

Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxv
<i>Table of International Instruments</i>	lxxxvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	cix
<i>Glossary</i>	cxvii
 Introduction	 1
1. Purpose of This Book	1
2. Sources and Components of the Right to a Fair Trial	5
2.1 Sources of the right to a fair trial in international law	5
2.2 Right to a fair trial in international treaties	7
2.3 Right to a fair trial: exhaustive list or an expanding 'bundle of rights'?	8
2.4 Right to a fair trial in international criminal courts	10
2.5 Right to a fair trial in national courts	12
3. Right to a Fair Trial in Customary International Law	13
3.1 Right to a fair trial is a rule of customary international law	14
3.2 Component rights of a fair trial and customary international law	19
4. Scope of the Right to a Fair Trial	26
4.1 Right to a fair trial in criminal proceedings	26
4.2 Right to a fair trial in the state's territory	28
4.3 Right to a fair trial during the trial phase of criminal proceedings	29
4.4 Who enjoys the right to a fair trial?	33
4.5 Particular application of the right to a fair trial	42
5. Burden of Proof and Deference to National Courts	49
5.1 Burden and standard of proof	49
5.2 Degrees of deference	51
6. Fragmentation and Harmonisation of the Right to a Fair Trial	56
6.1 A fragmented legal landscape	56
6.2 Methods of harmonisation	60
 1. Right to a Competent, Independent and Impartial Tribunal Established by Law	 66
1. Introduction	67
2. Origins and Rationale of the Right	67
3. Definition of the Right in International Instruments	71
4. Scope of the Right	73
4.1 General scope of the right	73
4.2 When does the right apply?	74
4.3 What is a 'tribunal'?	75
5. Right to a Competent Tribunal	76
5.1 Individual competence	77
5.2 Judicial competence	79
5.3 Jurisdictional competence	80
5.4 Authority to determine competence	81

6. Right to an Independent Tribunal	82
6.1 Definition of 'independence'	83
6.2 Objective and subjective independence	84
6.3 Separation of powers	85
6.4 Appointment of judges	90
6.5 Tenure	94
6.6 Promotion	99
6.7 Discipline, demotion and removal from office	100
6.8 Immunity	104
6.9 Compensation and conditions of service	104
6.10 Assignment and transfer of cases and judges	105
7. Right to an Impartial Tribunal	106
7.1 Subjective impartiality	109
7.2 Objective impartiality	110
7.3 Adverse media reporting	124
7.4 Arbitrary rulings at trial	125
7.5 Courts outside the regular court system	129
8. Establishment by Law	133
9. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	136
10. Derogations and Reservations	137
10.1 Derogations	137
10.2 Reservations	140
11. Waivers	141
11.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	141
11.2 Waiver of the right to a competent, independent and impartial tribunal established by law?	142
12. Remedies	142
12.1 Can a violation be remedied at trial or on appeal?	143
12.2 Discharge of a jury	144
12.3 Release	144
12.4 Quashing of convictions and expunging records	145
12.5 Retrial	146
12.6 Sentence reduction	147
12.7 Compensation	147
12.8 Declarations	148
12.9 Legal reform	148
12.10 Other remedies	149
13. Conclusion	150
2. Right to a Public Trial	152
1. Introduction	153
2. Origins and Rationale of the Right to a Public Trial	153
3. Definition of the Right to a Public Trial in International Instruments	155
4. Scope of the Right to a Public Trial	157
4.1 Principle of public oral hearings	157
4.2 What is a 'trial'?	158
4.3 When is a trial 'public'?	162
4.4 Exceptions to the right to a public trial	167
5. Scope of the Right to a Public Judgment	180
5.1 What is a 'judgment'?	182

5.2 What makes a judgment 'public'?	182
5.3 Exceptions to the right to a public judgment	183
6. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	185
7. Derogations and Reservations	186
7.1 Derogations	186
7.2 Reservations	189
8. Waivers	190
8.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	190
8.2 Waiver of the right to a public trial	191
9. Remedies	192
9.1 Can a violation be remedied on appeal?	193
9.2 Release, quashing of convictions, and expunging records	193
9.3 Retrial	194
9.4 Sentence reduction	195
9.5 Compensation	195
9.6 Declarations	196
9.7 Legal reform	196
10. Conclusion	196
3. Right to be Presumed Innocent	198
1. Introduction	199
2. Origin and Rationale of the Right to be Presumed Innocent	199
3. Definition of the Right to be Presumed Innocent in International Instruments	200
4. Scope of the Right to be Presumed Innocent	201
4.1 Pre-trial and trial proceedings	202
4.2 Appeal proceedings	203
4.3 Sentencing proceedings	204
4.4 After the completion of proceedings	205
5. Burden and Standard of Proof	206
5.1 Burden of proof	206
5.2 Standard of proof	213
6. Prejudicial Statements	217
6.1 Who made the statement?	218
6.2 What was the statement?	224
6.3 When was the statement made?	227
7. Presentation of the Defendant during Trial	228
7.1 Docks, cages, and measures of restraint	229
7.2 Appearance at trial in prison uniform	230
8. Right to be Presumed Innocent and Pre-Trial Detention	231
9. Violations of the Presumption of Innocence when there is Insufficient Evidence to Sustain a Conviction	234
9.1 Human Rights Committee	235
9.2 Working Group on Arbitrary Detention	238
9.3 European Court of Human Rights	238
9.4 Inter-American Court and Commission on Human Rights	240
9.5 African Court and Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights	242
10. Relationship between the Right to be Presumed Innocent and Other Fair Trial Rights	243

11. Derogations and Reservations	244
11.1 Derogations	244
11.2 Reservations	247
12. Waivers	247
12.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	247
12.2 Waiver of the right to be presumed innocent	248
13. Remedies	249
13.1 Can a violation be remedied on appeal?	249
13.2 Release, quashing of convictions, and expunging records	249
13.3 Retrial	251
13.4 Sentence reduction	252
13.5 Compensation	252
13.6 Declarations	253
13.7 Legal reform	254
13.8 Other remedies	254
14. Conclusion	255
4. Right to Prepare a Defence	257
1. Introduction	258
2. Origins and Rationale of the Right to Prepare a Defence	258
3. Definition of the Right to Prepare a Defence in International Instruments	259
4. Scope of the Right to Prepare a Defence	260
5. Right to be Informed of the Charges	261
5.1 Right to be informed 'promptly' of the charges	262
5.2 Right to be informed 'in detail' of the charges	266
5.3 Right to be informed of the 'cause' of the charges	267
5.4 Right to be informed of the 'nature' of the charges	270
5.5 Right to be informed of charges in a language the defendant 'understands'	271
5.6 Right of juveniles to be informed of the charges	272
5.7 Right to be convicted only of charges of which the defendant was adequately informed	272
6. Right to Adequate Time and Facilities to Prepare a Defence	279
6.1 Right to 'adequate time' to prepare a defence	279
6.2 Right to 'adequate facilities' to prepare a defence	283
7. Arbitrary Assessments of Evidence and Submissions	304
7.1 Arbitrary assessments of evidence	304
7.2 Arbitrary assessments of defence submissions	309
8. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	310
9. Derogations and Reservations	312
9.1 Derogations	312
9.2 Reservations	315
10. Waivers	315
10.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	316
10.2 Waivers of the right prepare a defence	317
11. Remedies	318
11.1 Can a violation be remedied on appeal?	318
11.2 Release	319
11.3 Quashing of convictions and expunging records	320
11.4 Commutation of death sentence and sentence reduction	321

11.5	Retrial	322
11.6	Compensation	323
11.7	Declarations	324
11.8	Legal reform	325
11.9	Other remedies	325
12.	Conclusion	326
5.	Right to Counsel	327
1.	Introduction	328
2.	Origins and Rationale of the Right to Counsel	328
3.	Definition of the Right to Counsel in International Instruments	331
4.	Scope of the Right to Counsel	333
4.1	What does 'counsel' mean?	333
4.2	When does the right to counsel apply?	334
5.	Right to be Notified of the Right to Counsel	342
6.	Right to Have Counsel Assigned Through Legal Aid	343
6.1	When is the assignment of legal aid required?	344
6.2	Content of the right	348
7.	Right to Choose Counsel	351
7.1	Can the defendant choose counsel?	351
7.2	Does the defendant have a right to have counsel replaced?	352
8.	Right to 'Effective' Assistance of Counsel	354
8.1	What type of counsel must be effective?	355
8.2	What is the standard for effectiveness?	357
8.3	When will a state be held responsible for counsel's ineffectiveness?	359
8.4	Right to 'communicate' with counsel	360
8.5	Protection of counsel from intimidation or interference	368
9.	Right to Self-Representation	370
10.	Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	373
11.	Derogations and Reservations	373
11.1	Derogations	373
11.2	Reservations	377
12.	Waivers	377
12.1	Requirements for a valid waiver	377
12.2	Waiver of the right to counsel	378
13.	Remedies	381
13.1	Can a violation be remedied on appeal?	381
13.2	Release	382
13.3	Quashing of convictions and expunging records	383
13.4	Commutation and sentence reduction	384
13.5	Retrial	384
13.6	Compensation	385
13.7	Declaratory relief	386
13.8	Legislative reform	386
13.9	Other remedies	387
14.	Conclusion	387
6.	Right to be Tried without Undue Delay	389
1.	Introduction	389
2.	Origins and Rationale of the Right to be Tried without Undue Delay	391

3. Definition of the Right to be Tried without Undue Delay in International Instruments	392
4. Scope of the Right to be Tried without Undue Delay	393
4.1 Length of a 'trial'	394
4.2 Right of victims to a trial without undue delay	398
5. Right to a Trial without 'Undue' Delay	399
5.1 What makes a delay 'undue'?	400
5.2 Proving that delay is 'undue'	424
6. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	426
7. Derogations and Reservations	429
7.1 Derogations	429
7.2 Reservations	432
8. Waivers	433
8.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	433
8.2 Waiver of the right to be tried without undue delay	434
9. Remedies	435
9.1 Can a violation be remedied on appeal?	435
9.2 Release	436
9.3 Quashing of convictions and expunging records	437
9.4 Retrial	438
9.5 Sentence reduction	439
9.6 Compensation	440
9.7 Declarations	442
9.8 Legal reform	443
10. Conclusion	444
7. Right to be Present	446
1. Introduction	446
2. Origins and Rationale of the Right to be Present	448
3. Definition of the Right to be Present in International Instruments	450
4. A Right or a Duty to be Present?	452
5. Scope of the Right to be Present	454
5.1 Pre-trial stage	454
5.2 Trial stage	455
5.3 Appeal stage	456
5.4 Sentencing stage	458
5.5 Right to be 'tried in his presence'	459
6. Conditions for Trials in the Absence of the Defendant	463
6.1 States must adequately notify the defendant of the trial	463
6.2 States must hand over a defendant who is in their custody to the court	466
6.3 States must safeguard the defendant's defence rights, including the right to counsel	466
6.4 States must grant a retrial if the defendant appears	468
7. Circumstances when a Trial may be Held in the Defendant's Absence	469
7.1 Waivers	469
8. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	480
9. Derogations and Reservations	481
9.1 Derogations	481
9.2 Reservations	484

10. Remedies	485
10.1 Can a violation be remedied on appeal?	485
10.2 Release	485
10.3 Retrial	486
10.4 Compensation	487
10.5 Declarations	488
11. Conclusion	488
8. Right to Examine Witnesses	491
1. Introduction	492
2. Origins and Rationale of the Right to Examine Witnesses	492
3. Definition of the Right to Examine Witnesses in International Instruments	495
4. Scope of the Right to Examine Witnesses	496
4.1 Sentencing proceedings	497
4.2 Appeal proceedings	498
4.3 Retrial	499
5. Right to Examine 'Witnesses'	499
5.1 Definition of a 'witness'	500
6. Right to Examine Prosecution Witnesses	503
6.1 Right to 'examine or have examined'	503
6.2 Right to an 'examination'	506
6.3 Limitations on the right	511
7. Right to Call and Examine Defence Witnesses	532
7.1 Right to examine 'witness on his behalf'	533
7.2 Right to 'obtain the attendance' of defence witnesses	535
7.3 Permissible limitations on the right to call witnesses	537
7.4 Right to an 'examination' of defence witnesses	539
7.5 Right to examine defence witnesses under the 'same conditions' as prosecution witnesses	540
8. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	542
9. Derogations and Reservations	542
9.1 Derogations	542
9.2 Reservations	545
10. Waivers	545
10.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	546
10.2 Waiver of the right to examine witnesses	547
11. Remedies	548
11.1 Can a violation be remedied on appeal?	548
11.2 Release, quashing of convictions, and sentence reduction	549
11.3 Retrial	550
11.4 Compensation	552
11.5 Declarations	553
11.6 Legal reform	554
11.7 Other remedies	554
12. Conclusion	555
9. Right to an Interpreter	556
1. Introduction	557
2. Origins and Rationale of the Right to an Interpreter	558

3. Definition of the Right to an Interpreter in International Instruments	561
4. Right to the 'Assistance of an Interpreter'	562
4.1 Scope of the right to an interpreter	562
4.2 Right to an 'interpreter': qualifications and quality	566
4.3 Right to 'free' assistance of an interpreter	568
4.4 'If the defendant cannot understand or speak the language used in court'	569
4.5 Language abilities of defence counsel	575
4.6 Language in which interpretation is provided	578
4.7 Language assistance for persons with disabilities	581
4.8 Interpretation rights of victims and witnesses	581
5. Right to Translation of Documents	582
5.1 Source of the right to translation	582
5.2 Scope of the right to translation	583
5.3 Documents that are relevant or necessary for the preparation of the defence	587
5.4 Summary or oral translation	592
6. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	593
7. Derogations and Reservations	595
7.1 Derogations	595
7.2 Reservations	598
8. Waivers	598
8.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	599
8.2 Waiver of the right to an interpreter or translator	600
9. Remedies	602
9.1 Can a violation be remedied on appeal?	603
9.2 Release	603
9.3 Retrial	604
9.4 Compensation	604
9.5 Declarations	605
9.6 Legal reform	606
9.7 Other remedies	606
10. Conclusion	606
10. Right to Silence	609
1. Introduction	609
2. Origins and Rationale of the Right not to be Compelled to Testify against Oneself or Confess Guilt	611
3. Definition of the Right in International Instruments	612
4. Scope of the Right	613
4.1 Right to be informed	614
4.2 Difference between the right to silence and the right not to be compelled to incriminate oneself	615
4.3 To whom does the right apply?	616
4.4 What does 'compelled' mean?	619
4.5 What kind of evidence is covered?	632
5. Consequences of Exercising the Right	636
6. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	637
7. Derogations and Reservations	638
7.1 Derogations	638
7.2 Reservations	641

8. Waivers	641
8.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	641
8.2 Waiver of the right not to testify against oneself and confess guilt	642
8.3 Waiver through selective silence	643
9. Remedies	644
9.1 Can a violation be remedied at trial or on appeal?	644
9.2 Release	645
9.3 Retrial	645
9.4 Sentence reduction	646
9.5 Compensation	647
9.6 Declarations	648
9.7 Legal reform	649
9.8 Other remedies	649
10. Conclusion	653
11. Right to Appeal	655
1. Introduction	656
2. Origins and Rationale of the Right to Appeal	657
3. Definition of the Right to Appeal in International Instruments	659
4. Scope of the Right to Appeal	661
4.1 Right to appeal of anyone 'convicted' of a criminal offence	661
4.2 Right to appeal of non-defendants	662
4.3 Right to appeal from stage that determined 'conviction and sentence'	664
4.4 Right to appeal and types of offences	669
4.5 Right to appeal from military proceedings and courts martial	674
5. Review by a 'Higher Tribunal According to Law'	675
5.1 Conviction by a 'tribunal'	675
5.2 Review by a 'higher tribunal'	675
5.3 Review 'according to law'	680
6. Standard of Review on Appeal	685
6.1 Substantive review of law and fact	685
6.2 Review of 'conviction and sentence'	689
7. Preconditions for Exercising the Right to Appeal	690
7.1 Notification of first instance judgment	691
7.2 Written, reasoned judgment by court of first instance	691
7.3 Access to other relevant documents	696
7.4 Preservation of evidence by court of first instance	697
8. Due Process Requirements for an Appeal	698
8.1 Certain fair trial rights may apply to a different extent on appeal	698
8.2 New evidence on appeal	700
8.3 Timely production of a written, reasoned appeals judgment	701
9. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	703
10. Derogations and Reservations	704
10.1 Derogations	704
10.2 Reservations	708
11. Waivers	709
11.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	709
11.2 Waiver of the right to appeal	710

12. Remedies	712
12.1 Can a violation be remedied on appeal?	712
12.2 Release	713
12.3 Retrial	714
12.4 Reduction of sentence	714
12.5 Compensation and declarations	715
12.6 Legal reform	716
13. Conclusion	717
12. Right to Equality	719
1. Introduction	720
2. Origins and Rationale of the Right to Equality before Courts and Tribunals	721
3. Definition of the Right to Equality in International Instruments	724
4. Scope of the Right to Equality before Courts and Tribunals	727
4.1 Which 'courts and tribunals' does the right apply to?	727
4.2 Pre-trial stage	728
4.3 Appeal stage	728
4.4 Sentencing stage	729
5. Equality of Treatment	730
5.1 Gender discrimination	731
5.2 Race discrimination	734
5.3 Discrimination on the basis of disability	735
5.4 Other grounds for discrimination: nationality, ethnicity, and religion	736
5.5 Discrimination on the basis of 'political or other opinion': politicised prosecutions	738
5.6 Different but not discriminatory treatment	747
6. Equality of Arms	748
7. Equality of Access	754
7.1 Defendants in detention	754
7.2 Defendants with disabilities	755
7.3 Defendants who are foreign nationals	756
8. Equality of Access and Special Courts and Proceedings	757
8.1 Military personnel before military or special courts	758
8.2 Civilians before military or special courts	759
8.3 Equality of access for victims and relatives	761
9. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	762
10. Derogations and Reservations	763
10.1 Derogations	763
10.2 No right to derogate from 'fundamental principles of fair trial'	764
10.3 No derogation from the right to equality before courts and tribunals	765
10.4 Reservations	767
11. Waivers	767
11.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	767
11.2 Waiver of the right to equality before courts and tribunals?	768
12. Remedies	769
12.1 Can a violation be remedied on appeal?	769
12.2 Release	770
12.3 Retrial	771
12.4 Sentence reduction	771

12.5 Compensation	771
12.6 Declarations	772
12.7 Quashing of convictions and expunging records	773
12.8 Legal reform and other remedies	773
13. Conclusion	775
13. Right not to be Subject to Double Jeopardy	777
1. Introduction	778
2. Origins and Rationale of the Right not to be Subject to Double Jeopardy	778
3. Definition of the Right not to be Subject to Double Jeopardy in International Instruments	783
4. Scope of the Right not to be Subject to Double Jeopardy	785
4.1 Scope of 'offence': limited to criminal offences?	786
4.2 Scope of 'offence': 'same offence' or 'same conduct'?	790
4.3 Geographic scope	799
5. Triggering the Application of the Right not to be Subject to Double Jeopardy	801
5.1 Right generally attaches to acquittals and convictions	801
5.2 Requirement of a 'final verdict'	802
6. Right not to be 'Liable to be Tried or Punished Again'	808
6.1 Right not to be 'liable to be tried ... again'	808
6.2 Right not to be 'tried' again	809
6.3 Right not to be 'punished' again	812
6.4 Is the right violated when the outcome of the second prosecution is more favourable to the defendant?	813
7. Exceptions to the Right not to be Subject to Double Jeopardy	813
7.1 Initial prosecution tainted by fundamental defects in due process	813
7.2 Initial prosecution lacked real intent to bring those responsible to justice	816
7.3 New facts discovered after conclusion of the initial prosecution	817
8. Relationship with Other Fair Trial Rights	818
9. Derogations and Reservations	819
9.1 Derogations	819
9.2 Reservations	822
10. Waivers	823
10.1 Requirements for a valid waiver	823
10.2 Waiver of the right not to be subject to double jeopardy	824
11. Remedies	825
11.1 Release	825
11.2 Compensation	826
11.3 Declarations	827
11.4 Other remedies	827
12. Conclusion	827
14. Remedies	830
1. Introduction	831
2. Definition of the Right to a Remedy for Fair Trial Violations in International Instruments	832
2.1 Provisions in international instruments on remedies for fair trial violations	832

2.2	Origin of the remedies provisions in the ICCPR	833
2.3	Reservations and declarations	840
2.4	Practice of international bodies	841
3.	Remedies Awarded by International Bodies for Fair Trial Violations	848
3.1	Release	850
3.2	Pardons and quashing of convictions	864
3.3	Retrial	867
3.4	Sentence reduction	874
3.5	Monetary compensation	879
3.6	Declarations	887
3.7	Steps to prevent future violations	888
3.8	Orders to investigate and prosecute those responsible for violations	893
3.9	Other remedies	895
4.	Compliance with Rulings on Remedies	897
5.	Conclusion	900
	<i>Index</i>	901