

CONTENTS

- Foreword 17
- I. Introduction 19
- II. Background 23
 - The history of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages 23
- III. General characteristics 27
 - Key features of the charter 27
 - The legal nature of the undertakings 28
 - Section 1. The different kinds of undertakings in the charter 29
 - A. The undertakings in Parts II and III 29
 - B. The other undertakings envisaged in the charter (Parts I and IV) ... 29
 - Section 2. The question of the charter’s lack of direct effect 30
 - Section 3. The nature of the rights and obligations laid down in the charter 31
 - Section 4. The impact on domestic law of ratifying the charter 32
 - Section 5. The differences between undertakings under the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages and undertakings under the European Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities 32
 - Debate around the charter 34
 - The financial cost of implementing the charter 37
- IV. Preamble 43
 - Introduction: the legal force of the preamble 43
 - Paragraph 1 43
 - Section 1. The charter is a Council of Europe instrument 43
 - A. The Committee of Ministers’ decision 43
 - B. The role of the Council of Europe in respect of the charter 44
 - Section 2. Council of Europe member states signatories to the charter 44
 - Paragraphs 2 and 3 45
 - Section 1. Regional or minority languages as part of European cultural heritage 45
 - Section 2. Threats to regional or minority languages 46

Paragraph 4	46
Section 1. The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	47
Section 2. The European Convention on Human Rights	48
Paragraph 5	48
Section 1. The Helsinki Final Act	49
Section 2. The document of the Copenhagen Meeting of the CSCE Conference on the Human Dimension, 15-19 June 1990	49
Paragraph 6	50
Paragraph 7	51
V. Part I – General provisions	53
Article 1 – Definitions	53
Section 1. Purpose of Article 1: to define the scope of the charter, not to define regional or minority languages	53
A. Specifying the scope of the charter	53
B. No definition of regional or minority languages	54
1. The concept of a regional or minority language underpinning the charter	54
2. The terminology employed	54
3. No distinction between different categories of languages	55
4. No list of regional or minority languages	56
Section 2. Typical features of the regional and minority languages covered by the charter	57
A. Languages with a territorial base	57
1. Characteristics of the regional or minority languages covered by the charter	57
2. The territory in which a language is used	65
B. Non-territorial languages	68
1. The concept of non-territorial languages	68
2. The definition of non-territorial languages	70
3. Arrangements for non-territorial languages	71
Article 2 – Undertakings	71
Section 1. Paragraph 1 – Undertakings under Part II of the charter	71
A. The obligation in principle encompasses all the provisions of this part	71
B. Part II applies (except in the case of the reservations mentioned) to all the regional or minority languages used on the territory of the state, within the meaning of Article 1 of the charter	71

Section 2. Paragraph 2 – Undertakings under Part III of the charter	72
A. Number of undertakings	72
1. Upper limit	73
2. Lower limit	73
B. Choosing between alternatives in the paragraphs or subparagraphs	75
C. Checking the undertakings given under Article 2.2	76
Article 3 – Practical arrangements	77
Section 1. Formal nature of an undertaking under Article 3	77
Section 2. Languages covered by Part III	78
A. Concept of a less widely used official language	78
1. Languages which can be regarded as less widely used official languages	79
2. Why less widely used official languages are mentioned in Article 3	79
3. Significance of specifying a less widely used official language under Article 3	79
4. Status of a language which is official in only part of the territory of a state	80
5. Possibility of recognising a variant of the official language as a less widely used official language	80
B. Where no language is designated under Part III	81
Section 3. Geographical application of undertakings	81
Section 4. Altering the undertakings entered into under Part III	82
Article 4 – Existing protection regimes	82
Section 1. Paragraph 1	83
Section 2. Paragraph 2	84
A. Respect for existing guarantees	84
B. Combination with other arrangements or guarantees	84
1. Does the existence of special more protective arrangements rule out applying the charter?	84
2. Can the arrangements and advantages extended to certain regional or minority languages have an adverse impact on other regional or minority languages?	85
Article 5 – Existing obligations	85
Section 1. Exclusion of negative interpretations of the charter	85

Section 2. Respect for the principles of sovereignty and territorial integrity	86
Article 6 – Information	87
Section 1. Scope of the requirement	87
A. Arrangements for providing information	87
B. The recipients of the information	87
C. Subject matter of the information	87
Section 2. Monitoring of compliance with undertakings	88
VI. Preliminary comments on Parts II and III	95
The significance of Parts II and III	95
Ingredients common to Parts II and III	96
Section 1. Meaning of the term “according to the situation of each language”	96
Section 2. Adaptability	97
Section 3. Assessing the situation of each language – relevant factors ...	98
The relationship between Parts II and III in the light of the reports of the Committee of Experts	99
VII. Part II – General objectives and principles	103
Preliminary remarks	103
Section 1. Objectives and principles	103
Section 2. Application to all regional or minority languages in a state ...	104
Section 3. The structure of Part II	106
Article 7.1 – Objectives and principles applicable on the territory of regional or minority languages	106
Section 1. Article 7.1.a – Recognition of regional or minority languages as an expression of cultural wealth	107
A. Recognition of regional or minority languages	107
B. Recognition as cultural wealth	108
C. Components of recognition	108
Section 2. Article 7.1.b – Respect for the geographical area of each language	109
A. Affirmation of a general principle: respect for the geographical area of each regional or minority language	109
B. Administrative divisions must not hinder promotion of a regional or minority language	111

Section 3. Article 7.1.c – Resolute action to promote regional or minority languages	112
Section 4. Article 7.1.d – Use of regional or minority languages in private and public life	113
Section 5. Article 7.1.e – Maintaining and developing links between groups using a regional or minority language	114
A. Relations between groups using the same regional or minority language, or similar languages	115
B. Cultural relations between groups using different languages	116
Section 6. Article 7.1.f – The teaching and study of regional or minority languages at all appropriate stages	117
Section 7. Article 7.1.g – Opportunities for those who do not speak a regional or minority language to learn it	118
Section 8. Article 7.1.h – Study and research on regional or minority languages at universities	119
Section 9. Article 7.1.i – Promotion of transnational exchanges for regional or minority languages	119
Article 7.2 – Elimination of unjustified discrimination in the use of regional or minority languages	120
Section 1. Article 7.2 (first sentence) – Eliminating measures unfavourable to regional or minority languages	121
A. The principle of non-discrimination applied to language use, as found in other international documents	121
B. The principle of non-discrimination under the charter.....	122
1. Justified distinctions	123
2. Distinctions the aim of which is not to disadvantage a regional or minority language	124
Section 2. Article 7.2. (second sentence) – Non-discriminatory character of special measures on behalf of regional or minority languages	125
Article 7.3 – Promotion of understanding between all the linguistic groups in a country	126
Article 7.4 – Policy for promoting regional or minority languages in consultation with representatives of the languages	127
Section 1. Taking into consideration the needs and wishes expressed by groups using regional or minority languages	128
Section 2. If necessary, setting up bodies to advise the authorities on matters pertaining to regional or minority languages	128
A. Organisational approach	128

B. Tasks which can be taken on by bodies representing the interests of regional or minority languages	129
Article 7.5 – Application of the above principles to non-territorial languages	130
Final comments on Article 7	133
VIII. Part III – Measures to promote the use of regional or minority languages in public life in accordance with the undertakings entered into under Article 2, paragraph 2	137
Introduction to Part III	137
Section 1. General remarks	137
Section 2. Making choices under Part III	138
A. The choice of languages to benefit under Part III	139
1. Significance of the choice made by a contracting state	139
2. Criteria for choice for contracting states	140
3. Connections between Part II and Part III regarding choice of languages	141
B. Criteria for choosing paragraphs	141
C. The territory on which the chosen paragraphs are to be applied	142
Article 8 – Education	143
Section 1. Article 8.1 – Education in territories in which a regional or minority language is traditionally used	144
A. Article 8.1.a – Pre-school education	145
1. State pre-school education	145
2. Pre-school education which does not come under the public authorities	149
B. Article 8.1.b – Primary education	149
C. Article 8.1.c and d – Secondary and technical or vocational education	152
D. Private primary or secondary education	153
E. Article 8.1.e – University and other higher education	154
1. Public higher and university education	154
2. Private education or education with a high degree of autonomy	155
F. Article 8.1.f – Adult and continuing education	155
G. Article 8.1.g – Teaching the history and culture reflected by the regional or minority language	156
H. Article 8.1.h – Basic and further training of teachers	156
I. Article 8.1.i – Supervisory bodies	157

Section 2. Article 8.2 – Measures to be taken in respect of territories other than those in which the regional or minority languages are traditionally used	158
General comments on Articles 9 and 10	159
Section 1. Use of regional or minority languages before public and judicial authorities	159
Section 2. A difficult subject	160
A. The weight of symbolism	160
B. A problem which is often misunderstood	161
Section 3. The charter's pragmatic, concrete approach	162
A. The use of regional or minority languages in dealings with administrative authorities	163
B. Judicial authorities	164
1. Criminal law	164
2. Non-criminal (civil or administrative) proceedings	164
Article 9 – Judicial authorities	165
Section 1. Article 9.1 – Court proceedings	165
A. General conditions	166
1. Implementation in judicial districts where numbers using a regional or minority language are sufficient to justify the specified measures	166
2. Allowing for the situation of each language	166
3. Proper administration of justice	167
B. Article 9.1.a – Regional or minority languages in criminal proceedings	168
1. Proceedings in a regional or minority language	169
2. The right of the accused to use the regional or minority language	170
3. Requests and evidence in a regional or minority language	170
4. Drafting of documents connected with legal proceedings in a regional or minority language	171
C. Article 9.1.b – Civil proceedings	171
1. Proceedings conducted in the regional or minority language	172
2. Appearances in person	172
3. Production of documents in the regional or minority language	172
D. Article 9.1.c – Proceedings before courts concerning administrative matters	173
E. Article 9.1.d – Translation and interpreting costs	173

F. Additional remarks concerning the practical arrangements for using regional or minority languages in court proceedings	174
Section 2. Article 9.2 – Legal relations between individuals	175
A. Article 9.2.a – General validity of legal documents drawn up in a regional or minority language	176
B. Article 9.2.b – Conditional validity of legal documents drawn up in regional or minority languages	176
C. Article 9.2.c – Limited validity of legal documents drawn up in regional or minority languages	177
Section 3. Article 9.3 – Translation of legislation into a regional or minority language	177
A. Scope of the measure	177
1. The most important national statutory texts	177
2. The most important texts relating to users of regional or minority languages	178
B. No obligation to translate	178
Article 10 – Administrative authorities and public services	178
Section 1. Introductory remarks	178
Section 2. Article 10.1 – Administrative authorities of the state.....	180
A. General requirements for applying Article 10.1	180
1. Administrative authority of the state	180
2. Number of speakers justifying the measures specified in Article 10.1	181
3. Taking each language's circumstances into account	181
4. Reasonable possibility	182
B. Undertakings in Article 10.1	182
1. Article 10.1.a – Use of regional or minority languages by state administrative authorities in their work and in their relations with users	182
2. Article 10.1.b – Forms and widely used administrative documents in a regional or minority language	184
3. Article 10.1.c – Drafting administrative documents in regional or minority languages	185
4. Additional practical observations	185
Section 3. Article 10.2 – Local and regional authorities	186
A. General observations	186
1. Concept of regional and local authorities	186

2. The role of local and regional authorities in implementing the charter	187
3. Local and regional government organisation and regional or minority languages	188
4. Nature and scope of the undertakings in the charter relating to action by regional and local authorities	190
B. The undertakings in Article 10.2	191
1. Article 10.2.a – Using the regional or minority language in the regional or local authority	191
2. Article 10.2.b – Submission of applications by speakers of regional or minority languages	191
3. Articles 10.2.c and 10.2.d – Publication of official documents in regional or minority languages	191
4. Articles 10.2.e and 10.2.f – Use of the regional or minority language in debates in assemblies	192
5. Article 10.2.g – Place names	192
Section 4. Article 10.3 – Public services	194
A. The concept of public services	194
B. Conditions governing Article 10.3	195
C. Types of undertaking	195
Section 5. Article 10.4 – Accompanying measures to permit regional or minority languages to be used in administrative authorities and public services	197
A. Article 10.4.a – Translation and interpretation	197
B. Article 10.4.b – Staff proficiency in regional or minority languages	198
C. Article 10.4.c – Appointment of public servants with a knowledge of a regional or minority language to the territory in which the language is used	199
Section 6. Article 10.5 – Use of family names in regional or minority languages	199
Article 11 – Media	200
Section 1. Introductory comments	200
Section 2. Article 11.1 – Public action to encourage use of regional or minority languages in the media	202
A. Conditions applying to undertakings on public action in media matters	202
B. Measures available for use of regional or minority languages	203

1. Article 11.1.a to 11.1.c – Regional and minority languages in radio and television	203
2. Article 11.1.d – Production and distribution of audio and audiovisual works in the regional or minority languages	207
3. Article 11.1.e – Action in support of regional or minority languages in relation to the print media	208
4. Article 11.1.f – Financial assistance for media in a regional or minority language	208
5. Article 11.1.g – Training media professionals in a regional or minority language	210
Section 3. Article 11.2 – Guaranteeing the reception of radio and television broadcasts and the circulation of print media in regional or minority languages in a cross-border context	211
A. Extent of the guarantees in Article 11.2	211
B. The limits to the guarantees in Article 11.2	212
Section 4. Article 11.3 – Representing the interests of users of regional or minority languages in official bodies responsible for guaranteeing media freedom and pluralism	213
Article 12 – Cultural activities and facilities	214
Section 1. Article 12.1 – The areas of the national territory in which a regional or minority language is most strongly represented	214
A. Scope	215
B. The undertakings on offer	216
1. Article 12.1.a – Encouraging cultural expression in regional or minority languages, and measures to foster access to works produced in them	216
2. Article 12.1.b and 12.1.c – Developing translation, dubbing, post-synchronisation and subtitling	217
3. Article 12.1.d – Incorporating the knowledge and use of regional or minority languages into the activities of cultural bodies	218
4. Article 12.1.e – Measures to ensure that cultural bodies have staff with a command of the regional or minority language	219
5. Article 12.1.f – Measures to involve representatives of users of regional or minority languages in providing facilities and planning cultural activities	219
6. Article 12.1.g – Encouragement for setting up bodies responsible for collecting and publishing works in a regional or minority language	220
7. Article 12.1.h – Promoting translation and terminology services	221
C. General remarks on implementing Article 12.1	221

Section 2. Article 12.2 – Support for cultural activities in the parts of the national territory where a regional or minority language is not traditionally used	222
Section 3. Article 12.3 – The place of regional or minority languages in national cultural policy abroad	223
Article 13 – Economic and social life	223
Section 1. Article 13.1 – Economic and social activities in the whole country	224
A. Article 13.1.a – Legality of using regional or minority languages in documents relating to economic or social life	225
B. Article 13.1.b – Forbidding the prohibition in private documents of the use of regional or minority languages in economic life	226
C. Article 13.1.c – Prohibition of practices designed to discourage the use of regional or minority languages in economic life	226
D. Article 13.1.d – Encouraging the use of regional or minority languages in economic life	226
Section 2. Article 13.2 – Special provisions for territories in which regional or minority languages are used	227
A. Article 13.2.a – Regulations authorising the use of regional or minority languages in financial documents and payment orders	228
B. Article 13.2.b – Use of regional or minority languages in public economic or social sectors	228
C. Article 13.2.c – Use of the regional or minority language in care facilities	229
D. Article 13.2.d – Drawing up safety instructions in regional or minority languages	230
E. Article 13.2.e – Information on consumer rights in regional or minority languages	231
Article 14 – Cross-border exchanges	232
Section 1. Article 14.a – International agreements	232
Section 2. Article 14.b – Cross-border co-operation between regional or local authorities	233
IX. Part IV – Application of the charter	245
Preliminary remarks on the charter's supervision mechanism	245
Article 15 – Periodical reports	246
Section 1. Frequency of reports	246
Section 2. Content of the reports	247
A. Outline of the initial report	247
B. Outline for subsequent triennial reports	248
Section 3. Article 15.2 – Publication of national reports	250

Section 2. Article 21.2 – Withdrawal of reservations 268

Article 22 – Denunciation 268

Section 1. Article 22.1 – Right to denounce 269

Section 2. Article 22.2 – Effect of denunciation 269

Article 23 – Notifications 269

Final provisions 270

XI. Remarks by way of conclusion 273

XII. Bibliography 275

XIII. Index 283