

## CONTENTS

|                                                                                 |    |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| PREFACE                                                                         | 3  |
| CONTENTS                                                                        | 5  |
| ABBREVIATIONS                                                                   | 9  |
| CHAPTER I THE OBJECT AND PURPOSE OF THE STUDY                                   | 11 |
| CHAPTER II GENERAL ASPECTS ON THE LIMITATION OF WARFARE                         | 15 |
| 2.1. Introduction. . . . .                                                      | 15 |
| 2.2. War and its legal regulation. . . . .                                      | 16 |
| 2.2.1. War as regulated violence. . . . .                                       | 16 |
| 2.2.2. The legal regulation of warfare . . . . .                                | 19 |
| 2.2.3. Law, military necessity and humanitarian values. . . . .                 | 24 |
| 2.3. Twentieth century developments in the regulation of warfare . . . . .      | 27 |
| 2.3.1. Changes in society and warfare . . . . .                                 | 27 |
| 2.3.2. General developments in the law of armed conflicts . . . . .             | 31 |
| 2.3.3. The present status and structure of the law of armed conflicts . . . . . | 37 |
| CHAPTER III EVOLUTION OF THE LAW RELATING TO PRISONERS OF WAR                   | 43 |
| 3.1. Introduction. . . . .                                                      | 43 |
| 3.2. Prehistoric times and antiquity. . . . .                                   | 44 |
| 3.3. The Middle Ages. . . . .                                                   | 45 |
| 3.3.1. General developments . . . . .                                           | 45 |
| 3.3.2. Developments with respect to prisoners of war . . . . .                  | 47 |
| 3.4. Modern times up to the French Revolution . . . . .                         | 49 |
| 3.4.1. General developments . . . . .                                           | 49 |
| 3.4.2. Developments with respect to prisoners of war . . . . .                  | 51 |
| 3.5. From the French Revolution to the Hague Conferences. . . . .               | 59 |
| 3.5.1. General developments . . . . .                                           | 59 |
| 3.5.2. Developments with respect to prisoners of war before 1850 . . . . .      | 61 |
| 3.5.3. Developments with respect to prisoners of war after 1850 . . . . .       | 69 |
| 3.6. From the Hague Conferences to the Geneva Conference of 1949. . . . .       | 75 |
| 3.7. Concluding remarks . . . . .                                               | 81 |



|                                                                                                       |     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| CHAPTER IV THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK                                                                        | 85  |
| 4.1. Introduction. . . . .                                                                            | 85  |
| 4.2. The present treaty law . . . . .                                                                 | 86  |
| 4.2.1. The Third Geneva Convention. . . . .                                                           | 86  |
| 4.2.2. The other Geneva Conventions of 1949 . . . . .                                                 | 90  |
| 4.2.3. The Hague Conventions and the Prisoner-of-War Convention of 1929 . . . . .                     | 91  |
| 4.2.4. Conventions relating to the protection of human rights . . . . .                               | 93  |
| 4.3. The draft Additional Protocols. . . . .                                                          | 95  |
| 4.4. Customary law and <i>ius cogens</i> . . . . .                                                    | 96  |
| 4.5. The binding force of the Third Convention . . . . .                                              | 105 |
| 4.5.1. Consent to be bound by the Convention. . . . .                                                 | 105 |
| 4.5.2. Violations of the law of armed conflicts by the adversary. . . . .                             | 110 |
| 4.5.3. Military necessity . . . . .                                                                   | 114 |
| 4.6. Reservations to the Third Convention . . . . .                                                   | 117 |
| 4.7. The status of the individual under the Third Convention . . . . .                                | 121 |
| CHAPTER V THE SOCIAL CONTEXT OF THE LAW                                                               | 126 |
| 5.1. A general political setting. . . . .                                                             | 126 |
| 5.2. Quantitative aspects. . . . .                                                                    | 131 |
| 5.3. The impact of certain military and political interests on the application<br>of the law. . . . . | 134 |
| CHAPTER VI SURVEY OF RECENT PRACTICE                                                                  | 141 |
| 6.1. Introduction. . . . .                                                                            | 141 |
| 6.2. Summary of official positions on the applicability of the Third<br>Convention. . . . .           | 143 |
| 6.3. Consideration of individual conflicts . . . . .                                                  | 146 |
| 6.3.1. Algeria. . . . .                                                                               | 146 |
| 6.3.2. Congo . . . . .                                                                                | 152 |
| 6.3.3. Yemen. . . . .                                                                                 | 156 |
| 6.3.4. Himalaya. . . . .                                                                              | 159 |
| 6.3.5. Angola, Guinea-Bissau and Mozambique . . . . .                                                 | 160 |
| 6.3.6. Vietnam . . . . .                                                                              | 167 |
| 6.3.7. The Indo-Pakistani conflicts . . . . .                                                         | 185 |
| 6.3.8. Nigeria. . . . .                                                                               | 196 |
| 6.3.9. The Middle East conflicts . . . . .                                                            | 202 |
| 6.3.10. Other conflicts . . . . .                                                                     | 213 |



|                                                                                       |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| CHAPTER VII THE LEGAL CONDITIONS FOR PRISONER-OF-WAR STATUS                           | 219 |
| 7.1. Introduction.                                                                    | 219 |
| 7.2. Some political and legal implications of the granting of prisoner-of-war status. | 221 |
| 7.3. The existence of an armed conflict.                                              | 224 |
| 7.3.1. General                                                                        | 224 |
| 7.3.2. The relevance of recognition of a state of war.                                | 226 |
| 7.3.3. Doubtful cases of armed conflicts                                              | 230 |
| 7.4. The existence of an international armed conflict                                 | 239 |
| 7.4.1. General                                                                        | 239 |
| 7.4.2. Recognition and the application of humanitarian law                            | 241 |
| 7.4.3. General observations on the Geneva Conventions                                 | 245 |
| 7.4.4. Article 4 A (3) of the Third Convention                                        | 251 |
| 7.4.5. The link between independent forces and parties to conflicts                   | 257 |
| 7.4.6. Wars of national liberation                                                    | 262 |
| 7.4.6.1. The emergence and development of the new doctrine                            | 262 |
| 7.4.6.2. An appraisal of the new doctrine                                             | 270 |
| 7.4.7. Large-scale civil wars                                                         | 277 |
| 7.4.8. Mixed conflicts                                                                | 282 |
| 7.4.9. The status of military prisoners in internal conflicts                         | 288 |
| 7.4.10. Concluding remarks.                                                           | 291 |
| 7.5. The categories of persons entitled to prisoner-of-war status                     | 293 |
| 7.5.1. General                                                                        | 293 |
| 7.5.2. The historical background.                                                     | 294 |
| 7.5.3. General observations on article 4 of the Third Convention                      | 298 |
| 7.5.3.1. Military personnel                                                           | 298 |
| 7.5.3.2. Civilians entitled to prisoner-of-war status                                 | 302 |
| 7.5.4. Prisoners of war and lawful combatants                                         | 305 |
| 7.5.5. The recent efforts to develop article 4 of the Third Convention                | 313 |
| 7.5.5.1. Background                                                                   | 313 |
| 7.5.5.2. The proposals of the ICRC                                                    | 316 |
| 7.5.5.3. The discussions at the present Diplomatic Conference                         | 318 |
| 7.5.6. The specific conditions for prisoner-of-war status                             | 326 |
| 7.5.6.1. General                                                                      | 326 |
| 7.5.6.2. Regular and independent forces                                               | 327 |
| 7.5.6.3. Collective or individual conditions?                                         | 333 |
| 7.5.6.4. Organization and responsible command                                         | 338 |
| 7.5.6.5. Display of combatant status                                                  | 341 |
| 7.5.6.5.1. General                                                                    | 341 |
| 7.5.6.5.2. How should combatants display their status                                 | 344 |
| 7.5.6.5.3. When should combatants display their status?                               | 349 |
| 7.5.6.5.4. Consequence of violations                                                  | 353 |



|                                                                                                                       |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 7.5.6.6. Compliance with the laws and customs of war . . . . .                                                        | 359 |
| 7.5.6.6.1. General . . . . .                                                                                          | 359 |
| 7.5.6.6.2. Collective compliance . . . . .                                                                            | 361 |
| 7.5.6.6.3. Individual compliance . . . . .                                                                            | 367 |
| 7.5.7. Mass levies . . . . .                                                                                          | 375 |
| 7.5.8. Is the list of prisoners of war in article 4 of the Third Convention<br>exhaustive? . . . . .                  | 379 |
| 7.5.9. Certain special categories of persons . . . . .                                                                | 383 |
| 7.5.9.1. The detaining power's own nationals . . . . .                                                                | 383 |
| 7.5.9.2. Defectors and deserters . . . . .                                                                            | 388 |
| 7.5.9.3. Volunteers, advisers and mercenaries . . . . .                                                               | 392 |
| 7.5.9.4. Persons guilty of crimes against peace . . . . .                                                             | 402 |
| 7.5.10. The determination of the status of captives. . . . .                                                          | 405 |
| 7.5.11. The protection of persons not entitled to prisoner-of-war status. . .                                         | 410 |
| 7.5.12. Concluding remarks. . . . .                                                                                   | 416 |
| 7.6. When is an enemy combatant <i>hors de combat</i> ? . . . . .                                                     | 420 |
| <br>CHAPTER VIII THE TREATMENT OF PRISONERS OF WAR                                                                    | 425 |
| 8.1. Introduction. . . . .                                                                                            | 425 |
| 8.2. The identification of the detaining power . . . . .                                                              | 426 |
| 8.3. Conflicts of interest between the detaining power and the power on<br>which the prisoners of war depend. . . . . | 430 |
| 8.3.1. General . . . . .                                                                                              | 430 |
| 8.3.2. The political struggle over the prisoners . . . . .                                                            | 434 |
| 8.4. Wilful killing, torture or inhuman treatment . . . . .                                                           | 439 |
| 8.5. Reprisals. . . . .                                                                                               | 445 |
| 8.6. Labour . . . . .                                                                                                 | 449 |
| 8.7. Relations with the exterior. . . . .                                                                             | 452 |
| 8.8. Penal and disciplinary sanctions . . . . .                                                                       | 453 |
| 8.9. Guarantees for ensuring compliance with the Third Convention . . . . .                                           | 458 |
| 8.9.1. General . . . . .                                                                                              | 458 |
| 8.9.2. The role of the ICRC and other humanitarian organizations . . . . .                                            | 463 |
| <br>CHAPTER IX RELEASE AND REPATRIATION                                                                               | 470 |
| 9.1. Introduction. . . . .                                                                                            | 470 |
| 9.2. Repatriation during hostilities . . . . .                                                                        | 471 |
| 9.3. Repatriation after hostilities. . . . .                                                                          | 478 |
| 9.3.1. Prisoners of war opposing repatriation . . . . .                                                               | 478 |
| 9.3.2. When does an obligation to repatriate arise? . . . . .                                                         | 486 |
| <br>CHAPTER X CONCLUSIONS                                                                                             | 491 |
| <br>SOURCES                                                                                                           | 499 |