

# CONTENTS

---

<i>Preface</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	<i>xxxi</i>
<i>Table of Statutory Instruments</i>	<i>xxxvi</i>
<i>Table of EU Legislation</i>	<i>xxxvii</i>
<i>Table of Abbreviations</i>	<i>xxxix</i>

## PART I: GENERAL PRINCIPLES

<b>1 ETHICS AND MEDICINE</b>	<b>3</b>
INTRODUCTION TO ETHICS	3
Why study ethics?	3
Consequences v deontological absolutes	6
Consequentialism	7
Absolutism/deontology	9
Rights, duties and liberties	13
Respect for persons	16
Justice	17
Relativism and feminist ethics	17
The medical humanities movement	19
THE DOCTOR–PATIENT RELATIONSHIP	19
Beneficence	19
Non-maleficence	25
The nature of illness	26
THE CASE FOR PATERNALISM	28
Introduction	28
What is paternalism?	29
Strong and weak paternalism	30
Paternalism and the sanctity of life principle	33
Paternalism and the doctor's duty of beneficence	34
Paternalism and a duty to oneself?	34
THE CASE FOR PATIENT AUTONOMY	34
Autonomy	35
The right to self-determination	36
The political approach and the rejection of 'social control'	37
Utilitarianism and autonomy	37
Rationality	37
Autonomy and beneficence	38
PATERNALISM V AUTONOMY – A FALSE DICHOTOMY?	38
Collaborative decision-making	38
A fiduciary relationship	39
JUSTICE IN THE ALLOCATION OF HEALTH RESOURCES	40

<b>2</b>	<b>HEALTH CARE IN ENGLAND AND WALES</b>	<b>51</b>
	BACKGROUND	51
	The international framework	51
	National provisions	51
	The National Health Service Act 1977	52
	STRUCTURE OF HEALTH CARE IN THE UK	54
	The private sector	62
	REGULATING THE QUALITY OF HEALTH CARE	62
	The 'macro' level: the role of regulatory bodies	63
	The 'micro' level: complaints and discipline	65
	The complaints system	65
	Discipline	69
	Role of (criminal) law	73
	ACCESS TO HEALTH CARE	75
	Background – scarcity of NHS resources	75
	Disputes over obtaining treatment	77
	Judicial review	78
	Breach of statutory duty	92
	Negligence and health resources	93
	Compulsory treatment and care	93
<b>3</b>	<b>CONSENT TO TREATMENT</b>	<b>95</b>
	ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	95
	Autonomy	95
	Paternalism	96
	THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK	97
	The protection of bodily integrity	97
	Battery	97
	Maim and statutory criminal offences	97
	The form and scope of consent	99
	Express consent	99
	Implied consent	102
	Problems with the scope of consent	102
	The extent of the treatment	102
	The person carrying out treatment	104
	Qualifications as to the effect of consent	105
	Countervailing interests that justify non-consensual treatment	
	at common law?	105
	Preservation of life	108
	Prevention of suicide	108
	Protecting the integrity of the medical profession	111
	Protection of innocent third parties	111
	Statutory exceptions to the need for consent	112
	Situations where consent may be insufficient	113
	Gender reassignment	113
	Sterilisation/vasectomy	114
	Circumcision	114

THE ELEMENTS TO A VALID CONSENT	115
Capacity to consent	115
Assessing capacity	119
The ability to understand and retain information	119
General principles	119
Belief and its effect upon understanding	121
Weighing treatment information in the balance	124
Background	124
Must there be 'reasons' for the patient's choice?	126
Consent must be voluntary	128
Informing the patient	132
Battery and mistake	136
THE DUTY TO DISCLOSE IN NEGLIGENCE	137
Introduction	137
The standard of care in relation to disclosing treatment risks	137
The doctrine of 'informed consent'	137
The position in England	139
The <i>Sidaway</i> case	139
Developments post- <i>Sidaway</i>	143
Therapeutic privilege	147
Disclosure of 'success rates'	148
Batter, negligence and capacity	148
Causation	149
General principles	149
The problem of <i>legal</i> causation	151
<b>4 TREATING THE INCOMPETENT PATIENT</b>	<b>157</b>
THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK	157
The temporarily incompetent – necessity	157
Children	160
Consent to treatment	160
Refusals of treatment	164
The incapacitated and proxy decision-making	170
Children and the rights of parents	171
Children and the role of the court	183
Adults and the rights of others	183
Adults and the role of the court	184
DECISION-MAKING CRITERIA	187
The therapeutic/non-therapeutic distinction	187
The 'best interests' test	190
Mental capacity Act 2005	191
The 'substituted judgment' test	194
The <i>Bolam</i> test	195
THE CONTROL OF FERTILITY AND THE INCOMPETENT	197
Introduction	197
Non-therapeutic sterilisations	200
Sterilisation to manage menstruation – therapeutic or non-therapeutic?	218
Abortion	220

<b>5 CONFIDENTIALITY, PRIVACY AND ACCESS TO MEDICAL RECORDS</b>	<b>223</b>
CONFIDENTIALITY – THE DUTY	223
The ethical obligation	223
The General Medical Council's guidance	224
The legal obligations of confidentiality and privacy	227
The right to privacy	228
The obligation of confidence	229
The elements of an action for breach of confidence	230
The confidential information	231
The circumstances in which the information is acquired	232
Statutory obligations of confidence	234
Incompetent patients and confidentiality	235
Children	235
Incompetent adults	237
CONFIDENTIALITY – BREACHING CONFIDENCES	237
Consent	238
Public interest	238
Disclosure to maintain the freedom of the press	239
Disclosure to prevent crime	240
Disclosure to prevent civil wrongs	244
Disclosure for the public good	245
Disclosure for the protection of third parties	246
Confidentiality and HIV and AIDS	247
The administration of justice	250
Disclosure in the interests of national security	251
Medical research	251
Exchange of information amongst health care workers	251
Breaches of confidence justified by statute law	252
Might there be a common law duty to disclose?	256
To whom should disclosure be made and what should be the extent of that disclosure?	260
CONFIDENTIALITY – REMEDIES	261
Detriment	261
Damages	261
Injunctions	262
The dead	263
CONFIDENTIALITY AND THE DATA PROTECTION ACT 1998	264
ACCESS TO MEDICAL RECORDS – ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	266
ACCESS TO MEDICAL RECORDS – THE LAW	267
Statutory provisions	267
Access to Medical Reports Act 1988	270
Common law	270
Supreme Court Act 1981	274

6 MEDICAL MALPRACTICE	277
INTRODUCTION	277
THE DUTY OF CARE	278
The duty to the patient	278
The duty in 'wrongful conception/birth' cases	282
The duty to third parties	286
Dangerous patient cases	287
Injured patient cases	288
Who to sue?	290
Liability of the Department of Health	291
THE BREACH OF DUTY	293
The standard of care	293
The ordinary professional	293
Junior doctors	294
Emergencies	296
Accepted practice – the <i>Bolam</i> test	296
Development and rationale	296
Application and scope	299
Impugning accepted practice – 'new <i>Bolam</i> '	301
Departures from approved practice	305
Proving the breach	308
CAUSATION	311
Factual causation: causal necessity and the 'but for' test	311
A framework for analysis	311
Evidential problems in applying the 'but for' test	313
Claims for 'loss of chance'	316
Human agency in the causal chain	322
Legal causation/remoteness of damage	323
DEFENCES AND LIMITATIONS OF ACTIONS	324
Defences	324
Contributory negligence	325
Consent or <i>volenti non fit injuria</i>	325
Illegality or <i>ex turpi causa</i>	325
Limitation of actions	326
DAMAGES	327
Principles governing awards	327
Damages for non-pecuniary loss	327
Damages in battery	327
Pain and suffering and loss of amenity	327
Progress of disease and loss of a chance	328
Non-disclosure cases	330
Fatal accidents	330
Damages for pecuniary loss	330
LIABILITY FOR DEFECTIVE MEDICINES	331

REFORMING THE LAW	334
Problems with the medical litigation system	334
Moving to a 'no fault' system?	336

## PART II: SPECIFIC AREAS IN MEDICAL TREATMENT

7 ASSISTED REPRODUCTION	345
-------------------------	-----

INTRODUCTION	345
--------------	-----

The key interests at stake	346
Potential parents	346
Gamete providers/surrogates	346
Potential children	347
Embryos	347
The response of the law	347
The Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 scheme	349

IN VITRO FERTILISATION	351
------------------------	-----

Background	351
The potential parents	352
Access to treatment	352
Protection through counselling and informed consent	355
Control over the use/disposition of embryos/gametes	355
The embryo	360
What is its status?	360
The storage of embryos and gametes	363
Embryo research	364
Embryonic manipulations that will affect a future child	368
Reproductive cloning	368
Genetic engineering	369
Sex selection	373

COLLABORATIVE REPRODUCTION	374
----------------------------	-----

Background	374
The potential rearing parent(s)	376
Access to treatment	376
Counselling requirements	378
Legal status vis à vis child	378
The gamete providers	380
Recruitment and screening issues	381
Status vis à vis resulting children	383
The child	385

SURROGACY	388
-----------	-----

Background	388
Ethical considerations	390
The response of the law	392
Entering into the surrogacy arrangement	393
Resolving surrogacy arrangements	395
Where the parties are in dispute	395
Where the parties are agreed	397

<b>8 PREGNANCY AND ABORTION</b>	<b>403</b>
INTRODUCTION	403
The morality of abortion	404
Abortion and legislation	411
THE LEGAL POSITION	412
Criminal law provisions	412
Defences to abortion prior to 1967	414
The effect of the Abortion Act 1967 as originally enacted	416
The Abortion Act 1967 as amended	418
IMPLICATIONS OF THE LAW	424
The interested parties	424
The foetus	424
The pregnant woman	428
The father	430
The doctor/health care worker	431
Forms of termination raising special issues	437
Pre-implantation termination	437
Selective reduction	438
Drug-induced abortions	440
Late abortion and the living abortus	443
PRE-NATAL HARM BEYOND THE ABORTION CONTEXT	443
General principles	443
Harm caused by the child's mother	445
Refusals of obstetric intervention	447
<b>9 MENTAL HEALTH LAW</b>	<b>457</b>
BACKGROUND	457
Introduction	457
What is mental illness?	458
Justifying detention	463
Statutory control	467
History	467
Current scheme under the Mental Health Act 1983	468
DETENTION	469
Mental disorder	469
Mental impairment	470
Psychopathic disorder	471
Treatability	472
Key parties involved	476
Approved social worker	476
Nearest relative	478
Doctors	480
The categories of admission	480
Admission for assessment – s 2	480
Admission for treatment – s 3	482
Admission for assessment in emergencies – s 4	484

Guardianship – s 7	485
The detention of inpatients – s 5	486
Informal admission – s 131	487
Miscellaneous powers	490
Detention via the criminal justice system	490
NON-MEDICAL TREATMENT	490
MEDICAL TREATMENT	492
Consent to treatment	492
Treatment not needing the patient's consent	492
Exceptional treatment not covered by s 63	496
Section 57 – consent and a second opinion	496
Section 58 – consent or a second opinion	497
Urgent treatment under s 62	499
Is it right to give any form of treatment without consent?	500
Is competence treated differently when the patient is suffering from a mental disorder?	501
SAFEGUARDING THE PATIENT	503
Discharge of the patient under s 23	503
The Mental Health Act Commission	503
Challenging detention	504
Mental Health Review tribunals	504
Habeas corpus	504
Judicial review	505
A RIGHT TO TREATMENT FOR MENTAL DISORDER?	508
LIABILITY TOWARDS PATIENTS	510
Criminal liability	510
Civil liability	510
False imprisonment	510
Battery and negligence	511
PROPOSALS FOR REFORM	512
<b>10 MEDICAL RESEARCH</b>	<b>515</b>
INTRODUCTION	515
Background	515
Defining 'research'	515
Therapeutic and non-therapeutic research	517
Therapeutic	517
Non-therapeutic	518
Innovative therapy	518
The concept of risk	518
THE ETHICS OF GOOD RESEARCH PRACTICE	519
Background	519
The duty of doctor/researcher	525
Duties to patients	525
Duties to volunteers	530

CONSENT TO RESEARCH	531
Therapeutic research	531
The competent patient	531
The incompetent patient	537
Children	537
Incompetent adults	538
Non-therapeutic research	541
The competent volunteer	541
The incompetent volunteer	542
Children	543
Adults	544
THE REGULATION OF RESEARCH IN THE UK	546
Common law	546
Contract	546
Tort	547
Criminal law	547
Statutory provisions in relation to clinical trials	547
The Ethics Committee System	552
Multi-centre trials	560
Quasi-statutory guidance	560
COMPENSATION FOR INJURIES ARISING FROM RESEARCH	561
Compensation at common law	561
'No fault' compensation?	562
Drug-induced injury	563
<b>11 ORGAN TRANSPLANTATION</b>	<b>567</b>
INTRODUCTION	567
EXTRACTION OF MATERIAL	569
The live donor	569
Ethical considerations	569
The legal position at common law	571
The competent donor and consent	571
The law of assault	571
The law of homicide	573
The incompetent donor	573
Actions by donors in negligence	578
Statutory limitations upon live organ donation	580
The need for 'appropriate cosent' to the storage and use of organs and tissue	580
The prohibition of organ (and tissue) trafficking	582
Further restrictions upon live donations	584
The Dead donor	586
Establishing death	587
Elective ventilation?	589
Authorising the removal and use of organs	591
Historical background	591
Problems with the 1961 Act	593

The effect of the Human Tissue Act 2004	594
Residual concerns	597
Other sources of organs/tissue	598
Foetal tissue transplants	598
Xenotransplantation	601
Mechanical organs	603
THE STATUS OF EXTRACTED MATERIAL	604
The requirements of the Human Tissue Act 2004	604
The question of property rights	605
Rights in the body of a deceased person (or parts taken therefrom)	606
Rights in body parts taken from the living	608
Intellectual property rights	610
Genetic privacy and the use of DNA	612
IMPLANTATION OF MATERIAL	614
The interests of the putative donee	614
The rights of the actual donee	614
Against the surgeon	614
Against the procurement agency	615
Against the donor	616
TACKLING THE SHORTAGE IN ORGANS	618
Addressing the shortfall in cadaveric organs	618
Elective ventilation – clarifying the law	622
Creating a market in organs	622
<b>12 EUTHANASIA</b>	<b>627</b>
INTRODUCTION	627
What is euthanasia?	627
The value of human life	627
‘Sanctity of life’ and ‘vitalism’	629
Quality of life	633
The qualified sanctity of life principle	634
The acts/omissions distinction	636
Euthanasia and the state	641
ACTIVE EUTHANASIA	642
Background	642
The separation of a non-viable conjoined twin	643
Medicines which shorten life	645
Assisted suicide	647
PASSIVE EUTHANASIA	650
Background	650
Competent patients	652
The patient who wishes treatment to take place	652
Refusals of medical treatment	653
Advance directives	655
Incompetent patients	662

---

Background	662
Best interests	664
Substituted judgment?	673
Permanently insensate patients	675
Best interests in PVS	677
Concerns in relation to decisions withdrawing treatment from patients in PVS	681
Other bases for the withdrawal of life-sustaining medical treatment?	682
'Impracticability'	682
Resource issues	683
The role of the court	684
REFORMING THE LAW	687
<i>Index</i>	693