

Contents

Acknowledgments page xiii

Introduction: Natural Law and the Theory of Practical Rationality	1
0.1 Natural Law Theory as an Account of Practical Rationality	1
0.2 The Ways in Which This Work Is Incomplete	3
1 The Real Identity Thesis	6
1.1 Rival Views of How Goods Are Known	6
Inclinationist and Derivationist Accounts of Fundamental Practical Knowledge	6
Difficulties with Derivationism and Inclinationism	13
The Real Identity Thesis Stated	17
1.2 Functioning and Flourishing	21
That the Human Has a Function: The Functional-Composition Thesis	23
An Analysis of 'Function'	26
That the Human's Functioning Is to Be Identified with Its Flourishing	29
A Superfluous Concept?	32
1.3 Knowledge of Human Flourishing	34
Mentalism	34
Statistical Normalcy	35
Knowledge of Flourishing as Implicit in Particular Function Judgments	36
1.4 The Real Identity Thesis	40
Reasons to Affirm the Real Identity Thesis	40
Aquinas's Natural Law Theory and the Real Identity Thesis	43

2	Well-Being	46
2.1	Natural Law Theory as Welfarist and Objectivist	46
2.2	The Refutation of Conceptual Subjectivism	48
2.3	The Simple Desire-Fulfillment Theory as the Best Version of Strong Subjectivism	50
	Against the Simple View: That Desires Can Be Based on False Beliefs	53
	Against the Simple View: That Desires Can Be Absent due to a Lack of True Beliefs	62
	Against the Simple View: That Second-Order Desires Must Be Taken into Account	64
	Against the Simple View: That It Is Unable to Capture the Critical Character of the Good	67
2.4	The Refutation of Strong Subjectivism	71
	How Desires Entail Reasons	72
	A Question Left Open	76
2.5	The Refutation of Weak Subjectivism	76
	The Subject-Relativity of Well-Being	76
	Internalist Constraints	80
	Troubles with Substantive Theories of Rationality	90
	A Question Left Open	92
2.6	'Objective List' Theories	94
3	The Reasons That Make Action Intelligible	96
3.1	The List of Goods	96
3.2	Pleasure and Pain	96
3.3	The Basic Goods	100
	Life	101
	Knowledge	106
	Aesthetic Experience	109
	Excellence in Play and Work	111
	Excellence in Agency	114
	Inner Peace	118
	Friendship and Community	126
	Religion	131
	Happiness	133
3.4	Inner Peace, Happiness, and the Hybrid View of the Nature of Well-Being	135
3.5	The Real Identity Thesis Revisited	137
4	Welfarism and Its Discontents	139
4.1	Welfarism in the Theory of Practical Rationality	139

4.2	Welfarism Does Not Imply Egoism	140
4.3	Welfarism Does Not Imply a Maximizing Theory of Rationality	142
4.4	Welfarism Does Not Imply Promotionism	147
5	The Principles That Make Choice Reasonable	157
5.1	A Justificatory Framework for Principles of Practical Reasonableness	157
	Plans of Action and Principles of Practical Reasonableness	157
	The Formulation and Defense of Principles of Practical Reasonableness	160
5.2	Egoism, Consequentialism, Kantianism	162
	Egoism	162
	Consequentialism	167
	Kantianism	169
5.3	The Nature of Reasons for Action	172
	Welfarism about the Good	172
	Agent-Relativity and Agent-Neutrality	174
	Incommensurability	182
	Producible Ends and Ends-in-Themselves	187
5.4	A Note on Hierarchy among the Basic Goods	190
5.5	Principles of Practical Reasonableness Governing Plans of Action	198
	Against Dismissing or Devaluing Aspects of Well-Being	198
	Against Dismissing or Devaluing Persons within the Context of Agent-Neutral Ends	201
	Against Intentional, Instrumental Destruction of Instances of Basic Good	204
	Against Inefficiency	207
5.6	Principles of Practical Reasonableness Governing Agents	208
	Against Over- and Under-Specificity in Planning	209
	Against Flightiness and Stubbornness	210
	Against Idleness	212
5.7	Virtue Theory	212
	Virtue and the Correctness of Practical Judgment	213
	Virtues, Principles, and Motivation	217
6	What Ought to Be Done	220
6.1	'Ought'	220
6.2	The Moral 'Ought'	222
6.3	How Practical Reason Can Err	228

Against Discrimination	230
Against Lying	234
Against Callousness	238
6.4 Moral Dilemmas	240
6.5 Positive Norms, Life Plans, and the Partial Constitution Thesis	246
6.6 Normative Openness and Natural Law Theories of Authority	252
Notes	255
Works Cited	271
Index	279