

TABLE OF CONTENTS

A PRIMER

FONS COOMANS, FRED GRÜNFELD and MENNO T. KAMMINGA	11
---	----

1. Problems with Methods of Human Rights Research.....	12
2. Some Suggestions.....	14

SOCIAL SCIENCE METHODS AND HUMAN RIGHTS

TODD LANDMAN	19
--------------------	----

1. Introduction.....	19
2. Human Rights as an 'Object of Inquiry'	21
2.1. Absence of Agreed Philosophical Foundations.....	21
2.2. Contestation over the Meaning of Human Rights	22
2.3. Applicability of the Social Sciences	24
3. Methods in Social Science.....	25
3.1. Dimensions of Social Science Research.....	26
3.1.1. Epistemological Continuum.....	26
3.1.2. Cross-National Generalisations and Comparative Methods.....	31
3.1.2.1. Global Comparative Analysis.....	31
3.1.2.2. Few-Country Comparisons	33
3.1.2.3. Single-Country Studies.....	36
3.2. Quantitative and Qualitative Evidence	39
4. Conclusion: Methods Matter	41

REDEFINING NORMATIVE LEGAL SCIENCE: TOWARDS AN ARGUMENTATIVE DISCIPLINE

JAN M. SMITS.....	45
-------------------	----

1. Introduction.....	45
2. From Internal to External Approaches of Legal Science	46
3. Towards a Redefinition of Normative Legal Scholarship: the <i>Homo Juridicus</i>	48
4. The Methodology of Normative Legal Scholarship	50
4.1. Law as the Science of Competing Arguments.....	50

4.2. How Can the Better Arguments Be Found?.....	51
4.3. Three Consequences.....	54
5. Two Examples: Fundamental Rights in Relationships between Private Parties	55
6. Conclusions: Legal Science as a Scholarly Discipline	57

HUMAN RIGHTS STUDIES: ON THE DANGERS OF LEGALISTIC ASSUMPTIONS

DAVID P. FORSYTHE.....	59
------------------------	----

1. Introduction.....	59
2. Legalistic Studies	62
2.1. General Overview	63
2.2. A Focus on Impact.....	70
2.3. A Focus on Legal Obligation.....	71
3. Conclusion	74

METHODS IN LEGAL HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH

EVA BREMS.....	77
----------------	----

1. Introduction.....	77
2. Research Question(s) and Method.....	77
2.1. Research Questions	77
2.2. Method.....	78
2.2.1. Examining the Attitudes and Practice of Researchers.....	78
2.2.2. Examining the Research Output.....	82
3. Results of the Empirical Research	83
3.1. Questionnaire	83
3.1.1. Who?.....	83
3.1.2. The Importance of Methodology	83
3.1.3. Training and Guidance.....	84
3.1.4. Methods Used	85
3.1.5. Empirical vs. Normative Research.....	86
3.1.6. Some Conclusions from the Questionnaire.....	87
3.2. Examination of the Corpus	87
4. Normative Conclusions	89

THE NEED FOR EVIDENCE-BASED HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH

HANS-OTTO SANO and HATLA THELLE.....	91
--------------------------------------	----

1. Introduction.....	91
2. The Sources of Human Rights Research.....	95

3. Empowerment and Making Claims — Two Different Contexts	101
4. Evidence-Based Research: an Example of the Complexities Involved	104
5. Conclusion	108

MEASURE FOR MEASURE: UTILIZING LEGAL NORMS AND HEALTH DATA IN MEASURING THE RIGHT TO HEALTH

DABNEY EVANS and MEGAN PRICE	111
------------------------------------	-----

1. Introduction.....	111
2. Global Health Inequalities Between States	112
3. Establishment of Right to Health under International Human Rights Law.....	114
4. A New Theoretical Model: The Synergistic Approach.....	117
4.1. The International Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination.....	119
4.2. Special Rapporteur on the Right to the Highest Attainable Standard of Physical and Mental Health	120
4.3. General Comment 14	121
5. Applying the Synergistic Approach.....	123
6. Barriers and Challenges to the Approach.....	130
7. Conclusion and Implications	131

METHODS IN HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH: TOWARDS A SPIRAL OF CO-LEARNING

MARIA STUTTAFFORD	135
-------------------------	-----

1. Introduction.....	135
2. Health and Human Rights	136
3. Review of Methods Used in Health and Human Rights Research.....	137
3.1. Methods Used in Research into Developing Policy and Programmes.....	138
3.2. Methods Used in Research into Analysing and Critique Government Performance	139
3.3. Methods Used in Research Providing Evidence in Redress for those who Suffer Violations of their Rights.....	140
3.4. Methods Used in Research into Supporting Advocacy and Civil Society Mobilization.....	141
4 Reflections on Research Design and Methods Used to Explore Health and Human Rights.....	142
4.1. Exploring Collective Rights to Public Health for Homeless People	144
4.2. Towards Establishing a Learning Network to Advance Health Equity Through Human Rights Strategies	145

4.3. Learning by Doing and Doing by Learning: A Civil Society Network to Realise the Right to Health.....	146
4.4. Strengths and Weaknesses of Methods used in the Completed Research Projects.....	146
5. A Learning Network to Facilitate a Spiral of Co-Learning.....	148
6. Mixed Methods of Research in the Learning by Doing Network.....	153
7. Conclusions.....	156

TELLING TRUTH? THE METHODOLOGICAL CHALLENGES OF TRUTH COMMISSIONS

PAUL GREADY	159
1. Introduction.....	159
2. Concepts and Methods.....	160
3. Qualitative and Quantitative Methods.....	163
4. Truth as Genre.....	167
5. Legitimacy and Impacts Beyond Report 'Fetishization'	170
6. Speaking Truth with and to Power	175
7. History as Saviour?	179
8. Conclusion.....	184

METHODOLOGICAL CHALLENGES IN COUNTRY OF ORIGIN RESEARCH

MARCO FORMISANO	187
1. Introduction.....	187
2. A Definition of Country of Origin Information	189
3. The Quasi-Judicial Character of Country of Origin Information and Its Role in Asylum Law	191
4. The Three Elements of COI Research: the Observer, the Facts and the Research Instruments	196
4.1. The Observer	196
4.2. The Facts.....	197
4.3. The Research Strategy.....	198
4.4. Procedural Principles	200
4.4.1. Impartiality and Objectivity	200
4.4.2. Public vs. Anonymous Sources.....	201
4.4.3. Assessing Sources.....	202
4.5. Substantive Principles.....	203
4.5.1. Relevance.....	203
4.5.2. Accuracy	204
4.5.3. Reliability.....	206

4.5.4. Currency	207
4.6. Presenting Research Results	208
5. Conclusions.....	210

TREATY INTERPRETATION AND THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

KOEN DE FEYTER.....	213
1. Introduction.....	213
2. Multidisciplinarity in Treaty Interpretation	213
3. The <i>Awas Tingni</i> Judgment	219
4. Subsequent Case Law	226
5. Lessons for Human Rights Research.....	230

METHODS OF PHILOSOPHICAL RESEARCH ON HUMAN RIGHTS

ANDREAS FOLLESDAL	233
1. Introduction.....	233
2. Amartya Sen	235
3. Charles Beitz.....	237
4. The Method of Reflective Equilibrium	237
4.1. Three Main Features	238
4.1.1. The Aim of Arriving at Reflective Equilibrium is Practical: To Attain Agreement on Specific Moral Issues.....	238
4.1.2. The Starting Points of the Procedure are Non-Foundational Empirical and Normative 'Considered Judgments'	238
4.1.3. The Theory Claims That There Is a rational Procedure by Which This Aim Sometimes Can Be Reached.	239
4.2. Elaboration.....	240
4.2.1. Partial, Wide, Ideal Reflective Equilibrium	240
4.2.2. The Method of Reflective Equilibrium	240
4.2.3. Justification by Reflective Equilibrium	241
4.2.4. Four Norms that Guide the Method of Reflective Equilibrium.....	241
5. The Method of Reflective Equilibrium applied: Sen and Beitz.....	242
5.1. On Sen: Why are Philosophical Human Rights Overriding?.....	243
5.2. On Beitz: The Complexity of Object-dependent Theories and of Multiple Roles for Human Rights.....	243
6. Conclusions.....	245

About the Authors.....247

Subject Index253