

# Contents

|                                                                                                            |           |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| Dedication .....                                                                                           | v         |
| Preface .....                                                                                              | xv        |
| About the authors .....                                                                                    | xvii      |
| About the book .....                                                                                       | xix       |
| <b>CHAPTER 1 THE DEVELOPMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW IN SOUTH AFRICA .....</b>                               | <b>1</b>  |
| 1.1 Introduction .....                                                                                     | 2         |
| 1.2 Defining administrative law .....                                                                      | 3         |
| 1.2.1 A working definition .....                                                                           | 3         |
| 1.2.1.1 Administrative law as constitutional law .....                                                     | 3         |
| 1.2.1.2 Two sides of public power .....                                                                    | 4         |
| 1.2.1.3 Administrative justice .....                                                                       | 4         |
| 1.2.1.4 The role of the legislature .....                                                                  | 4         |
| 1.2.1.5 Public authority and functions .....                                                               | 4         |
| 1.2.1.6 Administrative law as rules of law .....                                                           | 5         |
| 1.2.1.7 Rule of law .....                                                                                  | 5         |
| 1.3 The development of South African administrative law .....                                              | 6         |
| 1.3.1 The consequences of 'judge-made law' .....                                                           | 6         |
| 1.3.2 The shifting line between the private and public spheres .....                                       | 8         |
| 1.3.3 The growth of discretionary authority .....                                                          | 10        |
| 1.3.4 The distinction between executive and administrative authority .....                                 | 12        |
| 1.3.5 Distinguishing formally between review and appeal .....                                              | 13        |
| 1.3.6 The peculiar character of South African administrative law .....                                     | 14        |
| 1.3.7 Conclusion and defining some basic terminology .....                                                 | 15        |
| 1.4 The reform of South African administrative law 1990 to 2000 .....                                      | 16        |
| 1.4.1 First stage of reform .....                                                                          | 17        |
| 1.4.2 Second stage of reform .....                                                                         | 17        |
| 1.4.3 Third stage of reform .....                                                                          | 18        |
| 1.4.4 Fourth stage of reform .....                                                                         | 18        |
| 1.4.5 Superstructural reform .....                                                                         | 19        |
| 1.5 Outline of the general structure of the Promotion of Administrative Justice Act 3 of 2000 (PAJA) ..... | 19        |
| 1.6 Outline of the various avenues to judicial review of administrative action in South Africa .....       | 22        |
| 1.7 Concluding remarks about the current state of administrative law, and some challenges .....            | 23        |
| 1.7.1 The current state of administrative law .....                                                        | 24        |
| 1.7.2 Some challenges facing administrative law .....                                                      | 25        |
| <b>CHAPTER 2 ADMINISTRATIVE AUTHORITIES IN LEGAL CONTEXT .....</b>                                         | <b>27</b> |
| 2.1 Introduction .....                                                                                     | 28        |
| 2.2 Concepts and nomenclature .....                                                                        | 28        |
| 2.2.1 State .....                                                                                          | 28        |
| 2.2.2 Executive .....                                                                                      | 29        |
| 2.2.3 Government .....                                                                                     | 30        |
| 2.2.4 Public administration .....                                                                          | 30        |
| 2.2.5 Civil service .....                                                                                  | 30        |

|                  |                                                                                                               |           |
|------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| <b>2.3</b>       | <b>Constitutional supremacy</b>                                                                               | <b>31</b> |
| 2.3.1            | Democracy                                                                                                     | 32        |
| 2.3.2            | The Bill of Rights                                                                                            | 33        |
| 2.3.3            | Section 195 of the Constitution                                                                               | 33        |
| <b>2.4</b>       | <b>The doctrine of the separation of powers</b>                                                               | <b>34</b> |
| 2.4.1            | The separation of powers in South Africa                                                                      | 35        |
| 2.4.2            | The normative nature of the separation of powers                                                              | 36        |
| 2.4.3            | The public administration and the separation of powers                                                        | 37        |
| <b>2.5</b>       | <b>Identifying the administration</b>                                                                         | <b>40</b> |
| 2.5.1            | The rise of the administrative state                                                                          | 41        |
| 2.5.2            | The term 'the administration'                                                                                 | 42        |
| 2.5.3            | The South African administration                                                                              | 43        |
| 2.5.3.1          | National departments                                                                                          | 43        |
| 2.5.3.2          | National department: The Department of Water and Sanitation                                                   | 44        |
| 2.5.3.3          | The Ministry of Finance and its administrative authorities                                                    | 48        |
| 2.5.3.4          | State-owned company: Eskom SOC Ltd.                                                                           | 53        |
| 2.5.3.5          | The Public Protector                                                                                          | 54        |
| <b>2.6</b>       | <b>Administrative law: A discipline steeped in controversy</b>                                                | <b>57</b> |
| 2.6.1            | The dual nature of administrative law                                                                         | 58        |
| 2.6.2            | Administrative law and administrative power distinguished                                                     | 59        |
| 2.6.3            | Administrative law and administrative authorities distinguished                                               | 60        |
| 2.6.4            | Sources of administrative law                                                                                 | 61        |
| 2.6.5            | Sources of administrative power                                                                               | 62        |
| <b>CHAPTER 3</b> | <b>ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION</b>                                                                                  | <b>65</b> |
| <b>3.1</b>       | <b>Introduction</b>                                                                                           | <b>66</b> |
| <b>3.2</b>       | <b>The separation of powers and the classification of state functions</b>                                     | <b>66</b> |
| <b>3.3</b>       | <b>Branches capable of performing administrative action</b>                                                   | <b>67</b> |
| 3.3.1            | The 'policy branch'                                                                                           | 67        |
| 3.3.2            | The public administration                                                                                     | 68        |
| 3.3.3            | The legislature                                                                                               | 68        |
| 3.3.4            | The judiciary                                                                                                 | 69        |
| <b>3.4</b>       | <b>The meaning of administrative action understood within the phases of development of administrative law</b> | <b>70</b> |
| <b>3.5</b>       | <b>Administrative action during the pre-constitutional period</b>                                             | <b>71</b> |
| <b>3.6</b>       | <b>Administrative action during the pre-PAJA constitutional period</b>                                        | <b>71</b> |
| 3.6.1            | The SARFU judgment                                                                                            | 72        |
| 3.6.1.1          | A new approach: from institutional to functional                                                              | 72        |
| 3.6.1.2          | The Constitution and prerogative powers                                                                       | 73        |
| 3.6.1.3          | The scope of the functional approach                                                                          | 73        |
| 3.6.2            | The AAA <i>Investments</i> judgment                                                                           | 74        |
| <b>3.7</b>       | <b>Administrative action under PAJA</b>                                                                       | <b>76</b> |
| 3.7.1            | A decision of an administrative nature                                                                        | 78        |
| 3.7.2            | By an organ of state or a natural or juristic person                                                          | 82        |
| 3.7.3            | Exercising a public power or performing a public function                                                     | 83        |
| 3.7.4            | In terms of a constitution, any legislation or an empowering provision                                        | 86        |
| 3.7.5            | That adversely affects rights                                                                                 | 86        |
| 3.7.6            | That has a direct, external legal effect                                                                      | 89        |

|                                                         |                                                                                                 |            |
|---------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 3.7.7                                                   | That does not fall under any of the listed exclusions .....                                     | 90         |
| 3.8                                                     | Conclusion .....                                                                                | 93         |
| <b>CHAPTER 4 REGULATING ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION .....</b> |                                                                                                 | <b>95</b>  |
| 4.1                                                     | Control and facilitation .....                                                                  | 95         |
| 4.2                                                     | Legislative regulation .....                                                                    | 97         |
| 4.3                                                     | Internal controls .....                                                                         | 100        |
| 4.4                                                     | Specialised oversight bodies .....                                                              | 102        |
| 4.5                                                     | ADR in administrative law .....                                                                 | 105        |
| 4.6                                                     | Judicial oversight .....                                                                        | 106        |
| 4.6.1                                                   | Review and appeal .....                                                                         | 107        |
| 4.6.2                                                   | Judicial review .....                                                                           | 109        |
| 4.6.2.1                                                 | Grounds of review .....                                                                         | 111        |
| 4.6.2.2                                                 | Avenues to review .....                                                                         | 112        |
| 4.6.2.3                                                 | Review and internal remedies .....                                                              | 115        |
| 4.6.3                                                   | Deference .....                                                                                 | 116        |
| <b>CHAPTER 5 LAWFULNESS .....</b>                       |                                                                                                 | <b>119</b> |
| 5.1                                                     | Introduction .....                                                                              | 119        |
| 5.2                                                     | Authorisation .....                                                                             | 121        |
| 5.2.1                                                   | What? .....                                                                                     | 122        |
| 5.2.1.1                                                 | Reason, purpose, motive .....                                                                   | 123        |
| 5.2.1.2                                                 | Omission .....                                                                                  | 125        |
| 5.2.1.3                                                 | Changing a decision .....                                                                       | 127        |
| 5.2.2                                                   | Who? .....                                                                                      | 129        |
| 5.2.2.1                                                 | Identity of the authorised administrator .....                                                  | 129        |
| 5.2.2.2                                                 | Authorised bodies .....                                                                         | 131        |
| 5.2.2.3                                                 | Delegation .....                                                                                | 132        |
| 5.2.2.4                                                 | Influence and advice .....                                                                      | 135        |
| 5.2.3                                                   | How? .....                                                                                      | 135        |
| 5.2.3.1                                                 | Prescribed procedures .....                                                                     | 136        |
| 5.2.3.2                                                 | Conditions .....                                                                                | 138        |
| 5.3                                                     | Mistakes .....                                                                                  | 139        |
| 5.3.1                                                   | Error of law .....                                                                              | 140        |
| 5.3.2                                                   | Mistake of fact .....                                                                           | 141        |
| 5.4                                                     | Conclusion .....                                                                                | 142        |
| <b>CHAPTER 6 PROCEDURAL FAIRNESS .....</b>              |                                                                                                 | <b>145</b> |
| 6.1                                                     | Introduction .....                                                                              | 145        |
| 6.2                                                     | Procedural fairness in the constitutional era .....                                             | 147        |
| 6.3                                                     | Procedural fairness under PAJA .....                                                            | 148        |
| 6.3.1                                                   | Section 3 of PAJA: Procedural fairness in respect of decisions that affect individuals .....    | 148        |
| 6.3.1.1                                                 | When does section 3 apply? .....                                                                | 149        |
| 6.3.1.2                                                 | The requirements of section 3, and how they apply .....                                         | 154        |
| 6.3.2                                                   | Section 4 of PAJA: Procedural fairness in respect of decisions that have a general impact ..... | 159        |
| 6.3.2.1                                                 | When does section 4 apply? .....                                                                | 160        |
| 6.3.2.2                                                 | The requirements of section 4 .....                                                             | 160        |

|                  |                                                                                                                      |            |
|------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 6.3.3            | Procedural fairness in respect of decisions that affect individuals and the public .....                             | 162        |
| 6.3.4            | The consequences of a failure to follow a fair procedure as required by sections 3 and/or 4 of PAJA .....            | 163        |
| 6.4              | The rule against bias .....                                                                                          | 166        |
| 6.5              | When is procedural fairness demanded of exercises of public power that do not amount to administrative action? ..... | 167        |
| <b>CHAPTER 7</b> | <b>REASONABLENESS</b> .....                                                                                          | <b>169</b> |
| 7.1              | Introduction .....                                                                                                   | 169        |
| 7.2              | Reasonableness and related grounds of review .....                                                                   | 171        |
| 7.3              | Symptomatic unreasonableness .....                                                                                   | 172        |
| 7.4              | Rationality .....                                                                                                    | 175        |
| 7.4.1            | Rationality under PAJA .....                                                                                         | 175        |
| 7.4.2            | Rationality and legality .....                                                                                       | 179        |
| 7.4.3            | Rationality and common-law review .....                                                                              | 179        |
| 7.5              | Proportionality .....                                                                                                | 180        |
| 7.5.1            | Proportionality in South African courts .....                                                                        | 180        |
| 7.5.2            | A test for proportionality in South African administrative law? .....                                                | 183        |
| 7.6              | Vagueness .....                                                                                                      | 186        |
| 7.7              | Reasonableness generally .....                                                                                       | 188        |
| 7.8              | Reasonableness and respect .....                                                                                     | 188        |
| 7.8.1            | Factors influencing reasonableness review .....                                                                      | 190        |
| 7.8.1.1          | The nature of the decision .....                                                                                     | 190        |
| 7.8.1.2          | The identity and expertise of the decision-maker .....                                                               | 190        |
| 7.8.1.3          | The range of factors relevant to the decision .....                                                                  | 190        |
| 7.8.1.4          | The reasons given for the decision .....                                                                             | 191        |
| 7.8.1.5          | The nature of the competing interests involved .....                                                                 | 191        |
| 7.8.1.6          | The impact of the decision on the lives and well-being of those affected .....                                       | 191        |
| <b>CHAPTER 8</b> | <b>REASONS</b> .....                                                                                                 | <b>193</b> |
| 8.1              | Introduction .....                                                                                                   | 193        |
| 8.2              | The right to reasons in section 5 of PAJA .....                                                                      | 197        |
| 8.2.1            | Requesting reasons under section 5 of PAJA .....                                                                     | 197        |
| 8.2.1.1          | Who may request reasons? .....                                                                                       | 197        |
| 8.2.1.2          | What must that person do in order to obtain reasons? .....                                                           | 200        |
| 8.2.2            | Providing reasons under section 5 of PAJA .....                                                                      | 201        |
| 8.2.3            | Failure to give reasons .....                                                                                        | 203        |
| 8.2.4            | Departure from requirements of section 5 of PAJA .....                                                               | 204        |
| 8.2.5            | Decisions requiring reasons to be furnished automatically .....                                                      | 205        |
| 8.3              | Adequacy of reasons .....                                                                                            | 206        |
| 8.3.1            | Are reasons revealing possible grounds of review 'adequate'? .....                                                   | 215        |
| 8.4              | Procedure and remedies .....                                                                                         | 215        |
| 8.5              | Inconsistent sets of reasons .....                                                                                   | 216        |
| 8.6              | Reasons and legality .....                                                                                           | 217        |
| <b>CHAPTER 9</b> | <b>STANDING AND PROCEDURE FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW</b> .....                                                              | <b>219</b> |
| 9.1              | Introduction .....                                                                                                   | 219        |
| 9.2              | Standing .....                                                                                                       | 220        |

|                   |                                                                                                             |            |
|-------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 9.2.1             | The concept of standing .....                                                                               | 220        |
| 9.2.2             | The rationale for a standing requirement .....                                                              | 221        |
| 9.2.3             | Standing under the common law .....                                                                         | 222        |
| 9.2.4             | Standing under section 38 of the Constitution .....                                                         | 222        |
| 9.2.5             | Standing under PAJA .....                                                                                   | 223        |
| 9.2.6             | Standing in practice .....                                                                                  | 225        |
| 9.3               | <b>Procedure for judicial review .....</b>                                                                  | <b>227</b> |
| 9.3.1             | Duty to exhaust internal remedies .....                                                                     | 227        |
| 9.3.2             | Time to institute judicial proceedings .....                                                                | 227        |
| 9.3.3             | The rules applicable to judicial review proceedings .....                                                   | 229        |
| 9.3.3.1           | The High Court rules on judicial review .....                                                               | 229        |
| 9.3.3.2           | The 2009 rules for judicial review .....                                                                    | 233        |
| <b>CHAPTER 10</b> | <b>REMEDIES IN JUDICIAL REVIEW PROCEEDINGS .....</b>                                                        | <b>237</b> |
| 10.1              | Introduction .....                                                                                          | 238        |
| 10.2              | The nature and purpose of judicial review remedies .....                                                    | 238        |
| 10.3              | The two-staged approach to remedies .....                                                                   | 240        |
| 10.4              | Declarations of constitutional invalidity .....                                                             | 241        |
| 10.4.1            | The retrospective operation of declarations of constitutional invalidity .....                              | 241        |
| 10.4.2            | Subsequent acts that are not affected by declarations of invalidity .....                                   | 242        |
| 10.5              | Setting aside unlawful administrative action .....                                                          | 244        |
| 10.5.1            | Invalid administrative action has legal effect until declared invalid and set aside by a court of law ..... | 244        |
| 10.5.2            | The 'collateral challenge' exception .....                                                                  | 246        |
| 10.5.3            | When will courts decline to set aside unlawful administrative action? .....                                 | 247        |
| 10.6              | Remittal .....                                                                                              | 251        |
| 10.7              | Substitution .....                                                                                          | 253        |
| 10.8              | A declaration of rights .....                                                                               | 257        |
| 10.9              | Compensation .....                                                                                          | 258        |
| 10.9.1            | Delictual damages for malperformance of statutory functions .....                                           | 259        |
| 10.9.2            | Compensation under section 8(1)(c)(ii)(bb) of PAJA .....                                                    | 262        |
| 10.9.3            | Constitutional damages .....                                                                                | 265        |
| 10.10             | Interdicts .....                                                                                            | 267        |
| 10.10.1           | Prohibitory, mandatory and structural interdicts .....                                                      | 267        |
| 10.10.2           | Interim and final interdicts .....                                                                          | 267        |
| 10.10.3           | Interdicts that restrain the exercise of executive and legislative power .....                              | 269        |
| 10.11             | Remedies for the failure to take a decision .....                                                           | 271        |
| 10.12             | Non-PAJA remedies .....                                                                                     | 273        |
| 10.12.1           | Severance .....                                                                                             | 273        |
| 10.12.2           | Contempt of court .....                                                                                     | 274        |
| 10.13             | Costs .....                                                                                                 | 276        |
|                   | <b>Appendix: Promotion of Administrative Justice Act 3 of 2000 .....</b>                                    | <b>279</b> |
|                   | <b>Bibliography .....</b>                                                                                   | <b>291</b> |
|                   | <b>Table of cases .....</b>                                                                                 | <b>297</b> |
|                   | <b>Table of legislation .....</b>                                                                           | <b>307</b> |
|                   | <b>Glossary .....</b>                                                                                       | <b>313</b> |
|                   | <b>Index .....</b>                                                                                          | <b>321</b> |