

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements viii

Table of Contents ix

List of Tables xvii

Table of Abbreviations xix

1 Introduction..... 1

1.1 The object of inquiry 1

1.2 Questions and order of discussion 4

1.3 “Asylum” 5

1.4 International asylum law 6

1.4.1 Sources 7

1.4.2 Rules and means of interpretation 14

1.4.2.1 The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties . 14

1.4.2.2 Treaty monitoring bodies 19

1.4.2.3 Concluding remarks 25

1.5 European asylum law 25

1.5.1 The genesis of European asylum law 26

1.5.2 Features of Community law 33

1.5.3 Instruments of European asylum law 36

1.5.4 Institutions and decision-making procedures 39

1.5.5 Interpretation 41

2 The working of international asylum law in European law 59

2.1 The Member States as states party to international treaty law.. 59

2.1.1 The Vienna Treaty Convention rules on treaty conflicts . 59

2.1.2 Conciliatory interpretation 61

2.1.3 *Jus cogens* 62

2.1.4 Article 307 TEC 63

2.1.5 Insoluble conflicts 68

2.1.6 The European Court of Human Rights 69

2.1.7 Conclusions 76

2.2	The working of international asylum law within the Community legal order	77
2.2.1	Effect as international law	78
2.2.2	General principles of Community law	82
2.2.2.1	Introduction	82
2.2.2.2	Sources	84
2.2.2.3	Scope of application	85
2.2.2.4	Intensity of the test	91
2.2.2.5	Conclusions	96
2.2.3	Article 63 TEC	97
2.2.4	References in secondary law	105
2.2.5	Concluding remarks	105
2.3	The Charter	108
2.3.1	Introduction	108
2.3.2	General provisions on Charter provisions and international law	108
2.3.3	Scope of application	110
2.3.4	Human dignity	111
2.3.5	The right to asylum	111
2.3.6	The prohibition of <i>refoulement</i>	114
2.3.7	The legal effect of the Charter	116
2.3.8	Concluding remarks	118
2.4	Assessment	119
3	The Treaty basis for asylum legislation	139
3.1	Title IV in outline	139
3.2	The “area of freedom, security and justice”	140
3.3	The scope of Community powers on asylum	143
3.3.1	Introduction	143
3.3.2	The relation between Article 63(1), 63(2) and 63(3) TEC	144
3.3.3	Asylum (Article 63(1) TEC)	146
3.3.4	Temporary protection, subsidiary protection and sudden inflows (Articles 63(2) and 64(2) TEC)	151
3.3.5	Immigration (Article 63(3) TEC)	155
3.3.6	External competencies	156
3.3.7	The exception of Article 64(1)	157

3.3.8	Legal basis outside Title IV	158
3.3.9	Concluding remarks	159
3.4	Harmonisation	160
3.5	Geographical scope of European asylum legislation	165
3.6	Community powers on asylum and international asylum law ..	166
3.7	Concluding remarks	168
3.8	The Constitution	170
3.8.1	Introduction	170
3.8.2	The policy objectives	172
3.8.3	Personal and geographical scope	172
3.8.4	Harmonisation	173
3.8.5	Substantive scope	175
3.8.6	The Protocols on the United Kingdom and Ireland and on Denmark	183
3.8.7	Concluding remarks	183
4	The Common European Asylum System	195
4.1	The concept	195
4.2	The lay-out	196
4.3	Legal basis	199
4.4	Objectives	199
4.5	Minimum standards	202
4.6	Harmonisation	204
4.7	Personal scope	205
4.8	Territorial scope	208
4.9	Concluding remarks	211
5	Qualification	219
5.1	CEAS statuses and international law	219
5.2	Definition elements	222
5.3	Risk and proof	224
5.3.1	Refugee and subsidiary protection	224
5.3.2	Temporary protection	229
5.4	Harm	230
5.4.1	Harmful acts	231

5.4.1.1	Persecution	231
5.4.1.2	Serious harm	234
5.4.1.3	Temporary protection	241
5.4.1.4	Comparison	242
5.4.2	Actors of harm	243
5.4.3	Protection and actors of protection	246
5.4.4	The Convention grounds	254
5.4.5	Concluding remarks	260
5.5	Alienage	261
5.6	Grounds for refusal	262
5.6.1	Article 1F RC	262
5.6.2	Article 33(2) RC	265
5.6.3	Article 1D and 1E RC	266
5.6.4	Conclusion	267
5.7	Cessation and withdrawal	267
5.8	The relation between the CEAS protection statuses	269
5.8.1	The complementary character of subsidiary and temporary protection	270
5.8.2	Hierarchy and concurrence	271
5.9	Concluding remarks	274
6	Asylum procedures	289
6.1	Introduction	289
6.2	Asylum procedures at first instance	291
6.2.1	International law	292
6.2.2	The set-up	296
6.2.3	The organisation	298
6.2.4	Basic principles and guarantees	304
6.2.4.1	Scope of application	305
6.2.4.2	Standards on the ‘normal procedure’ and the ‘normal border procedure’	308
6.2.4.3	Standards on the special procedures	314
6.2.5	Conclusions	317
6.3	Appeal procedures	318
6.3.1	Standards of international and Community law	318
6.3.2	CEAS provisions on appeal in asylum procedures	327
6.3.3	Conclusions	331

6.4	Grounds for refusal	332
6.4.1	Inadmissibility	332
6.4.2	Withdrawn applications	333
6.4.3	Manifestly unfounded applications	334
6.4.4	Subsequent applications	336
6.4.4.1	Introduction	336
6.4.4.2	Subsequent applications lodged during the processing of the former application.	337
6.4.4.3	Repeated applications	338
6.4.4.4	Applications by dependants.	340
6.4.4.5	Applications after withdrawal	341
6.4.4.6	Concluding remarks	343
6.4.5	The safe country of origin	344
6.4.5.1	Introduction	344
6.4.5.2	The designation	346
6.4.5.3	The application	351
6.4.5.4	Concluding remarks	357
6.4.6	Concluding remarks	358
6.5	Termination procedures.	360
6.5.1	International law	360
6.5.2	Termination of refugee status	361
6.5.3	Termination of temporary protection	363
6.5.4	Concluding remarks	363
6.6	Assessment	364
7	Allocation and safe third country arrangements	385
7.1	Introduction	385
7.2	Allocation criteria	386
7.2.1	Allocation of applicants within the European Economic Area	386
7.2.2	Allocation of temporary protection beneficiaries	391
7.2.3	Allocation to non-Member States	392
7.2.4	Concluding remarks	393
7.3	Allocation mechanisms	394
7.4	The exception of the safe third country in international law ...	397
7.4.1	Introduction	397
7.4.2	Conditions on the third state	398

7.4.3	Assessment of the safety	407
7.4.3.1	The individual and the generic approach	407
7.4.3.2	The principle of inter-state trust as a rebuttable presumption	409
7.4.4	Conclusions	418
7.5	The exception of the safe third country in European law	418
7.5.1	The Dublin Regulation and the Dublin Convention	419
7.5.2	The safe third country concept	421
7.5.3	The country of first asylum concept	426
7.5.4	Member States as countries of first asylum	427
7.5.5	The safe third neighbouring country	428
7.5.6	Concluding remarks	431
8	Secondary rights	447
8.1	Introduction	447
8.2	Refugee Convention rights	448
8.2.1	Introduction	448
8.2.2	Qualifications of refugees	448
8.2.3	The nature of refugee status determination	455
8.2.3.1	The declaratory and constitutivist views	455
8.2.3.2	The Refugee Convention text	457
8.2.3.3	Object and purpose laid down in the Preamble	459
8.2.3.4	Object and purpose of individual provisions	460
8.2.3.5	Concluding remarks	465
8.2.4	The obligation to determine refugee status	466
8.2.5	Conclusions	468
8.3	International law on family unity	469
8.4	Refugee status	474
8.4.1	General	474
8.4.2	Refugee Convention benefits	475
8.4.3	Family unity	477
8.4.4	Concluding remarks	485
8.5	Alternative refugee statuses	486
8.5.1	Article 14(6) QD refugee status	486
8.5.2	Article 24(1) QD refugee status	488
8.6	Subsidiary protection status	490
8.7	Applicant status	493

8.7.1	Entitlement to Refugee Convention benefits	493
8.7.2	Reception standards	496
8.7.2.1	(Un)lawful presence, illegal entry and the freedom of movement	496
8.7.2.2	Other reception standards	499
8.7.2.3	Reduction of benefits and procedures.	502
8.7.3	Family unity	503
8.7.4	Concluding remarks	506
8.8	Temporary protection	507
8.8.1	Temporary protection and Convention refugee status . . .	507
8.8.2	Temporary protection status benefits	509
8.8.3	Family unity	510
8.8.4	Concluding remarks	512
8.9	Assessment	512
9	Judicial supervision	531
9.1	Judicial protection of Community rights	531
9.1.1	The principle of effective protection	531
9.1.2	Direct appeal to the Court of Justice	532
9.1.3	Requirements on remedies in domestic courts.	534
9.1.4	Concluding remarks	537
9.2	Direct and indirect effect of European law on asylum	537
9.2.1	Indirect effect	538
9.2.2	Direct effect	539
9.2.2.1	The conditions for direct effect	540
9.2.2.2	Article 63 TEC	542
9.2.2.3	Secondary law	543
9.2.2.4	Conclusions	550
9.2.3	Obligations during the transposition period	551
9.2.4	Concluding remarks	553
9.3	Adjudication of asylum law by the Court of Justice	554
9.3.1	Preliminary rulings	554
9.3.2	Review of validity of Community legislation on asylum	555
9.3.3	Review of Member State acts.	561
9.3.4	The implications of Article 68 TEC	571
9.3.4.1	Introduction	571
9.3.4.2	Courts of first instance and interpretation	573

9.3.4.3	Courts of first instance and invalid Community acts.	573
9.3.4.4	Courts whose decisions are not subject to review	577
9.3.4.5	Conclusions	577
9.3.5	Exceptions to the obligation to refer	577
9.3.6	Conclusions	579
9.4	The Luxembourg Courts and domestic courts.	580
9.5	Strasbourg review of European asylum law	584
9.5.1	Review of Member State acts based on Community law that leaves discretion	585
9.5.2	Member State acts based on Community law that leaves no discretion	585
9.5.3	Review of acts by Community institutions	590
9.5.4	Assessment	592
9.6	Conclusions	592
10	Conclusions.	603
10.1	European asylum law and international asylum law	603
10.2	The Community legislation	606
10.3	Future developments	614
	Bibliography	619
	Cases	641
	Treaties and Community legislation	655
	Index	675