</i>	523
6.7.2.1	The infliction of severe pain	523
6.7.2.2	Form of the underlying act	527
6.7.3	<i>Mens rea</i>	529
6.7.3.1	An intent to inflict severe pain and a prohibited purpose	529
6.7.3.2	Evidential considerations	532
6.7.4	Torture and associated offences	533
6.8	Rape	536
6.8.1	General considerations	536
6.8.1.1	Rape as a crime against humanity—A brief history	536
6.8.1.2	Normative status	538

6.8.1.3	Elements of the offence under customary international law	539
6.8.1.4	Rape in the ICC regime	541
6.8.1.5	Select evidential challenges	548
6.8.2	<i>Actus reus</i>	555
6.8.2.1	Penetration	556
6.8.2.2	Absence of consent	557
6.8.2.3	Culpable contribution to the crime	563
6.8.3	<i>Mens rea</i>	564
6.8.3.1	Applicable standard	564
6.8.3.2	Establishing the <i>mens rea</i>	565
6.8.4	Rape and associated offences	567
6.9	Persecution	569
6.9.1	Persecution as a crime against humanity—A brief history	569
6.9.1.1	Birth of the crime against humanity of persecution at Nuremberg	569
6.9.1.2	Persecution as a crime under customary law	571
6.9.2	<i>Raison d'être</i> and elements of the offence—General considerations	572
6.9.3	Discrimination against members of a group	573
6.9.3.1	Targeting of individuals based on membership in a group	573
6.9.3.1.1	Persecution as crime directed against individuals or groups?	573
6.9.3.1.2	Civilian or military character of victim irrelevant	575
6.9.3.2	Membership of the victim in a discernible group	575
6.9.3.2.1	Victim belongs to a targeted group whose members are discriminated against	575
6.9.3.2.2	Defining the group—Objective and subjective considerations	576
6.9.3.2.3	Victim mistakenly believed to belong to targeted group	578
6.9.3.2.4	The law of genocide <i>vs</i> the law of persecution	580
6.9.3.2.4.1	The notion and relevance of the 'group'	580
6.9.3.2.4.2	Protected interest: Individuals <i>vs</i> groups	582
6.9.3.2.4.3	Respective grounds of discrimination	583
6.9.4	Grounds of persecution	584
6.9.4.1	General considerations	584
6.9.4.2	State of customary international law	584
6.9.4.2.1	At the core: Political, racial, and religious grounds	584
6.9.4.2.2	Ethnic grounds and beyond	587
6.9.4.3	Disjunctive and overlapping grounds of discrimination	589
6.9.4.3.1	Disjunctive nature of grounds of discriminatory	589
6.9.4.3.2	Overlapping nature of grounds of discrimination	589
6.9.4.4	Political grounds	591
6.9.4.5	Racial grounds	596
6.9.4.6	Religious grounds	596
6.9.4.7	Ethnic grounds	597
6.9.4.8	National grounds	599
6.9.4.9	Gender grounds	602
6.9.4.10	Social, cultural, or other grounds that are universally recognized as impermissible under international law	604
6.9.5	<i>Actus reus</i>	608
6.9.5.1	General considerations	608
6.9.5.1.1	The many possible forms of persecutory acts	608

6.9.5.1.2	Underlying act need not itself be a recognized criminal offence; severe rights violations may qualify	614
6.9.5.1.3	Requirement of equal gravity	618
6.9.5.1.3.1	Not every violation of rights constitutes persecution—Equal gravity requirement	618
6.9.5.1.3.2	Gross or blatant violations of rights only	619
6.9.5.1.3.3	Overall and contextual assessment of gravity	620
6.9.5.1.3.4	No additional element of inhumanity required	625
6.9.5.2	Categories of underlying acts capable of amounting to persecutions	625
6.9.5.2.1	General and historical considerations	625
6.9.5.2.2	Examples of underlying persecutory acts	628
6.9.5.2.3	Destruction and unlawful appropriation of property as persecution	640
6.9.5.2.4	Single act or course of conduct amounting to persecution	643
6.9.5.3	Discrimination ‘in fact’	645
6.9.5.3.1	Actual discrimination as element of the <i>actus reus</i>	645
6.9.5.3.2	Interpreting the requirement	646
6.9.5.3.3	Establishing discrimination in fact	648
6.9.6	<i>Mens rea</i>	651
6.9.6.1	Dual element of <i>mens rea</i> —Underlying act and discriminatory intent	651
6.9.6.2	<i>Dolus specialis</i> to discriminate	651
6.9.6.2.1	General considerations	651
6.9.6.2.2	No required knowledge of a policy or plan	653
6.9.6.3	Recognized grounds of discrimination	653
6.9.6.3.1	One of the prohibited grounds was intended	653
6.9.6.3.2	Whose intent?	654
6.9.6.4	Deliberateness in relation to underlying act or conduct	655
6.9.6.4.1	Deliberateness of underlying conduct	655
6.9.6.4.2	Recklessness and knowledge insufficient	656
6.9.6.4.3	Motives irrelevant	656
6.9.6.5	Proving the discriminatory intent	658
6.9.6.6	Persecutory <i>mens rea</i> vs genocidal intent	664
6.9.6.7	Discriminatory intent aggravates the offence	665
6.9.7	Persecution in the Statute of the ICC	666
6.9.7.1	Definition of persecution at the ICC	666
6.9.7.2	ICC regime vs customary international law	666
6.9.7.3	Peculiarities of the ICC regime	668
6.9.7.3.1	Against any identifiable group or collectivity	668
6.9.7.3.2	Range of discriminatory grounds	669
6.9.7.3.2.1	New grounds of discrimination	669
6.9.7.3.2.2	Subjective assessment of grounds of discrimination	670
6.9.7.3.3	‘In connection with’ another crime	670
6.9.7.3.3.1	Origin of the requirement	670
6.9.7.3.3.2	Meaning of the requirement	673
6.9.7.3.4	<i>Mens rea</i>	675
6.9.8	Persecution and associated offences	676

6.10 Other Inhumane Acts	677
6.10.1 General considerations	677
6.10.1.1 Origin of the offence	677
6.10.1.2 Residual character of the offence	678
6.10.1.3 Elements of the offence	680
6.10.1.3.1 Customary international law	680
6.10.1.3.2 ICC regime	681
6.10.2 <i>Actus reus</i>	687
6.10.2.1 Elements of <i>actus reus</i>	687
6.10.2.2 Type and form of the underlying conduct	687
6.10.2.3 Gravity threshold	695
6.10.2.4 Indirect victims	697
6.10.3 <i>Mens rea</i>	698
6.10.4 Other inhumane acts and associated offences	699
6.11 Enforced Disappearance	700
6.11.1 Enforced disappearance as a human rights violation	700
6.11.2 Enforced disappearance as a crime against humanity	703
6.11.2.1 Recognition of enforced disappearance as a criminal offence	703
6.11.2.1.1 Enforced disappearance as a recognized criminalized practice	703
6.11.2.1.2 The transformation of a human rights prohibition into a crime against humanity	705
6.11.2.2 Status under customary international law?	706
6.11.2.2.1 1975—Not yet part of customary law	706
6.11.2.2.2 Developments since then—The recognition of enforced disappearance under customary international law	706
6.11.2.3 Definition and elements	710
6.11.2.3.1 General elements of the offence	710
6.11.2.3.2 A state or no state?	712
6.11.2.3.3 Refusal to clarify fate of victim	715
6.11.2.3.4 Categories of potential perpetrators	718
6.11.3 Enforced disappearance in the Statute of the ICC	718
6.11.3.1 The definition	718
6.11.3.2 Deprivation of liberty	719
6.11.3.3 Denial or suppression of information	720
6.11.3.3.1 Refusal to provide information as an element of the crime	720
6.11.3.3.2 Refusal to inform need not be imputed to the accused	721
6.11.3.3.3 Does a refusal imply a request for information?	721
6.11.3.3.4 Possible forms of refusal	723
6.11.3.4 Involvement of a state or political organization	724
6.11.3.4.1 Statutory requirement	724
6.11.3.4.2 Stage or stages of involvement	724
6.11.3.4.3 Form and manner of involvement	725
6.11.3.4.4 State or political organization	726
6.11.3.5 Dual element of intent	726
6.11.3.5.1 Normative framework	726
6.11.3.5.2 Intended removal for a prolonged period of time	728
6.11.3.6 A continuing crime (within jurisdictional limits)	729
6.11.3.6.1 A continuing crime	729
6.11.3.6.2 Limited competence <i>ratione temporis</i> of the Court	730
6.11.4 Enforced disappearance and associated offences	730

6.12	Apartheid	732
6.12.1	A short history of the crime against humanity of apartheid	732
6.12.2	Apartheid under customary international law	738
6.12.3	Perpetratorship	739
6.12.4	The crime of apartheid in the ICC Statute	739
6.12.4.1	The importance of the statutory recognition of apartheid as a crime against humanity	739
6.12.4.2	Definition of the crime	740
6.12.4.2.1	Normative framework	740
6.12.4.2.2	Inhumane acts	740
6.12.4.2.3	In the context of an institutionalized regime of systematic oppression and domination	742
6.12.4.2.4	On grounds of race	743
6.12.4.2.5	<i>Mens rea</i>	744
6.12.5	Apartheid and associated offences	744
6.13	Sexual and Gender Crimes	745
6.13.1	General considerations	745
6.13.1.1	From the First World War to the ICC and beyond	745
6.13.1.2	Gender-specific and non-gendered crimes— Overlap and differences	750
6.13.2	Sexual slavery	751
6.13.2.1	Origin of the offence	751
6.13.2.2	Elements of the offence	754
6.13.2.3	Sexual slavery and associated offences	763
6.13.3	Enforced prostitution	767
6.13.3.1	Origin of the offence	767
6.13.3.2	Elements of the offence	770
6.13.3.3	Enforced prostitution and associated offences	774
6.13.4	Forced pregnancy	775
6.13.4.1	Origin of the offence	775
6.13.4.2	Elements of the offence	776
6.13.4.3	Forced pregnancy and associated offences	781
6.13.5	Enforced sterilization	782
6.13.5.1	Origin of the offence	782
6.13.5.2	Elements of the offence	783
6.13.5.3	Enforced sterilization and associated offences	785
6.13.6	Sexual violence	785
6.13.6.1	Origin of the offence	785
6.13.6.2	Elements of the offence	787
6.13.6.3	Sexual violence and associated offences	793
6.13.7	Forced marriage	795
7	Crimes Against Humanity and Other International Crimes	799
7.1	Crimes Against Humanity in a Nutshell	799
7.2	Crimes Against Humanity and War Crimes	801
7.2.1	General considerations	801
7.2.2	Different contextual elements	802
7.2.2.1	Armed conflict and nexus therewith	802
7.2.2.2	Widespread or systematic attack against a civilian population	804
7.2.3	Different scope of criminalization	805
7.2.3.1	Protected individuals	805
7.2.3.2	Protected properties	808
7.2.3.3	Underlying offences	809
7.2.4	Relative gravity	810

7.3 Crimes Against Humanity and Genocide	813
7.3.1 Common features	813
7.3.2 Differences	814
7.3.2.1 Different <i>mens rea</i> and relevance of groups	814
7.3.2.2 Range of underlying crimes	815
7.3.2.3 Widespread or systematic attack against a civilian population	816
7.3.2.4 Protected individuals	816
7.3.2.5 Specific inchoate offences for genocide	817
7.3.2.6 Policy element	817
7.3.2.7 Gravity	818
7.3.2.8 Other normative differences	818
7.3.3 Genocide and certain overlapping crimes against humanity	819
7.3.3.1 Genocide and persecution	819
7.3.3.2 Genocide and extermination	820
7.3.3.3 Genocide and enforced sterilization	821
7.3.3.4 Genocide, deportation, and forcible transfer	822
7.4 Crimes Against Humanity and Aggression	823
7.5 Crimes Against Humanity and Terrorism	827
 <i>Bibliography</i>	 831
<i>Index</i>	857