

# Contents

---

<i>Preface</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xiii
<i>Table of cases</i>	xxxi
<i>Table of legislation</i>	xxxiv
 <b>1 Introduction</b>	 <b>1</b>
1.1 The importance of WTO oversight of government trade measures	1
1.2 Conceptual foundations of standards of review	4
1.2.1 The definition of standards of review	4
1.2.2 Types of standards	6
1.2.3 Review of facts versus law	8
1.2.4 Rationales for standards of review	10
1.2.5 Standards applied in other relevant jurisdictions	12
A Australia	13
B The United States	15
C France	18
D The European Court of Justice	20
E Selected international dispute settlement bodies	24
F Assessment of other legal systems	25
1.3 Application of standards of review in the WTO	27
1.3.1 Relevancy, definitions and application	27
1.3.2 Institutional considerations and limitations within the WTO system	30
1.3.3 Usefulness of the domestic law analogy	32
1.4 Argument, methodology and chapter outlines	33
1.4.1 Summary of argument	33
1.4.2 Methodology	34
1.4.3 Chapter outlines	35



<b>2</b>	<b>The development of the WTO standard of review</b>	<b>36</b>
2.1	Introduction	36
2.2	The General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1947	37
2.2.1	GATT 1947	37
2.2.2	Tokyo Round Codes	40
2.2.3	GATT panel decisions	42
2.3	The Uruguay Round negotiations	44
2.4	The World Trade Organization	47
2.4.1	Decisions prior to <i>EC-Hormones</i>	47
2.4.2	<i>EC-Hormones</i>	49
2.4.3	Post <i>EC-Hormones</i>	52
2.4.4	The anti-dumping standard of review	59
2.5	Conclusion	65
<b>3</b>	<b>Alternative models and principles for the development of a WTO standard of review</b>	<b>66</b>
3.1	Introduction	66
3.2	Alternative standard of review models	68
3.2.1	The sovereignty perspective and Chevron analogy	68
3.2.2	The ‘deliberation test’	72
3.2.3	The ‘reasonable regulator’ test	75
3.2.4	<i>De novo</i> review	79
3.2.5	A flexible standard of review	81
3.2.6	Other theoretical approaches: constitutionalization and harmonization	83
3.2.7	Deference based upon a ‘margin of appreciation’ or ‘policy space’	86
3.3	Identification of principles for the development of a WTO standard of review	87
3.3.1	Relevant principles	90
3.3.2	Developing a standard that supports the key aims of WTO dispute settlement	91
3.3.3	Ensuring adjudicative legitimacy	94
3.3.4	Developing appropriate procedures	96
	A Scope of fact-finding and expertise	97
	B Efficiency	97
	C Procedural fairness	98
3.4	Conclusion	99



<b>4</b>	<b>A new general standard of review</b>	<b>100</b>
4.1	Introduction	100
4.2	Features of a new general standard of review	102
4.2.1	The requirement to examine all available and sufficient evidence	103
4.2.2	The requirement to conduct a comprehensive review	108
4.2.3	Treatment of facts and law	112
4.3	Justifications for a new general standard of review	114
4.3.1	The legal basis for developing a new standard of review	115
4.3.2	Assessment against relevant standard of review principles	118
4.3.3	Brief assessment against other standards of review	121
4.3.4	The relationship with Article 17.6 of the Anti-Dumping Agreement	123
4.4	Conclusion	125
<b>5</b>	<b>Modification of the general standard of review</b>	<b>127</b>
5.1	Introduction	127
5.2	The application of a specific standard of review	130
5.2.1	The threshold test for the modification of the general standard of review	130
5.2.2	The method of construction of a specific standard of review	138
5.2.3	The treatment of facts and law	143
5.3	Justifications for a specific standard of review	145
5.3.1	General arguments for and against a specific standard of review	146
5.3.2	The legal basis for a specific standard of review	148
5.3.3	Assessment against relevant standard of review principles	150
5.3.4	Brief assessment against other standards of review	152
5.4	Conclusion	154
<b>6</b>	<b>The application of a new standard of review to the Trade Remedy Agreements</b>	<b>155</b>
6.1	Introduction	155
6.2	Factual and legal issues in reviewing trade remedies	157
6.3	The Anti-Dumping Agreement	158
6.3.1	Key concepts and obligations	158
6.3.2	The role of Article 17.6	161



6.3.3	The application of the new standard to the Anti-Dumping Agreement	163
6.4	The Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures	169
6.4.1	Key concepts and obligations	169
6.4.2	The application of the new standard to the SCM Agreement	171
6.5	The Safeguards Agreement	174
6.5.1	Key concepts and obligations	174
6.5.2	The application of the new standard to the Safeguards Agreement	177
6.6	Comparison of the new standard with the current standard applied in trade remedy disputes	179
6.6.1	The Anti-Dumping Agreement	179
6.6.2	The SCM Agreement	180
6.6.3	The Safeguards Agreement	182
6.7	Conclusion	183
<b>7</b>	<b>The application of a new standard of review to selected non-trade remedy agreements</b>	<b>185</b>
7.1	Introduction	185
7.2	Uniformity of the standard of review in non-trade remedy agreements	187
7.3	The agreement on sanitary and phytosanitary measures	188
7.3.1	Key concepts and obligations	188
7.3.2	The application of the new standard to the SPS Agreement	191
7.4	The agreement on technical barriers to trade	199
7.4.1	Key concepts and obligations	199
7.4.2	The application of the new standard to the TBT Agreement	201
7.5	The General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994	205
7.5.1	Key concepts and obligations	205
7.5.2	The application of the new standard to GATT 1994	207
7.6	Comparison of the new standard with the current standard applied to non-trade remedy disputes	209
7.6.1	The SPS Agreement	209
7.6.2	The TBT Agreement	211
7.6.3	GATT 1994	212
7.7	Conclusion	213



<b>8 Conclusion</b>	214
8.1 Overview of this work	214
8.1.1 Critique and contentions	214
8.1.2 Summary of chapters	216
8.2 Directions for future research	223
8.3 The significance of the standard of review issue for the WTO: concluding remarks	226
<i>Bibliography</i>	228
<i>Index</i>	243