## CONTENTS

Preface vii

#### INTRODUCTION 1

What is Art Criticism? 1
The Search for Standard Features 3
Distinctions and Overlaps between Art Criticism and Related Activities 5
Art Criticism's Place in the Larger Field of Criticism 7
What Can Art Criticism Offer? 10
The Influence and Legitimacy of Criticism 13
Critics and Responsibilities 15
Who are Art Critics? 18
Conclusions 21

BOND STEEL AND THE RESIDENCE AND THE PARTY OF THE PARTY O

## Chapter 1 A HISTORY OF ART CRITICISM 23

The Birth of a Genre 23 Early Voices in Art Criticism 25 Diderot and the Specter of Censorship English Art Criticism in the Later 1700s 31 Politics with a Vengeance 32 Romanticism versus Neoclassicism 34 English Criticism: Hazlitt and Ruskin 36 The Development of French Modernism 39 The Rise of Formalist Criticism 44 Paris in the Early 1900s 47 European Criticism between the Wars 49 American Criticism Comes of Age 50 Abstract Expressionism and Harold Rosenberg 55 ARTnews and the Poet-Critics 57 Clement Greenberg and the Return of Formalism 59 1960s Formalism and Artforum 61 Emerging Alternatives to Formalism 63 Reenter Politics 65 Early Feminist Criticism 67 Neo-Marxism and October 69 The 1980s and the Culture Wars 71 Festivalism, Globalism, and Institutional Critique Art Criticism since 2000 77 Conclusions 80

### Chapter 2 DESCRIPTION AND CONTEXTUALIZATION 82

General Issues Involving Description 82

The Act of Description and Its Aims 82

Strategies of Description 83

Internal and External Evidence 85

Internal Evidence: The Medium and Formal Elements 87

Internal Evidence: Subject Matter and Content 91

External Evidence: Title, Price, Materials, and Intention 93 External Evidence: The Artist's Experiences, Categories,

and Historical Context 97

External Evidence: Physical Context and Crowd Responses 100

External Evidence: Personal Responses 101

Complexities Involving Description 103

**Evocative Description 103** 

Difficulties in Rendering the Visual in Verbal Terms 105

Description as Interpretation 107

The Costs of a Poor Description 109

Conclusions 110

### Chapter 3 INTERPRETATION AND ANALYSIS 113

General Issues Involving Interpretation 113

Relations—and Distinctions—between Description

and Interpretation 113

Criticism as Retrieval and as Revision 116

Judging Interpretations 118

Opposition to—and Support for—Interpretation 119

Interpretation and Intentionality 120

Interpretations Involving Internal and External Evidence 123

Iconographic Interpretation 124

Formal Analysis 125

Phenomenological Interpretation 126

The Status of External Evidence 127

Biographical Interpretation 128

Historicizing Interpretation: The Zeitgeist 130

Historicizing Interpretation: Cultural Context 131

Critical Theory and Systematic Interpretations 134

Psychoanalytic Interpretation 134

Feminist Interpretation 137

Marxist Interpretation 140

Structuralist and Semiotic Interpretation 143

Poststructuralist Interpretations 146

Conclusions 148

## Chapter 4 JUDGMENT AND EVALUATION 152

The Place of Judgment in Criticism 152

Changing Attitudes about Judgment 153

The Contributions of Hume and Kant 155

Challenges to—and Revisions of—Kant 157

Claims about Universal and Personal Criteria 160

Early Examples of Common Criteria 162

Changing Criteria in the Nineteenth Century 165

Originality and Expressiveness Become Common Criteria 167

Early-Twentieth-Century Criteria 168

Recent Variations in the Use of Criteria 171

Forms of Judgment and Related Issues 174

Positive Judgment 175

Negative Judgment 177
Complexities Involving Judgment 182
Conclusions 185

# Chapter 5 INDIVIDUAL CRITICAL STYLES: TONE AND VOICE 188

External Factors Affecting Criticism 188
Deadlines 188
Word and Space Limits 190
Contextual Considerations 192
Considerations of Audience 194

Institutional Ideologies 197
Tone, Voice, and the Relevance of External Factors

The Creation of Tone: Word Choice 202

The Creation of Tone: Person 204

The Creation of Tone: Punctuation 208

The Creation of Tone: Tense 210

The Creation of Tone: Syntax and Sentence Structure 210

The Creation of Tone: Further Strategies 212

Debates About Tone 213

Should Art Criticism Match Its Subject in Tone? 214
How Clear Should Art Criticism Be? 215
Conclusions 218

#### **CONCLUSION 221**

#### ANTHOLOGY 223

Denis Diderot, Selections from the Salons of 1765 and 1767 223 Charles Baudelaire, Selections from the Salon of 1846 235 John Ruskin, "Conclusion: Modern Art and Modern Criticism" (1843) 246 Guillaume Apollinaire, Two Articles on Picasso (1905) 253 Royal Cortissoz, "The Post-Impressionist Illusion" (1913) 256 Harold Rosenberg, "The American Action Painters" (1952) 259 Leo Steinberg, "Month in Review" (1956) 265 Hilton Kramer, "Critics of American Painting" (1959) 269 Clement Greenberg, "Modernist Painting" (1960) 274 Michael Fried, "Art and Objecthood" (1967) 279 Lucy Lippard, "The Women Artists' Movement-What Next?" (1975) 290 The Editors of October, "About October" (1976) 293 Suzi Gablik, "Beyond the Rectangle, Out of the Frame" (1995) 295 James Elkins, Excerpt from What Happened to art Criticism? (2003) 302

Glossary 310
Bibliography 326
Index 339