

Table of Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxi
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxxix
<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	li
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	lix

Introduction	1
<i>Jan Wouters, Anna-Luise Chané, and Manfred Nowak</i>	
A. Focus and structure of this book	1
B. Challenges for the EU and human rights	3
C. Opportunities for the EU and human rights	6
D. Recommendations	7

PART I: FRAMEWORK

1. From an economic community to a union of values: The emergence of the EU's commitment to human rights	11
<i>Jan Wouters</i>	
A. Introduction: Setting the scene	11
B. Recognition of fundamental rights by the CJEU	14
C. Political recognition of fundamental rights in the 1960s and 1970s	18
D. Treaty recognition of fundamental rights	23
E. Mainstreaming human rights in the 1990s and 2000s	29
F. The Treaty of Lisbon and human rights	33
G. Concluding remarks: The untenability of the current competence arrangements	37
2. Factors enabling and hindering the promotion and protection of human rights by the EU	39
<i>Eva Maria Lassen</i>	
A. Introduction	39
B. Analysis of the factors enabling or hindering EU human rights policy	40
1. Historical factors: Setting the scene for human rights protection	40
a) Positioning human rights in the evolving Community	40
b) Historical development of external policies on human rights	42
2. Legal factors: Unresolved challenges	44
a) The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights	45
b) The EU as a global player	46
3. Political and economic factors	47
a) Political factors	47
b) Economic factors	49
4. Social factors	50
5. Cultural and religious factors: Celebrating diversity, challenged by diversity	53
a) Struggling with diversity inside the EU	53
b) Challenged by diversity: Interacting with third states	55
6. Technological factors	56

C. Recommendations	58
1. Addressing inconsistencies linked to legal factors	58
2. Social factors: The case of ethnicity	59
3. Addressing the dynamic development of single factors: The case of technological factors	59
D. Conclusion	60
3. Conceptual underpinnings of the EU's commitment to human rights <i>Lorena Sosa and Alexandra Timmer</i>	62
A. Introduction	62
B. The EU's conceptions of human rights	63
1. State of affairs	63
a) Internal	63
b) External	66
2. Challenges	67
a) The impact of the EU's economic mission on its conceptualisation of human rights	67
b) Challenges regarding substantive universality	69
c) Conceptualising a universal and inclusive legal subject of EU human rights	72
i) Vulnerability and intersectionality	72
ii) Internal and external dimension	73
C. Opportunities and recommendations for further conceptualisation	75
1. Incorporating multiple voices	76
2. Critically assessing the politics of conceptual difference	77
D. Conclusion	78
4. The normative framework of the EU's commitment to human rights: The Treaties, the Charter, Member States' constitutional traditions, and international law <i>Chiara Altafin, Karin Lukas, and Manfred Nowak</i>	79
A. Introduction	79
B. Discussion	79
1. State of affairs	79
a) EU Treaties	80
b) The Charter	83
c) Fundamental rights as general principles of EU law	93
d) International normative sources of human rights law	94
e) Relevant regional instruments	96
i) ECHR	97
ii) ESC	98
iii) Istanbul Convention	99
2. What are the opportunities?	101
3. What are the challenges?	106
a) The absence of EU human rights competence	106
b) The difficulties of Charter implementation in view of EU institutions' and Member States' competences	109
c) The uneven nature of the EU and Member States' human rights obligations with regard to the international legal framework, leading to gaps and overlaps	110
d) The application of 'double standards' in the EU's approach	111

C. Recommendations	112
1. EU internal policies	113
2. EU external policies	114
D. Conclusions	115
5. 'The EU's institutional human rights architecture'	117
<i>Monika Mayrhofer</i>	
A. Introduction	117
B. State of Affairs: The institutional framework of the EU	118
1. European Council	118
2. The Council of the European Union and its human rights-related working parties	120
3. The European Parliament	122
4. The European Commission	123
5. The Court of Justice of the European Union	125
6. The European External Action Service, the HR/VP, and the Special Representative for Human Rights	127
7. Fundamental Rights Agency	129
8. European Ombudsman	130
C. What are the opportunities?	131
D. What are the challenges?	131
E. Recommendations: Proposed ways forward	132
F. Conclusion	134

PART II: ACTORS

6. The EU's engagement with its Member States on human rights	137
<i>Jan Wouters</i>	
A. Introduction	137
B. State of affairs	137
1. The human rights obligations of the EU	137
2. The human rights obligations of EU Member States	143
3. Channels through which the EU and EU Member States impact each other on human rights promotion and protection	152
a) Legal channels	152
i) Bottom-up: From Member States towards the EU	152
Preliminary rulings	152
Common constitutional traditions	154
'Constitutional rebellions' from Member State courts	154
ii) Top-down: From the EU towards Member States	155
Judicial independence	155
Infringement procedures	156
Article 7 TEU	158
Accession criteria	160
iii) Member States towards Member States	160
b) Political and diplomatic channels	161
i) From Member States towards the EU	161
ii) From the EU towards Member States	162
The rule of law framework and the rule of law dialogue	162

Working groups assisting the Council on human and fundamental rights	164
Article 7 TEU	165
c) Other channels	165
C. Opportunities and challenges	166
D. Recommendations	167
E. Conclusion	169
7. The EU's engagement with the United Nations on human rights	171
<i>Anna-Luise Chané</i>	
A. Introduction	171
B. State of affairs	172
1. The UN human rights system	172
2. Legal and policy framework	175
3. Internal coordination and external representation	178
4. Toolbox	179
a) Statements	180
b) Resolutions	180
i) Resolutions tabled 'on behalf of the EU'	181
ii) Voting and co-sponsorship	182
iii) Resolutions tabled by the EU Member States	184
c) Universal Periodic Review	184
d) Financing	184
C. Challenges and opportunities	185
D. Recommendations	188
E. Conclusions	189
8. The EU's engagement with the Council of Europe and the OSCE on human rights	190
<i>Jakub Jaraczewski, Władysław Józwicki, and Zdzisław Kędzia</i>	
A. Introduction	190
B. The EU's relationship with the Council of Europe	195
1. State of affairs	195
2. Opportunities	198
3. Challenges	200
4. Conclusions	203
C. The EU's relationship with the OSCE	204
1. State of affairs	204
2. Opportunities	206
3. Challenges	207
4. Conclusions	208
D. Concluding remarks	209
9. The EU's engagement with non-European regional organisations on human rights	210
<i>Elizabeth Salmon and Magnus Killander</i>	
A. Introduction	210
B. Discussion	211
1. State of affairs	211
a) Introduction to regional human rights systems	211
i) The OAS and the Inter-American Human Rights System	212

ii) The AU and the African human rights system	213
iii) Other regional human rights initiatives	214
b) EU engagement with regional organisations	215
i) Legal and policy framework of the EU's human rights engagement with regional organisations	215
ii) Methods of cooperation	219
Dialogue as a method to establish the human rights agenda	219
Financial support for human rights issues in other regions	221
2. What are the opportunities?	223
3. What are the challenges?	225
C. Recommendations	226
D. Conclusion	227
10. The EU's engagement with the Eastern Partnership on human rights	228
<i>Pál Dunay</i>	
A. Introduction	228
B. History predating the Eastern Partnership	229
1. From the end of the East-West conflict to a 'wider Europe'	229
2. From ENP through to Action Plans to Eastern Partnership	231
C. Analysis of human rights elements in the Eastern Partnership	235
D. Conclusions	241
11. The human rights encounter between the EU and its Southern Mediterranean Partners	244
<i>T Jeremy Gunn and Alvaro Lagresa</i>	
A. Introduction	244
B. Discussion	245
1. State of affairs in the Southern Mediterranean	245
a) Official EU positions regarding human rights with its Southern Partners	245
b) State of human rights in the EU's Southern Partners	247
c) Israeli occupation of Palestine	252
2. What are the human rights challenges?	256
3. What are the opportunities?	259
C. Recommendations: Proposed way forward	261
D. Conclusion: Normative Power Europe?	264
12. The EU's engagement with foreign powers on human rights: Brazil, China, and India	265
<i>Francisca Costa Reis, Weiyuan Gao, and Vineet Hegde</i>	
A. Introduction	265
B. Brazil	266
1. Introduction	266
2. Bilateral cooperation on human rights: EU-Brazil	267
a) First steps in human rights cooperation (1992–2007)	267
b) The EU-Brazil Strategic Partnership (2007–present)	268
3. Multilateral cooperation on human rights: EU-Brazil	270
4. Challenges	272
5. Opportunities	273
C. India	273
1. EU-India human rights relations: Introduction	273

2. Bilateral cooperation on human rights: EU-India	275
a) Pre-human rights dialogue (1993–2004)	275
b) Human rights dialogues (2004–13)	276
c) Post-human rights dialogues (2013–present)	277
d) Shift in focus on specific human rights issues	277
e) EU’s developmental assistance in India	278
3. Multilateral cooperation on human rights: EU-India	279
4. Human rights in economic partnership	280
5. Challenges	281
6. Opportunities	282
D. China	282
1. Bilateral cooperation on human rights: EU-China	284
a) Diplomatic dialogue between officials	284
b) Legal seminars	286
c) Technical cooperation projects	286
2. Multilateral cooperation on human rights: EU-China	287
3. Challenges	289
4. Opportunities	290
E. Conclusions	291
13. The EU’s engagement with civil society on human rights	293
<i>Jeff Kenner, Katrina Peake, and Stuart Wallace</i>	
A. Introduction	293
B. Discussion	294
1. State of Affairs	294
2. What are the challenges?	300
a) Cross-cutting challenges	300
b) Challenges for EU engagement with civil society organisations	303
C. Recommendations: Proposed ways forward	305
1. Cross-cutting recommendations	305
2. Improved engagement with civil society organisations	307
D. Conclusion	311
14. The EU’s engagement with business on human rights	312
<i>Mary E Footer</i>	
A. Introduction	312
B. Discussion	314
1. State of affairs: How is the issue at hand playing out in the context of the EU’s commitment to human rights?	314
a) Background	314
b) Setting the agenda for the EU’s ‘smart-mix’ approach to business and human rights	315
i) Sectoral guides on business and human rights	316
ii) Regulatory and ‘smart mix’ measures to implement the business and human rights agenda	316
iii) Member States’ National Action Plans on CSR and on business and human rights	320
c) Completing the EU’s agenda on business and human rights with access to remedy	322
i) Access to judicial remedies in civil and commercial matters	323

ii) Access to judicial remedies in criminal matters	324
iii) Access to non-judicial remedies	325
d) The EU's approach to CSR and business and human rights on the external plane	326
i) Bilateral engagement on business and human rights through specific provisions in trade and investment cooperation agreements	327
ii) Addressing CSR and business and human rights through soft power: Dialogue with third countries and regions	330
iii) EU endorsement of UN-level action on business and human rights	331
2. What are the opportunities?	333
a) Horizontal embeddedness of business and human rights	333
b) Transversal character of EU policy on CSR	334
c) Uniform implementation of UNGPs	334
d) Better alignment of European and global approaches to CSR	334
e) Adaptability of voluntary CSR instruments to business and human rights	334
f) Mutual reinforcement of CSR instruments	335
g) A regulatory smart mix for business and human rights	335
h) Exchange of information on best practices	335
3. What are the challenges?	336
a) Transversal character of EU policy on CSR	336
b) EU engagement with multi-stakeholders on business and human rights	336
c) Alignment of European and global approaches to CSR	336
d) Implementation of UNGPs as the primary CSR instrument	337
e) External advancement of the EU's business and human rights policy	337
f) A regulatory smart mix for business and human rights	338
C. Recommendations: Proposed way forward	339
D. Conclusions	340

PART III: POLICIES

15. EU enlargement policy and human rights	345
<i>Beáta Huszka and Zsolt Körtvélyesi</i>	
A. Introduction	345
B. State of affairs: Human rights and enlargement	346
C. Opportunities for improving human rights performance during the process of enlargement	348
D. Challenges of the EU human rights conditionality	349
1. Current challenges and the Western Balkans	351
2. The leverage and inconsistencies of enlargement conditionality	354
3. Consistency of internal and external policies	355
4. Benchmarking and measuring impact	356
5. Delivery and consequences	358
6. The challenge of prioritisation and the puzzle of securitisation	359
7. Depth and sustainable changes	361
E. Recommendations	362
F. Conclusions	364
16. EU trade policy and human rights	365
<i>Nicolas Hachez and Axel Marx</i>	
A. Introduction	365

B. Free trade agreements	366
1. Human rights clauses	367
a) State of affairs	367
b) Opportunities	368
c) Challenges	369
i) Exceptions to generalised conditionality	369
ii) Inconsistency in drafting and scope	369
iii) Monitoring and application of human rights clauses	370
2. Sustainable development chapters	372
a) State of affairs	372
b) Challenges	373
c) Opportunities	374
3. Investment	375
a) Opportunities	376
b) Challenges	377
C. Generalised system of preferences	378
1. State of affairs	378
a) Eligibility	379
b) Conditionality	379
c) Granting process	379
d) Monitoring and withdrawal	379
2. Challenges	380
a) Enforcement	380
b) Double standards	382
c) Lack of transparency and legal certainty in the suspension process	382
3. Opportunities	382
D. Recommendations	384
E. Conclusion	385
17. Human rights in EU development cooperation	386
<i>Brecht Lein</i>	
A. Introduction	386
B. Human rights in EU development cooperation: Policy framework and instruments	387
1. Policy framework	387
2. EU instruments for integrating human rights into development cooperation	389
a) Aid sanctions and political conditionality	389
i) Aid sanctions under Article 96 of the Cotonou Agreement	390
ii) Human rights conditionality in EU budget support policy	391
iii) Challenges and opportunities	395
b) The European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights	397
c) EU human rights mainstreaming	399
d) The EU's rights-based approach to development	401
C. Conclusions	406
18. Human rights in the EU's common security and defence policy	408
<i>Carmen Márquez Carrasco</i>	
A. Introduction	408
B. Origins, evolution, and structures of CSDP	408

C. The EU's commitment to human rights applied to CSDP missions and operations	413
1. The legal and policy framework on the protection and respect for human rights in CSDP missions and operations	413
2. Opportunities	420
3. Challenges	422
a) Applicability of human rights and humanitarian law	422
b) Accountability and remedies	426
c) Responsibility of private military and security companies in the context of CSDP	430
d) Challenges at the operational level	431
4. Recommendations	434
a) Enhancing the protection of vulnerable groups in EU crisis management	434
b) Applicable regulatory framework	434
c) Integrating the promotion of human rights within the different EU comprehensive strategies to crises	435
d) Responsibility for human rights violations	435
e) Planning structures and resources	435
f) Training of mission personnel	436
D. Conclusion	436
19. EU migration policy and human rights	438
<i>Elina Pirjatanniemi and Maija Mustaniemi-Laakso</i>	
A. Introduction	438
B. Discussion	439
1. State of affairs: EU migration framework	439
a) Introduction	439
b) Legislation	439
c) Policy developments	441
2. What are the human rights challenges?	445
a) Introduction	445
b) Security and human rights—issues of coherence	446
3. What are the opportunities?	449
C. Recommendations: Proposed way forward	452
1. Introduction	452
2. In search for a right(s) approach to migration management	453
3. Towards shared responsibility?	455
D. Conclusion	456
20. EU security and counter-terrorism policies and human rights	457
<i>Mikaela Heikkilä and Elina Pirjatanniemi</i>	
A. Introduction	457
B. Discussion	458
1. State of affairs	458
a) Criminal justice and police cooperation in relation to terrorism	458
b) Large-scale databases and general surveillance	460
c) Criminalisation of terrorist-related offences	462
d) The external dimension of the fight against terrorism	463
2. What are the opportunities?	464

3. What are the challenges?	466
a) Data protection and the right to respect for private life	466
i) How is data collected? Whose data is collected?	467
ii) What data is collected?	468
iii) How is the data stored? For how long is it stored?	470
iv) How is the data used? Who has access?	471
b) Terrorism as a criminal law matter	472
c) Human rights challenges in the external counter-terrorism action	473
d) How are the counter-terrorism instruments/measures adopted?	473
C. Recommendations	474
D. Conclusion	476
21. The EU human rights and democratisation policy	478
<i>Cristina Churruca Muguruza and Felipe Gómez Isa</i>	
A. Introduction	478
B. The EU human rights and democracy promotion policy:	
Strategic orientations	479
1. The Strategic Framework on Human Rights and Democracy: principles, objectives, and priorities	481
2. The Action Plan on Human Rights and Democratization 2012–2014	483
3. The Action Plan on Human Rights and Democratization 2015–2019	484
4. Human rights guidelines and human rights and democracy country strategies	486
C. Specific tools for the implementation of the human rights and democracy policy	487
1. EU Special Representative for Human Rights	487
2. Human rights dialogues	488
3. Human rights conditionality clauses	489
4. Human rights and democracy focal points	491
5. The European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights (EIDHR)	491
6. Election support	493
D. Opportunities and challenges of the EU's human rights and democratisation policy in light of the case of Egypt	495
E. Recommendations	499
F. Conclusions	502
22. The EU's engagement with human rights defenders	504
<i>Wolfgang Benedek</i>	
A. Introduction	504
B. Main issues at stake	504
1. State of affairs	504
a) Who is a human rights defender?	504
b) Actors in support of human rights defenders	506
2. Opportunities: Policy framework and EU action	508
a) Bilateral action instruments	509
b) Support in regional and multilateral action	510
c) Financial support through the EIDHR	511
3. Challenges	514
C. Recommendations	515
D. General conclusions	517

PART IV: STRATEGIES

23. EU practices on measuring human rights	523
<i>Markus Möstl, Maddalena Vivona, Isabella Meier, and Klaus Starl</i>	
A. Introduction	523
B. Discussion	524
1. Measuring human rights and the EU: State of affairs	524
a) Human rights measurement techniques	524
i) Mechanisms monitoring compliance	524
ii) Human rights indicators	525
iii) Indices	526
iv) Impact assessments	526
v) Benchmarks	526
vi) 'Human-rights-related' measurements	526
b) Examples of EU human rights measurements	527
i) EU and Member States	527
ii) Accession countries	529
iii) Third countries	530
2. What are the opportunities?	531
a) Better evidence	531
b) Improved coherence	532
c) Interim conclusion on opportunities	533
3. What are the challenges?	533
a) Access to meaningful human rights information	533
b) Accountability and credibility	535
c) Coordination	536
d) Interim conclusion on challenges	536
C. Recommendations: Proposed way forward	536
1. Improve access to relevant human rights information	537
2. Coordination of measurement efforts	539
3. Improving accountability and credibility	540
D. Conclusions	540
24. The EU's (strategic) use of human rights tools and instruments	542
<i>Manfred Nowak and Karolina Podstawa</i>	
A. Introduction	542
B. The EU toolbox and its current use	544
1. State of affairs: Typology of instruments	544
2. State of affairs: The EU fundamental and human rights toolbox in action	546
a) Political tools	546
b) Legal tools	548
c) Enforcement tools	550
d) The information, monitoring, and evaluation tools	552
e) The reflexive and outreach tools	553
f) The diplomatic tools	554
C. Discussion: Critical analysis of the use of the toolbox	555
1. Strengths	556
a) Breadth and complementarity of the toolbox	556

b) Stability and flexibility of the toolbox	557
c) Reflexivity and innovation	558
2. Weaknesses	559
a) Implementation Gap	559
b) Coherence	561
c) Effectiveness	563
D. Discussion: (Strategic) use of fundamental and human rights toolbox?	565
E. Conclusions	567
25. Towards ever greater coherence? Human rights policies in the evolving EU	569
<i>Lisa Ginsborg and Graham Finlay</i>	
A. Introduction: Short description of the issue	569
B. Discussion	570
1. State of affairs: How is the issue at hand playing out in the context of the EU's commitment to human rights?	570
2. What are the challenges?	572
a) Structural incoherence	572
b) Interest-based incoherence	575
c) Normative framework incoherence	577
3. What are the opportunities?	579
C. Recommendations: proposed way forward	584
1. Foster the adoption and implementation of international human rights law in EU Member States	585
2. Implement the EU's commitment to human rights through international law	585
3. Provide adequate human rights information and training to EU officials	586
4. Increase the use and improve the methodology of human rights impact assessments	587
5. Expand the mandate of the EU Fundamental Rights Agency (including in the review of external policies)	588
D. Conclusion	588
Conclusion: Delivering on the EU's commitment to human rights: Implementation, coherence and effectiveness	589
<i>Nicolas Hachez</i>	
A. Introduction	589
B. A deteriorating context at home and abroad	590
C. A world of opportunities	591
D. Implementation, coherence, and effectiveness: Three approaches to the delivery challenge	594
1. Implementation	594
a) An uncertain normative framework	595
b) Values common to Member States?	596
c) Delivering the EU's commitment to human rights to the wider world	597
2. Coherence	600
a) Internal-internal (in)coherence: A house divided?	600
b) Internal-external (in)coherence: Walking the talk?	601
c) External-external (in)coherence: Double standards?	602

3. Effectiveness	603
a) Knowledge	604
b) Bringing others on board	606
i) States: The role of credibility	606
ii) Non-state actors: The untapped potential	608
E. Moving forward in practice	609
 <i>Index</i>	 613