

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements v

PART I: INTRODUCTION

Chapter 1: Introduction 3

1. Introduction..... 3

2. Interpretation and Gap Filling..... 4

3. Purpose and Issue Definition..... 4

4. Methodology and Structure 6

4.1. Introduction..... 6

4.2. Choice of Legal Systems 6

4.3. Theoretical Component 7

5. European Contract Law: The Harmonization Debate 9

5.1. Introduction..... 9

5.2. The Need for Harmonization..... 10

5.2.1. Introduction..... 10

5.2.2. Diversity Deters Cross-Border Trade..... 11

5.2.3. Improving Consumer Protection..... 16

5.2.4. Protection of Social Values 17

5.2.5. Creating A ‘European’ Identity 18

5.3. The European Agenda 19

5.3.1. General..... 19

5.3.2. The Common Frame of Reference 20

5.3.3. The Optional Instrument 22

5.4. Reflection 23

PART II: COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

Chapter 2: Preview	27
Chapter 3: Interpretation and Gap Filling in Dutch Law.....	29
1. Introduction.....	29
2. Interpretation	30
2.1. Introduction.....	30
2.2. The Haviltex Interpretation Standard.....	30
2.2.1. Introduction.....	30
2.2.2. Relationship to the Will-Reliance Theory.....	31
2.2.3. Subjective-Objective Interpretation.....	32
2.2.4. Conclusion.....	35
2.3. The Objective CAO Standard.....	35
2.3.1. Introduction.....	35
2.3.2. Interpretation of the CAO	36
2.3.3. Scope of Application	37
2.3.4. Conclusion.....	39
2.4. Reconciling Rival Approaches.....	39
2.4.1. Introduction.....	39
2.4.2. A Common Foundational Norm	39
2.4.3. A Smooth Transition?	40
2.4.4. Reflection	41
2.5. Conclusion.....	43
3. The Supplementary Sources of Article 6:248(1) BW	43
3.1. Introduction.....	43
3.2. Legislation As a Source of Gap Filling Solutions	44
3.2.1. Introduction.....	44
3.2.2. The Supplementing Character of Legislation	45
3.2.3. General and Specific Default Provisions	46
3.2.4. Conclusion.....	47
3.3. Custom.....	47
3.3.1. Introduction.....	47
3.3.2. Definition of Custom.....	47
3.3.3. Customary Conditions.....	49
3.3.4. Conclusion.....	50
3.4. Good faith (<i>Redelijkheid en Billijkheid</i>)	51
3.4.1. Introduction.....	51
3.4.2. What is Good Faith (<i>Redelijkheid en Billijkheid</i>)?	51
3.4.2.1. Introduction.....	51
3.4.2.2. Conceptual Definition.....	52
3.4.2.3. Behavioural Norm or Legal-Ethical Principle?.....	52
3.4.2.4. Objectification	53
3.4.2.5. Contextualization of an Open-ended Norm	54
3.4.2.6. Functions	55
3.4.2.7. An Alternative View	56
3.4.2.8. Conclusion.....	57

3.4.3.	The Case Law	58
3.4.3.1.	Introduction.....	58
3.4.3.2.	Duties to Inform.....	60
3.4.3.2.1.	General	60
3.4.3.2.2.	Contractual Duties to Inform	61
3.4.3.2.3.	Objective to Control and Enforce Performance	61
3.4.3.2.4.	Knowledge.....	63
3.4.3.2.5.	Bank-Client Relationships	65
3.4.3.2.6.	Conclusion.....	68
3.4.3.3.	Right to Terminate Contract of Undefined Duration	69
3.4.3.4.	Duties to Compensate	71
3.4.3.5.	The Impact of a Legislative Framework	74
3.4.3.6.	Duty not to Compete.....	76
3.4.3.7.	Duty to Cooperate	78
3.4.3.8.	Conclusion.....	78
3.4.4.	Concluding Remarks on Gap Filling Based on Good Faith	80
3.5.	The Nature of the Contract.....	81
3.5.1.	Introduction.....	81
3.5.2.	An Independent Source of Obligation?	82
3.5.3.	Determining the Nature of the Contract	83
3.5.4.	Conclusion.....	85
3.6.	Hierarchy of Sources	86
4.	The Prevailing View vs. An Alternative Viewpoint	88
4.1.	Introduction.....	88
4.2.	The Prevailing View	88
4.3.	An Alternative View	89
4.4.	Reflection on Two Opposing Views.....	90
5.	Conclusion.....	91
Chapter 4: Interpretation and Gap Filling in German Law		95
1.	Introduction.....	95
2.	Interpretation	96
2.1.	Introduction.....	96
2.2.	Subjective or Objective Interpretation: § 133 and § 157 BGB	96
2.3.	The ' <i>Wirkliche Wille</i> ' and § 133 BGB	97
2.3.1.	Introduction.....	97
2.3.2.	'Actual Intention'	98
2.3.3.	Common Understanding.....	98
2.3.4.	Conclusion.....	100
2.4.	Objective-Normative Interpretation	100
2.4.1.	Introduction.....	100
2.4.2.	The Nature of Normative Interpretation.....	101
2.4.3.	Relevant Circumstances.....	103
2.5.	Conclusion.....	107
3.	Supplementation of the Contract	107
3.1.	Introduction.....	107

3.2.	Legislative Default Provisions	108
3.2.1.	General	108
3.2.2.	Primacy of Legislative Defaults	108
3.2.3.	Conclusion	110
3.3.	The Supplementing Role of § 242 BGB	111
3.3.1.	Introduction	111
3.3.2.	The Nature of § 242 and Good Faith (<i>Treu und Glauben</i>)	111
3.3.2.1.	Introduction	111
3.3.2.2.	'Treue' and 'Glauben' – Conceptual Definition	111
3.3.2.3.	Open-ended Norm	113
3.3.2.4.	A Legal-Ethical Principle	114
3.3.2.5.	The Role of Common Practices (<i>Verkehrssitte</i>)	114
3.3.2.6.	The Functions and Fallgruppen of Good Faith (<i>Treu und Glauben</i>)	115
3.3.2.7.	Conclusion	118
3.3.3.	Ancillary Duties	118
3.3.3.1.	Introduction	118
3.3.3.2.	Concretization of the Main Obligations (<i>Hauptleistungskonkretisierung</i>)	119
3.3.3.3.	Duties of Loyalty (<i>Leistungstreuepflichten</i>)	120
3.3.3.4.	Duties to Inform (<i>Aufklärungs- und Auskunftspflichten</i>)	124
3.3.3.5.	Duties to Cooperate (<i>Mitwirkungspflichten</i>)	126
3.3.3.6.	Duties of Care (<i>Schutzpflichten</i>)	128
3.3.4.	Conclusion	130
4.	Constructive Interpretation: <i>Ergänzende Vertragsauslegung</i>	131
4.1.	Introduction	131
4.2.	The Gap Concept	132
4.2.1.	Introduction	132
4.2.2.	Issues of Definition	132
4.2.3.	Deliberate and Inadvertent Gaps	133
4.2.4.	Initial and Subsequent Gaps	135
4.2.5.	Conclusion	136
4.3.	Standards of Constructive Interpretation	137
4.3.1.	Introduction	137
4.3.2.	The Parties' Hypothetical Intention	137
4.3.3.	Constructing the Parties' Hypothetical Intention	138
4.3.3.1.	Introduction	138
4.3.3.2.	Individual-Subjective Factors	139
4.3.3.3.	Normative-Objective Factors	140
4.3.3.4.	The Time Factor	141
4.3.4.	Individualized vs. Standardized Solutions	142
4.4.	Limits to Constructive Interpretation	143
4.5.	The Nature, Function and Foundation of Constructive Interpretation	146
4.5.1.	Introduction	146
4.5.2.	Legal Foundation	146
4.5.3.	Is Constructive Interpretation a Form of Interpretation?	149
4.5.4.	Constructive Interpretation and Filling Gaps in Default Law	151
4.5.5.	Hierarchy between Default Law and Constructive Interpretation	152
4.6.	Conclusion	154

5.	Conclusion.....	154
Chapter 5: Interpretation and Gap Filling in English Law.....		157
1.	Introduction.....	157
2.	Interpretation	157
2.1.	Introduction.....	157
2.2.	Objective or Subjective Interpretation?.....	158
2.2.1.	General.....	158
2.2.2.	Justification of the Objective Approach.....	160
2.2.3.	Criticism of the Objective Approach.....	161
2.2.4.	Conclusion.....	162
2.3.	Ascertaining the Objective Meaning.....	163
2.3.1.	Introduction.....	163
2.3.2.	The Traditional Approach.....	163
2.3.3.	Modern Developments	164
2.3.3.1.	General.....	164
2.3.3.2.	The Objective Nature of Interpretation	166
2.3.3.3.	The Relevant Background	166
2.3.3.3.1.	General.....	166
2.3.3.3.2.	Absolutely Anything?	167
2.3.3.3.3.	Mutual Context.....	168
2.3.3.3.4.	The Contractual Document	169
2.3.3.3.5.	Surrounding Circumstances	169
2.3.3.3.6.	Aim and Purpose of the Transaction	170
2.3.3.4.	The Exclusionary Rules.....	171
2.3.3.4.1.	Introduction.....	171
2.3.3.4.2.	The Exclusionary Rules in the Courts.....	171
2.3.3.4.3.	Criticism of the Exclusionary Rules	174
2.3.3.4.4.	An Exceptional Case	175
2.3.3.4.5.	Conclusion.....	176
2.3.3.5.	The Contextual Meaning	176
2.3.3.6.	The Natural and Ordinary Meaning – A Common Sense Approach.....	177
2.4.	Conclusion.....	179
3.	Implied Terms.....	180
3.1.	Introduction.....	180
3.2.	Terms Implied in Fact	181
3.2.1.	Introduction.....	181
3.2.2.	Presumption Against Implication	181
3.2.3.	Parties' Presumed Intention as the Basis for Implication.....	183
3.2.3.1.	The Role of Intention.....	183
3.2.3.2.	Reflection	185
3.2.4.	Tests for the Implication of Terms in Fact.....	185
3.2.4.1.	Introduction.....	185
3.2.4.2.	Business Efficacy Test	186
3.2.4.2.1.	Introduction.....	186
3.2.4.2.2.	What does it mean?	186
3.2.4.2.3.	Application.....	188

3.2.4.2.4.	Reflection	189
3.2.4.3.	Officious Bystander Test.....	190
3.2.4.3.1.	Introduction.....	190
3.2.4.3.2.	The Subjective or Objective Officious Bystander?.....	191
3.2.4.3.3.	Obviousness	193
3.2.4.3.4.	Application.....	195
3.2.4.3.5.	Reflection	195
3.2.4.4.	Other Factors	199
3.2.4.4.1.	Introduction.....	199
3.2.4.4.2.	Reasonableness and Equity	199
3.2.4.4.3.	Capable of Clear Expression	201
3.2.4.4.4.	Compatibility with Express Terms.....	203
3.2.4.5.	Relationship Between the Tests	204
3.2.5.	Implication in Fact as Constructive Interpretation	206
3.2.6.	Overlap with 'Terms Implied in Law'	209
3.2.7.	Conclusion.....	210
3.3.	Terms Implied in Law.....	211
3.3.1.	Introduction.....	211
3.3.2.	Implied Terms or Default Rules?.....	211
3.3.3.	Precedent as a Source Terms Implied in Law	213
3.3.3.1.	Introduction.....	213
3.3.3.2.	Development of Terms Implied in Law	213
3.3.3.3.	Nature of the Contract	214
3.3.3.4.	Reasonableness or Necessity?.....	217
3.3.3.5.	Policy Considerations	218
3.3.3.6.	Conclusion.....	222
3.3.4.	Statute as a Source of Terms Implied in Law.....	223
3.3.4.1.	General	223
3.3.4.2.	Sale of Goods Act 1979.....	224
3.3.4.3.	Other Statutes.....	225
3.3.4.4.	Conclusion.....	226
3.4.	Terms Implied by Custom.....	226
3.4.1.	General	226
3.4.2.	Conditions	227
3.4.3.	Examples.....	229
3.4.4.	Continued Relevance?	229
4.	Conclusion.....	229
Chapter 6: Comparative Review		231
1.	Introduction.....	231
2.	Ordinary Interpretation	233
2.1.	Introduction: Textual and Contextual Approaches	233
2.2.	Subjective Interpretation.....	235
2.2.1.	General	235
2.2.2.	Ascertaining the Common Understanding.....	236
2.2.3.	Contrast.....	238
2.3.	Objective Interpretation.....	238

2.3.1.	General	238
2.3.2.	The Reasonable Person	239
2.3.3.	The Reasonable Parties	240
2.3.4.	Normative Interpretation	241
2.3.5.	Literal or Textual Meaning	242
2.3.6.	Conclusion	243
2.4.	Textual vs. Contextual Interpretation	244
2.5.	Concluding Remarks	246
3.	Constructive Interpretation	247
3.1.	Introduction	247
3.2.	Constructive Interpretation Recognized?	247
3.3.	Presumed or Hypothetical Intention	250
3.4.	Thresholds	251
3.5.	Constructing the Parties' Hypothetical Intention	252
3.6.	Conclusion	254
4.	Supplementation	255
4.1.	Introduction	255
4.2.	Legislative Default Provisions	255
4.3.	Custom and Trade Usages	256
4.4.	Supplementation by the Courts	259
4.4.1.	Introduction	259
4.4.2.	The Supplemending Function of Good Faith	260
4.4.3.	Terms Implied in Law – Standardized Terms	263
4.4.4.	Comparative Observation	264
4.5.	Conclusion	265
5.	Concluding Remarks	266

PART III: THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

Chapter 7: Preview	271
---------------------------------	------------

Chapter 8: Autonomy and Gap Filling	273
--	------------

1.	Introduction	273
2.	Autonomy-Based Theories of Contract	274
2.1.	Introduction	274
2.2.	Autonomy-Based Theories of Contract	274
2.3.	Barnett's Consent Theory of Contract	276
3.	Justification of Gap Filling	277
3.1.	Introduction	277
3.2.	Autonomy-Based Theories in General	277
3.3.	Consent Theory Justification of Gap Filling	278
3.3.1.	Introduction	278
3.3.2.	Consent to Jurisdiction	279
3.3.3.	Consent to Enforcement of Default Rules	279
3.4.	Conclusion	282

4.	Guidelines for Gap Filling	282
4.1.	Introduction.....	282
4.2.	Autonomy-Based Theories in General.....	283
4.3.	Barnett's Conventionalist Defaults.....	284
4.3.1.	Introduction.....	284
4.3.2.	The Role of Tacit Assumptions.....	285
4.3.3.	Subjective Disagreement	285
4.3.4.	What Are Conventionalist Defaults?	286
4.4.	Conclusion.....	287
5.	Conclusion.....	287
Chapter 9: A Law and Economics Perspective on Gap Filling		289
1.	Introduction.....	289
2.	Fully Contingent Contract and Transaction Costs.....	290
3.	The Hypothetical Bargain.....	293
3.1.	Introduction.....	293
3.2.	Hypothetical Bargains and Transaction Costs.....	294
3.3.	Constructing the Hypothetical Bargain.....	295
3.4.	The Optimal Design of Gap Filling Terms	296
3.4.1.	Introduction.....	296
3.4.2.	Individualized and Majoritarian Hypothetical Bargains	296
3.4.3.	Rules vs. Standards	298
3.4.4.	Individualization vs. Standardization of Gap Filling Solutions.....	300
3.5.	Status Quo Bias	302
3.6.	Conclusion.....	303
4.	A Formalist Approach	303
4.1.	Introduction.....	303
4.2.	Default Rules and Standards	304
4.2.1.	Introduction.....	304
4.2.2.	Default Rules.....	304
4.2.3.	Default Standards.....	306
4.2.4.	Conclusion.....	308
4.3.	Information Asymmetry and Incomplete Contracts.....	308
4.4.	New Formalism and Extralegal Sanctions	311
4.5.	Conclusion.....	313
5.	Concluding Remarks: Some Concerns About the Effectiveness of the Economic Approach.....	314
Chapter 10: Fairness and Gap Filling		319
1.	Introduction.....	319
2.	Fairness in Exchange.....	320
2.1.	Introduction.....	320
2.2.	Aristotle's Theory of Justice	320
2.2.1.	Distributive and Corrective Justice	320

2.2.2.	Distributive or Corrective Justice in Contract Law?	321
2.2.3.	Distributive and Corrective Justice and Gap Filling.....	323
2.3.	Fairness in Exchange and Gap Filling.....	323
2.4.	Measuring Fair Exchange	324
2.5.	Conclusion.....	326
3.	Fairness – An Indeterminate Concept?.....	327
3.1.	Introduction.....	327
3.2.	Fairness and Open-ended Norms	327
3.3.	A Process of Contextualization.....	328
3.4.	Fairness and Gap Filling	330
4.	Conclusion.....	330
Chapter 11: The Role of Social Context.....		333
1.	Introduction.....	333
2.	Why Contextualize the Content of the Contract?.....	334
2.1.	Introduction.....	334
2.2.	Empirical Studies into Contract Practice	334
2.2.1.	Introduction.....	334
2.2.2.	The Use and Non-Use of Contracts.....	335
2.2.3.	The Role of Non-Legal Sanctions	336
2.2.4.	Conclusion.....	338
2.3.	Reconceptualization of Contract	338
2.3.1.	Introduction.....	338
2.3.2.	The Contextual Setting of the Contract	338
2.3.3.	A Relational Conception of Contract	340
2.4.	Conclusion.....	341
3.	Commercial Norms and Practices in the UCC	343
3.1.	Introduction.....	343
3.2.	Llewellyn's Incorporation Strategy	343
3.3.	Commercial Norms and Practices in Article 2 of the UCC.....	344
3.3.1.	Introduction.....	344
3.3.2.	Sources of Immanent Commercial Norms	344
3.3.3.	The Incorporation of Commercial Norms.....	347
3.3.3.1.	Introduction.....	347
3.3.3.2.	Defining the Agreement	347
3.3.3.3.	Interpretation and Supplementation	348
3.3.3.4.	Hierarchy	349
3.3.3.5.	Open-ended Standards	350
3.4.	Conclusion.....	351
4.	Discussion Surrounding the Incorporation Strategy	351
4.1.	Introduction.....	351
4.2.	Verifying the Existence of Trade Usages	351
4.2.1.	Do Trade Usages Exist?	351
4.2.2.	Fine-tuning the Verification of Trade Usages.....	354

4.3.	The Incorporation of Extralegal Norms.....	357
4.3.1.	Legal vs. Extralegal Norms	357
4.3.2.	Rebutting the Critique	358
4.4.	Encrustation and Standardization.....	360
4.4.1.	The Encrustation Critique	360
4.4.2.	The Need to Combat Encrustation.....	360
4.5.	Conclusion.....	362
5.	Conclusion.....	362
Chapter 12: Review		365
1.	Introduction.....	365
2.	The Inevitability of Gaps and the Necessity of Gap Filling	365
2.1.	Introduction.....	365
2.2.	Efficiency Arguments.....	366
2.3.	The Contextual Dimension.....	367
2.4.	Consent to Jurisdiction and Reliance	368
2.5.	Conclusion.....	369
3.	Three Gap Filling Strategies	370
3.1.	Introduction.....	370
3.2.	A Formalist Strategy	370
3.3.	Normative Strategies.....	372
3.4.	The Contextual Approach	372
3.5.	Reflection	373
4.	Conclusion.....	375
 PART IV: A LAYERED INTERPRETATIVE AND GAP FILLING STRATEGY		
Chapter 13: A Layered Interpretative and Gap Filling Strategy		379
1.	Introduction.....	379
2.	The Nature of the Parties and the Nature of the Contract	381
2.1.	Introduction.....	381
2.2.	The Nature of the Contracting Parties	381
2.2.1.	Introduction.....	381
2.2.2.	Commercial Parties	382
2.2.3.	Private Individuals	384
2.2.4.	Conclusion.....	385
2.3.	The Nature of the Contract.....	386
2.4.	Conclusion.....	387
3.	A Layered Interpretative and Gap Filling Strategy	387
3.1.	Introduction.....	387
3.2.	Gap Filling by the Contracting Parties	388
3.2.1.	Introduction.....	388
3.2.2.	Negotiation.....	388

3.2.3.	Private Regulation within Contracting Communities	389
3.2.3.1.	Introduction.....	389
3.2.3.2.	The Nature of the Private Regulatory Framework	390
3.2.3.3.	Advantages of Private Regulation.....	392
3.2.3.4.	Some Concerns.....	394
3.2.3.5.	Conclusion.....	395
3.2.4.	Private Regulation and Atypical Transactions	395
3.2.5.	Private Regulation in Contracts Involving Private Individuals	396
3.2.6.	Private Regulation and European Contract Law	397
3.2.7.	Conclusion.....	400
3.3.	Legislative Gap Filling.....	400
3.3.1.	Introduction.....	400
3.3.2.	Legislative Frameworks for Standard Contract Types.....	401
3.3.3.	A General Contracting Framework for Atypical Contracts.....	405
3.3.4.	Scope of Application	406
3.3.5.	Legislative Frameworks and European Contract Law	408
3.3.6.	Conclusion.....	409
3.4.	Interpretation and Gap Filling by the Courts	409
3.4.1.	Introduction.....	409
3.4.2.	Textual and Contextual Interpretation Revisited.....	410
3.4.2.1.	General.....	410
3.4.2.2.	Private Individuals	411
3.4.2.3.	Mixed Transactions	412
3.4.2.4.	Commercial Transactions	413
3.4.2.5.	Interpretation in European Contract Law	414
3.4.3.	Gap Filling.....	415
3.4.3.1.	Introduction.....	415
3.4.3.2.	Threshold Conditions for Gap Filling.....	415
3.4.3.3.	Constructing the Hypothetical Bargain.....	417
3.4.3.4.	Gap Filling in Contracts between Private Individuals	422
3.4.3.5.	Gap Filling in Mixed Transactions	422
3.4.3.6.	Gap Filling in a Contracting Community.....	423
3.4.3.7.	Gap Filling in other Commercial Transactions.....	425
3.4.3.8.	Gap Filling in European Contract Law.....	427
3.5.	Conclusion.....	427
4.	Evaluation.....	428
4.1.	Introduction.....	428
4.2.	Legal Certainty and Flexibility	428
4.3.	Transaction Costs and Cost-Effectiveness.....	430
4.4.	Reduction of Judicial Error.....	432
4.5.	The Legal and Extralegal Dimensions	433
5.	Concluding Remarks.....	434

Samenvatting: Uitleg en aanvulling van de overeenkomst: rechtsvergelijkende en theoretische perspectieven	437
1. Inleiding: probleemstelling, methodologie en plan van aanpak.....	437
2. Deel II – Rechtsvergelijkend perspectief	437
3. Deel III – Theoretische perspectieven	440
4. Deel IV – Een strategie voor een gelaagde uitleg en aanvulling	441
Bibliography	443
Index	477
Curriculum Vitae.....	483