

# Table of Contents

<b>Foreword</b>	<b>xix</b>
<b>Preface and Acknowledgement</b>	<b>xxiii</b>
<b>List of Abbreviations</b>	<b>xxv</b>
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>Disclosure</b>	<b>1</b>
I     Function of Disclosure	2
II    Standard of Disclosure	3
A   ICSID	3
1   General Standard	3
2   Disclosure of Past and Present Relationships with the Parties	6
3   Disclosure of Any Other Circumstance Causing the Arbitrator's Reliability to Be Questioned	8
4   Application by ICSID Tribunals	12
a   Placing the Arbitrator in the Centre	12
b   Placing the Parties in the Centre	18
B   UNCITRAL Rules	24
1   General Standard	24
2   Application by UNCITRAL Tribunals	26
C   IBA Guidelines	27
1   General Disclosure Standards	27
2   Application Lists	29
D   ICC Rules	35
E   LCIA Rules	37
F   SCC Rules	38



## *Table of Contents*

III	Timing of Disclosure	39
	A ICSID	39
	B UNCITRAL Rules	41
	C IBA Guidelines	41
	D Other Rules	42
IV	Disclosure Practice of Arbitrators	43
	A ICSID	43
	B UNCITRAL Rules	45
	C ICC Rules	45
	D LCIA Rules	46
	E SCC Rules	47
V	Duty of the Arbitrator to Investigate Possible Conflicts of Interest	48
	A ICSID	49
	1 Placing the Arbitrator in the Centre	49
	2 Placing the Parties in the Centre	52
	B UNCITRAL Rules	54
	C IBA Guidelines	54
	D ICC Rules	55
	E Other Rules	56
	F National Case Law	56
VI	Duty of the Parties to Inform the Arbitrator of Possible Conflicts of Interests	59
	A ICSID	59
	B IBA Guidelines	61
	C ICC Rules	62
	D National Case Law	63
VII	Concluding Remarks	63
 <b>Chapter 2</b>		
<b>Making a Challenge</b>		<b>65</b>
I	Initiative	66
	A ICSID	66
	B Other Rules	67
II	Subject of a Challenge	69
	A ICSID	69
	1 Members of the Tribunal	69
	2 Prospective Arbitrators	72
	3 Members of the Ad Hoc Committee	73
	B Other Rules	75
	C Multiple Challenges	76
	1 ICSID	76
	2 Other Rules	77
III	Grounds for Challenge	78
	A ICSID	78



## *Table of Contents*

1	Manifest Lack of the Required Qualities	79
a	Legislative History	79
b	High Moral Character	83
c	Recognised Competence	84
d	Reliability to Exercise Independent Judgment	84
e	Cumulative Application	89
2	Ineligibility for Appointment	89
a	Under Section 2 of Chapter IV of the ICSID Convention	89
b	Under Article 7 of the ICSID (Additional Facility) Rules	91
c	Under Other Provisions of the ICSID Convention, the ICSID Rules or the ICSID Regulations	92
d	Under the Parties' Contractual Arrangements	92
e	Continuous Application of the Eligibility Criteria	95
3	The Exclusivity of the Grounds for Challenge	96
B	Other Rules	97
1	Grounds for Challenge	97
2	Ineligibility for Appointment	98
IV	Formal Requirements of the Challenge	100
A	ICSID	100
B	Other Rules	101
V	Consequences of the Challenge	102
A	ICSID	102
1	Automatic Suspension of the Arbitration Proceeding	102
2	Resignation of the Challenged Arbitrator	105
3	Agreement on Replacement of the Challenged Arbitrator	108
B	Other Rules	109
1	Suspension of the Arbitration Proceeding	109
2	Resignation of the Challenged Arbitrator	111
3	Agreement on Replacement of the Challenged Arbitrator	113
VI	Waiving the Right to Challenge	113
VII	Concluding Remarks	115

### **Chapter 3**

<b>The Timing of a Challenge</b>	<b>119</b>
I Introduction	120
II Time Limits	121
A ICSID	121
1 Making a Challenge Promptly	121
2 Taking all the Factors Surrounding the Challenge into Consideration	125
3 Before the Proceeding Is Declared Closed	131
a Annulment Proceedings	132
b Revision Proceedings	133
c Re-opening of the Arbitration Proceedings	135



## *Table of Contents*

	B	UNCITRAL Rules	136
	C	Other Rules	138
III		Acquiring Knowledge of the Ground for Challenge	140
	A	Straightforward Cases	141
	1	Challenge Based on Facts Disclosed by the Arbitrator	141
	2	Challenge Based on a Specific Act or Decision of the Arbitrator	141
	B	Complex Cases	142
	1	Challenge Based on Doubts Turning into New Facts	142
	2	Challenge Based on Circumstances Discovered in the Course of the Arbitration	145
	3	Challenge Based on Facts Discovered in the Course of the Challenge Procedure	146
IV		Burden of Proving the Time of Acquiring Knowledge of the Ground for Challenge	147
	A	ICSID	147
	B	Other Rules	148
	C	National Case Law	150
V		The Challenging Party's Duty to Investigate and Discover a Ground for Challenge at an Earlier Point in Time	151
	A	ICSID	152
	B	Other Rules	154
	C	National Case Law	155
VI		Parties' Freedom to Modify the Time Limit for Making a Challenge	158
	A	ICSID	158
	B	Other Rules	160
VII		Sanction for Making a Challenge outside the Time Limit	161
	A	ICSID	161
	B	Other Rules	164
VIII		Concluding Remarks	165
<b>Chapter 4</b>			
<b>Challenge Procedure</b>			<b>169</b>
I		Jurisdiction	170
	A	ICSID	170
	1	The Other Members of the Tribunal	170
	2	The Chairman of the Administrative Council of ICSID	175
	3	Mandatory Character	179
	B	UNCITRAL Rules	179
	C	ICC Rules	181
	D	LCIA Rules	183
	E	SCC Rules	185



II	Procedural Aspects	186
A	ICSID	186
1	Explanations Furnished by the Challenged Arbitrator	186
2	Parties' Submissions	188
3	Duration of the Procedure	189
4	On the Basis of the File before the Deciding Body	191
B	Other Rules	191
1	Parties' and Arbitrators' Submissions	191
2	Duration of the Procedure	193
III	Challenge Decision	194
A	ICSID	194
1	Form	194
2	Reasoned	195
3	Publication	196
4	Finality	197
B	Other Rules	199
1	Form	199
2	Reasoned	199
3	Publication	200
4	Finality	201
IV	Outcome of the Challenge Procedure	204
A	ICSID	204
1	Replacement of the Disqualified Arbitrator	204
2	Repetition of Prior Proceedings	205
3	Costs of the Challenge Procedure	206
B	Other Rules	208
1	Replacement of the Disqualified Arbitrator	208
2	Repetition of Prior Proceedings	211
3	Costs of the Challenge Procedure	211
V	Concluding Remarks	212

## Chapter 5

	<b>Standard for Disqualification</b>	<b>217</b>
I	Introduction	218
II	The Standard for Disqualifying an Arbitrator	219
A	ICSID	219
1	Manifest as a Synonym for Quasi-Certain or Highly Probable	219
2	Manifest as Part of a Reasonable Doubts Standard	221
3	Manifest as a Requirement of Objective Evidence	225
4	Manifest in the Legislative History of the ICSID Convention	230
5	Manifest in Other Provisions of the ICSID Convention	234
6	Conclusion	236
B	UNCITRAL Rules	241
C	ICC Rules	242



## *Table of Contents*

	D	LCIA Rules	243
	E	SCC Rules	244
	F	IBA Guidelines	244
III		The Disqualification Standard Applies to All Arbitrators	246
	A	ICSID	246
	B	Other Rules	247
IV		The Disqualification Standard Applies Throughout the Arbitration	248
	A	ICSID	249
	B	UNCITRAL Rules	250
	C	ICC Rules	251
	D	IBA Guidelines	252
V		Cumulative Effect of Grounds for Disqualification	252
	A	ICSID	253
	B	UNCITRAL Rules	254
	C	ICC Rules	255
	D	LCIA Rules	256
VI		Sources of Law	257
	A	ICSID	257
	B	Other Rules	263
VII		Concluding Remarks	265

## **Chapter 6**

		<b>Challenge and Disqualification on the Ground of Independence Issues</b>	<b>269</b>
I		Introduction	270
II		Relationships of the Arbitrator with a Party	271
	A	Client-Attorney Relationship	271
	1	ICSID	271
	2	UNCITRAL Rules	273
	3	ICC Rules	274
	4	LCIA Rules	275
	5	IBA Guidelines	277
	6	National Case Law	278
	B	Financial Interest in a Party or in the Subject Matter of the Arbitration	278
	1	ICSID	278
	2	Other Rules	282
	3	National Case Law	283
	C	Business or Professional Relationship	285
	1	ICSID	285
	2	ICC Rules	285
	3	SCC Rules	286
	4	IBA Guidelines	287
	5	National Case Law	288



## *Table of Contents*

	D Social or Personal Relationship	289
	1 ICSID	289
	2 UNCITRAL Rules	290
	3 SCC Rules	291
	4 IBA Guidelines	291
III	Relationships of the Arbitrator with Counsel of a Party	292
	A ICSID	292
	B UNCITRAL Rules	298
	C ICC Rules	298
	D SCC Rules	301
	E LCIA Rules	303
	F IBA Guidelines	304
	G National Case Law	304
	H Disqualification of Counsel as an Alternative to Arbitrator Disqualification	308
	1 ICSID	308
	2 Other Rules	314
IV	Relationships of the Arbitrator with a Barrister Belonging to the Same Chambers	314
	A ICSID	315
	B LCIA Rules	317
	C ICC Rules	318
	D IBA Guidelines	319
	E National Case Law	320
	F 2010 Report Berwin Leighton Paisner	325
V	Relationships of the Law Firm of the Arbitrator with a Party	327
	A ICSID	328
	B UNCITRAL Rules	331
	C ICC Rules	332
	D SCC Rules	335
	E LCIA Rules	336
	F IBA Guidelines	337
	G National Case Law	338
VI	Relationships of the Law Firm of the Arbitrator with Counsel of a Party	342
	A ICSID	342
	B Other Rules	345
VII	Multiple Appointments	345
	A ICSID	346
	B ICC Rules	352
	C SCC Rules	353
	D LCIA Rules	354
	E IBA Guidelines	355
	F National Case Law	356
VIII	Concluding Remarks	359



## *Table of Contents*

### **Chapter 7**

#### **Challenge and Disqualification on the Ground of Impartiality Issues**

I	Introduction	366
II	Dual Role of the Arbitrator	368
	A Arbitrator and Counsel	368
	1 ICSID	369
	2 UNCITRAL Rules	369
	3 Other Rules	374
	4 IBA Guidelines	375
	5 National Case Law	377
	B Arbitrator and Other Role	378
	1 ICSID	378
	2 UNCITRAL Rules	380
	3 Other Rules	381
	4 IBA Guidelines	383
	5 National Case Law	383
III	Membership of Other Tribunals	384
	A Consecutive Memberships	384
	1 ICSID	384
	2 ICC Rules	387
	3 SCC Rules	388
	4 IBA Guidelines	389
	5 National Case Law	389
	B Concurrent Memberships	392
	1 ICSID	392
	2 UNCITRAL Rules	395
	3 ICC Rules	396
	4 SCC Rules	397
	5 IBA Guidelines	397
	6 National Case Law	398
IV	Writings and Public Statements	398
	A ICSID	398
	B UNCITRAL Rules	404
	C ICC Rules	406
	D IBA Guidelines	406
	E National Case Law	408
V	Conduct of the Arbitrator	408
	A Conduct Prior to or Subsequent to the Hearing	409
	1 ICSID	409
	2 UNCITRAL Rules	412
	3 ICC Rules	413
	4 SCC Rules	414
	5 LCIA Rules	415
	6 National Case Law	422



## *Table of Contents*

	B	Arbitrator's Conduct at the Hearing	422
	1	ICSID	422
	2	UNCITRAL Rules	423
	3	LCIA Rules	425
	4	National Case Law	427
VI		Failure to Disclose	427
	A	ICSID	427
	B	UNCITRAL Rules	434
	C	ICC Rules	435
	D	IBA Guidelines	436
	E	LCIA Rules	436
	F	National Case Law	437
VII		Nationality	440
	A	ICSID	440
	B	Other Rules	441
	C	National Case Law	443
VIII		Various	444
	A	ICSID	444
	B	UNCITRAL Rules	446
	C	ICC Rules	446
	D	SCC Rules	447
	E	LCIA Rules	448
IX		Concluding Remarks	450

### **Annex 1**

	<b>Table of ICSID Rules Challenge Decisions</b>	<b>455</b>
--	---	------------

### **Annex 2**

	<b>Extracts from the Legislative History of the ICSID Convention</b>	<b>463</b>
--	--	------------

I	Working Paper in the form of a Draft Convention prepared by the General Counsel and transmitted to the Executive Directors (Doc. No. 6, R 62-1 (SD) of 5 June 1962)	463
II	Memorandum of the Meeting of the Committee of the Whole, not an Approved Record (Doc. No. 13, SID 62-1 of 28 December 1962)	464
III	Preliminary Draft of a Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States – Working Paper for Consultative Meetings of Legal Experts Designated by Governments (Doc. No. 24, COM/AF/WH/EU/AS/1 of 15 October 1963)	465
IV	Consultative Meeting of Legal Experts in Addis Ababa on 16 to 20 December 1963 – Summary Record of Proceedings (Doc. No. 25, Z7 of 30 April 1964)	466
V	Consultative Meeting of Legal Experts in Santiago, Chile on 3 to 7 February 1964 – Summary Record of Proceedings (Doc. No. 27, Z8 of 12 June 1964)	470



## *Table of Contents*

VI	Consultative Meeting of Legal Experts in Geneva on 17 to 22 February 1964 – Summary Record of Proceedings (Doc. No. 29, Z9 of 1 June 1964)	471
VII	Consultative Meeting of Legal Experts in Bangkok, Thailand on 27 April to 1 May 1964 – Summary Record of Proceedings (Doc. No. 31, Z10 of 20 July 1964)	476
VIII	Regional Consultative Meetings of Legal Experts on Settlement of Investment Disputes – Chairman’s Report on Issues Raised and Suggestions Made with Respect to the Preliminary Draft of a Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States (Doc. No. 33, Z11 of 9 July 1964)	481
IX	Draft Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States – Working Paper for the Legal Committee (Doc. No. 43, Z12 of 11 September 1964)	483
X	Comments and Observations of Member Governments on the Draft Convention for the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States to the Legal Committee on Settlement of Investment Disputes (Doc. No. 45, SID/LC/5 of 23 November 1964)	485
XI	Summary Proceedings of the Legal Committee Meeting of 30 November, Afternoon (Doc. No. 62, SID/LC/SR/7 of 22 December 1964)	485
XII	Summary Proceedings of the Legal Committee Meeting of 4 December 1964, Afternoon (Doc. No. 79, SID/LC/SR/13 of 30 December 1964)	487
XIII	Comments to the Legal Committee on Settlement of Investment Disputes by Mr da Cunha (Brazil) on Certain Articles of Chapter IV (Doc. No. 85, SID/LC/54 of 9 December 1964)	489
XIV	Summary Proceedings of the Legal Committee Meeting of 10 December 1964, Morning (Doc. No. 106, SID/LC/SR/20 of 5 January 1965)	490
XV	Revised Draft of the Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States of 11 December 1964 (Doc. No. 123, Z-13 of 11 December 1964)	491
XVI	Report of the Chairman of the Legal Committee on Settlement of Investment Disputes (Doc. No. 124, 23 December 1964)	493
XVII	Memorandum from the General Counsel and List of Proposed Changes to the Revised Draft Convention Transmitted to the Committee of the Whole (Doc. No. 127, R65-6 of 8 January 1965)	493
XVIII	Memorandum from the General Counsel and Draft Report of the Executive Directors to Accompany the Convention (Doc. No. 128, R65-11 of 19 January 1965)	494



## *Table of Contents*

XIX	Memorandum of the Meeting of the Committee of the Whole of 23 February 1965, Morning, not an Approved Record (Doc. No. 132, SID/65-5 of 25 February 1965)	494
XX	Memorandum of the Meeting of the Committee of the Whole of 23 February 1965, Afternoon, not an Approved Record (Doc. No. 133, SID/65-6 of 25 February 1965)	495
XXI	Memorandum and Modified Articles of the Revised Draft Convention (Doc. No. 136, SID/65-9 of 1 March 1965)	497
XXII	Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Others States and Report of the Executive Directors of 18 March 1965 (Doc. No. 145)	497
<b>Bibliography</b>		<b>501</b>
<b>Table of Cases</b>		<b>515</b>
<b>Index</b>		<b>529</b>