## Contents

Fore	eword	xi
Just	tice Jasti Chelameswar	
Intr	roduction	xiii
	I The History of Judicial Appointments in India	
1.	From Kania to Sarkaria: Judicial Appointments from 1950 to 1973 Suchindran B.N.	3
2.	A Committed Judiciary: Indira Gandhi and Judicial Appointments T.R. Andhyarujina	18
3.	Recovering Lost Ground: The Case of the Curious Eighties A.K. Ganguli	31
4.	The Judicial Collegium: Issues, Controversies, and the Road Ahead  Arun Jaitley	45
5.	A Plague on Both Your Houses: NJAC and the Crisis of Trust Pratap Bhanu Mehta	56

## II The Analysis of the NJAC Judgment

6.	Judicial Review and Parliamentary Power: Reorienting the Balance K.T. Thomas	73
7.	Checks and Balances Revisited: The Role of the Executive in Judicial Appointments  Mukul Rohatgi	84
8.	Opening up Appointments: Civil Society Participation in the NJAC Madhavi Divan	96
9.	The Obvious Foundation Test: Re-inventing the Basic Structure Doctrine Raju Ramachandran and Mythili Vijay Kumar Thallam	109
10.	Eight Fatal Flaws: The Failings of the National Judicial Appointments Commission  Arvind Datar	122
11.	The Sole Route to an Independent Judiciary?: The Primacy of Judges in Appointment  Gautam Bhatia	135
12.	Justice Lokur's Concurring View: The Future of Appointments Reform Alok Prasanna Kumar	146
13.	Justice Chelameswar's Dissent: Reforming to Preserve Arghya Sengupta	158
14.	The NJAC Case and Judicial Independence: Conceptual and Contextual Safeguards  Gopal Subramanium	168
	III Comparative Perspectives	
15.	Comparative Law in the NJAC Judgment: A Missed Opportunity Suhrith Parthasarathy	197

16.	Judicialization of Judicial Appointments?: A Response from the United Kingdom  Chintan Chandrachud	208
17.	South Africa—Analysing a Commission Model Chris McConnachie	219
18.	Appointments to the Supreme Court of Canada: Procedures and Controversies Peter McCormick	231
19.	Judicial Appointments in Pakistan: The Seminal Case of the 18th Amendment  Sameer Khosa	242
20.	Judicial Appointments in Sri Lanka: A Politicized Trajectory Rehan Abeyratne	255
21.	Appointments to the Supreme Court of Nepal: A New Beginning Semanta Dahal	267
Index		281
	out the Editors and Contributors	291