## CONTENTS

List of figures and tables

	Preface and acknowledgements xvii
	Table of GATT 1947 Reports xix
	Table of WTO Reports xxi
	List of abbreviations xxvi
	Introduction 1
I	Foundations: the relevance of NPA measures at the
	interface of domestic regulation, economic globalization
	and world trade law 7
1	Setting the stage for legal analysis 11
	1.1 Brief introduction to the topic 11
	1.2 The crucial cases 13
	1.2.1 Tuna-Dolphin I (1991) 13 1.2.2 Tuna-Dolphin II (1994) 15
	1.2.2 Tuna-Dolphin II (1994) 13 1.2.3 Shrimp Turtle (1998) 16
	1.2.3.1 The Panel Report 17
	1.2.3.2 The Appellate Body Report 18
	1.2.3.3 Shrimp Turtle - Article 21.5 (2001) 20
	1.3 Overview of the PPM debate 20
	1.3.1 Emergence of the PPM debate 21
	1.3.2 Developments in academia and practice 22
	1.3.3 Concepts and terms central to the 'PPM debate' 25
	1.3.3.1 The product-process distinction 25
	1.3.3.2 Processes and production methods 27
	1.3.3.3 'Product-related' and 'non-product-related' PPMs 28
	1.3.4 Unanswered questions and legal uncertainty 29
	1.4 Identification of key legal issues 31
	1.4.1 Customs tariffs 32 1.4.1.1 Article II 32
	1.4.1.1 Article if 32 1.4.1.2 The relevance of international rules 33
	1.4.1.2 The relevance of international rules  1.4.1.2 Obligation to most-favoured-nation treatment  35
	1.4.2 Import prohibitions or other quantitative restrictions 36

	1.4.3 Non-tax internal regulation 38
	1.4.4 Internal taxes and other internal charges 39
	1.4.4.1 Indirect taxation and NPAs 40
	1.4.4.2 Direct taxes and NPAs 43
	1.4.5 Border tax adjustment 43
	1.4.5.1 Imports 44
	1.4.5.2 Exports 45
	1.4.6 Anti-dumping duties 46
	1.4.7 Subsidies 48
	1.4.7.1 Subsidies linked to NPAs 48
	1.4.7.2 Low standards as illegitimate subsidization 51
	1.4.8 General exceptions 52
	1.4.8.1 The particular exceptions 53
	1.4.8.2 The introductory provision of Article XX 54
	1.4.9 Technical barriers to trade and sanitary and
	phytosanitary measures 55
	1.4.10 Summary 56
	1.5 Delineation and foundations of the legal analysis 57
	1.5.1 Scope of the analysis 57
	1.5.1.1 General object of research: trade in goods 57
	1.5.1.2 Scope of the legal analysis 60
	1.5.2 Terms and concepts 61
	1.5.2.1 NPA measures 61
	1.5.2.2 Processes and production methods or 'PPMs' 62
2	D 44 41 1 1 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4
2	Putting the debate into perspective: analysis of the
	socio-economic context 64
	2.1 National regulation and NPAs 65
	2.1.1 Overview of regulation 66
	2.1.1.1 General domestic regulation 66
	2.1.1.2 The notion of social regulation 68
	2.1.1.3 Different modes of regulation 70
	2.1.2 Differences and similarities in regulatory cultures: the example of the
	United States and Europe 74
	2.1.2.1 Regulation in the United States 75
	2.1.2.2 Regulation in Western Europe 78
	2.1.2.3 Assessment of differences and similarities 81
	2.1.3 The economic case for state intervention 83
	2.1.3.1 Basic considerations on free markets and the economic
	role of governments 84
	2.1.3.2 Categories of economic rationales for regulation 86
	2.1.3.2.1 Regulation to safeguard competitive markets 8
	2.1.3.2.2 Regulation addressing market failure 88
	2.1.3.2.3 Regulation in pursuit of distributional or
	social objectives 90
	2.1.3.3 Preliminary conclusion 91

	2.2.2.1 The general debate on domestic regulation 100 2.2.2.2 NPA measures and international trade in goods 103 2.2.3 Political arguments in the international debate 104 2.2.3.1 Effective and efficient protection of national or foreign objects 104 2.2.3.2 Sovereignty and extraterritoriality 106 2.2.3.3 Unilateralism 108	98
	2.2.3.4 Competitiveness and effective regulation 110 2.2.3.5 Summary 113	
I	Legal analysis: reviewing the status of NPA measures  de lege lata 115	
	Preliminary considerations: applicability of WTO law and other international law to NPA measures 119 3.1 Applicability of WTO law to NPA measures 120 3.2 The relevance of conventional international law in WTO dispute settlement 121 3.2.1 No closed self-contained regime 122 3.2.2 General applicability of international law 124 3.2.3 Conflicts with other international treaties and instruments 3.2.3.1 Existence of a conflict of norms 128 3.2.3.2 Applicable conflict rules 132 3.2.3.2.1 Asymmetrical conflicts 134 3.2.3.3 Conflicts of norms, NPAs and the example of CITES 138 3.3 NPA measures and the law on state responsibility 140	8
	3.4 Conclusion 145	
	Consistency with GATT obligations 147	
	4.1 The scope of the national treatment obligations 4.1.1 The use of specific terms 150 4.1.1.1 Narrow interpretation: products 151 4.1.1.2 Broad interpretation: 'affecting' 152 4.1.1.3 Preliminary conclusion 155 4.1.2 Comparison of Article III:2 and 4 156 4.1.3 Measures 'of the same nature' 158 4.1.4 Summary and conclusion 161	

4.2 The principle of non-discrimination and the 'like products' concept 162	
4.2.1 Introduction to the principle of non-discrimination 162	
4.2.1.1 General problems inherent to the principle 163	
4.2.1.2 Clear prohibition of origin-based discrimination 165	
4.2.1.3 Non-discrimination and NPAs 167	
4.2.2 Interpreting the 'like products' concept with special consideration	
of NPAs 168	
4.2.2.1 The DSB approach: 'objective' determination 169	
4.2.2.1.1 Main features 170	
4.2.2.1.1.1 Relevant factors 172	
4.2.2.1.1.2 Varying importance of factors 174	
4.2.2.1.1.3 Degree of 'likeness' under different	
provisions 177	
4.2.2.1.2 Relevance of NPAs 179	
4.2.2.1.2.1 Processes and production methods 1	79
4.2.2.1.2.2 Output and producer characteristics 1	83
4.2.2.1.2.3 Price 189	
4.2.2.1.2.4 National policies and regulatory	
regimes 192	
4.2.2.1.3 Relevance of 'minor' physical differences 196	
4.2.2.1.3.1 Editorial content 197	
4.2.2.1.3.2 Environmental impacts 200	
4.2.2.1.3.3 Toxicity and risk 201	
4.2.2.1.3.4 Genetic modifications 203	
4.2.2.1.4 Summary 204	
4.2.2.2 The 'aim and effects' theory 206	
4.2.2.2.1 Rationales and main elements 207	
4.2.2.2.1.1 The criteria 208	
4.2.2.2.1.2 Scope and relevance 209	
4.2.2.2.1.3 Diversity of opinions 210	
4.2.2.2.2 Significance for NPA measures 211	
4.2.2.2.3 The 'aim and effects' theory in WTO	
adjudication 212	
4.2.2.2.3.1 US – Malt Beverages (1992) 213	
4.2.2.2.3.2 US – Taxes on Automobiles (1994) 21	4
4.2.2.2.3.3 <i>Japan – Alcoholic Beverages</i> (1996) and	
EC – Bananas (1997) 215	
4.2.2.2.3.4 Subsequent jurisprudence 218	
4.2.2.2.4 Critique 220	
4.2.2.3 Market-based or economic approaches 222	
4.2.2.3.1 Rationales and main elements 223	
4.2.2.3.2 Significance for NPA measures 226	
4.2.2.3.3 Relevance in WTO adjudication 228	
4.2.2.3.4 Critique 232	
4.2.3 Summary 236	
4.3 Detrimental treatment and NPA measures 240	
4.4 Conclusions 244	

CONTENTS X

			istification of NPA measures under the	
ger	neral	except	ons 247	
5.1	Partic	cularitie	s in interpreting Article XX 249	
J	5.1.1	Relevar	ce of international law for interpretation 249	
			Basic framework of interpretation 250	
		5.1.1.2	GATT and WTO case law 252	
		5.1.1.3	Signatories-based approach 254	
			5.1.1.3.1 Congruence within disputes 255	
			5.1.1.3.2 Incongruence within disputes 257	
			Objective approach 258	
		0.2.2.	5.1.1.4.1 The nature of interpretation 258	
			5.1.1.4.2 Relevance of international instruments 260	
			5.1.1.4.3 Summary 263	
			5.1.1.4.4 Excursus: inter se understanding on	
			interpretation 264	
	512	Other i	nterpretative questions 265	
			No restrictive interpretation 265	
			Static or evolutionary interpretation? 267	
	513	Summa		
E 2			erns regarding justifiability of NPA measures 269	
5.2			ess of basic objections 270	
		_	of arguments against justifiability 272	
	3.2.2		Irreconcilability with WTO objectives and purpose 272	
			Per se violation of the chapeau 274	
			Violation of the sovereignty principle 275	
	E 2 2		281	
F 2		Result		
5.3			Article XX 281 arranged 281 arranged 281 281	
	5.5.1	•	graphical scope and the problem of extraterritoriality 281 Insufficient GATT and WTO case law 283	
		5.5.1.2	The text of the particular exceptions 284	
			5.3.1.2.1 Direct references to the geographical scope 285	06
				86
			5.3.1.2.2.1 'necessary' 286	
			5.3.1.2.2.2 'relating to' and 'imposed for' 288	
			5.3.1.2.2.3 Implications for the geographical	
			scope 291	
			5.3.1.2.3 Indirect reference in exception (g): domestic	
			restrictions 295	
			5.3.1.2.3.1 History and relevant case law 295	
			5.3.1.2.3.2 Distinction between foreign and shared	
			resources 297	
			Object and purpose 300	
			Negotiating history 302	
			Alternative approaches to extraterritoriality 305	
			Conclusions on the geographical scope 308	
	5.3.2	•	coverage of the particular exceptions 309	
		5.3.2.1	Exclusivity of listed policies 310	

		5.3.2.2	Coverage of other policies 311
			5.3.2.2.1 Protection of the environment 311
			5.3.2.2.2 Human rights and labour standards 313
		5.3.2.3	Summary 316
	5.3.3	Special	consideration of the public morals exception 316
		5.3.3.1	Open subject coverage 317
		5.3.3.2	Standards of right and wrong 321
		5.3.3.3	The geographical scope 323
			5.3.3.3.1 Location of moral standards 323
			5.3.3.2 Location of the threat 324
		•	5.3.3.3 Preliminary conclusions 326
		5.3.3.4	Requirements relating to the means-end relationship 326
			5.3.3.4.1 Motivation for moral NPA trade measures 327
			5.3.3.4.2 Suitability 328
			5.3.3.4.3 Necessity 329
			5.3.3.4.3.1 'Relative' and 'absolute' necessity 330
			5.3.3.4.3.2 WTO jurisprudence on 'weighing and
			balancing' 331
			5.3.3.4.3.3 Other approaches 338
			5.3.3.4.4 Conclusions for an adequate 'necessity' test 339
			5.3.3.4.4.1 Step 1 340
			5.3.3.4.4.2 Step 2 341
			5.3.3.4.4.3 Step 3 342
	5.3.4	Summa	ary 343
.4	The c	hapeau	and other requirements regarding the application of
	meas	ures	345
	5.4.1	A 'bala	ncing process' under the chapeau? 347
	5.4.2	The rec	quirements 349
		5.4.2.1	Introductory remarks 350
		5.4.2.2	General requirements and principles 352
			5.4.2.2.1 An 'unavoidable' standard of justifiability? 352
			5.4.2.2.2 Relevance of different conditions in countries 353
			5.4.2.2.3 Special and differential treatment 356
			5.4.2.2.3.1 The principle of SDT 356
			5.4.2.2.3.2 Relevance of SDT for the chapeau 359
			5.4.2.2.4 Due process and general principles 359
		5.4.2.3	Specific problem fields 361
			5.4.2.3.1 No prohibition of unilateral measures 361
			5.4.2.3.2 Are serious negotiations obligatory? 362
		5.4.2.4	Specific requirements for NPA measures 364
			5.4.2.4.1 Relevant characteristics of NPA measures 365
			5.4.2.4.2 Consultations and negotiations 366
			5.4.2.4.3 Implementation periods 367
			5.4.2.4.4 Transfer of technologies, administrative and financial
			support 369
5	Conc	lusions	372

CONTENTS xiii

6	The status of	PPM measures under the TBT Agreement and	
	the SPS Agre		
	6.1 Introductio	n 374	
	6.2 The TBT A	greement and PPMs 374	
	6.2.1 Appli	cability of the TBT Agreement 375	
		1 Categorization of relevant norms linked to	
		unincorporated PPMs 376	
		2 Technical regulations and standards 377	
	6.2.1.	3 Labelling requirements 381	
		6.2.1.3.1 The EU regulatory framework on egg labelling	383
		6.2.1.3.2 Coverage with respect to labelling of PPMs	
		and NPAs 385	
		6.2.1.3.2.1 Labelling of unincorporated PPMs	385
		6.2.1.3.2.2 Other NPAs 388	
	6.2.2 Subst	antive provisions 389	
	6.2.2.	1 No per se illegality 389	
	6.2.2.	2 Substantive requirements on technical regulations and	
		standards 393	
		6.2.2.2.1 Overview of substantive requirements 393	
		6.2.2.2.2 The distinction between regulations and	
		standards 395	
	6.2.2.	3 Legitimacy of the objective pursued: special consideration	of
		consumer information 396	
		6.2.2.3.1 Consumer information as an internationally	
		recognized value 398	
		6.2.2.3.2 Consumer information as precondition for the	
		functioning of markets 405	
	622	6.2.2.3.3 Preliminary conclusions 410	
		4 Necessity 412 elationship of the TBT Agreement and the GATT 414	
		al and differential treatment 415	
	6.3 The SPS Ag		
	6.4 Result		
	U.T Ittsuit	121	
III	Outlookene	ew perspectives on the legal status of	
TTT			
	NPA measu	res 423	
7	The interface	of international trade and public policies:	
		over existing proposals for reform 427	
	7.1 Review	427	
	7.1.1 Denia	al of competence? 428	
		ges at WTO level 432	
		1 Substance 433	
	7.1.2.2	2 Procedure 438	
	7.1.3 Institu	utional changes and governance-related suggestions 440	

	7.1.3.1 Institutional changes 440
	7.1.3.2 Governance in a multi-level system 443
	7.2 Comment 448
8	A regulation-based perspective on NPA trade measures 451
	8.1 Regulatory problems linked to international trade 452
	8.1.1 Side-effects of international trade 453
	8.1.2 The regulatory dilemma 454
	8.1.2.1 Effectiveness of unimpaired national regulation 454
	8.1.2.2 Effectiveness of impaired national regulation 456
	8.1.3 Market failure and the lack of international institutions 461
	8.1.4 Regulatory failure is not in line with objectives and key rationales
	of the WTO 463
	8.1.5 Conclusions 466
	8.2 Applying the regulation-based perspective 467
	8.2.1 Deduction of the regulation-based approach 467
	8.2.2 Categorization of national regulation 469
	8.2.2.1 Category 1: Regulation reducing market imperfections 469
	8.2.2.2 Category 2: Regulation addressing market failure 473
	8.2.2.3 Category 3: Distributive regulation 478
	8.2.3 General conditions of consistency 481
	8.2.3.1 General requirements 481
	8.2.3.2 National regulation and SDT 482
	8.2.4 Conclusions 483

Summary and concluding remarks 485 Bibliography 494 Index 513