

# Contents

<i>General Editor's Preface</i>	vii
<i>Foreword</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xxi
<i>List of Cited WTO Panel and Appellate Body Reports, Initiated WTO Disputes, and their Common Abbreviations</i>	xxv
<i>List of Cited GATT Panel and Working Party Reports, and their Common Abbreviations</i>	xlvi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xlix
<i>Introduction</i>	lxiii

## I. The Basic Principles and Concepts Governing WTO Dispute Settlement and Treaty Interpretation

1. The WTO Dispute Settlement System	3
1.1 Introduction	3
1.2 The Character of WTO Dispute Settlement	4
1.3 The Jurisdiction of WTO Panels and the Appellate Body	8
1.3.1 Exclusive but Not General Jurisdiction	8
1.3.2 Jurisdiction over Facts and Law	12
1.4 The Applicable Law in WTO Dispute Settlement	13
1.5 Treaty Interpretation in WTO Dispute Settlement	22
1.6 Authentic Interpretation <i>versus</i> Judicial Interpretation	26
1.7 Conclusion	30
2. Principles of Treaty Interpretation: Meaning and Function	32
2.1 Introduction	32
2.2 The Position under General International Law	34
2.2.1 Principles, Not Rules	34
2.2.2 Categories of Principles of Treaty Interpretation	37
2.2.2.1 Codified Principles	37
A Historical Note	37
Articles 31 to 33 VCLT	49
2.2.2.2 Non-Codified Principles	52
2.2.3 Functions of Principles of Treaty Interpretation	53
2.2.4 The Inter-Temporal Element in Treaty Interpretation	55



2.3 The Position in WTO Dispute Settlement	56
2.3.1 The Appellate Body's Appreciation of Treaty Interpretation	56
2.3.2 The Appellate Body's Application of Codified and Non-Codified Principles of Interpretation	57
2.3.3 Special Principles of Treaty Interpretation	58
2.3.3.1 A Questionable Category	58
2.3.3.2 Illustration 1: The Alleged Principle of <i>In Dubio Mitius</i>	61
2.3.3.3 Illustration 2: The Principle of Legitimate Expectations	65
2.3.3.4 Illustration 3: Article 17.6(ii) Anti-Dumping Agreement	68
2.4 Conclusion	72
3. The Subject of Treaty Interpretation in WTO Dispute Settlement	73
3.1 Introduction	73
3.2 The Scope of WTO 'Treaty Language'	74
3.2.1 WTO 'Treaty Language'	74
3.2.1.1 Articles and <i>Ad Articles</i>	77
3.2.1.2 Cross-References and Incorporation by Reference	77
3.2.1.3 Waivers and 'GATT/WTO Issues'	78
3.2.1.4 Footnotes and Understandings	80
3.2.2 The Character of the WTO Covered Agreements	81
3.2.2.1 The ILC's View: No Formal Classes or Categories of Treaties	81
3.2.2.2 The Contractual <i>versus</i> the Law-Making Approach	83
3.2.2.3 The Distinction Applied to the WTO Covered Agreements	86
3.2.2.4 Constitutional Theories and the Interpretation of WTO Treaty Language	87
3.3 The Special Case of Schedules of Commitments	93
3.3.1 Schedules of Commitments—Negotiation and Conclusion	93
3.3.2 Article 2(1)(a) VCLT and Schedules of Commitments	99
3.3.3 The Appellate Body's Interpretation of Schedules of Commitments	100
3.3.4 Alternative Approaches to the Interpretation of Schedules of Commitments	102
3.3.4.1 The ICJ's Interpretations of Unilateral Declarations	102
3.3.4.2 Struggling Towards a Solution in WTO Dispute Settlement	106
3.4 Conclusion	108



4. The Interpretation of Silence in the WTO	
Covered Agreements	110
4.1 Introduction	110
4.2 <i>Non Liqueur</i> and the Completeness of International and WTO Law	112
4.2.1 General International Law	112
4.2.1.1 Gaps, <i>Non Liqueur</i> , Completeness, and Judicial Power	112
4.2.1.2 Problems with the Traditional Discourse	116
4.2.2 WTO Law	117
4.2.2.1 Judicial Law-Making in the WTO	117
4.2.2.2 Illustration 1: The Applicable Law and the Principle of Institutional Balance	120
4.2.2.3 Illustration 2: The Zeroing Saga	121
4.3 An Alternative Perspective: Silence in WTO Treaty Language	124
4.3.1 Silence in Treaty Language	124
4.3.2 Interpretation of Some Silences in the WTO	
Covered Agreements	126
4.3.2.1 Introduction	126
4.3.2.2 Silence Outside the Scope of the Applicable Law	128
4.3.2.3 Genuine Silences	129
Procedural and Substantive Silences	135
Procedural Silences	135
Substantive Silences	139
Causes and Motivations	141
Defective Treaty-Drafting	141
Deliberate Silences in Treaty-Drafting	143
Techniques for Interpreting Silences	146
The Use of Customary International Law and General Principles	146
The Use of Practice	147
The Use of Cross-Referencing	148
The Use of the Principle of Effectiveness	152
The Use of the Object and Purpose	153
4.4 Conclusion	155
5. Inherent Powers and Treaty Interpretation	157
5.1 Introduction	157
5.2 The International Judicial Function and the WTO Appellate Body	159
5.3 The Role of the Judicial Function in the WTO	162
5.4 Powers and the Judicial Process	164
5.5 Inherent Powers of the WTO Appellate Body	168
5.5.1 Inherent Powers and Jurisdiction	169
5.5.2 Inherent Powers and Admissibility	177



5.5.3	Inherent Powers and Interpreting Other Procedural Rules	189
5.5.3.1	<i>Amicus Curiae</i> Briefs	191
5.5.3.2	Open Hearings	192
5.5.3.3	Legal Certainty and <i>Jurisprudence Constante</i>	195
5.5.3.4	Due Process and Preliminary Rulings	203
5.5.3.5	Burden of Proof	207
5.6	Inherent Powers and Interpreting Substantive Rules	208
5.7	Conclusion	209

## II. The Interpretative Practice of the WTO Appellate Body

6.	The Contextual Interpretation of the WTO	
	Covered Agreements	213
6.1	Introduction	213
6.2	Meaning and Function of Context in Article 31 VCLT	214
6.2.1	Incomplete Description of Context in Article 31 VCT	214
6.2.2	The History of Context in Article 31 VCLT	216
6.3	Meaning and Function of Context in the Appellate	
	Body's Jurisprudence	221
6.3.1	Literal Interpretation as the Starting Point	221
6.3.2	Contextualized Ordinary Meaning	222
6.3.2.1	Ordinary Meaning: Text and Grammar	223
6.3.2.2	Contextualized Plain and Dictionary Meaning	225
	The Limited Value of Dictionaries	226
	Choosing between Dictionaries and Dictionary	
	Definitions	229
	Complementary Dictionary Meanings	230
	Affirming Dictionary Meanings	230
	Dictionary Preferences	231
	Contextualizing Dictionary Definitions	
	through their Use	232
6.3.3	The Technique of Cross-Referencing	235
6.3.3.1	Function of Cross-Referencing	235
	Cross-Referencing to Establish Ordinary Meaning	237
	Cross-Referencing to Confirm Ordinary Meaning	239
	Necessity of Cross-Referencing	240
6.3.3.2	Types of Cross-Referencing	242
	Identical Treaty Language	242
	Similar Treaty Language	245
	Different Treaty Language	249
6.3.3.3	A Special Case: Cross-Referencing	
	between Schedules	251
6.3.4	Context Relating to the Conclusion of the Treaty	253
6.3.4.1	Agreements and Instruments in Connection with the	
	Conclusion of the Treaty	253
6.3.4.2	Is the Harmonized System Context?	254



6.3.4.3 Are Explanatory Notes and Scheduling Guidelines Context?	256
6.3.5 Teleology of the Treaty	257
6.3.6 Other Extrinsic Elements	264
6.3.6.1 Trade Negotiations and WTO Committees	264
6.3.6.2 Economic Conditions of Disputants	265
6.3.6.3 <i>Ad Articles</i>	266
6.3.6.4 Scientific Knowledge	267
6.3.6.5 Academic Literature	268
6.3.6.6 Business and Trade Practices	268
6.4 Factual Context	269
6.5 Conclusion	272
7. The Effective Interpretation of the WTO Covered Agreements	275
7.1 Effectiveness as a Principle of Treaty Interpretation	275
7.1.1 The VCLT and the Principle of Effective Interpretation	275
7.1.2 Some Applications of the Principle of Effectiveness	278
7.2 Effective Interpretation in WTO Dispute Settlement	282
7.3 Interaction between Effectiveness and Contextualism: Harmonious Interpretation	285
7.4 Effective Interpretation of the Contextualized Ordinary Meaning	287
7.5 Effective Interpretation of the Unity of the Treaty Language	292
7.6 Giving Effect to Values in Treaty Interpretation	294
7.7 Conclusion	303
8. Other Issues in WTO Treaty Interpretation	305
8.1 Introduction	305
8.2 Supplementary Means of Interpretation (Article 32 VCLT)	306
8.2.1 General International Law	306
8.2.2 WTO Law	310
8.2.2.1 Residual Character of Article 32 VCLT	310
8.2.2.2 Preparatory Work as a Problem and as a Solution	315
8.2.2.3 Other Supplementary Means of Interpretation	321
8.2.2.4 Article 32 VCLT and the Interpretation of Schedules	324
8.3 Other Authentic Versions of the Treaty (Article 33 VCLT)	327
8.3.1 General International Law	327
8.3.1.1 History of Article 33 VCLT	327
8.3.1.2 Meaning of Article 33 VCLT	329
8.3.2 WTO Law	332
8.4 Use of Subsequent Practice (Article 31(3)(b) VCLT)	338
8.4.1 Definition in WTO and International Law	338



8.4.2 Practice of the WTO and Other International Organizations	340
8.4.3 Finding Subsequent Practice	343
8.4.3.1 What Qualifies as Practice?	343
8.4.3.2 Agreement Among Parties Who Have Not Engaged in the Practice	345
8.4.3.3 Consistency of Practice	346
8.5 Use of Subsequent Agreements (Article 31(3)(a) VCLT)	346
8.6 Special Meanings (Article 31(4) VCLT)	350
8.6.1 General International Law	350
8.6.2 WTO Law	351
8.7 Conclusion	353
9. WTO Treaty Interpretation against the Background of Other International Law	355
9.1 Harmonization of WTO Law and International Law	355
9.2 The Role of International Law in Treaty Interpretation	357
9.2.1 The Principle of Harmonious Interpretation	357
9.2.2 History of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	359
9.2.3 Interpretation of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	360
9.2.4 Limited Value of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	365
9.2.5 Article 31(3)(c) VCLT and Jurisdiction	366
9.3 Article 31(3)(c) VCLT in WTO Dispute Settlement	367
9.3.1 Application of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	368
9.3.2 Implied Interpretation of Article 31(3)(c) VCLT	373
9.4 Conclusion	374
III. Conclusions	
Conclusions	379
<i>Appendix Articles 31, 32, and 33 VCLT</i>	385
<i>Bibliography</i>	387
<i>Index</i>	413