

# Contents

<i>Acknowledgements .....</i>	v
<i>List of Acronyms .....</i>	xv
<i>Table of Cases .....</i>	xvii
<i>DAC list of ODA recipients Effective for reporting on 2011, 2012 and 2013 flows .....</i>	xxiii

<i>Introduction .....</i>	1
1. Tied Aid .....	1
2. Scope and Objectives of the Book .....	5
3. Outline of the Book .....	10
4. Concluding Comments .....	12

## Part I: Tied Aid in Context

1. Tied Aid and Poverty Alleviation: Contradictions and Inefficiencies of Benefactors' Development Cooperation Policies .....	17
1. Introduction .....	17
2. Poverty Eradication and Development Aid .....	17
2.1 Increasing Aid Resources and Improving Aid Predictability.....	22
2.2 Increasing Aid Effectiveness .....	24
3. Tied Aid Practices .....	29
3.1 Meaning of Tied Aid.....	30
3.2 Tied Aid Data: A Critique .....	32
3.3 Political and Economic Justifications for Tying Aid: An Old Fashioned Rationale? .....	34
3.3.1 Donors' Economic Rationale.....	35
3.3.2 Donors' Political Rationale .....	37
3.4 Costs of Tied Aid.....	38
3.4.1 The Loss of 'Trade for Aid' .....	41
3.5 The Economic Effects of Tying Aid within the EU.....	42
3.6 The Prisoner's Dilemma and the International Community.....	43
4. Conclusions .....	46
2. Food Aid .....	48
1. Introduction.....	48
2. Hunger and Food Aid .....	49
2.1 Where do We stand on Hunger? .....	49
2.2 Changing Patterns in the Way Food Aid is Perceived.....	52

2.3 Food Aid in the International Context of Human Rights Declarations, Covenants and Summits.....	53
3. Food Aid: Definition, Donations and Modalities of Distribution .....	59
4. Tied Food Aid: Definition, Data and Costs.....	66
4.1 Definition .....	66
4.2 Data.....	69
4.3 Tied Aid and Genetically Modified Organisms in Food Aid.....	70
4.4 The Costs of Tying Food Aid.....	71
4.5 Donors' Rationales for Tying Aid .....	74
5. Tied Aid and the Renewal of the UN Food Aid Convention.....	77
6. The World Food Programme.....	84
6.1 The WFP's Procurement Rules and System .....	85
6.1.1 Emergency Food Aid: A Challenge that can be Met by Using Modern Procurement Techniques ....	91
7. Conclusions .....	94
 3. International Steps to Untie Aid: Ten Years since the Recommendation on Untying Aid .....	97
1. Introduction .....	97
2. International Initiatives to Untie Aid: Forty Years of Negotiations to Make Aid More Effective.....	98
3. A Thorough Scrutiny of the OECD/DAC Recommendation's Text.....	102
3.1 Scope of the Recommendation's Coverage: Geographical Limitations, Exclusions and Derogations .....	102
3.1.1 Geographical Scope: LDCs and HIPC.....	102
3.1.2 Categories of ODA.....	104
3.1.3 Exclusions: Technical Cooperation.....	104
3.1.4 Exclusions: Food Aid .....	106
3.1.5 Derogation(s) .....	108
3.1.6 Emergency Aid .....	109
3.1.7 Further Untying.....	110
3.2 DAC—Donors' Commitments to Untying Aid De Jure and De Facto .....	110
3.2.1 De Facto Untying and the Transparency Obligations.....	111
3.2.2 Corollary Commitments: Completing De Facto Untying .....	113
3.2.3 Effort Sharing and Coordination.....	113
3.2.4 Procurement Procedures: The Use of Country Systems .....	114

3.3 Monitoring .....	115
3.4 Effectiveness and Enforcement: A Successful Story? .....	117
3.4.1 Effectiveness .....	117
3.4.2 Enforcement .....	122
4. Assessment and Conclusions.....	122
4. Tied Aid: The Example of Italy .....	125
1. Introduction.....	125
2. An Overview of the Italian Development Cooperation System.....	126
2.1 Legal Foundations and Institutional Structure of the Italian Development Cooperation System .....	126
2.2 Principles and Objectives .....	129
2.3 Volume of Aid .....	133
2.4 Sectors and Countries of Interventions .....	134
2.5 Instruments of Italian Bilateral Development Cooperation Policies .....	135
3. Italy's Stand on Tied Aid and the Legal Foundations of Tied Aid Conditions .....	139
3.1 Proposals for Reforming Law 49/87 .....	143
3.1.1 Content of the Major Reform Bill: the Commitment to Untie Aid .....	145
4. Aid in Practice: Procurement Procedures and Tied Aid Projects .....	146
4.1 <i>Crediti di Aiuto</i> : Modalities for Granting Aid .....	146
4.1.1 Tied Aid in Practice: The Procurement Process in the <i>Crediti di Aiuto</i> .....	148
4.1.2 Examples of the Procurement Process in the <i>Crediti di Aiuto</i> .....	149
4.2 <i>Interventi a Dono</i> .....	151
4.2.1 The Procurement Process in the <i>Interventi a Dono</i> ...	153
4.2.2 Examples of Aid Tenders for <i>Interventi a Dono</i> .....	155
4.3 Review Mechanisms: The Sincat/ENEL Case.....	158
4.4 Food Aid Projects .....	159
5. Assessment, Conclusions and Future Prospects .....	162
5. Tied Aid: The Example of the UK.....	165
1. Introduction.....	165
2. Development Cooperation in the UK.....	166
3. Tied/Untied Aid Practices in the UK.....	169
3.1 History of UK Tied Aid .....	169
3.2 The New Century: The UK's Vision on Untying Aid and the International Community of Donors.....	171
3.3 The International Development Act.....	172

4. The Aid Procurement Process: The Rules Applied .....	174
5. The Impact of the Untied Aid Policy.....	178
6. Conclusions .....	180
6. Tied Aid: The Rules on Access to EU External Assistance .....	182
1. Introduction.....	182
2. EU Development Cooperation Policies: An Overview.....	185
2.1 Structure of EU Development Cooperation.....	188
2.2 EU External Assistance: Geographic and Thematic Aid .....	191
3. The EU Legislative Measures for Untying EU Aid .....	195
3.1 The EU Pledge to Further Untie EU Aid .....	195
3.2 The Rules on Contractual Participation in EU External Action Contracts .....	198
3.2.1 The Rules on Contractual Participation in the EU Development Cooperation Instruments set up by Regulation 1905/2006.....	200
3.2.2 Eligibility Rules: Article 31 of Regulation 1905/2006.....	200
3.2.3 Eligibility Rules for Thematic Aid .....	201
3.2.4 Eligibility Rules for Geographic Aid.....	202
3.2.5 Eligibility Rules: Other (Donor) Countries' Suppliers and Goods .....	204
3.2.6 Eligibility Rules: Projects Implemented in LDCs .....	208
3.2.7 Eligibility Rules: Miscellaneous .....	209
3.2.8 Exceptions .....	209
3.2.9 Local Purchases .....	210
3.3 Food Security Projects and Policies.....	211
3.4 Aid Projects Implemented by NGOs.....	213
3.5 Eligibility Rules for Access to EDF Aid.....	213
4. Conclusions .....	215
7. Tied Aid: The Example of the USA .....	219
1. Introduction.....	219
2. US Aid Programmes: A Brief Overview.....	220
2.1 Status and Data on US Tied Aid .....	224
3. USAID: Eligibility Rules for Participation in USAID Procurement Aid Contracts.....	225
3.1 USAID: An Introduction .....	225
3.2 USAID and the Legal Framework for Procurement: The Source, Origin and Nationality (S/O/N) Rules.....	227
3.2.1 Regulation 22 CFR part 228.....	229
3.2.2 Procurement Restrictions for Certain Products and Cargo Preference Clauses .....	232
3.2.3 The 2012 Reforms .....	237

4.	US Food Aid Programmes and Tied Aid .....	239
4.1	Attempts to Reform US Food Aid.....	244
5.	The Millennium Challenge Corporation .....	248
5.1	MCC Procurement Procedures.....	251
6.	Conclusions .....	254

## Part II: Tied Aid and the EU

8.	Tied Aid and the External Competences of the EU .....	259
1.	Introduction.....	259
2.	Setting the Framework for Discussion: the EU's External Action Competences, Development Aid Procurement and Tied Aid .....	261
2.1	The CPP, Export Credits and Tied Aid .....	266
3.	Interaction between the CCP and other EU External Competences.....	273
3.1	Trade and Foreign Policy .....	273
3.2	Trade and Environment .....	275
4.	Development Cooperation .....	277
4.1	Parallel Powers, Mutual Complementarity, Policy Coherence between the Union and the Member States .....	277
4.2	Interaction between Trade and Development Cooperation .....	282
5.	Conclusions .....	286
9.	The Single Market and Tied Aid .....	288
1.	Introduction.....	288
2.	The Single Market and Public Procurement: An Overview .....	289
3.	The Commission's Stance on the Legality of Tied Aid .....	295
4.	Tied Aid Practices and the Free Movement Provisions.....	299
4.1	The Setting up of the Tied Aid Condition.....	299
4.2	The Implementation of the Tied Aid Condition .....	303
4.2.1	The Donor Carrying out the Procurement Process .....	304
4.2.2	The Recipient Country Carrying out the Procurement Process.....	306
4.2.3	Conclusions .....	310
4.3	Positive Obligations under the Treaty .....	311
4.4	Derogations of Articles 34 and 56 of the Treaty.....	315
5.	Tied Aid and the Treaty Provisions on State Aid .....	317
5.1	The Measure Needs to be Classifiable as Aid .....	319
5.1.1	The Economic Advantage.....	319
5.1.2	Normal Market Conditions.....	321
5.2	Distortion of Competition and Effect on Trade Between Member States .....	323
5.3	Aid Granted by the State or through State Resources .....	323

5.4 Compatibility of the Aid Schemes with the Common Market.....	325
6. Conclusions.....	326
10. Tied Aid Procurement and the EU Public Procurement Directives .....	328
1. Introduction .....	328
2. Overview of the Public Procurement Directives .....	330
2.1 An Evolving Story.....	330
2.2 Major Principles .....	334
3. The Directives' Definition of Contracting Authorities and Aid Procuring Entities .....	337
3.1 The First Case: The Procurement Process Carried out by the Donor State or by a Procurement Agent on Behalf of the Donor State .....	337
3.1.1 The Directives' Notion of 'Contracting Authority': Member states' Agencies Operating Within and Outside the EU .....	337
3.1.2 Conclusions .....	344
3.2 The Second Case: The Procurement Process is Carried out by the Beneficiary Country.....	344
3.3 Article 8 of the Public Sector Directive: The Case of a Contract Financed by a Procurement Entity .....	348
4. Possible Factors Against the Application of the Directives to Aid Procurement Contracts.....	350
4.1 Delivery of the Aid Contracts in a Third Country .....	351
4.2 The Exception in the Utilities Directive for Activities Pursued in a Non-Member Country .....	355
4.3 International Agreements with Third Countries .....	357
4.4 Emergency Aid .....	359
5. Conclusions.....	360

### Part III: Tied Aid and the WTO

11. Tied Aid and the WTO .....	365
1. Introduction .....	365
2. Tied Aid and the Objectives and Principles of the WTO .....	366
3. Tied Aid within GATT and GATS.....	370
4. Tied Aid and the Subsidies and Countervailing Measures Agreement .....	378
4.1 Identifying Subsidies: The Financial Contribution and the Income/Price Support Elements .....	378
4.2 The Benefit .....	384
4.3 Specificity .....	389
4.4 Tied Aid as a Prohibited (Export) Subsidy.....	389

5. The WTO Agreement on Agriculture (AoA) and Tied Aid:	
State of the Law and Proposals for its Reform.....	394
5.1 Introduction.....	394
5.2 Tied Aid within the Agreement on Agriculture .....	395
5.3 Food Aid within the Negotiations for Reforming Agricultural Trade .....	398
5.4 The Draft Modalities for Reforming Article 10.4 .....	400
6. Concluding Remarks.....	407
12. Tied Aid and the GPA .....	411
1. Introduction .....	411
2. GPA Coverage.....	414
2.1 The GPA's Approach to Coverage and Development Aid.....	414
2.1.1 Gaps in the Interpretation of the Exceptions in Article II(3)(e)(i) and (iii) .....	418
2.2 The Exemptions in Article II(3)(e) and their Implications on the Granting of Aid as Budget Support and the Use of Country Systems.....	422
3. General Coverage: Would Aid-Funded Procurement be Covered but for the International Assistance and Aid Exception? .....	423
3.1 Introduction.....	423
3.2 Definition of Procurement and the Exceptions in the General Notes.....	424
3.3 Entities Covered .....	425
3.4 Conduct Covered.....	427
4. Concluding Remarks: Reflecting on the New Agreement and the Exclusion for Development Aid Procurement.....	428
13. Conclusions.....	431
<i>Bibliography</i> .....	444
<i>Index</i> .....	461