

# Contents

## Chapter I: Party Autonomy and Restrictions upon it in Private International Law

Introduction	67
Section 1: Historical Overview	68
Section 2: Terminological and Theoretical Aspects of Party Autonomy	73
2.1 Party autonomy as a general principle of private international law	73
2.2 'Subjectivism' and 'objectivism'	73
2.3 'Proper law' and applicable law	75
2.4 'International' and 'internal' contracts	76
2.5 'Universalism' and 'particularism'	77
Section 3: Justifications For and Arguments Against Party Autonomy	79
3.1 Freedom of contract	79
3.2 Certainty in international transactions and commercial convenience	81
3.3 Predictability and fulfilment of expectations of parties	83
3.4 More favourable and suitable law	83
3.5 Uniformity	84
3.6 Suitable for growth of international trade	85
3.7 Benefit for developed countries	85
3.8 Choice of law of dominant State on market	85
3.9 Neutral law	85
3.10 Familiarity or similarity	85
Section 4: Party Autonomy and Conventions	86
4.1 Party autonomy: basic dominant rule of conventions	87



4.2	Express or implied choice of law	88
4.3	<i>Dépeçage</i> (dismemberment)	91
4.4	Posterior choice of law	93
Section 5: Restrictions on Party Autonomy		95
5.1	Background to the development of restrictions	96
5.1.1	<i>Inequality of bargaining power</i>	97
5.1.2	<i>Economic legislation</i>	98
5.1.3	<i>International standard codifications</i>	99
5.2	Restrictions in conventions	99
5.2.1	<i>Mandatory rules</i>	99
5.2.2	Public policy/ <i>ordre public</i>	100
5.2.3	Evasion of law/ <i>fraude à la loi</i>	100
Conclusion		100



## Chapter II: Applicable Law in the Absence of Choice

Introduction	104
Section 1: Doctrine of 'Most Close Connection': Basic Principle of Article 4(1)	105
1.1 Article 4(1) of the Rome Convention	108
1.2 Supervening (post contract) events	109
1.3 <i>Dépeçage</i> (severability of contract)	110
1.4 ' <i>Law of country</i> ' rather than ' <i>system of law</i> '?	111
1.5 Critical evaluation of Article 4(1)	114
Section 2: Rebuttable Presumptions of 'Characteristic Performance' Test: an Undefined Innovation of Article 4(2)	115
2.1 Notion and function of undefined innovation of 'characteristic performance'	117
2.2 General presumptions	122
2.2.1 Habitual residence in case of natural persons (outside a trade or profession)	122
2.2.2 Law of place of central administration in case of bodies corporate or unincorporate	124
2.2.3 Two different applicable laws in case of party's trade or profession	125
2.2.3.1 <i>Law of principal place of business</i>	125
2.2.3.2 <i>Law of another place of business through which contract performed</i>	126
2.3 Special consideration in the sale of goods (buyer or seller?)	126
2.4 Critical evaluation of Article 4(2)	128
Section 3: Special Presumptions for Two Types of Contract	130
3.1 Immovable property	130
3.2 Contract of carriage	131



Section 4: Non-Applicability of Presumptions	132
4.1 Where 'characteristic performance' of a contract cannot be determined	133
4.2 Where contract is more closely connected with another country	134
4.3 Critical evaluation of Article 4(5)	135
Section 5: General Evaluation and Suggestions	137
5.1 Evaluation of Article 4	137
5.1.1 Advantages of the 'characteristic performance' presumption	137
5.1.2 ' <i>Objectivity</i> ' or ' <i>subjectivity</i> ' of the test in the absence of choice?	138
5.1.3 Two opposite approaches	139
5.2 Suggestions	140
Conclusion	142



# Chapter III: Public Policy/*Ordre Public* Exception and Mandatory Rules

Introduction	145
Section 1: Historical Overview of Notion of Public Policy/ <i>Ordre Public</i> Exception	147
1.1 Roman law	147
1.2 Continental law	148
1.3 Common law	148
1.3.1 English law	148
1.3.2 American law	150
1.4 Post-war private international law	151
Section 2: Terminological and Theoretical Aspects of Public Policy/ <i>Ordre Public</i>	153
2.1 Public policy/ <i>ordre public</i> as a 'general principle of law' in private international law	153
2.2 Public policy/ <i>ordre public</i> in various legal systems	154
2.3 Different approaches to notion of public policy/ <i>ordre public</i>	156
2.3.1 <i>Public policy/ordre public as an exception to choice of law rules</i>	156
2.3.2 <i>Public policy/ordre public as an alternative application of choice of law rules</i>	156
2.3.3 <i>Public policy/ordre public as a matter of international concept</i>	156
2.4 Definition or non-definition of public policy/ <i>ordre public</i> ?	157
2.4.1 Definitions of public policy/ <i>ordre public</i>	157
2.4.2 Non-definition of public policy/ <i>ordre public</i>	159
2.4.3 Identification via precedent illustrations	160
2.4.3.1 Contracts that involve trading with the enemy	161
2.4.3.2 Deliberate violation of foreign law, in particular a friendly foreign country's law	161
2.4.3.3 Champertous contracts	163



2.4.3.4	Contracts in restraint of trade	163
2.4.3.5	Cases against fundamental notions of justice and morality	163
2.4.3.6	Contract contrary to foreign legislation which is discriminatory or oppressive	164
2.4.3.7	Contract to deceive a third party	165
2.5	Public policy and <i>ordre public</i> : different connotation, or just interchangeable use?	165
Section 3:	The Dilemma of Positivity and/or Negativity of Regarding Public Policy/ <i>Ordre Public</i>	167
Section 4:	Grounds and Purposes of Application of Public Policy/ <i>Ordre Public</i>	170
4.1	Bases and grounds of application of public policy/ <i>ordre public</i>	170
4.1.1	Sovereignty of forum	170
4.1.2	Familiarity with national legal system	171
4.1.3	Political perspective	171
4.1.4	Implementation of justice	171
4.2	Purposes of application of public policy/ <i>ordre public</i>	171
4.2.1	Protection of national public interest	171
4.2.2	Protection of basic values of the forum state	172
4.2.3	Protection of justice and morality	172
4.2.4	Protection of its own international coherence	172
Section 5:	Public Policy/ <i>Ordre Public</i> and Comity	172
Section 6:	Problems of the Notion of Public Policy/ <i>Ordre Public</i>	175
6.1	No established criteria for public policy/ <i>ordre public</i>	176
6.2	Variety with lack of certainty based on individual opinion	176
6.3	Variety and relativity of public policy/ <i>ordre public</i> in space and time	177
6.3.1	Variety and relativity in space	177
6.3.2	Variety and relativity in time	177
6.4	Public policy/ <i>ordre public</i> as an obstacle to uniformity	178
6.5	Critical evaluation	179



Section 7:	<i>Ordre Public Interne, Ordre Public International and Réal Ordre Public International</i>	179
7.1	<i>Ordre public interne</i>	180
7.2	<i>Ordre public international</i>	181
7.3	<i>Réal ordre public international</i> (transnational public policy)	184
Section 8:	Relationship between Public Policy/ <i>Ordre Public</i> and Mandatory Rules	188
8.1	Types and purposes of rules	188
8.2	Distinction between mandatory rules and public policy/ <i>ordre public</i>	189
Section 9:	Public Policy/ <i>Ordre Public</i> and Private International Law Conventions	194
9.1	Public policy/ <i>ordre public</i> and conventions	194
9.2	Public policy/ <i>ordre public</i> in Article 16 of the Rome Convention	196
9.2.1	Language of Article 16 of the Rome Convention	196
9.2.1.1	' <i>The application of a rule of law</i> '	197
9.2.1.2	' <i>may be refused if only</i> '	199
9.2.1.3	' <i>manifestly incompatible</i> '	199
9.2.1.4	Contrary to ' <i>the public policy of the forum</i> '	202
9.2.1.5	Adoption of both terms public policy and <i>ordre public</i>	203
9.2.2	Relationship between Article 7 and Article 16	204
9.2.2.1	What is the distinction between Article 16 and Article 7(2)?	204
9.2.2.2	Is it necessary to enact both Articles 7(2) and 16?	204
9.2.2.3	What is a proper solution in case of conflict between Article 16 and Article 7(1)?	205
9.2.3	Two main points in the application of Article 16	206
Section 10:	Evaluation and Suggestions	206
Conclusion		214



## Chapter IV: Evasion of Law/*Fraude à la Loi* and Mandatory Rules

Introduction	220
Section 1: Concept and Elements of Evasion of Law/ <i>Fraude à la Loi</i> in Private International Law	221
1.1 Historical background	221
1.2 Concept and nature of evasion of law/ <i>fraude à la loi</i> in private international law	222
1.3 Elements of evasion of law/ <i>fraude à la loi</i>	223
1.3.1 Voluntary utilisation of conflict of laws rules	223
1.3.2 Fraudulent intention to evade law	223
1.3.3 <i>Fraude</i> must be directed against law	224
Section 2: Evasion of Law/ <i>Fraude à la Loi</i> and Legal Systems	225
2.1 French law	226
2.2 English law	226
2.2.1 Party autonomy and law	226
2.2.2 Objectivity of law rather than subjectivity	227
2.2.3 Fidelity to the rule of law	227
2.2.4 Jurisdictional limits	227
2.2.5 Domicile as a connecting factor	227
2.2.6 Public policy/ <i>ordre public</i>	227
2.3 American law	229
2.3.1 Contract law	230
2.3.2 Corporate law	231
2.3.3 Carriage of goods by sea	231
2.3.4 Marriage law	231
2.3.5 Divorce law	231
Section 3: Evasion of Law/ <i>Fraude à la Loi</i> and Other Institutions	232
3.1 Evasion of law/ <i>fraude à la loi</i> and good faith/ <i>bona fides</i>	232
3.2 Evasion of law/ <i>fraude à la loi</i> and avoidance	235
3.3 Evasion of law/ <i>fraude à la loi</i> and public policy/ <i>ordre public</i>	236



Section 4: Policy behind and Justifications for Evasion of Law/ <i>Fraude à la Loi</i>	236
4.1 Legal system is harmed if it is evaded	236
4.2 Legal system has the right to defend its enactments and court orders	237
4.3 Evasion connotes the essence of moral guilt and unfairness	237
4.4 Legal systems have standards of justice of equal values	238
4.5 Evasion as a source of inequality among members of society	238
4.6 Doctrine of evasion of law/ <i>fraude à la loi</i> protects weaker parties	238
4.7 Doctrine of evasion of law/ <i>fraude à la loi</i> protects public or national interests of forum	238
Section 5: Evasion of Law/ <i>Fraude à la Loi</i> and Mandatory Rules	239
Section 6: Evasion of Law/ <i>Fraude à la Loi</i> and Codifications	240
Section 7: Evaluation and Suggestions	242
Conclusions	244



# Chapter V: General Consideration of Mandatory Rules in Private International Law

Introduction	246
Section 1: Historical and Theoretical Sketch of Mandatory Rules	248
1.1 Historical overview	248
1.2 Theoretical sketch of mandatory rules	249
1.2.1 Contribution of three scholars	249
1.2.1.1 <i>Wachter</i>	249
1.2.1.2 <i>Savigny</i>	250
1.2.1.3 <i>Mancini</i>	252
1.2.2 French scholars in post-war private international law:	254
1.2.2.1 <i>Pillet</i>	254
1.2.2.2 <i>Francescakis</i>	255
Section 2: Various Expressions and Definition of Mandatory Rules	256
2.1 Various expressions of mandatory rules	256
2.1.1 Anglo-American terminology	256
2.1.2 Continental terminology	257
2.1.2.1 <i>Règles d'application immédiate</i>	258
2.1.2.2 <i>Lois de police</i>	259
2.2 Definition and characterisation of mandatory rules	260
Section 3: Terminological Distinctions when One Deals with Mandatory Rules	263
3.1 <i>Jus cogens</i> v. <i>jus dispositivum</i>	263
3.2 <i>Lois de police</i> v. <i>dispositions impératives</i>	263
3.3 Substantive law rules v. conflict of laws rules	264
3.4 Optional rules v. mandatory rules	266
3.5 Private interest v. public interest	267
Section 4: Identification and Determination of Mandatory Rules	268
4.1 Express intention of legislation	269



4.2	Nature and purposes of legislation	270
4.3	Collective approach and the role of courts	271
Section 5:	Public/Private Law Dichotomy and Mandatory Rules	272
5.1	Theory of public/private law dichotomy in civil law and common law perspectives	272
5.2	Definition and characteristics of public and private laws	274
5.3	Public/private laws and mandatory rules	275
Section 6:	Classification and Categorisation of Mandatory Rules	277
6.1	Mandatory rules of public interests	277
6.1.1	Rules relating to competition	277
6.1.2	Rules relating to antitrust law	278
6.1.3	Rules relating to confiscation and nationalisation	278
6.1.4	Rules relating to fiscal regulations and exchange control	278
6.1.5	Rules relating to taxation law	279
6.1.6	Rules relating to contracts generally	280
6.1.7	Rules relating to landed property	280
6.1.8	Rules relating to penalty clauses	280
6.1.9	Rules relating to criminal law	281
6.2	Mandatory protective rules of private interests	281
6.2.1	Rules relating to protection of employees	282
6.2.2	Rules relating to protection of consumers	282
6.2.3	Rules relating to protection of a weaker party	282
6.3	Mandatory rules of double purposes	282
Section 7:	Statutory Mandatory Rules in English Law	284
7.1	Section 27(2) of the Unfair Contract Terms Act, 1977	284
7.1.1	<i>'notwithstanding any contract term'</i>	285
7.1.2	<i>'applies or purports to apply...'</i>	286
7.1.3	<i>'imposed wholly or mainly for the purpose of...'</i>	286
7.1.4	<i>'one of the parties dealt as consumer'</i>	286
7.1.5	<i>'habitually resident in the United Kingdom'</i>	287
7.1.6	<i>'the essential steps necessary for the making of the contract'</i>	287
7.2	Other statutory mandatory rules	287



Section 8: Extraterritoriality of Rules and Mandatory Rules	288
8.1 Distinction between extraterritorial and territorial rules	288
8.2 Extraterritorial effects of mandatory rules in American legislation	289
8.2.1 American case law	289
8.2.2 American Presidential Order	290
Section 9: Domestic, International and Community Mandatory Rules	293
9.1 Domestic mandatory rules	294
9.2 International/internationally mandatory rules	294
9.3 Community mandatory rules	296
Section 10: Which Mandatory Rules – <i>Lex Fori</i> , <i>Lex Causae</i> , or Third State?	297
10.1 Forum mandatory rules: <i>lex fori</i>	297
10.2 Foreign mandatory rules: <i>lex causae</i> or third State	298
10.2.1 Common law and civil law considerations	298
10.2.2 Justification of non-application of a foreign mandatory rule	301
10.2.2.1 <i>Uncertainty v. certainty</i>	301
10.2.2.2 <i>Party autonomy</i>	301
10.3 A better approach	303
Conclusion	304



## Chapter VI: Provisions as to Mandatory Rules in the Rome Convention, 1980

Introduction	307
--------------	-----

Section 1: Mandatory Rules Subject to the Provision of Article 3(3) of the Rome Convention	309
--	-----

1.1 The Language of Article 3(3)	310
----------------------------------	-----

1.1.1 <i>'where all the other elements relevant to the situation...'</i>	310
--	-----

1.1.2 <i>'shall not... prejudice the application of rules of the law of that country which cannot be derogated from by contract, hereinafter called mandatory rules'</i>	311
--	-----

1.1.2.1 Definition of Mandatory rules under Article 3(3)	312
--	-----

1.1.2.2 <i>'hereinafter called mandatory rules'</i>	313
---	-----

1.2 Purely domestic or international situation	314
--	-----

1.3 Evaluation of Article 3(3)	314
--------------------------------	-----

Section 2: Mandatory Rules Subject to the Provision of Article 7(1) of the Rome Convention	315
--	-----

2.1 <i>Sonderstatut</i> theory	316
--------------------------------	-----

2.2 The Dutch <i>Alnati</i> case	317
----------------------------------	-----

2.3 The Language of Article 7(1)	319
----------------------------------	-----

2.3.1 <i>'applying... the law of a country'</i>	319
---	-----

2.3.2 <i>'effect may be given to...'</i>	320
--	-----

2.3.3 <i>'with which the situation has a close connection'</i>	321
--	-----

2.3.3.1 Which connection? 'Close connection', 'significant connection' or 'closest connection'?	322
---	-----

2.3.3.2 Notion of close connection	323
------------------------------------	-----

2.3.4 <i>'if... under the law of the latter country, those rules must be applied whatever the law applicable to the contract'</i>	324
---	-----

2.3.5 <i>'...regard shall be had to their nature and purpose and to the consequences of their application or non-application'</i>	326
---	-----

2.3.5.1 Nature and purposes of rules	336
--------------------------------------	-----

2.3.5.2 Consequences of their application or non-application	328
--	-----

2.3.5.3 American doctrine of 'interest analysis'	329
--	-----



2.4	Right of reservation on Article 7(1)	331
2.4.1	Germany's reservation on Article 7(1)	332
2.4.2	The United Kingdom's reservation on Article 7(1)	332
2.4.3	Article 7(1) in practice: reservation or acceptance?	333
2.5	Problems and shortcomings of Article 7(1)	336
2.5.1	<i>Difficult to find and determine foreign mandatory rules</i>	336
2.5.2	<i>Conflict of interests and various mandatory rules</i>	337
2.5.3	<i>Vagueness and uncertainty</i>	338
2.5.4	<i>Inconsistency and non-uniformity of results</i>	338
2.5.5	<i>No security for parties</i>	339
2.5.6	<i>A heavy and daunting task for judges</i>	340
2.6	Some justifications for the provision of Article 7(1)	342
2.7	Evaluation of and suggestions concerning Article 7(1)	344
2.7.1	Suggestions	344
2.8	Evaluation of Article 7(1)	346
Section 3: Mandatory Rules Subject to the Provision of Article 7(2) of the Rome Convention		347
3.1	The Language of Article 7(2)	348
3.2	Mandatory rules subject to Article 7(2)	349
3.3	The necessity of Article 7(2)'s enactment	350
3.4	Article 7(2) and choice of law rules of the Convention	352
3.5	Relationship between Article 7(2) and Article 7(1)	352
3.6	Evaluation of and suggestions concerning Article 7(2)	354
Section 4: Mandatory Rules Subject to Article 9(6) of the Rome Convention		356
Section 5: Public and Private Law Dichotomy and the Rome Convention		358
Section 6: Mandatory Rules in Private International Law Conventions and National Legal Systems		361
6.1	Mandatory rules in regional and international conventions	362
6.2	Mandatory rules in national legal systems	367
6.2.1	Anglo-American law	367



6.2.1.1 <i>English law</i>	367
6.2.1.2 <i>American law</i>	370
6.2.2 <i>Continental law</i>	372
6.2.2.1 <i>Swiss law</i>	372
6.2.2.2 <i>German law</i>	373
6.2.2.3 <i>Danish law</i>	373
Section 7: Final Evaluation and Suggestions on Provisions as to Mandatory Rules in the Rome Convention	374
Conclusions	377



## Chapter VII: Mandatory Protective Rules under the Rome Convention, 1980

Introduction	381
Section 1: Overview of Conventions	382
Section 2: Mandatory Protective Rules on Consumer Contracts	384
2.1 Article 5 of the Rome Convention on 'certain consumer contracts'	384
2.2 Definition of consumer contracts in private international law conventions	385
2.3 Matters which are covered by Article 5	390
2.3.1 Contracts for the supply of services and goods	390
2.3.2 Provision of credit in relation to contracts with such objects	392
2.3.3 Package tours	392
2.4 Matters which are excluded from Article 5	393
2.4.1 Contracts made by traders, manufacturers or persons in their professional role	393
2.4.2 Unknown circumstances in a transaction	394
2.4.3 Contracts of carriage	394
2.4.4 Supply of services in a country other than consumer's habitual residence	395
2.5 Consumer contracts and limitation of freedom of choice	396
2.5.1 Requirements of limitation of freedom of choice in consumer contracts	396
2.5.1.1 <i>First requirement</i>	396
2.5.1.2 <i>Second requirement</i>	399
2.5.1.3 <i>Third requirement</i>	400
2.6 Consumer contracts and mandatory protective rules	401
2.7 Consumer contracts and habitual residence	402
2.8 Applicable law in the absence of choice	405



Section 3: Mandatory Protective Rules on Employment Contracts	406
3.1 Article 6 of the Rome Convention on ‘individual employment contracts’	406
3.2 Definition and subject matter of individual employment contracts	407
3.3 Individual employment contracts and collective agreements	410
3.4 Employment contracts and mandatory protective rules	411
3.5 Employment contracts and habitual place of work	414
Section 4: Relationship between Choice of Law and Mandatory Protective Rules	419
4.1 Chosen law is strictly inconsistent with mandatory protective rules	420
4.1.1 <i>Chosen law is less protective</i>	420
4.1.2 <i>Chosen law is more protective</i>	420
4.2 Chosen law is not strictly inconsistent with mandatory protective rules	421
4.2.1 <i>Application of mandatory protective rules</i>	422
4.2.2 <i>Application of chosen law</i>	423
4.2.3 <i>Application of a cumulative approach</i>	423
4.2.4 <i>Application of most favourable approach</i>	425
4.2.5 <i>Final evaluation</i>	425
Section 5: Relationship between Mandatory Protective Rules and other Mandatory Rules of the Rome Convention	426
5.1 Relationship between Articles 5 and 6 and Article 3	426
5.2 Relationship between Articles 5 and 6 of the Rome Convention	426
5.3 Relationship between Articles 5 and 6 and Article 7(1)	427
5.4 Relationship between Articles 5 and 6 and Article 7(2)	429
Section 6: Evaluation and Suggestions	431
6.1 Shortcomings	431
6.2 Suggestions for the future	433
Conclusion	436



General Conclusion	439
Selected Bibliography	443