CONTENTS

Acknowledgments Contents Abbreviations

The state CHAPTER I r.

1

. th

Introduction

The Legal Framework CHAPTER 2 The legal framework Ι Developments at the international law level I.I

	I.I.I	The proliferation of international courts and tribunals	9
	I.I.2	The institutionalization of international law	10
	I.I.3	The risk of fragmentation of international law	12
	2	Developments at the European law level	14
	2.I	The scope of ECJ jurisdiction regarding international treaties	15
	2.2	The exclusive scope of jurisdiction of the ECJ under	
		Article 292 EC	17
	3	Summary	18
CHAPTER	3	Case Studies	21
	I	Introduction	23
	2	The MOX plant dispute	24
	2.I	The factual and legal background	24
	2.2	The various judicial decisions on the MOX plant dispute	25
	2.2.I	The OSPAR Arbitral Tribunal Award	25
	2.2.2	The UNCLOS Arbitral Tribunal Award	26
	2.2.3	The Opinion of Advocate-General Maduro of the ECJ	27
	2.2.4	The MOX plant judgment of the ECJ	28
	2.3	Commentary	30
	3	The IJzeren Rijn dispute	30
	3.I	The factual and legal background	30
	3.2	The IJzeren Rijn Arbitral Tribunal Award	33
	3.3	Commentary	34
	4	The Mexican soft drinks dispute	36
	4.I	The factual and legal background	36
	4.2	The WTO Panel and Appellate Body rulings	37
	4.2.I	The WTO Panel ruling	37
	4.2.2	The WTO Appellate Body ruling	38
	4.3	Commentary	41
	5	The Brazilian Tyres dispute	41
	5.I	The factual and legal background	41
	5.2)	42
	5.2.I	The MERCOSUR ad hoc Arbitral Tribunal Award	42
	5.2.2	The WTO Panel ruling	43
	5.2.3	The WTO Appellate Body ruling	45

vii

V

vii

Х

1

7

9

9

JURISDICTIONAL COMPETITION

3

	5.3	Commentary	46
	6	The ICTY's Tadic test v. the ICJ's Nicaragua test	49
	6.I	The factual and legal background	49
	6.2	The ICJ's Genocide Convention judgment	50
	6.3	Commentary	52
	7	The Bosphorus case	54
	7.I	The factual and legal background	54
	7.2	The ECrtHR's Bosphorus judgment	55
	7.3	Commentary	56
	8	Interim conclusions	58
CHAPTER	1	Possible Solutions	61
CIIMIILK	4 T	Hard law options	63
	I.I	Extending the jurisdiction of the ICJ	63
	I.2	Making the ICJ a Court of Appeal vis-à-vis the other courts	
		and tribunals	64
	I.3	Creating a preliminary ruling system for the ICJ	64
	I.4	Extending the already existing advisory jurisdiction of the ICJ	65
	I.5	Creating a Tribunal des Conflits	65
	I.6	Explicitly defining the scope of jurisdiction in founding	
		instruments	66
	2	Soft-law options	67
	2.I	The res judicata and lis pendens principles	67
	2.2	The principle of good faith	68
	2.3	Comity	69
	2.4	The Solange method	72
	2.4.I	The origins of the Solange method	72
	2.4.2	The application of the Solange method at the international	
		law level	78
CHAPTER	5	Conclusions	81

. .

87

105

Bibliography Table of Cases

