

Contents (detail)

Foreword by Valerie Hughes, Director, Appellate Body Secretariat, World Trade Organization	page xxxvii
---	-------------

Part I Appellate Body Reports

A	3
---	---

Administrative Review of Countervailing Duty Measures. *See* SCM Agreement, Article 21 (S.2.29)

Admission of Evidence. *See* Evidence (E.3)

Adverse Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information. *See* Inferences from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1)

A.1 Agreement on Agriculture	3
A.1.1 Article 1(a) and Annex 3 – “Aggregate Measurement of Support”	3
A.1.2 Article 1(a)(ii) and Annex 3 – “AMS commitments”	3
A.1.3 Article 1(e) – “subsidy”	4
A.1.4 Article 1(e) – “contingent upon export performance”	5
A.1.5 Article 3.3 – “export subsidies”	5
A.1.6 Articles 3.3 and 10.1 – “export subsidy commitments”	5
A.1.7 Article 4 – “market access”	6
A.1.8 Article 4.1 – Market access commitments contained in Schedules. <i>See also</i> Tariff Quotas – Non-discriminatory Administration (T.2)	6
A.1.9 Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 – Conversion of certain border measures into ordinary customs duties	7
A.1.10 Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 – Measures of the kind	8
A.1.11 Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 – Minimum import price	9
A.1.12 Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 – Similar border measures	9
A.1.13 Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 – Variable import levies	10
A.1.14 Article 5 – special safeguard	11
A.1.15 Article 9.1(a) – “direct subsidies, including payments-in-kind”	11
A.1.16 Article 9.1(a) – “governments or their agencies”	12
A.1.17 Article 9.1(c) – “payments”	12

A.1.18	Article 9.1(c) – Benchmark for payments-in-kind	13
A.1.19	Article 9.1(c) – Benchmark – world market prices vs. domestic prices	14
A.1.20	Article 9.1(c) – Benchmark – cost of production	15
A.1.21	Article 9.1(c) – Industry-wide vs. Individual standard	18
A.1.22	Article 9.1(c) – “imputed” costs	18
A.1.23	Article 9.1(c) – Selling and quota costs	20
A.1.24	Article 9.1(c) – “governmental action”	20
A.1.25	Article 9.1(c) – Governmental action vs. Private action	21
A.1.26	Article 9.1(c) – “by virtue of”	22
A.1.27	Article 9.1(c) – “financed”	24
A.1.28	Article 9.1(c) – Cross-subsidization	26
A.1.29	Article 9.1(d) – “costs of marketing”	27
A.1.30	Article 10.1 – “export subsidy commitments”	27
A.1.31	Article 10.1 – “export subsidies” not listed in Article 9.1	28
A.1.32	Article 10.1 – “circumvention”	28
A.1.33	Article 10.1 – Relationship with Article 9.1	29
A.1.34	Article 10.3 – Reversal of Burden of Proof. <i>See also</i> Burden of proof, reversal (B.3.4)	29
	Article 13 – “due restraint”. <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the GATT 1994 (A.1.37)	
	Article 21. <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the GATT 1994 (A.1.37)	
A.1.35	Annex 3, paragraph 8 – “market price support”	31
A.1.36	Relationship between Domestic Support and Export Subsidies Disciplines	31
A.1.37	Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the GATT 1994	32
A.1.38	Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the SCM Agreement. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 1(e) – “subsidy” (A.1.3); SCM Agreement, Article 3.1 – “except as provided in the Agreement on Agriculture” (S.2.11)	33
	Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of the GATT 1994. <i>See</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement (A.3)	
	Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures. <i>See</i> Licensing Agreement (L.2)	
	Agreement on Safeguards. <i>See</i> Safeguards Agreement (S.1)	
	Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement (S.2)	
	Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade. <i>See</i> TBT Agreement (T.4)	
	Agreement on Textiles and Clothing. <i>See</i> Textiles and Clothing Agreement (T.7)	

	Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures. <i>See</i> SPS Agreement (S.6)	
	Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights. <i>See</i> TRIPS Agreement (T.9)	
	Allocation of Quotas and Tariff Quotas. <i>See</i> Tariff Quotas – Non-discriminatory Administration (T.2)	
A.2	Amicus Curiae Briefs	34
A.2.1	Briefs submitted by NGOs	34
A.2.2	Briefs submitted by WTO Members	37
A.2.3	Additional Procedure	39
A.3	Anti-Dumping Agreement	42
	Article 1. <i>See</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article VI of the GATT 1994 – Anti-Dumping duties (A.3.65)	
A.3.1	Article 2 – Intent and effect of dumping	42
A.3.2	Article 2 – Period of investigation	42
A.3.3	Article 2.1 – “normal value . . . in the ordinary course of trade”	42
A.3.4	Article 2.1 – Sales below cost	44
A.3.5	Article 2.1 – Calculation of normal value	44
A.3.6	Article 2.1 – Fair comparison	45
A.3.7	Article 2.1 – Volume of dumped imports	45
A.3.8	Article 2.1 – Relationship with Article 11.3. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 (A.3.45–52)	45
A.3.9	Article 2.2.1 – Sales below cost and “ordinary course of trade”	46
A.3.10	Article 2.2.2 – Low volume sales and “ordinary course of trade”	46
A.3.11	Article 2.2.2(ii) – Calculation of “weighted average”	47
A.3.12	Article 2.4 – Identity of seller and “fair comparison”	47
A.3.13	Article 2.4 – Calculation of dumping margins – Relationship with Article 11.3. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 (A.3.45–52)	47
A.3.14	Article 2.4.2 – Calculation of dumping margins – “zeroing”. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article VI of the GATT 1994 (A.3.65)	48
A.3.15	Article 3.1 – general	49
A.3.16	Article 3.1 – “positive evidence”	50
A.3.17	Article 3.1 – “objective examination”	51
A.3.18	Articles 3.1 and 3.2 – Method of calculating the “volume of the dumped imports”	52
A.3.19	Articles 3.1 and 3.2 – Calculation of the “volume of the dumped imports” without examining each producer or exporter individually. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2.1 (A.3.3–8), Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.3 (A.3.21); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.10 (A.3.37); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 9.4 (A.3.41–44)	53

A.3.20	Article 3.2 – No country-specific analysis of volume and prices of dumped imports	55
A.3.21	Article 3.3 – Cumulative assessment of dumped imports. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 3.2 (A.3.20)	55
A.3.22	Article 3.4 – Evaluation of injury factors	57
A.3.23	Article 3.4 – Manner of evaluating injury factors	59
A.3.24	Article 3.5 – Non-attribution of injury caused by other known factors	60
A.3.25	Article 3.5 – Examination of other known factors	62
A.3.26	Article 3.5 – Individual vs. Collective effects of other factors. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Articles 3.1 and 3.2 (A.3.18–19)	63
A.3.27	Article 3.7 – Threat of material injury	64
A.3.28	Article 5.4 – Motives of domestic producers for supporting investigation	65
A.3.29	Article 6 – Evidentiary rules for anti-dumping investigation. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 (A.3.45–52)	65
A.3.30	Article 6.1.1 – Time-limits for responses to questionnaire. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.4 (A.3.53)	66
A.3.31	Article 6.2 – Opportunity for interested parties to defend their interests	66
A.3.32	Article 6.4 – Access to information relevant for interested parties to present their case. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6.2 (A.3.31); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.4 (A.3.53)	67
A.3.33	Article 6.8 and Annex II – Facts available to investigating authorities	68
A.3.34	Article 6.8 and Annex II – Timeliness of parties' submissions	68
A.3.35	Article 6.8 and Annex II – “reasonable period” for submission of information	69
A.3.36	Article 6.8 and Annex II – Lack of cooperation by investigated parties. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.4 (A.3.53)	70
A.3.37	Article 6.10 – No individual examination of all producers. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Articles 3.1 and 3.2 – Method of calculating the “volume of the dumped imports” (A.3.18); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.4 – Relationship with Article 6 (A.53)	71
A.3.38	Article 6.13 – Cooperation between interested parties and investigation authorities	72
A.3.39	Article 9.1 – Imposition of anti-dumping duties – Relationship with Articles 2 and 3	72
A.3.40	Article 9.2 – Product-specific vs. Company-specific anti-dumping determination. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.3 (A.3.45–52)	73
A.3.41	Article 9.4 – Calculation of the “all other” anti-dumping duty rate	73
A.3.42	Article 9.4 – Relationship with Article 2.4.2	74
A.3.43	Article 9.4 – Relationship with Article 6.8	74
A.3.44	Article 9.4 – Relationship with paragraphs 1 and 2 of Article 3	75
A.3.45	Article 11.3 – Sunset review – conditions. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 6 (A.3.29–38); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 9.2 (A.3.40); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.4 (A.3.53)	76

A.3.46	Article 11.3 – Likelihood of continuation or recurrence of dumping	76
A.3.47	Article 11.3 – Nature of sunset review investigation	77
A.3.48	Article 11.3 – Methodology for sunset review investigations	78
A.3.49	Article 11.3 – Relationship with Article 2. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 2.1 (A.3.3–8)	78
A.3.50	Article 11.3 – No duty to investigate each known producer and exporter individually. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 11.4 (A.3.53)	79
A.3.51	Article 11.3 – Determination of dumping margins and import volumes	80
A.3.52	Article 11.3 – Likelihood determination based on evidence vs. presumptions	81
A.3.53	Article 11.4 – Relationship with Article 6. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement – Article 6 (A.3.29–38)	82
A.3.54	Article 17 – Dispute settlement. <i>See also</i> Special or Additional Rules and Procedures for Dispute Settlement (S.5)	82
A.3.55	Article 17.3 – Consultations. <i>See also</i> Consultations (C.7); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Terms of Reference of Panels, specific measure at issue (T.6.3)	83
A.3.56	Article 17.4 – “matter referred to the DSB”. <i>See also</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	84
A.3.57	Article 17.5 – Facts made available to the investigating authority. <i>See also</i> Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2)	86
A.3.58	Article 17.6 – Standard of Review under the Anti-Dumping Agreement. <i>See also</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6)	87
A.3.59	Article 17.6(i) – “assessment of the facts”. <i>See also</i> Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of the facts (S.7.3)	88
A.3.60	Article 17.6(ii) – “permissible interpretations”. <i>See also</i> Interpretation, General rules of treaty interpretation – Article 31 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.1); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of the facts (S.7.3)	91
A.3.61	Article 18.1 – Specific action against dumping. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article VI of the GATT 1994 (A.3.65); SCM Agreement, Article 32.1 – Specific action against a subsidy (S.2.36)	93
A.3.62	Article 18.4 – Ensure conformity of domestic anti-dumping laws, regulations and administrative procedures. <i>See also</i> WTO Agreement, Article XVI:4 – WTO-conformity of laws, regulations and administrative procedures (W.4.3)	96
	Aggregate Investigations. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 19 (S.2.26–28)	
A.3.63	Relationship between the Anti-Dumping Agreement and the SCM Agreement	97
	Relationship between the Anti-Dumping Agreement and the Safeguards Agreement. <i>See</i> Safeguards Agreement, Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and the Anti-Dumping Agreement (S.1.43)	
A.3.64	Relationship between the Anti-Dumping Agreement and the GATT 1994	98

A.3.65	Article VI of the GATT 1994 – Anti-dumping duties. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 18.1 (A.3.61)	99
	B	101
B.1	Balance-of-Payments Restrictions	101
B.1.1	Article XVIII:11 of the GATT 1994, Note Ad	101
B.1.2	Article XVIII:11 of the GATT 1994, Proviso. <i>See also</i> Jurisdiction, General (J.2.1)	101
	Benefit. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 14 (S.2.22–24)	
B.2	Bilateral Settlements	102
B.3	Burden of Proof	102
B.3.1	General. <i>See also</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1)	102
B.3.2	Presumption – prima facie case	107
B.3.3	Defences and Exceptions. <i>See also</i> Request for the Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Claims and legal basis of the complaint (R.2.2); SCM Agreement, Article 27 – Special and differential treatment for developing country Members (S.2.35); SPS Agreement, Article 3.2 – “measures which conform to international standards” (S.6.7)	110
B.3.4	Reversal of Burden of Proof. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 10.3 – Reversal of Burden of Proof (A.1.34)	114
B.4	Business Confidential Information. <i>See also</i> Confidentiality (C.6); Inferences drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4)	114
	C	117
C.1	Claims and Arguments. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, General (B.3.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal (W.2.7)	117
C.2	Claims and Panel Reasoning	119
	Coherence. <i>See</i> International Monetary Fund – “Coherence” (I.2)	
C.3	Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body. <i>See also</i> Jurisdiction (J.2); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	121
C.3.1	Article 3.2 of the DSU – “clarify existing provisions”	121
C.3.2	Articles 3.2 and 19.2 of the DSU – “not add to or diminish rights and obligations”. <i>See also</i> Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measure at issue (T.6.3)	121

C.4	Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body. <i>See also</i> Judicial Economy (J.1); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)	122
C.5	Conditional Appeals	128
C.6	Confidentiality. <i>See also</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 8 – Rules of Conduct (W.2.4)	129
C.7	Consultations. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.3 – Consultations (A.3.55)	131
	Context. <i>See</i> Interpretation, General rules of treaty interpretation – Article 31 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.1)	
	Customary Rules of Interpretation. <i>See</i> Interpretation (I.3)	
	D	135
	Development. <i>See</i> Enabling Clause (E.1); SCM Agreement, Article 27 – Special and differential treatment for developing country Members (S.2.35)	
D.1	Directly Competitive or Substitutable Products. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, second sentence – “directly competitive or substitutable” products (N.1.6); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “directly competitive products” (T.7.4)	135
	Discretionary and Mandatory Legislation. <i>See</i> Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1)	
	Dispute Settlement Understanding	138
	Article 1.2. <i>See</i> Special or Additional Rules and Procedures for Dispute Settlement (S.5)	
	Article 3.2. <i>See</i> Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3); Interpretation (I.3)	
	Article 3.3. <i>See</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU (R.4.1–3); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measure at issue (T.6.3)	
	Article 3.7. <i>See</i> Right to Bring Claims – Legal Interest (R.5); Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations (S.9)	
	Article 3.8. <i>See</i> Burden of Proof, Presumption – prima facie case (B.3.2); Nullification or Impairment (N.3)	
	Article 3.10. <i>See</i> Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3); Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, Good faith (P.3.1); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal (W.2.7)	
	Article 4. <i>See</i> Consultations (C.7)	

Article 6.2. <i>See</i> Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	
Article 7. <i>See</i> Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	
Article 9.2. <i>See</i> Multiple Complainants (M.4); Panel Reports, Separate Panel Reports (P.1.3)	
Article 10. <i>See</i> Third Party Rights (T.8); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 24 – Third participants (W.2.9)	
Article 11. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review, Review of “objective assessment” by the panel (S.3.2); Standard of Review (S.7)	
Article 12.1. <i>See</i> Terms of Reference of Panels, Claims and legal basis of the complaint (T.6.2)	
Article 12.7. <i>See</i> Panel Reports, Basic rationale behind findings and conclusions (P.1.1)	
Article 13. <i>See</i> Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6)	
Article 14. <i>See</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6)	
Article 15. <i>See</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6)	
Article 16.4. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of Appeal (W.2.7)	
Article 17.4. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 24 – Third participants (W.2.9)	
Article 17.6. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)	
Article 17.10. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 8 – Rules of Conduct – Confidentiality (W.2.4)	
Article 17.11. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 3.2 – Concurring opinion – Article 17.11 of the DSU (W.2.3)	
Article 17.13. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)	
Article 17.14. <i>See</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU – Effect of DSB rulings in the original dispute (R.4.3)	
Article 19.2. <i>See</i> Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3)	
Article 21.5. <i>See</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings (R.4)	
Article 22. <i>See</i> Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations (S.9)	
Article 23.2. <i>See</i> Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations (S.9)	
Domestic Law. <i>See</i> Municipal Law (M.5)	139
D.2 Due Process	139
D.2.1 Due process in the application of trade measures	139
D.2.2 Due process in WTO dispute settlement proceedings. <i>See also</i> Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review (W.2)	140
Duty of a Member to Comply with the Request of a Panel to Provide Information. <i>See</i> Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4)	

E	145
E.1 Enabling Clause	145
E.1.1 Paragraph 1. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, Defences and Exceptions (B.3.3); Request for the Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Claims and legal basis of the complaint (R.2.2)	145
E.1.2 Paragraph 2(a)	146
E.1.3 Paragraph 2(d)	149
E.1.4 Paragraph 3(a)	149
E.1.5 Paragraph 3(c) Enforcement of Intellectual Property Rights. <i>See</i> TRIPS Agreement, Article 42 (T.9.10)	149
E.2 Environmental Multilateral Agreements. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994 (G.3)	151
E.3 Evidence. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof (B.3); Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6)	153
Exceptions. <i>See</i> Burden of Proof, Defences and Exceptions (B.3.3); General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994 (G.3)	
Experts Advising a Panel. <i>See</i> Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4)	
F	156
Fact Finding. <i>See</i> Burden of Proof (B.3); Business Confidential Information (B.4); Consultations (C.7); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	
Factual vs. Legal Findings. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review, Issues of law vs. Issues of fact (S.3.3)	
Financial contribution. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1(a)(1) (S.2.3)	
Financial contribution – “in kind”. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1(a)(1)(iii) (S.2.6–7)	
G	157
G.1 GATS	157
G.1.1 Article I: Scope of application – Measures affecting trade in services. <i>See also</i> GATT 1994: Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the GATS (G.2.2) Article II. <i>See</i> MFN Treatment, Article II of the GATS (M.2.2)	

Article XVII. <i>See</i> National Treatment, Article XVII of the GATS (N.1.13)	157
G.2 GATT 1994	159
Article I. <i>See</i> Enabling Clause, Paragraph 1 (E.1.1); MFN Treatment, Article 1 of the GATT 1994 (M.2.1)	
Article II. <i>See</i> Tariff Concessions (T.1)	
Article III. <i>See</i> National Treatment (N.1); SCM Agreement, Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.42)	
Article VI. <i>See</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement (A.3)	
Article VI:3. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	
Article VIII. <i>See</i> International Monetary Fund – “Coherence” (I.2)	
Article X. <i>See</i> Licensing Agreement (L.2); Publication and Administration of Trade Regulations (P.5)	
Article XIII. <i>See</i> Tariff Quotas – Non-discriminatory Administration (T.2)	
Article XV. <i>See</i> International Monetary Fund – “Coherence” (I.2); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4)	
Article XVI. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.2.41)	
Article XVIII:11, Note Ad. <i>See</i> Balance-of Payments Restrictions (B.1)	
Article XVIII:11, Proviso. <i>See</i> Balance-of Payments Restrictions (B.1)	
Article XIX. <i>See</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article XIX of the GATT 1994 (S.1.45–50); Safeguards Agreement, Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.1.44)	
Article XX. <i>See</i> General Exceptions, Article XX of the GATT 1994 (G.3)	
Article XXIV. <i>See</i> Regional Agreements (R.1)	
G.2.1 Language of Annex 1A incorporating the GATT 1994 into the WTO Agreement. <i>See also</i> Status of Panel and Appellate Body Reports (S.8) Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the Agreement on Agriculture. <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Relationship between the Agreement on Agriculture and the GATT 1994 (A.1.37) Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the Anti-Dumping Agreement. <i>See</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Relationship between the Anti-Dumping Agreement and the GATT 1994 (A.3.64)	160
G.2.2 Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the GATS. <i>See also</i> GATS, Article I: Scope of application – Measures affecting trade in services (G.1.1) Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the Agreement on Import Licensing Procedures. <i>See</i> Licensing Agreement (L.2) Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the Agreement on Safeguards. <i>See</i> Safeguards Agreement, Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.1.44) Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the SCM Agreement. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.2.41)	

	Relationship between the GATT 1994 and the Schedules to the GATT 1994. <i>See</i> Tariff Concession (T.1)	161
G.3	General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994	163
G.3.1	Article XX – Two-tier analysis	163
G.3.2	Article XX(b) – Relationship with Article III	163
G.3.3	Article XX(b) – Evidence. <i>See also</i> General Exceptions: Article XX of the GATT 1994, Article XX(d) – Necessity test (G.3.6)	164
G.3.4	Article XX(b) – Objective pursued – alternative measure	164
G.3.5	Article XX(d) – Level of enforcement – alternative measure	164
G.3.6	Article XX(d) – Necessity test	165
G.3.7	Article XX(g) – “conservation of exhaustible natural resources”	166
G.3.8	Article XX(g) – “measures made effective in conjunction with”	167
G.3.9	Article XX(g) – “relating to”	167
G.3.10	Article XX(g) – jurisdictional limitation. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Relationship between Article III and Article XX (N.1.12)	169
G.3.11	Chapeau of Article XX – general	169
G.3.12	Chapeau of Article XX – “arbitrary or unjustifiable discrimination between countries where the same conditions prevail”	171
G.3.13	Chapeau of Article XX – “disguised restriction on international trade”	175
I		176
	Implementation of DSB Rulings Review. <i>See</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings (R.4)	
	Import Licensing. <i>See</i> Licensing Agreement (L.2)	
	Indirect Subsidization – Pass-Through. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	
I.1	Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information. <i>See also</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4)	176
	Internal Taxation Regulation. <i>See</i> National Treatment, Article III:2, first and second sentences (N.1.3–8); Taxation (T.3)	
I.2	International Monetary Fund – “Coherence”	177
I.3	Interpretation. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.6(ii) – “permissible interpretations” (A.3.60)	179
I.3.1	General rules of treaty interpretation – Article 31 of the Vienna Convention	179
I.3.2	Text. <i>See also</i> Interpretation, Legitimate expectations (I.3.5); Municipal Law (M.5)	180
I.3.3	Context	181
I.3.4	Domestic legislative history	182
I.3.5	Legitimate expectations	183

I.3.6	Preamble	184
I.3.7	Principle of effectiveness	184
I.3.8	Principle of in dubio mitius	186
I.3.9	Subsequent Practice	187
I.3.10	Supplementary means of interpretation – Article 32 of the Vienna Convention	187
I.3.11	Multiple authentic languages – Article 33 of the Vienna Convention	190
	Issues of Fact/Law. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review, Issues of law vs. Issues of fact (S.3.3)	
	J	192
J.1	Judicial Economy. <i>See also</i> Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4)	192
J.2	Jurisdiction	195
J.2.1	General. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.4 – “matter referred to the DSB” (A.3.56); Balance-of-Payments Restrictions (B.1); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	195
	Appellate Body. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)	
	Panels. <i>See</i> Standard of Review (S.7); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	
	L	201
	Languages. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Multiple authentic languages – Article 33 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.11)	
	Law vs. Fact. <i>See</i> Scope of Appellate Review, Issues of law vs. Issues of fact (S.3.3)	
L.1	Legislation as such vs. Specific Application. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.3 – consultations (A.3.55); Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.4 – “matter referred to the DSB” (A.3.56); Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1); Municipal Law (M.5); Non-Violation Claims, Article XXIII:1(b) of the GATT 1994 – “any measure” (N.2.2); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measure at issue (T.6.3)	201
	Legitimate expectation. <i>See</i> Interpretation (I.3)	
L.2	Licensing Agreement	205
	Like products. <i>See</i> National Treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first sentence – “like products” (N.1.3); National Treatment, Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – Regulatory discrimination, “Like products” (N.1.9.1); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “like products” (T.7.5)	

L.3	Lomé Convention	206
	M	207
M.1	Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, General (B.3.1); Jurisdiction, General (J.2.1); Municipal Law (M.5); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measure at issue (T.6.3)	207
	Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization. <i>See</i> WTO Agreement (W.4)	
	Matter referred to the DSB. <i>See</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	
	Measure at Issue. <i>See</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Request for Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Specific measures at issue (R.2.3); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measure at issue (T.6.3)	
	Measures affecting Trade in Services. <i>See</i> GATS, Article I (G.1.1)	
	Measures of the Kind. <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 (A.1.9–13)	
M.2	MFN Treatment. <i>See also</i> Enabling Clause (E.1); Tariff Quotas – Non-discriminatory Administration (T.2)	212
M.2.1	Article I of the GATT 1994	212
M.2.2	Article II of the GATS	213
M.2.3	Article 4 of the TRIPS Agreement	214
	Minimum Import Price. <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 (A.1.9–13)	
M.3	Mootness of Panel Findings as a Consequence of Appellate Body Ruling. <i>See also</i> Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3)	215
	Multiple Authentic Languages. <i>See</i> Interpretation (I.3)	
M.4	Multiple Complainants. <i>See also</i> Panel Reports, Separate panel reports (P.1.3)	216
M.5	Municipal Law. <i>See also</i> Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1)	217
	N	221
N.1	National Treatment	221
N.1.1	Article III:1 of the GATT 1994 – General Principle	221

N.1.2	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994 – Tax discrimination	222
N.1.3	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first sentence – “like products”	223
N.1.3.1	Scope of “like products”	223
N.1.3.2	Criteria. <i>See also</i> National Treatment, Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – Regulatory discrimination – Relation to Article III:2 (N.1.9.3); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “like products” (T.7.5)	224
N.1.4	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first sentence – “in excess of”	225
N.1.5	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994 – Notions of “like” and directly competitive or substitutable” products	225
N.1.6	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, second sentence – “directly competitive or substitutable” products. <i>See also</i> Directly Competitive or Substitutable Products (D.1); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6.2 – “directly competitive products” (T.7.4)	226
N.1.7	Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, second sentence – “not similarly taxed”	228
N.1.8	Article III:2 of the GATT, second sentence – “so as to afford protection”	230
N.1.9	Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – Regulatory discrimination	230
N.1.9.1	“Like products”	230
N.1.9.2	Relation to general principle in Article III:1	231
N.1.9.3	Relation to Article III:2	232
N.1.9.4	Likeness criteria	233
N.1.9.5	Evidence	236
N.1.10	Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – “affecting”	236
N.1.11	Article III:4 of the GATT 1994 – “less favourable treatment”	237
N.1.12	Relationship between Article III and Article XX	239
N.1.13	Article XVII of the GATS. <i>See also</i> MFN Treatment, Article II of the GATS (M.2.2)	240
N.1.14	Article 3.1 of the TRIPS Agreement	240
	Non-Discrimination. <i>See</i> Enabling Clause (E.1); MFN Treatment (M.2); National Treatment (N.1); Tariff Quotas – Non-discriminatory Administration (T.2)	
	Non-Governmental Organizations. <i>See</i> Amicus Curiae Briefs, Briefs submitted by NGOs (A.2.1)	
N.2	Non-Violation Claims. <i>See also</i> Interpretation, Legitimate expectations (I.3.5); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1)	242
N.2.1	Article XXIII:1(b) of the GATT 1994 – General	243
N.2.2	Article XXIII:1(b) of the GATT 1994 – “any measure”	243
	Notice of Appeal. <i>See</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of appeal (W.2.7)	

N.3	Nullification or Impairment. <i>See also</i> Non-Violation Claims (N.2)	244
	O	245
O.1	Objections. <i>See also</i> Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	245
	Objective assessment of the Matter. <i>See</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Scope of Appellate Review, Review of “objective assessment” by the panel – Article 11 of the DSU (S.3.2); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of appeal, Article 11 of the DSU – Allegation of the panel’s failure to objectively assess (W.2.7.6)	
	Omission to Act. <i>See</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1)	
	Ordinary Meaning. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Text (I.3.2)	
	P	248
P.1	Panel Reports	248
P.1.1	Basic rationale behind findings and conclusions. <i>See also</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Claims and Panel Reasoning (C.2); Standard of Review (S.7)	248
	Duty to address issues. <i>See</i> Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Judicial Economy (J.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Objections (O.1)	
P.1.2	Panel rulings not appealed. <i>See also</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU – Effect of DSB rulings in the original dispute (R.4.3)	250
P.1.3	Separate panel reports	251
	Status of GATT panel reports. <i>See</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU – Effect of DSB rulings in the original dispute (R.4.3); Status of Panel and Appellate Body Reports (S.8)	
	Panel Request. <i>See</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6)	
	Panels. <i>See</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Claims and Panel Reasoning (C.2); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Judicial Economy (J.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Panel Reports (P.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings (R.4); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Standard of Review (S.7); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Panels (W.3)	

P.2	Paris Convention (1967). <i>See also</i> TRIPS Agreement, Article 2.1 (T.9.2); TRIPS Agreement, Article 15.2 (T.9.4)	252
P.2.1	Article 6(1) – Trademarks	252
P.2.2	Article 6quinquies – Trademarks	253
P.2.3	Article 8 – Trade names	254
	Pass-Through of Indirect Subsidization. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	
	Patents. <i>See</i> TRIPS Agreement, Article 33 (T.9.7–9)	
P.3	Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law	254
P.3.1	Good faith – Pacta sunt servanda	254
P.3.2	Jura novit curia	258
P.3.3	Non-recognition of foreign expropriations	258
P.3.4	No retroactive application of treaties. <i>See also</i> Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations (T.5)	258
P.3.5	Precautionary principle. <i>See also</i> SPS Agreement, Article 5.7 – Precautionary principle (S.6.23)	260
P.3.6	Proportionality	261
P.4	Private Counsel Participation in Dispute Settlement Proceedings	262
P.5	Publication and Administration of Trade Regulations. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 3.1 (S.1.18–22); Safeguards Agreement, Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – General (S.1.45)	262
P.5.1	Article X:1 of the GATT 1994 – Publication of laws, regulations, judicial decisions and administrative rulings of general application	262
P.5.2	Article X:2 of the GATT 1994 – Publication of measures of general application	263
P.5.3	Article X:3 of the GATT 1994 – Uniform, impartial and reasonable administration	263
P.5.4	SPS Agreement, Annex B on “Transparency of SPS Regulations”, paragraph 1	263
R		265
	Refusal of a Party to Provide Information. <i>See</i> Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1)	
R.1	Regional Trade Agreements	265
R.1.1	Article XXIV:4 – Purpose of trade integration	265
R.1.2	Article XXIV:5 – Chapeau	265
R.1.3	Article XXIV:5(a) – Duties and other trade regulations on trade with non-parties “not on the whole” higher or more trade restrictive than prior to customs union formation	266

R.1.4	Article XXIV:8(a)(i) – Elimination of duties and other trade restrictions on “substantially all” internal trade	267
R.1.5	Article XXIV:8(a)(ii) – “substantially the same” duties and other regulations on external trade	267
R.1.6	Relationship between Article XXIV of the GATT 1994 and the Safeguards Agreement. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 2 – Parallelism (S.1.13)	268
R.2	Request for the Establishment of a Panel. <i>See also</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review (W.2)	269
R.2.1	Article 6.2 of the DSU – General	269
R.2.2	Article 6.2 of the DSU – Claims and legal basis of the complaint. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, General (B.3.1); Claims and Arguments (C.1); Claims and Panel Reasoning (C.2); Enabling Clause (E.1)	271
R.2.3	Article 6.2 of the DSU – Specific measures at issue. <i>See also</i> Legislation as such vs. Specific application (L.1); Mandatory and Discretionary Legislation (M.1); Terms of Reference of Panels, Specific measure at issue (T.6.3)	278
R.2.4	Article 6.2 of the DSU – “whether consultations were held”	280
	Resolution of a Dispute. <i>See</i> Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings (R.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 30 – Withdrawal (W.2.13)	
R.3	Retroactive Application of Trade Measures	281
R.4	Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings	281
R.4.1	Article 21.5 of the DSU – “measures taken to comply”	281
R.4.2	Article 21.5 of the DSU – “new claims”	283
R.4.3	Article 21.5 of the DSU – Effect of DSB rulings in the original dispute. <i>See also</i> Status of Panel and Appellate Body Reports (S.8)	285
	Review of Countervailing Duty Measures. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 21 (S.2.29–33)	288
R.5	Right to Bring Claims – Legal Interest	288
	S	290
S.1	Safeguards Agreement	290
S.1.1	General	290
S.1.2	Standard of Review. <i>See also</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6)	291
S.1.3	Article 2.1 – “like or directly competitive products”. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.1(c) – Domestic industry (S.1.25)	292

S.1.4	Article 2.1 – Domestic decision-making	293
S.1.5	Articles 2.1 and 4.1(c) – Territorial application of safeguard measure	293
S.1.6	Article 2.1 – Increased imports	293
S.1.7	Article 2.1 – Examination of trends	295
S.1.8	Article 2.1 – Decrease at the end of an investigation period	296
S.1.9	Article 2.1 – Increase relative to domestic production	297
S.1.10	Article 2.1 – Serious injury or threat thereof. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.1(b) – Threat of serious injury (S.1.24)	297
S.1.11	Article 2.1 – Causation. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 4.2(b) – Causation (S.1.29–32)	298
S.1.12	Article 2.1 – “under such conditions”	299
S.1.13	Article 2 – Parallelism	299
S.1.13.1	General	299
S.1.13.2	Prima facie case	300
S.1.14	Article 2 – “factors other than increased imports”	300
S.1.15	Article 2 – Separate determinations	301
S.1.16	Article 2.1, Footnote 1 – Customs union. <i>See also</i> Regional Trade Agreements, Relationship between Article XXIV of the GATT 1994 and the Safeguards Agreement (R.1.6)	302
S.1.17	Article 2.2 – Free trade area. <i>See also</i> Regional Trade Agreements, Relationship between Article XXIV of the GATT 1994 and the Safeguards Agreement (R.1.6)	303
S.1.18	Article 3.1 – General	304
S.1.19	Article 3.1 – Investigation	305
S.1.20	Article 3.1 – Multiple findings	306
S.1.21	Article 3.1 – Published report	307
S.1.22	Article 3.1 – Reasoned conclusions	308
S.1.23	Article 4.1(a) – Serious injury	309
S.1.24	Article 4.1(b) – Threat of serious injury. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 2.1 – Serious injury or threat thereof (S.1.10)	310
S.1.25	Article 4.1(c) – Domestic industry Article 4.2(a) – “increase in imports”. <i>See</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 2.1 – Increased imports (S.1.6)	311
S.1.26	Article 4.2(a) – Evaluation of relevant injury factors. <i>See also</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of whether the investigating authority’s explanation is reasoned and adequate (S.7.4)	313
S.1.27	Article 4.2(a) – Data for the injury evaluation	314
S.1.28	Article 4.2(a) – Injury data relating to the most recent past	316
S.1.29	Article 4.2(b) – Causation of injury by increased imports	316
S.1.30	Article 4.2(b) – Causation of injury by increased imports vs. other factors	317
S.1.31	Article 4.2(b) – Non-attribution of injury caused by other factors	318
S.1.32	Article 4.2(b) – Causation – assumptions regarding increased imports and injury	320

S.1.33	Article 4.2(c) – Publication of a detailed analysis. <i>See also</i> Safeguards Agreement, Article 3.1 – General (S.1.18); Safeguards Agreement, Relationship between Article XIX of the GATT 1994 and Article 3.1 of the Safeguards Agreement (S.1.46); Safeguards Agreement, Relationship between Article XIX of the GATT 1994 and Article 4.2(c) of the Safeguards Agreement (S.1.47)	321
S.1.34	Article 5.1 – Application of the safeguard measure to the extent necessary to prevent or remedy serious injury and to facilitate adjustment. <i>See also</i> Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, Proportionality (P.3.6)	322
S.1.35	Article 5.1 – Justification of the necessary extent of the application	322
S.1.36	Relationship between Articles 5.1 and 4.2(b) of the Safeguards Agreement	324
S.1.37	Article 5.2(b) – Quota modulation	326
S.1.38	Article 8.1 – Equivalent level of concessions	326
S.1.39	Article 9.1 – Exclusion of developing country Members from the application of safeguards	327
S.1.40	Article 12.1 – Immediate notification	328
S.1.41	Article 12.2 – Notification of all pertinent information	329
S.1.42	Article 12.3 – “adequate opportunity for prior consultations”	330
S.1.43	Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and the Anti-Dumping Agreement	332
S.1.44	Relationship between the Safeguards Agreement and the GATT 1994	333
S.1.45	Article XIX of the GATT – General. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 5 – Special safeguard (A.1.14); Safeguards Agreement, General (S.1.1); Textiles and Clothing Agreement, Article 6 – Transitional safeguard (T.7.1)	334
S.1.46	Relationship between Article XIX of the GATT 1994 and Article 3.1 of the Safeguards Agreement	335
S.1.47	Relationship between Article XIX of the GATT 1994 and Article 4.2(c) of the Safeguards Agreement	336
S.1.48	Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – “as a result of”	336
S.1.49	Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – “such product”	337
S.1.50	Article XIX of the GATT 1994 – “unforeseen developments”	338
	Schedules of Concessions. <i>See</i> Tariff Concessions (T.1)	
S.2	SCM Agreement	340
S.2.1	Object and Purpose	340
S.2.2	Article 1.1 – “subsidy”. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 15 – Determination of injury (S.2.25)	342
S.2.3	Article 1.1(a)(1) – “financial contribution”	343
S.2.4	Article 1.1(a)(1)(ii) – “government revenue . . . otherwise due”	344
S.2.5	Article 1.1(a)(1)(ii), Footnote 1 – Exemption from or remission of internal taxes upon exportation	345
S.2.6	Article 1.1(a)(1)(iii) – “Goods” provided by the government	346

S.2.7	Article 1.1(a)(1)(iii) – “Provision” of goods	347
S.2.8	Article 1.1(a)(1)(iv) – Payments to a funding mechanism	348
S.2.9	Article 1.1(b) – Conferral of a benefit to a recipient. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 14 – Chapeau – Calculation of the benefit to the “recipient” (S.2.22)	348
S.2.10	Article 1.1 – Pass-through of indirect subsidies. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article VI.3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	352
S.2.11	Article 3.1 – “except as provided in the Agreement on Agriculture”	353
S.2.12	Article 3.1(a) – “contingent, in law or in fact, . . . upon export performance”	353
S.2.13	Article 3.1(a) – Contingency in law	355
S.2.14	Article 3.1(a) – Contingency in fact	356
S.2.15	Article 3.1(b) – “contingent upon the use of domestic over imported products”	357
S.2.16	Article 3.1(b) – Contingent in law and contingent in fact	358
S.2.17	Article 4, paragraphs 1 to 4 – Consultations	359
S.2.18	Article 4.2 – “statement of available evidence”	360
S.2.19	Article 4.7 – “withdraw the subsidy without delay” Article 10 and Footnote 36 – Application of Article VI of the GATT 1994. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1 – Pass-through of indirect subsidies (S.2.10); SCM Agreement, Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43) Article 11 – Initiation and subsequent investigation. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 21.4 – Relationship with Articles 11 and 12 (S.2.33)	360
S.2.20	Article 11.4 – Initiation of an investigation	361
S.2.21	Article 11.9 – Termination of an investigation Article 12 – Evidence. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Article 21.4 – Relationship with Articles 11 and 12 (S.2.33)	361
S.2.22	Article 14 – Chapeau – Calculation of the benefit to the “recipient”. <i>See also</i> SCM Agreement, Article 1.1(b) – Conferral of a benefit to a recipient (S.2.9)	362
S.2.23	Article 14(d) – Calculation of adequacy of remuneration	363
S.2.24	Article 14(d) – Alternative benchmark for calculating the adequacy of remuneration	364
S.2.25	Article 15 – Determination of injury	367
S.2.26	Article 19.1 – Conditions for the imposition of countervailing duties	367
S.2.27	Article 19.3 – Imposition of countervailing duties on a non-discriminatory basis after aggregate investigation	367
S.2.28	Article 19.4 – Calculation of countervailing duty rates on per unit basis	369
S.2.29	Article 21 – Duration and review of countervailing duties	369
S.2.30	Article 21.1 – “only as long and to the extent necessary”	369
S.2.31	Article 21.2 – Review of the need for continued imposition	370
S.2.32	Article 21.3 – Termination of countervailing duties unless continued or recurrent subsidization and injury likely	372

S.2.33	Article 21.4 – Relationship with Articles 11 and 12	374
S.2.34	Article 22 – Public notice and explanation of determinations	374
S.2.35	Article 27 – Special and differential treatment for developing country Members	375
S.2.35.1	Paragraph 4 – Phase-out or standstill of export subsidies	375
S.2.35.2	Paragraphs 10 and 11 – Higher <i>de minimis</i> subsidization threshold	376
S.2.36	Article 32.1 – Specific action against a subsidy. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 18.1 – Specific action against dumping (A.3.61); SCM Agreement, Article 1.1 – Pass-through of indirect subsidies (S.2.10); SCM Agreement, Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies (S.2.43)	376
	Article 32.3 – Temporal Scope of Application. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement, Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994 (S.2.41); Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations, SCM Agreement (T.5.1)	
	Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Items (c) and (d). <i>See</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 9.1(c) – Governmental action vs. Private action (A.1.25)	
S.2.37	Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (e), footnote 59, first sentence – “remission or deferral of direct taxes”	379
S.2.38	Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (e), footnote 59, fifth sentence – “double taxation”	379
S.2.39	Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (j) – Export credit guarantee or insurance. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 9.1(c) – Governmental action vs. Private action (A.1.25)	382
S.2.40	Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (k) – Export credits. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 9.1(c) – Governmental action vs. Private action (A.1.25); SCM Agreement, Illustrative List of Export Subsidies: Item (j) (S.2.39)	383
	Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the Anti-Dumping Agreement. <i>See</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Relationship between the Anti-Dumping Agreement and the SCM Agreement (A.3.63)	
S.2.41	Relationship between the SCM Agreement and the GATT 1994	384
S.2.42	Article III:8 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies	387
S.2.43	Article VI:3 of the GATT 1994 – Subsidies. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 18.1 – Specific action against dumping (A.3.61); SCM Agreement, Article 1.1 – Pass-through of indirect subsidies (S.2.10); SCM Agreement, Article 32.1 – Specific action against a subsidy (S.2.36)	387
S.3	Scope of Appellate Review. <i>See also</i> Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3); Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Conditional Appeals (C.5); Judicial Economy (J.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU	

	(S.7.2–6); Terms of Reference of Panels (T.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review (W.2)	388
S.3.1	General	388
S.3.2	Review of “objective assessment” by the panel – Article 11 of the DSU. <i>See also</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6)	390
S.3.3	Issues of law vs. Issues of fact. <i>See also</i> Completion of the Legal Analysis by the Appellate Body (C.4); Mootness of Panel Findings as a Consequence of Appellate Body Rulings (M.3)	391
S.4	Seek Information and Technical Advice. <i>See also</i> Amicus Curiae briefs (A.2); Burden of Proof (B.3); Evidence (E.3); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU) (S.7.2–6)	394
	Separate Panel Reports. <i>See</i> Panel Reports, Separate Panel Reports (P.1.3)	
	Special and Differential Treatment. <i>See</i> Enabling Clause (E.1); SCM Agreement, Article 27 – Special and differential treatment for developing country Members (S.2.35)	
S.5	Special or Additional Rules and Procedures for Dispute Settlement. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17 (A.3.54)	399
S.6	SPS Agreement	400
S.6.1	Difference between the appropriate level of protection and the SPS measure chosen to implement. <i>See also</i> SPS Agreement, Article 5 (S.6.9–23)	400
S.6.2	Article 2 – Basic rights and obligations. <i>See also</i> SPS Agreement, Article 5.1 (S.6.9–14)	402
S.6.3	Article 2.2 – “sufficient scientific evidence”. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, Presumption – prima facie case (B.3.2); SPS Agreement, Article 5.1 (S.6.9–14); SPS Agreement, Article 5.7 (S.6.19–23)	402
S.6.4	Article 2.3 – “not arbitrarily or unjustifiably discriminate between Members where identical or similar conditions prevail”. <i>See also</i> SPS Agreement, Article 5.5 (S.6.15–17)	404
S.6.5	Article 3 – Level of protection and harmonization of SPS measures	404
S.6.6	Article 3.1 – “measures based on . . . international standards”	405
S.6.7	Article 3.2 – “measures which conform to international standards”	406
S.6.8	Article 3.3 – “measures which result in a higher level of . . . protection”	406
S.6.9	Article 5.1 and Annex A, paragraph 4 – Concept of risk assessment	407
S.6.10	Article 5.1 – Ascertainable risk	409
S.6.11	Article 5.1 – Types of risk assessment	410
S.6.12	Article 5.1 – Degree of risk	410
S.6.13	Articles 5.1 and 5.2 – Risk assessment – specific to the risk identified	411
S.6.14	Article 5.1 – Requirement to base measure on the risk assessment	413
S.6.15	Article 5.5 – consistency in the application of the appropriate level of protection	414

S.6.16	Article 5.5 – “distinctions in the level of protection in different situations”	415
S.6.17	Article 5.5 – “result in discrimination or a disguised restriction”	416
S.6.18	Article 5.6 – Not more trade restrictive than required to achieve the appropriate level of protection	417
S.6.19	Article 5.7 – Provisional adoption of SPS measures	418
S.6.20	Article 5.7 – “where relevant scientific evidence is insufficient”	419
S.6.21	Article 5.7 – “seek to obtain additional information”	419
S.6.22	Article 5.7 – “review . . . within a reasonable period of time”	420
S.6.23	Article 5.7 – Precautionary principle	420
S.6.24	Annex B on “Transparency of SPS Regulations”, paragraph 1 – “publication of laws, decrees or ordinances”	421
S.7	Standard of Review. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 17.6 – Standard of Review under the Anti-Dumping Agreement (A.3.58); Safeguards Agreement, General (S.1.1); Scope of Appellate Review (S.3); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of appeal (W.2.7)	421
S.7.1	General	421
S.7.2	Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of the matter	424
S.7.3	Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of the facts	425
S.7.4	Article 11 of the DSU – Objective assessment of whether the investigating authority’s examination is reasoned and adequate	430
S.7.5	Article 11 of the DSU – No de novo review	431
S.7.6	Article 11 of the DSU – Temporal scope of review	433
	Standing. <i>See</i> Right to Bring Claims – Legal Interest (R.5)	
S.8	Status of Panel and Appellate Body Reports. <i>See also</i> Panel Reports (P.1); Review of Implementation of DSB Rulings, Article 21.5 of the DSU – Effect of DSB rulings in original dispute (R.4.3)	434
	Subsequent Practice. <i>See</i> Interpretation (I.3)	
	Subsidies. <i>See</i> SCM Agreement (S.2)	
	Supplementary Means of Interpretation. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Supplementary means of interpretation – Article 32 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.10)	
S.9	Suspension of Concessions or Other Obligations	436
	T	437
T.1	Tariff Concessions	437
T.1.1	Article II:1 of the GATT 1994. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 4.2 and Footnote 1 (A.1.9–13)	437
T.1.2	Interpretation and clarification of tariff concessions	438

T.1.3	Relationship between Schedules of concessions and the GATT 1994	439
T.2	Tariff Quotas – Non-Discriminatory Administration. <i>See also</i> Agreement on Agriculture, Article 4.1 – Market access commitments contained in Schedules (A.1.8); Licensing Agreement (L.2); Waivers (W.1)	441
T.3	Taxation. <i>See also</i> National treatment, Article III:2 of the GATT 1994, first and second sentences (N.1.3–8)	442
T.4	TBT Agreement	443
T.4.1	Annex 1.1 – “technical regulation” definition	443
T.4.2	Annex 1.2 – Standards	446
	Article 2.2 – “not be more trade-restrictive than necessary to fulfil a legitimate objective”. <i>See</i> TBT Agreement, Article 2.4 – “international standards . . . as a basis for technical regulations” (T.4.3)	
T.4.3	Article 2.4 – “international standards . . . as a basis for technical regulation”. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, General (B.3.1); Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations, TBT Agreement (T.5.3)	446
T.4.4	Article 2.4 – “except when such international standards or relevant parts would be an ineffective or inappropriate means”	447
T.4.5	Article 2.4 – Preparation, adoption and continued application of existing regulations	448
T.5	Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations. <i>See also</i> WTO Agreement, Article XVI:4 – WTO-conformity of laws, regulations and administrative procedures (W.4.3)	449
T.5.1	SCM Agreement	449
T.5.2	SPS Agreement	449
T.5.3	TBT Agreement. <i>See also</i> Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, No retroactive application of treaties (P.3.4)	450
	TRIPS Agreement. <i>See</i> TRIPS Agreement, Article 70 (T.9.11–15)	
T.6	Terms of Reference of Panels. <i>See also</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1); Claims and Panel Reasoning (C.2); Competence of Panels and the Appellate Body (C.3); Judicial Economy (J.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel (R.2); Standard of Review – General (S.7.1)	450
T.6.1	General	450
T.6.2	Claims and legal basis of the complaint. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof, General (B.3.1); Claims and Arguments (C.1); Enabling Clause (E.1); Judicial Economy (J.1); Jurisdiction (J.2); Request for the Establishment of a Panel, Article 6.2 of the DSU – Claims and legal basis of the complaint (R.2.2)	453
T.6.3	Specific measure at issue. <i>See also</i> Burden of Proof (B.3); Jurisdiction (J.2); Legislation as such vs. Specific Application (L.1); Mandatory	

	and Discretionary Legislation (M.1); Request for the Establishment of a Panel – Specific measures at issue (R.2.3)	459
	Text. <i>See</i> Interpretation (I.3)	
T.7	Textiles and Clothing Agreement	460
T.7.1	Article 6 – Transitional safeguard	460
T.7.2	Article 6.2 – “determination”	461
T.7.3	Article 6.2 – “domestic industry”	461
T.7.4	Article 6.2 – “directly competitive products”. <i>See also</i> Directly Competitive or Substitutable Products (D.1)	462
T.7.5	Article 6.2 – “like products”	463
T.7.6	Article 6.4 – Attribution of serious damage. <i>See also</i> Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, Proportionality (P.3.6)	463
T.7.7	Article 6.10 – No backdating of safeguard	465
T.7.8	Article 6.11 – Provisional application of a safeguard	466
T.8	Third Party Rights. <i>See also</i> Amicus Curiae Briefs, Briefs submitted by WTO Members (A.2.2); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 24 – Third participants (W.2.9)	466
	Trademarks. <i>See</i> Paris Convention (1967), Articles 6(1) and 6(quinquies) (P.2.1–2); TRIPS Agreement, Articles 15 and 16 (T.9.3–6)	
	Trade Names. <i>See</i> Paris Convention (1967), Article 8 (P.2.3); TRIPS Agreement, Article 2.1 (T.9.2)	
	Transparency. <i>See</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6); Inferences Drawn from the Refusal of a Party to Provide Information (I.1); Publication and Administration of Trade Regulations (P.5); Seek Information and Technical Advice (S.4)	
	Treaties Incorporated into the TRIPS Agreement. <i>See</i> Paris Convention (1967) (P.2)	
T.9	TRIPS Agreement	468
T.9.1	Article 1.2 – Definition of “intellectual property”	468
T.9.2	Article 2.1 – Intellectual Property Law Conventions. <i>See also</i> Paris Convention (1967) (P.2)	468
	Article 3.1 – National treatment. <i>See</i> National Treatment, Article 3.1 of the TRIPS Agreement (N.1.14)	
	Article 4 – MFN treatment. <i>See</i> MFN Treatment, Article 4 of the TRIPS Agreement (M.2.3)	
T.9.3	Article 15.1 – Trademarks – “protectable subject-matter”	469
T.9.4	Article 15.2 – Trademarks – Denial of protection on other grounds	470
T.9.5	Article 16.1 – Trademarks – Exclusive rights conferred on the owner	470
T.9.6	Article 16.1 – Trademarks – Determination of ownership	471

T.9.7	Article 33 – Patents – “term of protection”	471
T.9.8	Article 33 – Relationship with Article 62.2	472
T.9.9	Article 33 – Relationship with Article 70.2	473
T.9.10	Article 42 – Civil and administrative procedures and remedies	473
T.9.11	Article 70 – Relationship between paragraphs 1 and 2	475
T.9.12	Article 70.1 – Acts which occurred before the date of TRIPS application	476
T.9.13	Article 70.2 – “protection of existing subject-matter”	477
T.9.14	Article 70.8(a) – Filing of “mailbox” applications	477
T.9.15	Article 70.9 – Exclusive marketing rights	478
	V	479
	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	479
	Article 26 – Pacta sunt servanda. <i>See</i> Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, Good faith – Pacta sunt servanda (P.3.1)	
	Article 28 – Non-retroactivity of treaties. <i>See</i> Principles and Concepts of General Public International Law, No retroactive application of treaties (P.3.4); Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations (T.5)	
	Article 31. <i>See</i> Interpretation, General rules of treaty interpretation – Article 31 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.1)	
	Article 32. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Supplementary means of interpretation – Article 32 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.10)	
	Article 33. <i>See</i> Interpretation, Multiple authentic languages – Article 33 of the Vienna Convention (I.3.11)	
	W	480
W.1	Waivers	480
	Withdrawal of an Appeal. <i>See</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 30 – Withdrawal (W.2.13)	
W.2	Working Procedures for Appellate Review	481
W.2.1	General	481
W.2.2	Rule 3.1 – Decision making	481
W.2.3	Rule 3.2 – Concurring opinion – Article 17.11 of the DSU	481
W.2.4	Rule 8 – Rules of conduct – confidentiality. <i>See also</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6)	482
W.2.5	Rule 13 – Replacement of Appellate Body Member on Division. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 16 – Process (W.2.6)	482
W.2.6	Rule 16 – Process. <i>See also</i> Amicus Curiae Briefs, Additional Procedure (A.2.3); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 26 – Working Schedule (W.2.10); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 27 – Oral hearing (W.2.11)	483
W.2.7	Rule 20 – Notice of appeal	486
W.2.7.1	General	486

W.2.7.2	Content. <i>See also</i> Claims and Arguments (C.1)	487
W.2.7.3	Insufficient notice	488
W.2.7.4	Amendment. <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 30 – Withdrawal, Withdrawal and re-filing notice of appeal (W.2.13.1)	489
W.2.7.5	Article 11 of the DSU – Allegation of the panel’s failure to objectively assess. <i>See also</i> Standard of Review, Article 11 of the DSU (S.7.2–6)	489
W.2.8	Rule 23 – Multiple appeals – (cross appeal). <i>See also</i> Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 20 – Notice of appeal (W.2.7)	491
W.2.9	Rule 24 – Third participants. <i>See also</i> Third Party Rights (T.8); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 26 – Working schedule (W.2.10); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 27 – Oral hearing (W.2.11)	491
W.2.10	Rule 26 – Working schedule	494
W.2.10.1	Extension of deadline for submissions of participants or third participants	494
W.2.10.2	Extension of deadline for circulation of Appellate Body Report	495
W.2.11	Rule 27 – Oral hearing. <i>See also</i> Business Confidential Information (B.4); Confidentiality (C.6)	496
W.2.11.1	Change of date	496
W.2.11.2	Joint oral hearing	497
W.2.12	Rule 28 – Written responses	497
W.2.13	Rule 30 – Withdrawal	499
W.2.13.1	Withdrawal and re-filing notice of appeal	499
W.2.13.2	Withdrawal of appeal	501
	Rules of Conduct – Annex II. <i>See</i> Confidentiality (C.6); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 3 (W.2.2–3); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 8 (W.2.4); Working Procedures for Appellate Review, Rule 27 (W.2.11)	
W.3	Working Procedures for Panels	502
W.4	WTO Agreement. <i>See also</i> GATT 1994, Language of Annex 1A incorporating the GATT 1994 into the WTO Agreement (G.2.1); Temporal Application of Rights and Obligations (T.5)	504
W.4.1	Preamble	504
	Article IX – Decision-making. <i>See</i> Waivers (W.1)	
W.4.2	Article XV:1 – Relevance to GATT 1947 decisions, procedures and customary practices	504
W.4.3	Article XVI:4 – WTO-conformity of laws, regulations and administrative procedures. <i>See also</i> Anti-Dumping Agreement, Article 18.4 – Ensure conformity of domestic anti-dumping laws, regulations and procedures (A.3.62)	505
	Part II Arbitration Awards under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU	
ARB.1	Mandate of Arbitrator Under Article 21.3(c)	509

ARB.2	Prompt Compliance	512
ARB.3	Withdrawal or Modification of the Measure	514
ARB.3.1	General	514
ARB.3.2	Panel Recommendations	515
ARB.4	“Reasonable Period of Time”	516
ARB.4.1	General	516
ARB.4.2	15 month guideline	517
ARB.4.3	Shortest period possible within a Member’s legal system	519
ARB.5	“Particular Circumstances”	521
ARB.5.1	General	521
ARB.5.2	Actions taken since DSB adoption of Report(s)	524
ARB.5.3	Complexity of implementing measures	525
ARB.5.4	Complexity of implementation process	526
ARB.5.5	Relevance of contentiousness	529
ARB.5.6	Means of implementation	532
ARB.5.7	Structural adjustment	535
ARB.5.8	Economic and financial collapse	536
ARB.5.9	Economic impact of existing measure. <i>See also</i> Relevance of contentiousness (ARB.5.5)	537
ARB.5.10	Developing countries	538
ARB.5.11	Calendar of Legislative Body	540
ARB.6	Burden of Proof	541
Annexes		
Annex A	Terms of Office of Current and Former Appellate Body Members	545
Annex B	Biographies of Current Appellate Body Members	547
Annex C	Information on Appellate Body Reports	552
Annex D	Arbitration Awards under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU: 1997–2003	562
Annex E	Articles of Covered Agreements Addressed in Appellate Body Reports	564
Annex F	Working Procedures for Appellate Review	578
Abbreviations used in the Table of References to the Covered Agreements and other Instruments and in the Indexes		599
Table of References to the Covered Agreements and other Instruments by Article		600
Subject Index		611
Subject Index by Case (Appellate Body Reports)		662
Subject Index by Case (Arbitration Awards under Article 21.3(c) of the DSU)		732