Contents

Acknowledgements		
Table of Cases		
European		
European Court of Human Rights	XV	
European Committee of Social Rights	xviii	
International	xix	
UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies	xix	
Other International Cases	XX	
List of Abbreviations	xxi	
Introduction	1	
I.1 Preliminary Definitions: Irregular Migrants		
and the Right to Health	4	
I.2 The Contours of This Human Rights Analysis:		
International Law and Public Health	7	
I.3 The Plan of This Book	11	
Sovereignty and the Human Rights of Irregular Migrants	15	
1.1 Sovereignty and Human Rights Obligations	16	
1.1.1 State Sovereignty in International Law	16	
1.1.2 Human Rights Law	19	
1.1.3 The Mutual Impact of Sovereignty and Human Rights	21	
1.2 Migrants: Between Sovereignty and Human Rights	24	
1.2.1 Migrants and Sovereignty	24	
1.2.2 Migrant Rights or Human Rights?	27	
1.2.2.1 International Law and the Standards		
of Civilisation	27	
1.2.2.2 Human Rights for Migrants	29	

	1.3	Trends in the European and International Jurisprudence	
		on the Human Rights of Migrants with Irregular or	
		Precarious Status	34
		1.3.1 Instances of Immigration Cases before the	
		Strasbourg Court	34
		1.3.1.1 The Prohibition of Refoulement and	
		Collective Expulsions	36
		1.3.1.2 The Right to Personal Liberty and to Fair	
		and Decent Conditions of Detention	
		and Living	40
		1.3.1.3 The Protection of Family Life	42
		1.3.2 A Glimpse at the UN Treaty Bodies' Jurisprudence	
		Concerning Migrant Human Rights	45
		1.3.2.1 Authoritative Interpretative Statements	
		on the Rights of Migrants	45
		1.3.2.2 Jurisprudential Trends from Treaty Bodies'	
		Communication Procedures	47
		1.3.3 The Different Approaches of European and	
		International Case Law	51
	1.4	Explicit Limitations on the Rights of Irregular Migrants	
		in Human Rights Treaty Provisions	52
		1.4.1 The Convention on Migrant Workers	52
		1.4.2 The European Social Charter	53
	1.5	Broadening Contextual Reflections on Migrant Rights	56
		1.5.1 The Pro-migrant Approach of the Inter-American	
		System of Human Rights	56
		1.5.2 The Global Compact for Migration	57
	1.6	Conclusions	59
		BT C W7 7 7 1 17 17 17 17 17 17 17 17 17 17 17	
2		e Normative Contours of a Vulnerability- and	
	1	uity-Oriented Right to Health	61
	2.1	The Origins of Health as a Social Interest in the Last	
		Two Centuries	62
	2.2	Early Proclamations of the Right to Health, Sovereignty	
		and the Universalisation of Social Rights as Human Rights	65
		Philosophical Justifications for the Right to Health	70
	2.4	The Right to the Highest Attainable Standard of Health	
		in the Context of the ICESCR	75
		2.4.1 A Textual Analysis of Article 12 ICESCR in the Light	
		of Its Travaux Préparatoires	77

Contents

2.4.2 The Normative Content of the International Right	
to Health and the Correlative State Obligations	80
2.4.2.1 The Complex Scope of the Right to Health	81
2.4.2.2 The 'Tripartite Typology'	82
2.4.2.3 The AAAQ-AP Framework	83
2.4.2.4 The Core Framework	85
2.4.2.5 International Meta-legal Health Standards:	
Primary Health Care and Universal	
Health Coverage	80
2.5 International Monitoring and Accountability	
for Protecting the Right to Health	94
2.5.1 State Reporting before the CESCR	95
2.5.2 The Justiciability of Socioeconomic Rights	
and the Optional Protocol to the ICESCR	99
2.5.3 A Sample of the Health-Related Views of the	
CEDAW Committee	102
2.5.4 The Contribution of the UN Charter-	
Based Mechanisms	104
2.5.5 Preliminary Conclusions	106
2.6 European Human Rights Law and the Right to Health	107
2.6.1 The Strasbourg Court's Case Law: Health System	
Deficiencies and Regulatory Obligations	108
2.6.2 The ESC: European 'Averages' and	
Socioeconomic Protection	112
2.7 The Principle of Non-discrimination, Vulnerable Groups	
and the Right to Health	115
2.7.1 Equality, Non-discrimination and Marginalisation	115
2.7.2 What Is Vulnerability in Human Rights?	118
2.7.3 Non-discrimination and Vulnerability for the	
CESCR, the ECtHR and the ECSR	120
2.7.4 Non-discrimination and Health	123
2.8 Conclusions	125
The Right to Health Care of Irregular Migrants: Between	C
Primary Care and Emergency Treatment	128
3.1 Irregular Migrants: Between Exclusionary Measures	
and Vulnerability	120
3.1.1 A Brief Recapitulation of the State Sovereignty	
Approach to Irregular Migration	120
3.1.2 Irregular Migrants and Their Vulnerability to Human	
Rights Abuse	131

3.2	European Human Rights Approaches to Health Care for	
	Irregular Migrants	135
	3.2.1 The ECtHR: Stretching a Constrained	
	Material Competence	135
	3.2.2 The ECSR: Between Interpretative Courage	
	and Limitations of Mandate	139
3.3	International Human Rights Law and Levels of Health	
	Care for Migrants with Irregular Status as	
	Vulnerable People	140
	3.3.1 The Human Rights Committee: Urgent Care	
	and the Right to Life	141
	3.3.2 The Committee on Economic Social and Cultural	
	Rights: Irregular Migrants and the Typologies	
	on Right to Health Obligations	143
	3.3.3 Non-discrimination in the Enjoyment of the Right	
	to Health as a Core Obligation of Immediate Nature	146
	3.3.3.1 Emergency Treatment, Non-discrimination	
	and Rights Limitations	146
	3.3.3.2 Core Obligations, Non-discrimination	
	and the Levels of Accessible Care	150
	3.3.3.3 What Is 'Essential' Primary Health Care?	154
3.4	Levelling-up Developments	156
	3.4.1 Vulnerable Migrants and Their Protection	
	in Economic and Health Crises	157
	3.4.1.1 The CESCR's Approach vis-à-vis the Financial	
	and Economic Crisis: Non-retrogression	
	and Non-discrimination	158
	3.4.1.2 The ECSR and Austerity in Europe	160
	3.4.1.3 The COVID-19 Pandemic and Vulnerability-	
	Targeted Measures	160
	3.4.2 'Firewalls' to Guarantee the Effective Enjoyment	
	of Health Services by Irregular Migrants	163
	3.4.3 The Most Vulnerable Situations among	
	Vulnerable Migrants	166
	3.4.3.1 The Right to Health Care for All	
	Migrant Children	167
	3.4.3.2 Gender Equality and Sexual and Reproductive	
	Health for Migrant Women and Girls	169
3.5	Conclusions	171

212

	Determinants of the Health of Irregular Migrants:	
	ween Interrelatedness and Power	173
•	Conceptual Analysis of the Applicability of the Determinants	
	of Health Approach for Irregular Migrants in Human	
	Rights and Public Health	175
4	4.1.1 Enabling Arguments: (a) The Interdisciplinary	
	Recognition of the Determinants of Health	175
2	4.1.2 Enabling Arguments: (b) Vulnerability and the	
	Determinants of Health	178
2	4.1.3 Enabling Arguments: (c) Interrelated Rights and	
	Intersectoral Measures	179
2	4.1.4 Conceptual Obstacles: (a) Immigration, Policy	
	Models and Welfare Rights	180
2	4.1.5 Conceptual Obstacles: (b) The Effects of Power	
	Constructs on the Rights of Irregular Migrants	184
2	4.1.6 Empowering Irregular Migrants with Indivisible	
	Rights? From Theory to Human Rights Practice	187
4.2	European Human Rights Frameworks: From Constrained	
	to Implicit Consideration of the Determinants of Health of	
	Irregular Migrants	188
2	4.2.1 The Sovereignty-Constrained Case Law of	
	the ECtHR	189
2	4.2.2 The Growing Jurisprudence of the ECSR	192
4.3	International Standards and UN Supervisory Bodies:	
	Developing an Explicit Recognition of the Determinants	
	of Health of Irregular Migrants as Human Rights	196
	4.3.1 The Foundation of the Determinants of Health	
	in Human Rights: The UDHR	196
2	4.3.2 Elaborating on UN Human Rights	
	Treaties' Obligations	198
	4.3.2.1 The Concluding Observations of the CESCR	198
	4.3.2.2 The General Comments of the CESCR	201
	4.3.2.3 Contributions of Other UN Treaty Bodies	204
	4.3.2.4 The Special Procedures: An Endorsement	7
	for Healthy Living Environments as a Human	
	Rights Issue	207
	4.3.3 The Global Compact for Migration and the	20/
2	Determinants of Health	210
1 1	Conclusions	210
4.4	Onicianini 2	212

5	Mental Health, Irregular Migration and Human Rights:	
	Synergising Vulnerability- and Disability-Sensitive	
	Approaches	215
	5.1 Approaching the Human Right to Mental Health in Theory	
	and Practice	217
	5.1.1 Definitional Challenges	217
	5.1.2 Theoretical Grounding: The Concepts of Vulnerability	
	and Disability as Tools of Substantive Equality	223
	5.2 Mental Health and Human Rights Law	225
	5.2.1 Mental Health Regulation on Human Rights	226
	5.2.2 Human Rights Violations on Mental Health	227
	5.2.3 Synergies between Public Health and Human	
	Rights in Right to Mental Health	228
	5.3 European Human Rights: Qualified Risks for Mental	
	Health and Emergency Approaches	231
	5.3.1 Deportation Measures and Mental Health	232
	5.3.2 Immigration Detention and Psychological Suffering	238
	5.3.3 Social Entitlements and Mental Health	241
	5.4 International Human Rights Bodies: Emphasising Mental	
	Health in Primary Care and Support Services	242
	5.4.1 Mental Health Considerations in Human	
	Rights Violations	242
	5.4.2 Irregular Migrants' Right to Mental Health: Non-	
	discrimination, Vulnerability and	
	Disability Arguments	246
	5.4.2.1 Mental Health in the PHC Model for	
	Irregular Migrants	246
	5.4.2.2 Age- and Gender-Related Considerations	251
	5.4.2.3 The CRPD: A Transformative Tool for	
	Combating Multiple Sources of Discrimination	
	and Health-Related Rights Violations	254
	5.5 Conclusions	259
Cor	aclusion	263
	C.1 Main Findings: From Framework Limitations to Expansive	
	Human Rights Standards	264
	C.1.1 Chapter 1 – 'Sovereignty and the Human Rights	
	of Irregular Migrants'	264
	C.1.2 Chapter 2 – 'The Normative Contours	
	of a Vulnerability- and Equity-Oriented Right	
	to Health'	265

C.1.	Chapter 3 – 'The Right to Health Care of Irregular	
	Migrants: Between Primary Care and	
	Emergency Treatment'	267
C.1.	4 Chapter 4 – 'The Determinants of the Health	
	of Irregular Migrants: Between Interrelatedness	
	and Power'	269
C.1.	5 Chapter 5 – 'Mental Health, Irregular Migration	
	and Human Rights: Synergising Vulnerability- and	
	Disability-Sensitive Approaches'	271
C.2 Tal	king a 'Final' Snapshot? Major Advances and	
Un	addressed Issues in Relation to Ensuring	
Co	mprehensive Protection of All Migrants'	
He	alth Rights	272
Select Bibliog	graphy	277
Index		293
		/ /