

# Table of Contents

|  |              |
|--|--------------|
| <b>Preface</b>   | <b>xxvii</b> |
| <b>Acknowledgement</b>   | <b>xxix</b>  |
| <b>List of Abbreviations and Short References</b>  | <b>xxxi</b>  |
| <b>Chapter 1</b>   |              |
| <b>Introduction</b>  | <b>1</b>     |
| I. Setting   | 1            |
| A. Spatial Data  | 1            |
| B. Public Sector Spatial Data  | 2            |
| C. Value of Public Sector Spatial Data   | 3            |
| D. The Role of the Public Sector in Making Spatial Data Available  | 4            |
| E. The Legal Framework for the Availability of Public Sector Spatial Data                                  | 6            |
| II. The Problematic Character of the EU Legal Framework for the Availability of Public Sector Spatial Data | 7            |
| III. Structure and Outline of the Following Chapters   | 8            |
| A. Structure   | 8            |
| B. Outline   | 8            |
| <b>Chapter 2</b>   |              |
| <b>Scope and Definitions</b>   | <b>11</b>    |
| I. Introduction  | 11           |
| II. Scope from the Point of View of the Legislation  | 12           |
| III. Scope from the Point of View of the Type of Data  | 16           |



## Table of Contents

|     |  |    |
|-----|--|----|
| A.  | Spatial Data   | 16 |
| 1.  | <i>Data</i>  | 16 |
| a.  | Data or Information  | 16 |
| b.  | Information or Document  | 19 |
| 2.  | <i>Spatial</i>   | 20 |
| 3.  | <i>Spatial Data</i>  | 21 |
| B.  | Spatial Data under the INSPIRE Directive   | 21 |
| C.  | Environmental Data   | 27 |
| 1.  | <i>Environmental</i>   | 27 |
| 2.  | <i>Environmental Information</i> in the Access Directive   | 28 |
| 3.  | <i>Environmental Information</i> in the Aarhus Convention  | 30 |
| D.  | Public Sector Data   | 32 |
| 1.  | <i>Public Sector Information – Government<br/>Information – Public Information – Public Domain<br/>Information</i> | 32 |
| 2.  | Public Sector Documents under the PSI Directive  | 33 |
| IV. | Scope from the Point of View of the Organizations Holding<br>the Data  | 34 |
| A.  | Public Sector and Related Terms  | 35 |
| 1.  | <i>Public Sector</i>   | 35 |
| 2.  | <i>State and Government</i>  | 36 |
| 3.  | <i>Administration</i>  | 39 |
| 4.  | <i>Public Service</i>  | 39 |
| B.  | Public Authorities under the Access Directive<br>and the INSPIRE Directive   | 40 |
| 1.  | The Definition of <i>Public Authority</i> in the Access<br>Directive   | 40 |
| 2.  | The Definition of <i>Public Authority</i> in the INSPIRE<br>Directive  | 42 |
| 3.  | The Definition of <i>Public Authority</i> in the Aarhus<br>Convention  | 44 |
| C.  | Public Sector Bodies under the PSI Directive   | 45 |
| 1.  | The Definition of the PSI Directive  | 45 |
| 2.  | Contracting Authorities under the Public Procurement<br>Directives   | 47 |
| a.  | State, Regional, and Local Authorities   | 47 |
| b.  | Bodies Governed by Public Law  | 49 |
| i.  | Meeting Needs in the General Interest<br>Not Having an Industrial or Commercial<br>Character                       | 50 |
| ii. | The Close Dependency Test  | 55 |
| c.  | Associations Formed by One or Several<br>Authorities or One or Several Bodies Governed<br>by Public Law            | 57 |
| d.  | Relevance for the PSI Directive  | 57 |



|      |  |    |
|------|--|----|
| D.   | Common Denominator between Public Sector Bodies and Public Authorities   | 58 |
| V.   | Common Denominator Between Spatial Data, Public Sector Data, and Environmental Data  | 59 |
| VI.  | Scope from the Point of View of the Purpose of Use   | 61 |
|      | A. Access  | 62 |
|      | B. Re-use  | 64 |
|      | C. Sharing   | 66 |
|      | D. Interim Summary   | 67 |
| VII. | A First Indication of the Problematic Character of the EU Legal Framework for the Availability of Public Sector Spatial Data | 67 |

### **Chapter 3**

#### **Existing Legal Framework for the Availability of Public Sector Spatial Data**

|     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| I.  | Introduction   | 69  |
| II. | Access   | 70  |
|     | A. Introduction  | 70  |
|     | B. The Access Directive  | 70  |
|     | 1. History: Directive 90/313/EEC   | 71  |
|     | a. Access upon Request   | 71  |
|     | b. Dissemination by Public Authorities of their Own Motion                 | 74  |
|     | c. Follow-Up   | 74  |
|     | 2. The Access Directive  | 75  |
|     | a. Introduction  | 75  |
|     | b. Objectives  | 75  |
|     | c. Definitions   | 77  |
|     | d. Access to Environmental Information upon Request                        | 79  |
|     | i. General Principle   | 79  |
|     | ii. Time Limits  | 79  |
|     | iii. Requests Formulated in Too General a Manner                           | 81  |
|     | iv. Form or Format of the Information                                      | 82  |
|     | v. Facilitating Measures   | 84  |
|     | vi. Exceptions to the Right of Access                                      | 85  |
|     | vii. Charges   | 91  |
|     | e. Access to Justice   | 93  |
|     | f. Dissemination of Environmental Information                              | 95  |
|     | g. Quality of Environmental Information: Article 8 of the Access Directive | 97  |
|     | 3. Review of the Access Directive  | 98  |
| C.  | INSPIRE Directive  | 99  |
|     | 1. Introduction  | 99  |
|     | 2. The INSPIRE Directive and the Access Directive                          | 100 |



# Table of Contents

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| 3.   | Access to Network Services  | 100 |
| a.   | Establishment of Network Services   | 101 |
| b.   | Limitation of Access to Network Services  | 103 |
| c.   | Charges for Network Services  | 107 |
| III. | Re-use  | 111 |
| A.   | History   | 111 |
| 1.   | Guidelines for Improving the Synergy between the Public and Private Sectors in the Information Market | 111 |
| 2.   | The Publaw Reports  | 114 |
| 3.   | The Stockholm Conference and the 1997 Bonn Ministerial Conference                                     | 116 |
| 4.   | The Green Paper on Public Sector Information  | 117 |
| 5.   | The eEurope 2002 Communication  | 119 |
| B.   | The PSI Directive   | 121 |
| 1.   | Objective   | 122 |
| 2.   | Title   | 123 |
| 3.   | Subject Matter and Scope  | 125 |
| a.   | Introduction  | 125 |
| b.   | Re-use of Existing Documents  | 125 |
| c.   | Re-use by any Natural or Legal Person   | 127 |
| d.   | Practical Means of Facilitating Re-use  | 127 |
| e.   | Limitations on the Field of Application   | 128 |
| i.   | Documents the Supply of Which Is an Activity Falling outside of the Public Task                       | 129 |
| ii.  | Documents for Which Third Parties hold Intellectual Property Rights                                   | 129 |
| iii. | Documents Excluded from Access  | 131 |
| iv.  | Documents Held by Public Service Broadcasters   | 132 |
| v.   | Documents Held by Educational, Research, and Cultural Establishments                                  | 133 |
| f.   | Documents Containing Personal Data  | 134 |
| 4.   | Definitions   | 136 |
| a.   | Public Sector Body  | 136 |
| b.   | Document  | 136 |
| c.   | Re-use  | 137 |
| d.   | Held by   | 139 |
| e.   | Public Task   | 139 |
| 5.   | General Principle   | 140 |
| 6.   | Requirements for the Processing of Requests for Re-use  | 143 |
| a.   | Time Limits   | 143 |
| b.   | Communication of the Grounds for Refusal and the Means of Redress                                     | 145 |
| 7.   | Conditions for Re-use   | 146 |
| a.   | Available Formats   | 146 |
| b.   | Charges   | 148 |



|  |     |
|--|-----|
| c. Transparency  | 150 |
| d. Licenses  | 151 |
| e. Practical Arrangements  | 152 |
| 8. Non-discrimination  | 154 |
| 9. Prohibition of Exclusive Arrangements                           | 155 |
| C. The Review of the PSI Directive                                 | 156 |
| IV. Sharing  | 158 |
| A. History   | 159 |
| B. Preparatory Phase   | 160 |
| C. The INSPIRE Directive   | 162 |
| 1. Objective and General Provisions                                | 162 |
| 2. Network Services  | 164 |
| 3. Data Sharing  | 164 |
| a. General Principle   | 164 |
| b. Restrictions at the Point of Use                                | 165 |
| c. Licensing and Charging  | 166 |
| d. Authorities outside the Borders of the Member States            | 168 |
| e. Limitations on Sharing  | 169 |
| f. References to Re-use?   | 170 |
| V. Summary   | 170 |
| A. Access  | 171 |
| B. Re-use  | 172 |
| C. Sharing   | 173 |
| D. Differences between the Rules on Access, Re-use,<br>and Sharing | 173 |
| 1. Obligatory Character  | 174 |
| 2. Limitations on the Availability of Data                         | 174 |
| 3. Charges   | 175 |
| 4. Time Limits   | 177 |
| E. Towards the Next Chapter  | 177 |

## **Chapter 4**

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>The Problematic Character of the EU Legal Framework<br/>for the Availability of Public Sector Spatial Data</b>                        | <b>179</b> |
| I. The Distinction between Access, Re-use, and Sharing   | 179        |
| II. Importance of the Difference between Access, Re-use,<br>and Sharing  | 179        |
| III. Example: Charging for Public Sector Spatial Data  | 181        |
| A. Introduction  | 181        |
| B. Existing Rules on Charges for Access, Re-use,<br>and Sharing in the Access Directive, the PSI Directive,<br>and the INSPIRE Directive | 181        |
| C. Basis of the Debate on Charging: Cost Recovery v. Open<br>Access  | 183        |



## *Table of Contents*

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 1. Background of the Debate  | 183        |
| 2. Description of the Open Access and Cost Recovery Models   | 184        |
| 3. Demarcation between Open Access and Cost Recovery   | 185        |
| D. Arguments for Open Access and Cost Recovery   | 186        |
| 1. Introduction  | 186        |
| 2. 'Democratic Arguments': Open Access Increases Democracy and Participation of the Citizen                                    | 189        |
| 3. The 'Why Pay Twice' Arguments   | 192        |
| a. 'The Investments Have Been Made for the Public Task'  | 192        |
| b. 'The Taxpayer Has Already Paid'   | 193        |
| c. 'Charges Between Public Bodies Merely Shift the Budget'   | 197        |
| 4. 'The Macro-Economic Arguments': Open Access Is an Incentive for Economic Activity and Economic Growth                       | 198        |
| 5. 'The Micro-Economic Argument': Better Performance of the Public Bodies  | 201        |
| a. Quality of the Data   | 201        |
| b. Quality and Efficiency of the Service   | 203        |
| c. Liability   | 205        |
| d. Transaction Costs of Charging for Public Sector Spatial Data  | 206        |
| 6. 'The Political Argument': Cost Recovery Improves the Negotiation Position of the Public Body                                | 208        |
| 7. Evaluation of the Arguments   | 209        |
| IV. Problematic Character of the Distinction between Access, Re-use, and Sharing   | 209        |
| <br><b>Chapter 5</b>   |            |
| <b>Obligations to Make Public Sector Spatial Data Available in International and European Legislation and Policy Documents</b> | <b>213</b> |
| I. Introduction  | 213        |
| II. The Obligation of Making Public Sector Spatial Data Available for Access   | 214        |
| A. Introduction  | 214        |
| B. The Obligation of Making Public Sector Data Available for Access as a Part of Freedom of Information                        | 215        |
| 1. United Nations  | 215        |
| a. Universal Declaration on Human Rights   | 215        |
| b. The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights  | 216        |
| 2. Council of Europe   | 218        |



|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| a.   | The European Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms   | 218 |
| b.   | Documents of the Council of Ministers and the Parliamentary Assembly   | 219 |
| c.   | The Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights   | 221 |
| 3.   | Interim Summary  | 225 |
| C.   | International and European Documents   | 226 |
| 1.   | Access: From Passive to Active?  | 226 |
| 2.   | United Nations   | 227 |
| a.   | United Nations Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Opinion and Expression   | 227 |
| b.   | United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)  | 228 |
| 3.   | Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development   | 231 |
| a.   | Report on Digital Broadband Content: Public Sector Information and Content   | 232 |
| b.   | Recommendation for Enhanced Access and More Effective Use of Public Sector Information   | 233 |
| 4.   | Council of Europe  | 234 |
| a.   | Recommendation 854 (1979) of the Parliamentary Assembly on Access by the Public to Government Records and Freedom of Information       | 234 |
| b.   | Recommendation No. R(81)19 of the Committee of Ministers on the Access to Information Held by Public Authorities                       | 235 |
| c.   | Recommendation Rec(2002)2 of the Committee of Ministers to Member States on Access to Official Documents                               | 236 |
| d.   | Convention on Access to Official Documents   | 237 |
| 5.   | European Union   | 240 |
| a.   | Access to Public Sector Data Held by the European Union Institutions and Bodies  | 240 |
| i.   | Article 15 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (Former Article 255 of the EC Treaty)                                | 240 |
| ii.  | Article 42 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU  | 242 |
| iii. | Regulation 1049/2001 Regarding Public Access to European Parliament, Council, and Commission Documents                                 | 242 |
| iv.  | Towards a Review of Regulation 1049/2001: the Green Paper on Public Access to Documents Held by Institutions of the European Community | 246 |



## Table of Contents

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| b.   | Access to Public Sector Data Held by the Member States  | 248 |
| i.   | Publaw Reports  | 249 |
| ii.  | Green Paper on Public Sector Information  | 249 |
| D.   | The Obligation of Making Environmental Data Available for Access in European and International Documents          | 250 |
| 1.   | United Nations  | 250 |
| a.   | Rio Declaration on Environment and Development  | 250 |
| b.   | Guidelines for Access to Environmental Information  | 251 |
| c.   | The Aarhus Convention   | 253 |
| i.   | Background  | 253 |
| ii.  | Article 3 of the Aarhus Convention: General Provisions  | 255 |
| iii. | Article 4 of the Aarhus Convention: Access to Information upon Request  | 256 |
| iv.  | Article 5 of the Aarhus Convention: Dissemination of Environmental Information                                    | 258 |
| 2.   | Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development: Recommendation of the Council on Environmental Information | 261 |
| 3.   | Council of Europe: The Lugano Convention  | 262 |
| 4.   | European Union  | 263 |
| a.   | Access to Documents Held by the Community Institutions and Bodies: Regulation 1367/2006                           | 263 |
| b.   | Access to Documents Held by Member States   | 266 |
| i.   | Directive 90/313/EEC  | 266 |
| ii.  | Access Directive  | 267 |
| iii. | Access to Documents Held by Member States and the European Union: Shared Environmental Information System (SEIS)  | 268 |
| E.   | The Obligation of Making Spatial Data Available for Access in European and International Documents                | 268 |
| 1.   | United Nations  | 268 |
| a.   | United Nations Spatial Data Infrastructure  | 268 |
| b.   | Global Earth Observation System of Systems  | 269 |
| 2.   | European Union  | 270 |
| a.   | The INSPIRE Directive   | 270 |
| b.   | Global Monitoring for Environment and Security (Kopernikus)   | 271 |
| F.   | Interim Summary   | 272 |
| III. | The Obligation of Making Public Sector Spatial Data Available for Re-use  | 274 |
| A.   | Introduction  | 274 |
| B.   | Does Freedom of Information Include a Right to Re-use the Information?  | 275 |



|  |   |            |
|--|---|------------|
| C.   | International and European Documents  | 275        |
| 1.   | United Nations  | 276        |
| a.   | UNESCO Policy Guidelines  | 276        |
| b.   | United Nations Spatial Data Infrastructure  | 276        |
| c.   | Global Earth Observation System of Systems  | 277        |
| 2.   | Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development   | 277        |
| 3.   | Council of Europe   | 279        |
| 4.   | European Union  | 280        |
| a.   | Synergy Guidelines  | 280        |
| b.   | The PUBLAW Reports  | 280        |
| c.   | Green Paper on Public Sector Information  | 282        |
| d.   | eEurope 2002 Communication  | 283        |
| e.   | The PSI Directive   | 283        |
| f.   | The Commission Decision on the Re-use of Commission Information   | 285        |
| g.   | Global Monitoring for Environment and Security (Kopernikus)   | 286        |
| D.   | Interim Summary   | 287        |
| IV.  | The Obligation of Making Public Sector Spatial Data Available for Sharing   | 289        |
| A.   | Introduction  | 289        |
| B.   | International and European Documents  | 290        |
| 1.   | United Nations  | 290        |
| a.   | Rio Declaration and Agenda 21   | 290        |
| b.   | Framework Convention on Climate Change  | 291        |
| c.   | United Nations Spatial Data Infrastructure  | 291        |
| d.   | Global Earth Observation System of Systems  | 293        |
| 2.   | European Union  | 295        |
| a.   | INSPIRE   | 295        |
| b.   | Shared Environmental Information System (SEIS)  | 296        |
| c.   | Global Monitoring for Environment and Security  | 297        |
| C.   | Interim Summary   | 299        |
| V.   | Conclusion and Outlook towards the Next Chapter:<br>What Is the Scope of the Obligations of the Public Bodies to Make Public Sector Spatial Data Available? | 300        |
| <b>Chapter 6</b>   |   |            |
| <b>Defining the Distinctions between Access, Re-use, and Sharing</b> |   | <b>303</b> |
| I.   | Introduction  | 303        |
| II.  | Type of User to Whom Public Sector Spatial Data Is Made Available   | 304        |
| A.   | Users Requesting Public Sector Spatial Data for Access  | 305        |
| B.   | Users Requesting Public Sector Spatial Data for Re-use  | 305        |
| C.   | Users Requesting Public Sector Spatial Data for Sharing   | 306        |



## *Table of Contents*

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| III. | Type of Public Sector Spatial Data That Is Made Available                         | 307 |
| A.   | Typologies of Public Sector Data  | 308 |
| B.   | Types of Public Sector Data Based on the Content                                  | 313 |
| 1.   | Spatial Data  | 313 |
| 2.   | Environmental Data  | 315 |
| C.   | Types of Public Sector Spatial Data Based on the Level of Processing              | 316 |
| D.   | Types of Public Sector Spatial Data Based on Format and Volume                    | 318 |
| E.   | Interim Summary   | 320 |
| IV.  | The Purpose for Which Public Sector Spatial Data Should Be Made Available         | 321 |
| A.   | Democratic Objectives   | 322 |
| 1.   | Transparency  | 322 |
| 2.   | Public Participation  | 322 |
| 3.   | Legitimacy and Accountability   | 324 |
| 4.   | Fulfilling One's Rights and Obligations   | 326 |
| B.   | Socio-Economic Objectives   | 327 |
| 1.   | Participation in Society: Societal Growth   | 327 |
| 2.   | Development of Communities  | 330 |
| 3.   | Economic Growth   | 331 |
| 4.   | Public Sector Spatial Data as a Public Good                                       | 332 |
| a.   | What Is a Public Good?  | 332 |
| b.   | Is Information a Public Good?   | 335 |
| c.   | Is Public Sector Spatial Data a Public Good?                                      | 337 |
| C.   | Better Decision Making  | 338 |
| D.   | Interim Summary   | 339 |
| V.   | The Problematic Character of the Distinctions Between Access, Re-use, and Sharing | 340 |
| A.   | Access and Re-use   | 341 |
| B.   | Re-use and Sharing  | 347 |

## **Chapter 7**

|   |  |            |
|---|--|------------|
| <b>The Public Task of Providing Spatial Information Services in International and European Legislation and Policy Documents</b> |  | <b>351</b> |
| I.  | Introduction   | 351        |
| II.   | The Scope of the Public Task of Providing Information Services from a Positive Point of View | 353        |
| A.  | Introduction   | 353        |
| B.  | The Public Task of Providing Spatial Information Services as Part of Freedom of Information? | 353        |
| 1.  | United Nations   | 354        |
| a.  | Universal Declaration on Human Rights  | 354        |
| b.  | The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights                                     | 354        |



|     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 2.  | Council of Europe  | 355 |
| a.  | The European Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms                               | 355 |
| b.  | Documents of the Committee of Ministers and the Parliamentary Assembly   | 355 |
| c.  | The Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights   | 356 |
| 3.  | Interim Summary  | 356 |
| C.  | The Public Task of Providing Public Sector Information Services in International and European Documents          | 357 |
| 1.  | Introduction   | 357 |
| 2.  | United Nations   | 357 |
| a.  | UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Opinion and Expression   | 357 |
| b.  | United Nations Economic, Social and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)   | 358 |
| 3.  | Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development   | 359 |
| 4.  | Council of Europe  | 360 |
| a.  | Recommendation No. R(81)19 of the Committee of Ministers on the Access to Information Held by Public Authorities | 360 |
| b.  | Recommendation Rec(2002)2 of the Committee of Ministers to Member States on Access to Official Documents         | 361 |
| c.  | Convention on Access to Official Documents   | 361 |
| 5.  | European Union   | 362 |
| a.  | The Provision of Information Services by the European Union Institutions and Bodies                              | 362 |
| i.  | Regulation 1049/2001 Regarding Public Access to European Parliament, Council, and Commission Documents           | 362 |
| ii. | Green Paper on Public Access to Documents Held by Institutions of the European Community                         | 362 |
| b.  | Documents Held by the Member States  | 363 |
| i.  | Publaw Reports   | 363 |
| ii. | Green Paper on Public Sector Information   | 364 |
| D.  | The Public Task of Providing Environmental Information Services in European and International Documents          | 365 |
| 1.  | United Nations   | 365 |
| a.  | Rio Declaration on Environment and Development and Agenda 21   | 365 |
| b.  | Guidelines for Access to Environmental Information   | 366 |
| c.  | The Aarhus Convention  | 367 |
| 2.  | OECD: Recommendation of the Council on Environmental Information   | 369 |



## *Table of Contents*

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| 3. European Union  | 370        |
| a. Access to Documents Held by the European Union Institutions and Bodies: Regulation 1367/2006  | 370        |
| b. Access to Documents Held by Member States   | 371        |
| i. Directive 90/313/EEC  | 371        |
| ii. Access Directive   | 371        |
| c. Access to Documents Held by the Member States and the Institutions and Bodies of the European Union: Shared Environmental Information System (SEIS) | 372        |
| E. The Public Task of Providing Spatial Information Services in European and International Documents   | 373        |
| 1. United Nations: Global Earth Observation System of Systems  | 373        |
| 2. European Union  | 374        |
| a. The INSPIRE Directive   | 374        |
| b. Global Monitoring for Environment and Security (Kopernikus)   | 375        |
| F. Interim Summary   | 375        |
| III. The Scope of the Public Task of Providing Information Services from a Negative Point of View  | 377        |
| A. Introduction  | 377        |
| B. The Limits on the Public Task in European and International Documents   | 377        |
| 1. Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development   | 377        |
| 2. European Union  | 379        |
| a. Guidelines for Improving the Synergy between the Public and the Private Sectors in the Information Market   | 379        |
| b. Publaw Reports  | 380        |
| c. Green Paper on Public Sector Information  | 381        |
| d. The eEurope 2002 Communication  | 382        |
| e. PSI Directive   | 382        |
| f. Commission Decision on the Re-use of Commission Information   | 383        |
| g. Review of the PSI Directive   | 383        |
| C. Interim Summary   | 385        |
| IV. Towards the Next Chapter: What Is the Scope of the Public Task of Providing Information Services?  | 385        |
| <br><b>Chapter 8</b>   |            |
| <b>The Possibility of Defining the Public Task</b>   | <b>387</b> |
| I. Introduction  | 387        |
| II. The Question of the Scope of the Public Task   | 388        |
| A. Introduction  | 388        |



|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| B.   | Recognition of the Problem  | 388 |
| C.   | Impact of the Lack of Definition of <i>the Public Task</i>  | 393 |
| D.   | The What-Question and the How-Question  | 395 |
| III. | Attempts at Criteria to Determine the Public Task   | 396 |
| A.   | Introduction  | 396 |
| B.   | The Positive Approach: What the Public Bodies Should Do   | 397 |
| 1.   | Legal Basis   | 397 |
| 2.   | Link with the Core Responsibility of the Public Body  | 401 |
| 3.   | Market Failure  | 401 |
| 4.   | Public Interest   | 405 |
| a.   | General   | 405 |
| b.   | Concretization of Public Interest: Accessibility  | 407 |
| i.   | Aspects of Accessibility  | 408 |
| ii.  | Measures to Ensure Accessibility  | 410 |
| iii. | The Dilemma in Ensuring Accessibility   | 411 |
| iv.  | Link with the Discussion on Raw Data<br>and Added Value   | 411 |
| v.   | Dilemma of the Public Task  | 413 |
| c.   | Concretization of Public Interest: Types or Target<br>Groups of Information Services                  | 414 |
| d.   | Concretization of Public Interest: Universal Service  | 416 |
| i.   | The Concept and Characteristics of Universal<br>Service   | 416 |
| ii.  | Approaches to the Universal Service Concept   | 420 |
| iii. | The Usefulness of the Concept for Spatial<br>Information Services                                     | 421 |
| 5.   | Interim Summary   | 423 |
| C.   | The Negative Approach: What the Public Bodies<br>Should Not Do  | 424 |
| D.   | Public Task v. Market: An Absolute Demarcation Line?  | 427 |
| 1.   | Not Exhaustive  | 427 |
| 2.   | Not Mutually Exclusive  | 429 |
| a.   | Selling Information Products as Part of the Public Task   | 429 |
| i.   | General   | 429 |
| ii.  | The Example of the Ordnance Survey  | 430 |
| b.   | Market Services in the Public Interest  | 431 |
| E.   | The Public Task Debate and Competition Law  | 431 |
| IV.  | Competition Law   | 433 |
| A.   | Public Bodies as Undertakings   | 434 |
| 1.   | Definition  | 434 |
| 2.   | The State or Public Bodies as Undertakings  | 436 |
| 3.   | Applicability to Spatial Information Services   | 438 |
| B.   | Distortions of Competition by Public Bodies Providing<br>Spatial Information Services as Undertakings | 441 |



## Table of Contents

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 1. Article 101 Treaty on the Functioning of the EU:<br>Agreements between Undertakings   | 442 |
| a. General   | 442 |
| b. Applicability to Spatial Information Services   | 443 |
| 2. Article 102 Treaty on the Functioning of the EU:<br>Abuse of a Dominant Position  | 444 |
| a. General   | 444 |
| i. Dominant Position   | 445 |
| ii. Abuse of Dominant Position   | 446 |
| iii. Examples of Abusive Acts with Regard to Pricing   | 447 |
| iv. Example of Abusive Acts: Refusal to Supply   | 449 |
| b. Applicability to Spatial Information Services   | 451 |
| C. Distortions of Competition by the State as a Sovereign Power  | 457 |
| 1. Article 107 Treaty on the Functioning of the EU:<br>State Aid   | 457 |
| a. General   | 457 |
| i. Principle: Prohibition of State Aid   | 457 |
| ii. Elements of the State Aid Concept  | 458 |
| iii. Compatible State Aid  | 460 |
| b. Applicability to Spatial Information Services   | 461 |
| c. Transparency and Separation of Activities   | 462 |
| i. Transparency Directive  | 462 |
| ii. Treaty on the Functioning of the EU  | 463 |
| iii. Applicability to Spatial Information Services   | 464 |
| 2. Article 106(1) of the Treaty on the Functioning<br>of the EU: Measures Regarding Public Undertakings and<br>Undertakings with Special or Exclusive Rights | 466 |
| a. Introduction  | 466 |
| b. Public Undertakings and Undertakings<br>with Special or Exclusive Rights  | 467 |
| c. Measures Contrary to the Treaty on the Functioning<br>of the EU   | 470 |
| d. Enforcement   | 472 |
| e. Applicability to Spatial Information Services   | 472 |
| i. The Practice in the Member States   | 472 |
| ii. PSI Directive  | 473 |
| D. Special Case: Services of General (Economic) Interest   | 475 |
| 1. Article 106(2) Treaty on the Functioning of the EU  | 476 |
| a. Introduction  | 476 |
| b. Definitions   | 477 |
| i. Revenue Producing Monopoly  | 477 |
| ii. Service of General Economic Interest   | 477 |
| c. Conditions of Application   | 480 |
| i. Entrustment   | 480 |



|                   |   |            |
|-------------------|---|------------|
| ii.               | Proportionality   | 481        |
| iii.              | Effect on the Development of Trade  | 485        |
| d.                | Enforcement   | 486        |
| e.                | Interim Summary   | 486        |
| 2.                | Legislative Activities  | 486        |
| a.                | Article 16 of the EC-Treaty: From Derogation to<br>Obligation   | 487        |
| b.                | The European Commission: From Services of General<br>Economic Interest to Services of General Interest                                | 489        |
| i.                | Importance of Services of General Interest  | 489        |
| ii.               | Concept of Services of General Interest   | 490        |
| iii.              | No Clear Definition   | 491        |
| iv.               | Some Elements of a Service of General Economic<br>Interest  | 492        |
| c.                | Services of General Economic Interest and State Aid   | 493        |
| 3.                | Applicability to Spatial Information Services   | 496        |
| a.                | Spatial Information Services of General Economic<br>Interest  | 496        |
| b.                | The Public Task and Services of General Economic<br>Interest  | 497        |
| E.                | Interim Summary: Competition Law and Spatial Information<br>Services  | 498        |
| F.                | Confrontation of Competition Law with the Division<br>in the EU Legal Framework for the Availability<br>of Public Sector Spatial Data | 499        |
| V.                | The Definition of <i>Public Task</i> Remains Contingent   | 501        |
| A.                | The Definition of <i>Public Task</i> Continues to Evolve  | 501        |
| B.                | The Definition of <i>Public Task</i> Remains Political  | 505        |
| C.                | The Scope of the Public Task Depends on Who Defines It  | 507        |
| 1.                | Democratic Process  | 507        |
| 2.                | Stakeholders Involvement  | 508        |
| 3.                | Regulatory or Advisory Body   | 509        |
| 4.                | Level of Decision Making  | 510        |
| VI.               | Interim Summary   | 512        |
| <b>Chapter 9</b>  |   |            |
| <b>Conclusion</b> |   | <b>515</b> |
| I.                | Hypothesis: The Problematic Character of the EU Legal<br>Framework  | 515        |
| II.               | Overview of the Results   | 516        |
| A.                | Access, Re-use and Sharing in the Access Directive,<br>the PSI Directive and the INSPIRE Directive                                    | 516        |
| B.                | The Need for a Demarcation between Access, Re-use,<br>and Sharing   | 516        |



## Table of Contents

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 1. The Content of Access, Re-use, and Sharing  | 517 |
| a. Access  | 517 |
| b. Re-use  | 518 |
| c. Sharing   | 519 |
| d. Comparison  | 520 |
| 2. The Importance of the Demarcation   | 521 |
| C. The Problematic Character of the Distinction<br>Between Access, Re-use, and Sharing   | 522 |
| D. Public Bodies as Providers of Public Sector Spatial Data  | 522 |
| 1. Obligations to Make Public Sector Spatial Data<br>Available in International and European Legislation<br>and Policy Documents   | 523 |
| 2. Defining the Distinction Between Access, Re-use,<br>and Sharing   | 524 |
| a. Indicators for the Type of Use  | 524 |
| b. The Purpose of the Use  | 525 |
| 3. Confirmation of the Problematic Character<br>of the Distinction Between Access, Re-use,<br>and Sharing in the Access Directive, the PSI Directive,<br>and the INSPIRE Directive | 526 |
| E. Public Bodies as Providers of Spatial Information Services  | 528 |
| 1. The Public Task to Provide Spatial Information Services<br>in International and European Legislation and Policy<br>Documents  | 528 |
| 2. The Possibility of Defining <i>the Public Task</i>  | 530 |
| a. Criteria for Defining the Scope of the Public Task<br>to Provide Spatial Information Services   | 530 |
| b. Competition Law as a Source of Inspiration  | 532 |
| c. Confirmation of the Problematic Character<br>of the Distinction between Re-use and Sharing  | 535 |
| III. Final Conclusions and Further Thoughts  | 535 |
| A. Confirmation of the Hypothesis  | 535 |
| B. Comments and Reflections  | 535 |
| 1. Wide Definition of <i>Re-use</i>  | 536 |
| a. Risk for the Right of Access  | 536 |
| b. Revision of the Definition  | 537 |
| 2. The Concept of the Public Task  | 538 |
| a. The Uncertain Character of the Public Task  | 539 |
| b. Reduction of the Uncertain Character of the Public<br>Task  | 540 |
| c. The Public Task on the Level of the European<br>Union   | 541 |
| d. Reduction of the Uncertainty of the Public<br>Task at the Level of the European Union   | 542 |



|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 3. Coherence with Other Legislation and Policies | 542 |
| a. Competition Law                               | 542 |
| b. Other Information Policies and Legislation    | 543 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Table of Legislation and Policy Documents | 545 |
|---|-----|

|                |     |
|----------------|-----|
| Table of Cases | 573 |
|----------------|-----|

|                    |     |
|--------------------|-----|
| List of References | 581 |
|--------------------|-----|

|       |     |
|-------|-----|
| Index | 613 |
|-------|-----|