

# Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations	xv
CHAPTER 1	
Introduction	1
CHAPTER 2	
The Conceptual Framework	5
2.1 Types of Information Exchange	5
2.1.1 Based on the Ancillarity to Other Conduct	5
2.1.1.a Ancillary Information Exchanges	6
2.1.1.b Pure Information Exchanges	6
2.1.2 Based on the Stage of the Concertation	8
2.1.3 Based on the Anti-competitive Subject Matter of the Information	9
2.1.4 Based on the Primary Flow of Information	9
2.1.4.a Horizontal Exchanges	9
2.1.4.b Vertical Exchanges (With Indirect Horizontal Effects)	10
2.2 Characteristics of the Information Exchange	11
2.2.1 The Inner Layer	11
2.2.1.a Public Availability (Public vs Private Data)	11
2.2.1.b Commercial Sensitivity (Strategic vs Non-strategic Private Data)	12
2.2.1.c Level of Detail (Aggregated vs Disaggregated Data)	12
2.2.1.d Age (Historic Data vs Recent Data vs Future Intentions)	12
2.2.2 The Outer Layer	13
2.2.2.a Frequency	13
2.2.2.b Public Availability	14
2.2.2.c Market Coverage	14



## Table of Contents

---

### CHAPTER 3

The Economic Framework	15
3.1 Efficiencies	15
3.1.1 Benefits for Suppliers (Horizontal Market Transparency)	15
3.1.2 Benefits for Customers (Vertical Market Transparency)	17
3.1.3 The Shortcomings of Static Models	18
3.1.4 The Stronger Weight of Vertical Transparency for Competition Policy	19
3.2 Foreclosure: A Negligible Concern	21
3.3 Collusion: The Main Concern	22
3.3.1 The Theory of Collusion	23
3.3.1.a Meaning	23
3.3.1.b Forms	23
3.3.1.c Conditions for Collusion	24
3.3.1.d Factors That Facilitate Collusion	26
3.3.1.d.1 Introduction	26
3.3.1.d.2 Factors Where the Effects on Collusion Is Clear	26
3.3.1.d.3 Factors Where the Effects on Collusion Is More Ambiguous	30
3.3.1.d.4 The Desirable Analytical Approach	31
3.3.2 The Theory of Tacit Collusion	32
3.3.2.a Meaning	32
3.3.2.b Terminology	32
3.3.2.c Situations in Which Tacit Collusion Can Occur	33
3.3.3 The Concept of 'Facilitative Practices'	34
3.3.3.a Meaning	34
3.3.3.b Forms	35
3.3.3.c Information Exchange as a Facilitative Practice	36
3.3.3.d Current Shortcomings	36
3.3.4 The Role of Market Transparency for Collusion: It Is Mainly About Past Data	37
3.3.4.a The Notion of Market Transparency	37
3.3.4.b The Ways in Which Market Transparency Facilitates Collusion	38
3.3.4.c The Requirement of Causal Attribution	40
3.3.4.d The Balancing of Pro- and Anti-competitive Effect: Circumstances Matter	41
3.3.5 The Role of Communication for Collusion: It Is Mainly About Future Intentions	42
3.3.5.a The Notion of Communication	42
3.3.5.b The Ways in Which Communication Facilitates Collusion	43
3.3.5.c The Importance of Communication for Competition Policy	45



3.3.6	The Risk Classification of Information Exchanges	47
3.3.6.a	The Theoretical Level: The Effect of Each Factor on Collusion	47
3.3.6.b	The Practical Level: Identifying the Most Harmful Factors for Collusion	47
3.3.6.c	The Policy Level: The Principle of Indispensability	51
CHAPTER 4		
	The Legal Framework of Art. 101 TFEU	53
4.1	The Structure of Art. 101 TFEU	53
4.1.1	Prohibition	53
4.1.2	Exemption	54
4.1.3	Consequences of an Infringement	55
4.2	The Concept of a ‘Concerted Practice’	55
4.2.1	Guidance by the EU Courts	56
4.2.1.a	Demarcation from the Concept of an ‘Agreement’	56
4.2.1.a.1	The Concept of ‘Agreement’	56
4.2.1.a.2	The Concept of a ‘Concerted Practice’ as a Residual Clause	57
4.2.1.a.3	The Fluid Boundaries Between Both Concepts	57
4.2.1.b	The Element of a ‘Concertation’	58
4.2.1.b.1	Dyestuffs (First Definition)	58
4.2.1.b.2	Suiker Unie (Independence Doctrine)	59
4.2.1.b.3	Cimenteries and Subsequent Case Law (Element of Reciprocity)	61
4.2.1.b.4	Eturas (Importance of Evidentiary Issues)	62
4.2.1.c	The Element of ‘Practice’	63
4.2.1.c.1	Dyestuffs (First Vague Indication of a Second Element)	63
4.2.1.c.2	Anic and Hüls (Requirement of Subsequent and Casual Conduct on the Market)	64
4.2.1.c.3	T-Mobile (Single Meeting Is Sufficient for Presumption)	66
4.2.2	Guidance by the Literature	66
4.2.2.a	The Jurisprudential Literature	66
4.2.2.a.1	The Importance of the Element of ‘Concertation’	66
4.2.2.a.2	The Sources of Concertation	67
4.2.2.a.3	The Lack of Consensus on the Conceptual Meaning	68
4.2.2.a.4	The Two Strands of the Conceptual Meaning	69
4.2.2.b	The Analytical Philosophical Literature	70
4.2.2.b.1	Black: Communication Should Matter	71



## Table of Contents

---

	4.2.2.b.2	Del Mar: Conduct Analysis vs Economic Analysis	72
4.2.3		Evidentiary Issues	73
	4.2.3.a	Burden of Proof	73
	4.2.3.b	Standard of Proof	74
	4.2.3.b.1	Meaning	74
	4.2.3.b.2	The Ambiguous Case Law on the Exact Test	75
	4.2.3.b.3	The Concept of 'Effort Probatoire'	76
	4.2.3.c	Types of Evidence	78
4.3		The Classification as a Restriction of Competition by Object or Effect	79
4.3.1		The Object/Effect Dichotomy	79
	4.3.1.a	Preliminary Observations	80
	4.3.1.a.1	Distinct Concepts	80
	4.3.1.a.2	Linguistic Considerations	81
	4.3.1.a.3	Normative Justifications for the Dichotomy	81
	4.3.1.b	Analytical Similarities	83
	4.3.1.b.1	Restriction of Competition vs Restriction in the Freedom of Action	83
	4.3.1.b.2	Relevance of the Counterfactual	83
	4.3.1.b.3	Relevance of Pro-competitive Effects	85
	4.3.1.b.4	Context-Specific Assessment	86
	4.3.1.c	Analytical Differences	86
	4.3.1.c.1	Nature of the Analysis: Plausibility vs Likelihood of Anti-competitive Effects	86
	4.3.1.c.2	Burden of Proof	88
	4.3.1.c.3	Appreciability on Competition (De Minimis Doctrine)	88
	4.3.1.c.4	Likelihood of Exemption	90
4.3.2		Identifying Restrictions by Object	91
	4.3.2.a	The Case Law in the Past: Emphasis on 'Category-Building' and Abstract Legal Formulas	91
	4.3.2.a.1	Category-Building and the Steady Shift Away from It	91
	4.3.2.a.2	The Long-Lasting Struggle to Settle on an Abstract Legal Formula	94
	4.3.2.a.3	The Challenges of Employing an Abstract Legal Formula	95
	4.3.2.b	The Current Case Law: The Importance of Context and Experience	96
	4.3.2.b.1	Contextual Approach: The Context Is Everything	96
	4.3.2.b.2	Cautious Approach: The Importance of Sufficient Experience (or in Dubio Pro Effectu)	100
	4.3.2.c	The Theoretical Perspective	103



4.3.2.c.1	The Plausible Efficiency Theory (Positive Theory)	103
4.3.2.c.2	The Intended Ends Theory (Normative Theory)	106
4.3.2.c.3	The Risk Offence Theory (Normative Theory)	107
CHAPTER 5		
	The Importance of Information Exchanges for the Implementation of Economic Collusion Theories in Art. 101 TFEU	109
5.1	Parallel Conduct and Circumstantial Evidence	109
5.1.1	The Legal Challenges of Tackling Mere Parallel Conduct	109
5.1.1.a	The Legal Challenge of Solely Relying on Circumstantial Evidence	109
5.1.1.b	The Differences Between the Legal and Economic Analysis	111
5.1.2	The Leading Cases: A Lost Fight to Tackle Parallel Conduct under Art. 101 TFEU?	112
5.1.2.a	The Early Days: 1950s and 1960s	112
5.1.2.b	The <i>Dyestuffs</i> Case	113
5.1.2.c	The <i>Suiker Unie</i> Case	115
5.1.2.d	The Zinc Producer Group Decision vs the Cartonboard Decision	116
5.1.2.e	The <i>Compagnie Royale Asturienne Des Mines</i> Case	118
5.1.2.f	The <i>Woodpulp II</i> Case	118
5.1.2.g	The <i>BPB</i> Case	123
5.1.2.h	The <i>CISAC</i> Case	124
5.1.3	Concluding Remarks	127
5.1.3.a	The Descriptive Perspective: Parallel Conduct Is Merely Weak Circumstantial Evidence	127
5.1.3.b	The Normative Perspective: Is the Strict Stance When Solely Relying on Circumstantial Evidence Justified?	127
5.1.3.c	The Prescriptive Perspective: The Implications for Competition Policy	128
5.2	Facilitative Practices in the Commission Guidelines	129
5.2.1	Horizontal Cooperation Guidelines	130
5.2.1.a	R&D Agreements	130
5.2.1.b	Production Agreements	131
5.2.1.c	Joint Purchasing Agreements	131
5.2.1.d	Joint Commercialisation Agreements	133
5.2.1.e	Standardisation Agreements	133
5.2.1.f	Other Types of Horizontal Cooperation Agreements	134
5.2.1.g	Conclusion	134
5.2.2	Vertical Guidelines	134
5.2.2.a	Definition and Scope	135



## Table of Contents

---

5.2.2.b	Agency Agreements	136
5.2.2.c	Single Branding Agreements	136
5.2.2.d	Exclusive (Territorial) Distribution Agreements	137
5.2.2.e	Exclusive Customer Allocation Agreements	137
5.2.2.f	Selective Distribution Agreements	138
5.2.2.g	Upfront Access Payments	139
5.2.2.h	Category Management Agreements	140
5.2.2.i	Resale Price Restrictions	140
5.2.2.j	Conclusion	141
5.2.3	Technology Transfer Guidelines	142
5.2.3.a	Definition and Scope	142
5.2.3.b	Licensing Agreements	143
5.2.3.c	Technology Pools	144
5.2.3.d	Conclusion	145
5.2.4	Concluding Remarks Regarding Information Exchanges	146
5.2.4.a	Information Exchange Is the Most Relevant and Universal Manifestation of a Facilitative Practice	146
5.2.4.b	The Scope and Nature of Ancillary Information Exchange	147
CHAPTER 6		
	Pure Information Exchange	151
6.1	The Commission's View	151
6.1.1	Early Policy Statements	151
6.1.1.a	1968 Notice	151
6.1.1.b	1977 Report	152
6.1.1.c	2001 Horizontal Cooperation Guidelines	153
6.1.1.d	2008 Maritime Guidelines	153
6.1.2	Early Decisional Practice	154
6.1.3	2011 Horizontal Cooperation Guidelines	156
6.1.3.a	Introduction	156
6.1.3.b	Analytical Framework	158
6.1.3.c	Collusion Concerns	160
6.1.3.d	Conclusion	162
6.2	Restrictions by Effect Cases	162
6.2.1	Case Law and Decisional Practice	162
6.2.1.a	The <i>John Deere</i> Case	162
6.2.1.b	The <i>Eudim</i> Decision	166
6.2.1.c	The <i>CEPI-Cartonboard</i> Decision	168
6.2.1.d	The <i>Wirtschaftsvereinigung Stahl</i> Decision	169
6.2.1.e	The <i>Thyssen Stahl</i> Case	171
6.2.1.f	The <i>EATA Decision</i> (Borderline Case)	171
6.2.1.g	The <i>Asnef-Equifax</i> Case	172
6.2.2	Descriptive Perspective: Identifying Some Common Themes	174
6.2.2.a	The Issue of Disaggregation	174



6.2.2.b	The Importance of the Market Structure Analysis	176
6.2.2.c	The Lack of Using of Art. 101(3) TFEU	177
6.2.3	Normative Perspective: Are Safe Harbours Desirable?	177
6.2.3.a	Safe Harbours Based on Market Shares	177
6.2.3.b	Safe Harbours for Certain Types of Information Exchange	180
6.2.3.c	'Safe Zones'	182
6.2.3.d	Conclusion	183
6.3	Restrictions by Object Cases	183
6.3.1	Case Law and Decisional Practice	183
6.3.1.a	The <i>Fatty Acid</i> Decision (Borderline Case)	183
6.3.1.b	The <i>Tate &amp; Lyle</i> Case	186
6.3.1.c	The <i>T-Mobile</i> Case	188
6.3.1.d	The <i>Two Bananas</i> Cases	190
6.3.1.e	The E-Book Commitment Decision	193
6.3.1.f	Foreign Exchange Spot Trading Cartels (Forex Cartels)	197
6.3.2	Descriptive Perspective: Identifying Common Themes	199
6.3.2.a	The Market Context Matters	199
6.3.2.b	The Lack of Plausible Efficiencies	200
6.3.2.c	The Practical Importance of the Concept of a Concerted Practice	200
6.3.2.d	The Temporal Perspective: Future Intentions Are Problematic	201
6.3.2.e	The Means of Communication: Private Communication Is Problematic	203
6.3.3	Normative Perspective: What Should Be the Scope of the Object Box?	204
6.3.3.a	Is the Dispute Between the Case Law and the Horizontal Cooperation Guidelines Justified?	204
6.3.3.b	Is the Exclusion of the Exchange of Disaggregated Data from the Object Box Justified?	205
6.4	Public Announcements Cases	206
6.4.1	Economic Perspective	207
6.4.1.a	The Pro-competitive Aspect of Public Announcements	207
6.4.1.b	The Anti-competitive Aspect of Public Announcements	207
6.4.2	Case Law and Decisional Practice	208
6.4.2.a	The <i>Dyestuffs</i> Case	208
6.4.2.b	The <i>Woodpulp II</i> Case	209
6.4.2.c	The Container Shipping Commitment Decision	210
6.4.3	Descriptive Perspective: Identifying the Problematic Features	212
6.4.3.a	The OECD Paper on Unilateral Announcements	212
6.4.3.b	The Container Shipping Commitment Decision	213
6.4.3.c	The Literature: Contingent Announcements Are Problematic	214



## Table of Contents

---

6.4.4	Normative Perspective: Classification as a Restriction by Object or Effect?	215
6.4.4.a	Is There Scope for Classification as a Restriction by Object?	215
6.4.4.b	The Role of Circumstantial Evidence	215
6.5	The Proposal for a More Coherent Analytical Framework	216
6.5.1	The Object Box: A Proposal for Identifying Restrictions by Object	216
6.5.1.a	The Issue	216
6.5.1.b	The Need to Go Beyond an Abstract Legal Formula	218
6.5.1.c	Step 1: Context Analysis	218
6.5.1.c.1	General Analytical Considerations	218
6.5.1.c.2	Application to Pure Information Exchanges	220
6.5.1.d	Step 2: Objectified Plausibility Analysis for Claimed Efficiencies	222
6.5.1.d.1	General Analytical Considerations	222
6.5.1.d.2	Application to Pure Information Exchanges	224
6.5.1.d.3	A Concerted Practice That Restricts Competition by Object: What Else!	227
6.5.2	The Effect Box: A Proposal to Assess Restrictive Pure Information Exchanges	228
6.5.2.a	The Issue	228
6.5.2.b	The Need to Further Developed the Concept of a Facilitative Practice	229
6.5.2.c	Step 1: Context Analysis	230
6.5.2.d	Step 2: Building a Robust Theory of (Tacit) Collusion	231
6.5.2.e	Step 3: Efficiencies	234
6.5.2.f	Step 4: Weighting Collusion Concerns Against Efficiencies (and the Importance of Less Restrictive Alternatives)	235
CHAPTER 7		
Conclusion		239
Bibliography		241
Table of Cases		253
Table of Legislation, Guidelines and Treaties		261
Index		265